Urban History Review Revue d'histoire urbaine

URBAN HISTORY REVIEW
REVUE D'HISTOIRE URBAINE

Gilje, Paul A. *The Road to Mobocracy: Popular Disorder in New York City, 1763-1834*. Chapel Hill, North Carolina: University of North Carolina Press, 1987. Pp. xviii, 315. Maps, figures, tables, 19 plates and index. \$32.50 (U.S.)

Reginald C. Stuart

Volume 17, numéro 1, juin 1988

URI : <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1017707ar>

DOI : <https://doi.org/10.7202/1017707ar>

[Aller au sommaire du numéro](#)

Éditeur(s)

Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine

ISSN

0703-0428 (imprimé)

1918-5138 (numérique)

[Découvrir la revue](#)

Citer ce compte rendu

Stuart, R. C. (1988). Compte rendu de [Gilje, Paul A. *The Road to Mobocracy: Popular Disorder in New York City, 1763-1834*. Chapel Hill, North Carolina: University of North Carolina Press, 1987. Pp. xviii, 315. Maps, figures, tables, 19 plates and index. \$32.50 (U.S.)]. *Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine*, 17(1), 51-52. <https://doi.org/10.7202/1017707ar>

busts in private sector activity (notably residential construction) are typically more extreme than those in the public sector. As a result, the sectorial composition of building activity varies systematically over time, with public uses most significant during depressions. Since cities grow outwards, we might expect that rings that were developed during the depressions are likely to contain a higher proportion of public uses, including parks. Whitehand presents evidence to suggest that such has often been the case, and argues that it can readily be explained in terms of the operation of the land market (Chapter 3).

Within this overall context the author argues that the timing of building cycles, and the particular details of urban morphology, depend, in part, on changes within the building sector itself (materials and technology) and, in part, upon innovations in methods of trading and manufacturing, transportation and the public regulation of land use (Chapter 4). Many issues that resist summarization are introduced under these headings. In his analysis of fringe-belt development, Whitehand further complicates the argument by showing that once a ring or district of the city has been developed under a certain (mix of) land use, a variety of forces typically conspire to keep it that way (Chapter 5). These general arguments are then elaborated by an analysis of the growth of residential districts and commercial cores (Chapter 6 and 7).

Lucid, logical and concise, *The Changing Face of Cities* provides a useful framework in which a great deal of research on city-building may be fitted. Whitehand has elucidated the linkages between long-run economic cycles, the operation of the land market, and the form of the city. To be sure, the tactic of discussing building, industry, transportation and land use planning under the single heading of "innovation" does seem rather forced. The specific issues that he discusses are certainly important, but need to be conceptualized in relation to one

another and, ideally, be incorporated into a broader socio-economic theory. Even so, the author has clarified ways in which the urban form reflects social change.

What the author has not done is to show why urban landscapes matter. Echoing Conzen, he states, in two brief paragraphs on page 2, that the fabric of the city helps us to orient ourselves in space and time, and that it has intrinsic aesthetic value. These assertions are reasonable enough, but they are surely not exhaustive and, when stated so baldly, will not convince any but the converted. If we are to study urban landscapes in that way, and in the detail that Whitehand recommends, we must know more about the effect of the landscape on the way people live. We need anatomies of the urban cadastre. But to understand fully how cities develop, the flesh of interpretation must be put upon these analytical bones.

Richard Harris
Department of Geography
University of Toronto

Gilje, Paul A. *The Road to Mobocracy: Popular Disorder in New York City, 1763-1834*. Chapel Hill, North Carolina: University of North Carolina Press, 1987. Pp. xviii, 315. Maps, figures, tables, 19 plates and index. \$32.50 (U.S.).

Urban history often seems less a clearly defined field than a controlled locale to study familiar themes. Recent works on ante-bellum American cities, for example, have explored partisan activity, social structure, ideology and community building. Paul Gilje's reworked dissertation on popular disorder plays against New York City's general socio-economic backdrop from pre-revolutionary disturbances to the time of Andrew Jackson.

Gilje argues that New York City is a case study in America's departure from 18th century conceptions of a corporate society. In the late colonial period, the ruling class

condoned riots that defended community values. Mob violence, therefore, had a limited, ritual quality. But by the 1830s Americans viewed society as collectivity of interests. Individualism and a competitive market economy dissolved the corporate ideal. Ethnic, religious, racial and class antagonisms in an impersonal city had replaced the intimacy of colonial times. Riots now exposed ugly, even murderous impulses. Gilje suggests that America's republican experiment to balance order and individual rights tilted towards order, as urban authorities quelled disruptions forcibly through the use of police powers. With the loss of social consensus, public disorder became a species of crime that expressed the particular interests of those perpetrating the disturbance.

The author effectively uses his sources to plot riots on city maps and produce lists of participants. He also traces, where possible, the social composition of the mobs and their purpose, as well as neatly categorizing the various disorders. His colourful recreations evoke cobblestone culture, whether dealing with the colonial ritual of the charivari, riots precipitated by grave-robbing doctors, St. Patrick's Day brawls, or the Callithumpian New Year's parade. In other cases, national politics, racial hatred and sectarian antagonism fueled disturbances that conjure the spectre of mobocracy for city authorities.

