Document generated on 10/12/2024 2:26 a.m.

Meta
Journal des traducteurs
Translators' Journal

CHIARO, Delia, HEISS, Christine, and BUCARIA, Chiara, eds. (2008): *Between Text and Image: Updating Research in Screen Translation*. Amsterdam: John Benjamins Publishing Company, 292 pages
DÍAZ CINTAS, Jorge, ed. (2008): *The Didactics of Audiovisual Translation*. Amsterdam: John Benjamins Publishing Company, 263 pages

Christine York

Volume 54, Number 4, décembre 2009

URI: https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/038912ar
DOI: https://doi.org/10.7202/038912ar

See table of contents

Publisher(s)

Les Presses de l'Université de Montréal

ISSN

0026-0452 (print)
1492-1421 (digital)

Explore this journal

Cite this review

York, C. (2009). Review of [CHIARO, Delia, HEISS, Christine, and BUCARIA, Chiara, eds. (2008): *Between Text and Image: Updating Research in Screen Translation*. Amsterdam: John Benjamins Publishing Company, 292 pages / DÍAZ CINTAS, Jorge, ed. (2008): *The Didactics of Audiovisual Translation*. Amsterdam: John Benjamins Publishing Company, 263 pages]. *Meta*, *54*(4), 888–890. https://doi.org/10.7202/038912ar

Tous droits réservés © Les Presses de l'Université de Montréal, 2009

This document is protected by copyright law. Use of the services of Érudit (including reproduction) is subject to its terms and conditions, which can be viewed online.

https://apropos.erudit.org/en/users/policy-on-use/

This article is disseminated and preserved by Érudit.

Érudit is a non-profit inter-university consortium of the Université de Montréal, Université Laval, and the Université du Québec à Montréal. Its mission is to promote and disseminate research.

https://www.erudit.org/en/

This is an extremely illuminating chapter on the way translation can be used to "free up the mind," to be exposed to a new image field. The translation, says Folkart, shows Eliot becoming Eliot. Here the intuitive nature of the contact with the poetry, the emotional associations are built into a compelling dialogue with the poem and with Eliot's translation.

> The multi-layered work of appropriation, the process of insinuating yourself into a text that at times refuses itself, involves a number of successive, concurrent and recurrent stages: deciphering, visualizing, entering into the world behind the words, giving voice to it with a music of your own making – and pleasuring in it, as intensely as possible (p. 232).

The combined frustration and exhilaration of the translator are here evident – as she struggles to understand both "what was in it for Eliot" and what the exercise might mean for herself. As inconclusive as this dialogue might be, it is also inspiring in the broad considerations it brings into play, in the keenness of observation demanded by the task. Other chapters are critiques of theorists such as Venuti. For Folkart, foreignization cannot be a byword for the translator of poetry. Her message: there is no excuse for interrupting the esthetic program of the text.

Full of enlightening comments, insights, and opinions, structured around themes that have immense resonance (visibility, intertextuality), this book is very readable, often inspiring. There are, however, unfortunate repetitions. Identical comments on Auden's poem *the Three Companions* turn up barely 50 pages apart. Folkart's translation of Charles d'Orléans is cited twice. Though treated under two different rubrics, the repetition nevertheless seems unnecessary.

The result of many years of independent reflection on poetry and translation, *Second Finding* is a coherent and eloquent statement – presenting a position which must now be addressed by theorists of poetry in translation. Deliberately iconoclastic, somewhat vitalist in its affirmation of intuition and personal taste, drawing on a vast range of references and erudition (the list of acknowledgments includes over sixty poets), based on a very direct and personal relationship to the translated texts, *Second Finding* is the work of a poet and a thinker. After *Le conflit des énonciations*, which demonstrated in rigorous scholarly terms the role of the translating subject , *Second Finding* takes a different route to discuss another form of translating subjectivity. It is tempting to see each book as an expression of the constraints and possibilities of its language, or perhaps of stages in the career of a productive writing life – the tight argumentation of the French, the more relaxed and personal tone in English. Taken together, the two books make a lasting contribution to translation studies.

Sherry Simon
Concordia University, Montreal, Canada

Chiaro, Delia, Heiss, Christine, and Bucaria, Chiara, eds. (2008): *Between Text and Image: Updating Research in Screen Translation.* Amsterdam: John Benjamins Publishing Company, 292 pages.

Díaz Cintas, Jorge, ed. (2008): *The Didactics of Audiovisual Translation.* Amsterdam: John Benjamins Publishing Company, 263 pages.

"Audiovisual translation comes of age," proclaims Jorge Díaz Cintas in his introduction to *Between Text and Image: Updating Research in Screen Translation*, citing the ubiquity of the screen in modern society and the technological developments that have made audiovisual products pervasive in the past decade. The need for audiovisual translation (AVT) to bring these products to wider audiences has grown accordingly; this has occasioned a corresponding surge of interest in research on AVT as a subdiscipline of translation studies, one that has its own concerns and methodologies. Evidence of the current enthusiasm for AVT can be found in the decision by John Benjamins to publish two edited collections of essays on this field in 2008: the previously mentioned *Between Text and Image,* which grew out of a conference on recent research in screen translation held in Forlì, Italy; and *The Didactics of Audiovisual Translation,* a volume edited by Jorge Díaz Cintas that focuses on translator training for audiovisual material.

