

Heart of the Great Lakes – Lake Huron and the Saugeen to 1850 by Robin R. Hilborn

John C. Carter

Volume 108, numéro 2, fall 2016

URI : <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1050603ar>

DOI : <https://doi.org/10.7202/1050603ar>

[Aller au sommaire du numéro](#)

Éditeur(s)

The Ontario Historical Society

ISSN

0030-2953 (imprimé)

2371-4654 (numérique)

[Découvrir la revue](#)

Citer ce compte rendu

Carter, J. C. (2016). Compte rendu de [*Heart of the Great Lakes – Lake Huron and the Saugeen to 1850* by Robin R. Hilborn]. *Ontario History*, 108(2), 268–270.
<https://doi.org/10.7202/1050603ar>

on-the-Lake's identity and its future. As a true bookend to her work, Morgan takes time to wonder how Janet Carnochan might have reacted to the twenty-first-century version of this tourist town.

Although *Creating Colonial Pasts* is “not a monograph” (3), there are important ways in which this publication could be more like a traditional book. First, Morgan's consideration of “Southern Ontario” is mostly limited to Niagara-on-the-Lake and the Six Nations of the Grand River, with only one chapter centered on the more easterly Tyendinaga reserve. While Morgan does provide solid reasoning for avoiding local historians already covered in other studies, plus good reasons to not consider contemporary historians who lived in Ontario's large urban centres, in the end, the collection begs for a few more examples, particularly from the eastern and western reaches of the province with similar early experiences of colonial settlement. What about Franco-Ontarians who created their colonial past within the settler and indigenous considerations of the past that she explores? Morgan's examples in this volume may be “threads” (4) pulled

from her previous research, but one or two new case studies would have rounded out and strengthened her analysis in important ways. One also has to wonder why this set of reflections was published without any bibliography, when its specific purpose seeks to illuminate the significance of local historians and the local history they wrote, plus the webs of connections that fan out across the archival record.

Nevertheless, none of these shortcomings should overshadow the contribution Morgan has made in this study or her masterful writing and analysis. She aims to “examine the formation of historical memory and the use of historical knowledge in Southern Ontario...” (3) and she accomplishes this task by providing a compelling framework for analysis. More importantly, her study provides a roadmap for others to explore underutilized collections stored within the local archives across the province—eastern, western, southern, and northern—and their unexplored webs of connections.

Ross Fair
Ryerson University

HEART OF THE GREAT LAKES *Lake Huron and the Saugeen to 1850*



Robin R. Hilborn

Heart of the Great Lakes – Lake Huron and the Saugeen to 1850

by Robin R. Hilborn

Southampton, Ontario: Family Helper Publishing,
2015. 212 pages. \$40.00 hardcover. ISBN 978-0-
9809468-7-1 (www.familyhelper.net/huron)

Oh the challenges of writing a *good* local history book! I'm sure all of us have seen or even own (but simply don't want to admit we do) such weighty tomes of 400-500 pages, that tell every single

detail of the history of a township now amalgamated with another municipality. These productions are usually poorly written, have little structure, no footnotes or credits, present poor quality graphics, span impossible time periods from creation to the present, don't have an index, and rely on sketchy and second-hand research. At the other end of the scale are those slim volumes that echo most of the shortcomings mentioned above, but are so brief that one wonders how so little can be written about the history of the community documented? Fortunately Robin R. Hilborn's, *Heart of the Great Lakes*, does not fall into either of these categories.

For Hilborn, who is an Ontario author and genealogist, this current volume is a follow up to his 2010 publication *Southampton Vignettes*. He spent four years researching this second offering which covers the history of Southampton (Saugeen) up to 1850, but also includes related and relevant information about Lake Huron. This book is purposely not meant to be a definitive history. A short preface and prologue, nicely introduces the reader to a reasonable size book that is made up of four distinct parts, with twenty-six separate chapters.

Part 1 deals with the early mapmakers of Lake Huron. This section begins with Samuel de Champlain in 1616, and then proceeds to detail six other French cartographers, during the span of 1656-1744. Next the author addresses the involvement and the work of four British map makers, between the years 1788-1828.