After 1800, the middle-classes recoiled from unbridled liberty as the population of New York became increasingly pluralistic. The Irish, an almost invisible minority in 1800, dominated the "Five Points" area in Ward Six, an increasingly dangerous enclave, by 1820. Vicious brawls flared on Irish holidays as "natives" assaulted those they derided a "Paddies." The Irish even fought among themselves. In 1824, Orangemen and Catholics bashed each other in the Greenwich Village riot, foreshadowing the intolerance that came into sharp focus with the rise of the Native American Association

in 1837 and the Know Nothing Party in the 1850s.

Gilje examines the transformation of New York's social structure in relation to its experience of economic change. Although the author is not an economic determinist, recognizing the many motives behind violence in a city as diverse as New York, he devotes considerable attention to disturbances originating in labour disputes. Labor violence generated by wage and other disagreements increased by the 1820s, as did anti-enclosure riots in response to attempts by the wealthy to bar the "hoi polloi" from their estates. New York was both a microcosm and belle-weather for later national cleavages and violence, as the author notes in his closing remarks on the context of the terrible 1863 draft riots. Gilje is most effective in focussing the context of the turbulent times and the character of the rioter. He is somewhat less successful in portraying the middle-class, who branded all disturbances as threats to order, and whose economic and political power enabled them to define the limits of socially acceptable behavior.

While this is a good book, it is not without some flaws. Gilje does not deal, for example, with New York's loss of autonomy to the state government, nor does he provide a broad enough context for understanding city's ethnic strife. Finally, the references appear properly as footnotes, but the bibliography is not comprehensive. Readers must leaf through the text to locate relevant secondary sources or see Gilje's historiographical references.

At the same time, however, this lively analysis exploits neglected and familiar sources - city directories, court records and newspapers - with care and imagination. Gilje has a firm grasp of the literature relating to multiple aspects of urban history, including republican ideology, partisan politics, mob action, urban change and social stratification. He brings the city's communities and street culture to vivid life. This clearly conceived and

organized, persuasively argued, engagingly written, and generously illustrated book expands our understanding of urban history. It provides a stimulating framework for the comparative analysis of America's complex ante-bellum urban disorder.

Reginald C. Stuart
Department of History
University of Prince Edward Island

LoRomer, David G. *Merchants and Reform in Livorno 1814-1868*. Berkeley, California: University of California Press. 1987. Pp. x, 387. Illustrations, tables and index.

The last few years have witnessed an impressive growth of scholarly interest in 19th century Italian cities and the urban middle-class. While the venerable Laterza publishing house, for instance, has launched a new series of urban histories, a group of bright young scholars led by Professor Raffaele Romanelli of the University of Pisa has been carrying out pathbreaking explorations in the social history of urban elites and the middle-class from Venice to Naples. LoRomer's study of the reform efforts of the Livorno merchant community is not only a valuable addition to this body of historical literature, but also a useful corrective to the narrowly political interpretations of the Risorgimento. The book is the result of some 15 years of archival work, writing and reflection. This time and care are clearly reflected in the depth of its research, the clarity of its conceptualization, as well as in its polished prose style.

In opening chapters, LoRomer sets the context for the reform efforts of his merchants by providing a general portrait of the economy, social structure and demographic trends of the Tuscan port city in the first half of the 19th century. He challenges the conventional wisdom that Livorno suffered a severe decline after 1814, arguing that the city's traditional commerce of deposit and

trans-shipment remained dominant largely because of the growing importance of the grain trade. The impetus for reform came instead from the general drop in price levels in the period of restoration that put new pressure on old economic and social relationships. The predominant commercial activity of the port strongly shaped the local social structure, nourishing a special community of interests that linked together members of different strata.

At the top of Livorno's social hierarchy stood the elite of merchants, who had been largely foreigners in the past. Using tax, probate and heraldic records, the author shows that in the first half of the 19th century real estate investment and acquisition of noble titles reflect their increasing assimilation into the economy and society. With assimilation came basic changes in the economic views of the merchant community, views strongly influenced by the writings of Benjamin Franklin and the doctrines of Saint-Simon. These views found institutional expression in the local chamber of commerce which formulated and articulated new concerns for the merchant community.

Gramsci's idea of hegemony provides LoRomer with the basic conceptual framework for his analysis of the economic and social reforms undertaken by the Livorno merchants in the decades after 1814. Economic concerns brought on by declining prices and profits led to demands for tariff reform, rationalization of business practices and improved transportation and port facilities. Economic reforms went hand in hand with a set of social reforms designed to reinforce patterns of deference and to inculcate merchant norms and values in the masses. Accordingly, the commercial elite strongly supported schools of reciprocal instruction and kindergartens to help socialize the city's labouring classes, as well as popular savings banks to encourage thrift.

Although the merchant community did succeed in building effective alliances with