The first publication, edited by Delia Chiaro, Christine Heiss and Chiara Bucaria, highlights the pioneering role of the University of Bologna in bringing together research on film and on translation starting as early as 1993. The Department of Interdisciplinary Studies in Translation, Languages and Cultures recently developed Forlixt 1, a multimedia corpus that combines electronic versions of films with transcripts of the dialogue and subtitles to allow researchers to extract data on audiovisual translation patterns and strategies. As of June 2006, it contained 30 feature-length fiction films, including original productions in Italian, German, and French; the transcriptions amount to about 300,000 words, making it comparable in size to other Italian spoken corpora. Two articles on Forlixt 1 are included in the first section of *Between Text and Image*, along with a paper describing INTCA, a prototype for a Catalan-English elec-

tronic dictionary of interjections, based on a corpus of television sitcoms in Catalan and in English dubbed into Catalan. These articles point to the potential of electronic and multimedia corpora as highly sophisticated AVT research tools.

The other sections present articles grouped according to approach: linguistic; empirical; cultural and psycholinguistic; and socio-economic. Noteworthy are the empirical studies by Rachele Antonini, Chiara Bucaria, and Flavia Cavaliere that draw on the methods of marketing research to examine audience perception of AV products. For example, Antonini questioned viewers on how well they understood "dubbese," the standardized spoken Italian found in dubbed films and television programs, in response to concerns about its impact on language learning, particularly among children. Also noteworthy is an essay by Elena Di Giovanni in the section on cultural and psycholinguistic approaches, which makes a heartfelt plea for "abusive subtitling" – a term coined by Abé Mark Nornes (1999) to refer to subtitling that draws attention to itself and does not hide the film's foreign origin – as particularly appropriate for documentary films on human rights.

While most of the papers focus on present or future concerns, *Between Text and Image* contains a rare look back at historical trends in AVT research – a sign of the growing maturity of the field. Written by Yves Gambier, the paper pinpoints 1995 as a watershed for AVT for three reasons: the centenary of cinema, which was marked by various publications and conferences; activism by linguistic minority groups in Europe, who recognized the role of audiovisual media in promoting identity; and technological changes, particularly the transition from analog to digital media. Gambier also discusses the challenges facing both researchers and practitioners, noting that certain key concepts of translation studies, such as *text*, *authorship*, and *translation norms*, need to be rethought when they are applied to AVT. He concludes by admonishing translators for their slow response to the changing media situation in our image-dominated world, whereby power is shifting from large media owners to cultural mediators like translators who work with the vast range of AV products.

One of the challenges mentioned by Gambier is translator training, which is precisely the focus of the second book on AVT published by John Benjamins in 2008, *The Didactics of Audiovisual Translation.* Edited by the prolific Jorge Díaz Cintas, it builds on the wealth of material published in AVT in recent years as well as current interest in training to explore the intersection between the two. In Part 1, it suggests that AV translators would benefit from further training in two areas: the semiotics of the audiovisual text and screenwriting. On the latter subject, Patrick Catrysse and Yves Gambier argue that translators should be familiar with the functions of film dialogue and the narrative and rhetorical strategies used by screenwriters, while Aline Remael makes a distinction between fictional dialogue and the impromptu speech found in documentaries and current affairs programming.

The longest section of the book is Part 2, which addresses practical concerns by describing specific AVT programs at higher-education institutions in Europe and offering suggestions for classroom activities. Thus it contains such articles as Bartoll and Orero's description of the online subtitling module offered by Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona and Anna Matamala's account of a university course on voice-over, a hitherto neglected mode of AVT. Other articles focus on dubbing and translation for the video game industry. The book also comes with a CD-ROM containing film excerpts, exercises, and a sample clip with audio description.

At the same time as it provides concrete ideas for teaching AVT in translation programs, *The Didactics of Audiovisual Translation* expands its purview to cover the relatively new field of media accessibility and the use of translated AV materials in language learning. The pioneering articles in Part 3 give guidelines on how to train language professionals in subtitling for the deaf and hard-of-hearing (SDH) and audio description for the blind (AD), the two main forms of AVT intended for people with sensory impairments. Part 4 looks at the potential for subtitled audiovisual materials to be used effectively in second-language acquisition, both in the classroom through techniques such as reversed subtitling (i.e., watching a film with audio in the learner's native language and subtitles in the second language), and in unguided learning situations such as home viewing of DVDs.