Part 2 describes fur traders of Lake Huron and the Saugeen, beginning with the North West Company and the Hudson's Bay Company, and also includes information about American, Metis and independent fur traders. Useful thumbnail sketches of sixteen fur traders and seven short descriptions of local fur trade merchants are

then provided. Ending this section, the author focuses on the founding of the Saugeen outpost, and provides readers with details about the annual fur trade activity at Saugeen, between the years 1826-1832.

Part 3 concerns the Saugeen Ojibway and their inter-action with missionaries. It includes material on the rise of the Methodist church in Upper Canada, the arrival of Peter Jones to the Saugeen Ojibway people in 1829, John Benham's stay between 1831-33, and the missions of Thomas Hurlburt in 1834-36 and George Copway (Kahgegagahbowh) from 1843-45. Hilborn also provides information about Paul Kane and his sketches at Saugeen, the development of Methodist Day Schools, and issues related to religion, education and literacy, the impacts of assimilation, the numerous encroachments by white settlers, farmers and land speculators, and the resulting devastation that they had on the original inhabitants.

Part 4, entitled the Fishing Islands, is to me the best section in this book, and certainly currently the most topical. It follows up on previous research and writing by Victor P. Lytwyn, Peggy J. Blair, Donald B. Smith and Peter Schmalz. Hilborn adds to the existing body of knowledge regarding the interaction between the Saugeen Ojibway and white entrepreneurs, over fishing and fishing rights. This portion of the text starts with details about the arrival of European businessmen and their founding of the commercial fishing industry at the islands owned by the Saugeen Ojibway. This venture began with Alexander McGregor, and then was followed by initiatives undertaken by Tiger Dunlop, William Cayley, William Kennedy and John Spence. The author argues that these men all tried to make their fortunes on commercial fishing and failed, and in reality their presence "spelled the end of thousands of years of bountiful fishing" by succeeding

in devastating these fish stocks.

Seven chapters in this section describe matters such as fishing for food or profit, the involvement of various white entrepreneurs between 1831-56, the rise and fall of numerous fish companies, legal issues between local First Nations, governments and white fishermen, and the rise of Southampton as a commercial fishing hub. The final chapter also provides intriguing details about regulating the fishery, encroachment, Native loss of control over their fishing grounds, a fishery decline by the 1850s, and the survey and eventual sale of the Fishing Islands after 1900. A very brief epilogue serves as a conclusion.

Positive attributes of this book include a good use of mainly high quality graphics, maps, photos and drawings that compliment the text, the inclusion of an extensive bibliography of 320 titles (many available in digital format) used in the research and writing of this study, and an useful and thorough fourteen page index, which of-

ten is neglected in other local histories.

The author has chosen to invent his own method of identifying sources, including footnotes, image credits and bibliographic references. I find that Hilborn's personal creation is somewhat confusing, and strongly believe that a more familiar, standard and recognized format should have been used. In addition, the Epilogue=Conclusion, is very brief and should be expanded upon and made more substantive in future editions of this work.

When all is said and done, Robin Hilborn has done an excellent job of writing a *good* local history, an example that could be used as a model for other aspiring local history authors. In the future, I look forward to him producing an additional volume, which will chronicle Southampton's history from 1850 to the present.

Dr. John C. Carter, Research Associate
History and Classics Programme, School
of Humanities, University of Tasmania

Kensington Market

Collective Memory, Public History, and Toronto's Urban Landscape

by Na Li

Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2015. 144 pages. \$22.95 paperback ISBN 9781442616219. \$55.00 cloth ISBN 9781442648173. \$22.95 ebook (EPUB) ISBN 9781442616387. (www.utppublishing.com)

For over a century, Toronto's Kensington Market has served as a receiving area for successive waves of immigrants to the city. Unapologetically scruffy and eclectic, the market holds special value for Torontonians as an early site of inclusiveness and diversity. It is remarkable both for the changeability of its storefronts, and its persistence as a distinct and clearly-bounded commercial district within the city.

These themes of continuity and change

receive detailed exploration in Na Li's *Kensington Market: Collective Memory, Public History, and Toronto's Urban Landscape*. Li applies her training in urban preservation planning to examine the resilience of the market neighbourhood through decades of internal change and external development pressures. Drawing upon a wide body of research, including interviews conducted over three years with market business operators and residents, Li ex-