Both of these publications reflect a European perspective: most of the articles in *Between Text and Image* were written by scholars based in Italy, while those in *The Didactics of Audiovisual Translation* cover wider ground, with contributions from Europe – mostly Spain and Britain – as well as South Africa, the United States and Brazil. One significant difference in the North American perspective is that audiovisual translation tends not to incorporate issues related to media accessibility – although both audio description and subtitling for the deaf and hard-of-hearing (called captioning in North America) were invented in the United States. Nonetheless, readers from all parts of the world will find much valuable information in these two publications. Achieving a welcome balance between theory and practice, they represent a *coming of age* for AVT in that they go beyond the limited focus on dubbing and subtitling of previous

decades to consider numerous modes of audiovisual translation from a variety of approaches, opening many avenues for further research.

Christine York
University of Ottawa, Ottawa, Canada

REFERENCE

Nornes, Abé Mark (1999): For an Abusive Subtitling. *Film Quarterly.* 52(2):17-34.

Lafarga, Francisco, Méndez, Pedro S. et Saura, Alfonso, dir. (2007) : *Literatura de viajes y traducción*. Granada : Editorial Comares, 432 pages.

Literatura de viajes y traducción traite de l'intérêt croissant pour la littérature de voyages et des problèmes de traduction qu'elle suscite. Le livre est divisé en 33 chapitres présentés par ordre alphabétique d'auteurs. Toutefois, comme l'indique Francisco Lafarga dans sa présentation, on peut les regrouper par blocs thématiques selon les approches ou les méthodologies utilisées pour le traitement du sujet de la littérature de voyages et de la traduction de celle-ci.

Les auteurs s'entendent pour signaler que les problèmes de traduction les plus fréquents dans ce type de littérature découlent de l'interprétation donnée par le traducteur. En effet, la littérature de voyages présente des problèmes de traduction très précis qui tiennent fondamentalement au traitement des éléments culturels et linguistiques de la part du traducteur, ce dernier se débattant entre la fidélité à la lettre et l'adaptation au contexte d'arrivée.

La présence du traducteur se manifeste de façons diverses : par sa formation, par sa culture, par sa maîtrise de la langue d'origine, par son idéologie ou par ses intentions. Cette approche des problèmes de la traduction de la littérature de voyages centrée sur le traducteur est celle de la majorité des chapitres de ce volume.

La préparation culturelle et historique du traducteur s'avère indispensable pour réussir une traduction fidèle. Dans tous les chapitres concernés, les auteurs s'entendent pour signaler que l'érudition fait partie des compétences du traducteur ; les textes analysés sont en effet de précieuses sources de données et de documentation, qui aident le lecteur à mieux comprendre le texte et fournissent au traducteur des connaissances historiques nouvelles. Sarmiento et Batista, par exemple, défendent la *traduction philologique* au sens strict et soutiennent que, sans le savoir historique et la recherche de sources, il aurait été impossible de traduire les auteurs proposés. Saura montre que le manque d'information et la hâte des éditeurs sont la cause de mauvaises traductions, comme c'est le cas de celle de *L'âpre et splendide Espagne* de C. Mauclair.

Aguilá et García Garrosa signalent la littéralité et la méconnaissance de la grammaire et de la langue françaises, entre d'autres, comme causes des erreurs et des modifications dans la disposition textuelle – notes et signes de ponctuation –, et Picó y ajoute les difficultés de lecture et de compréhension suscitées par les lettres gothiques, les signes de ponctuation et les faux amis. Solé, pour sa part, attribue les erreurs, les omissions et les modifications de la traduction par rapport au texte de départ à l'âge avancé du traducteur, à son manque de motivation ainsi qu'à son éventuelle incompréhension du texte.

Finalement, les licences du traducteur font l'objet d'étude de plusieurs chapitres. Méndez Robles s'interroge sur les limites de l'intervention du traducteur dans le texte. L'analyse de la traduction de *La Havane* de la comtesse de Merlin par José Luis Arráez se révèle spécialement intéressante dans la mesure où elle montre les défauts et les omissions d'une traduction contaminée par les intérêts politiques et idéologiques. Iñarrea, pour sa part, expose l'importance des composantes paratextuelles, qui s'avèrent être des sources de connaissance de cultures, d'histoires et de géographies, pour la compréhension d'un texte et pour sa traduction.

Le principal atout de cet ouvrage est de rassembler des études sur la traduction d'un type de littérature trop longtemps ignoré. Aujourd'hui, cependant, la littérature de voyages connaît un regain de popularité spectaculaire et les recherches présentes dans ce volume en sont la preuve palpable.

Nous ignorons les raisons qui ont poussé les éditeurs à présenter les chapitres par ordre alphabétique d'auteurs. Une organisation thématique suivant, par exemple, la classification faite dans la présentation, aurait été préférable pour le confort du lecteur. On regrettera aussi de ne pas trouver à la fin du volume une bibliographie générale permettant d'accéder à toutes les références utilisées par les auteurs.

Par la richesse et la rigueur des approches des problèmes de traduction présentées, cet ouvrage constitue une source précieuse de réflexions et de références pour tous ceux qui s'intéressent aux problèmes de la traduction de la littérature de voyages.

Montserrat Planelles Iváñez
Université d'Alicante, Alicante, Espagne