

Myers, Tamara. *Caught: Montreal's Modern Girls and the Law, 1869–1945*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2006. Pp. 345. Illustrations, photographs, charts

Jane Nicholas

Volume 37, numéro 2, printemps 2009

Downtowns, Past and Present

URI : <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/029581ar>

DOI : <https://doi.org/10.7202/029581ar>

[Aller au sommaire du numéro](#)

Éditeur(s)

Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine

ISSN

0703-0428 (imprimé)

1918-5138 (numérique)

[Découvrir la revue](#)

Citer ce compte rendu

Nicholas, J. (2009). Compte rendu de [Myers, Tamara. *Caught: Montreal's Modern Girls and the Law, 1869–1945*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2006. Pp. 345. Illustrations, photographs, charts]. *Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine*, 37(2), 66–67. <https://doi.org/10.7202/029581ar>

Tous droits réservés © Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine, 2009

Ce document est protégé par la loi sur le droit d'auteur. L'utilisation des services d'Érudit (y compris la reproduction) est assujettie à sa politique d'utilisation que vous pouvez consulter en ligne.

<https://apropos.erudit.org/fr/usagers/politique-dutilisation/>

érudit

Cet article est diffusé et préservé par Érudit.

Érudit est un consortium interuniversitaire sans but lucratif composé de l'Université de Montréal, l'Université Laval et l'Université du Québec à Montréal. Il a pour mission la promotion et la valorisation de la recherche.

<https://www.erudit.org/fr/>

immigrant neighborhoods ease the economic integration of new Canadians and the area's ethnic businesses and restaurants, as Martha Radice argues, can acquaint Canadians with immigrant cultures, albeit superficially. Similarly, contentious debates over expression of ethnicity in the public sphere are not inevitably negative. Instead, Carolle Simard, in her chapter on the place of ethnic minorities in Canadian politics, asserts that the struggle for visibility is a key component of the political integration of ethnic minorities. It is, in fact, as Annick Germain, Laurence Liegeois, and Heidi Hoerning contend, sometimes necessary in order to establish an equitable social order. Further delineating the arguments brought forth in previous essays, Valerie Preston territorializes the question of ethnic visibility, comparing the establishment of an Asian shopping mall in Sydney, versus its rejection in Toronto. Underscoring the role played by the municipal, provincial, and federal governments, Preston concludes that in Australia, Chinese immigrants were positively perceived at every level of government, unlike in Toronto, where the municipal authorities were hostile to their claims in spite of Canada's overall positive reception of the Hong Kongese. In short, the authors bring to light the complex nature of the question of ethnicity in the public space, the milieu where the receiving society constructs its relationship with the minorities in its midst.

Emphasizing the multiple meanings of ethnicity, a function of not only ethnic origin but also, for example, social class, age or sexual orientation, and the multiple identities and forms of belonging that a territory can embody, Xavier Leloup's final essay is a fitting conclusion to this collection. A must read for academics looking for the latest research on ethnic studies, this book, nevertheless, could have benefited from an analysis of the ethnicity, and its relationship to space, of the two French and English majority groups. Because, indeed, as *Les nouveaux territoires de l'ethnicité* illustrates, the dynamic between individuals and their milieu is no longer necessarily a question of majority versus minority in a given space, but instead, extends to the many different social, economic, political, cultural and global forces that define our society today.

Amanda Ricci
Université de Montréal

Myers, Tamara. *Caught: Montreal's Modern Girls and the Law, 1869–1945*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2006. Pp. 345. Illustrations, photographs, charts.

Tamara Myers' *Caught* is a complex and fascinating study of female juvenile delinquency in Montreal. Myers explores how "*les jeunes filles modernes* were integral to the development of Quebec's juvenile justice system" (4). In doing so, Myers analyzes both the system and the women 'caught' in it, while highlighting Montreal's ethnic and religious diversity. Drawing on an impressive amount of research, anchored by over one thousand case files on female juvenile delinquents, Myers has produced a compelling and richly textured study of delinquency in relation to the particularities of Montreal.

The book focuses on three interrelated themes informing the discursive construction and lived experiences of young, female delinquents, which are taken up to varying degrees in seven chapters. First is the legal structure and apparatus that constructed and attempted to define and regulate juvenile delinquency from 1869 to 1945. Throughout this period Myers demonstrates that everything from what brought girls in front of the court to their 'treatment' was informed by particular discourses of femininity and often shaped by ideas of sexuality. Myers begins the study with the 1869 Acts respecting Industrial and Reformatory Schools, which were part of the reformatory impulse concerned with neglected children and intimately connected with the Catholic religious orders and notions of nation-building influenced by the Catholic hierarchy. Subsequent provincial government policy produced the Montreal Juvenile Delinquents' Court (MJDC) in 1912, which had sole responsibility for juvenile cases until another court was established in Quebec City in 1940. While focused on child-saving during the early decades of the twentieth century, Myers demonstrates that the court was deeply gendered and maternalistic in its response to delinquency, relying on various court prescribed 'surrogate mothers' who worked as female probation officers or who worked in the Catholic Soeurs du Bon Pasteur reform school or the Protestant Girls' Cottage Industrial School. During the interwar years, however, the court moved to an increasingly professional model helped along by female Jewish probation officers who rejected the maternalist focus. The study ends with girls' violent revolts in Montreal's two reformatories in 1945 and 1946.

Myers is keenly aware of the relationship between *les jeunes filles modernes* and the city of Montreal in the early to middle decades of the twentieth century, which is the period of focus for most of the study. The second theme is the emergence of and reaction to modern girls in Montreal, who like modern girls around the world, were born of the urban, industrial landscape and marked out significant generational differences in regard to public presence and private behaviour. Familial strife over daughters' roles and expectations in a changing urban context was an important component in the delinquency cases. Young, working class women's purported susceptibility to the urban environment and its commercial amusements increasingly informed discourses of female delinquency, and working class girls made up the majority of cases in the juvenile court. For the delinquent girls in Myers' study, it was often their experiences with low-paying work in the city (with its accompanying opportunity for cheap amusements) that brought girls increasingly out from the watchful eyes of traditional authorities and resulted in clashes with parents or guardians and eventually the juvenile court. Notions of female delinquency were also caught up in wider social and cultural anxieties related to changes in femininity and visibility as well as issues related to the maintenance of the French-Canadian family and nation. Young women, who perhaps fit too well with urban modernity, became fodder for critics who turned the female delinquent into a "social problem and metaphor." (59) Myers argues that the girls' age, gender, and familial unruliness, combined with their independence as

both workers and consumers, was often understood in sexual terms by a cast of medical and legal authorities. Unchaperoned on city streets, girls engaged in a host of behaviours that parents, guardians and other adults disapproved of and frequently labelled immoral. As a result, the body and sexuality also played key roles in understanding both female delinquency and girls' individual cases. In addition to the multifaceted relationship between modern girls and the city that brought 'delinquents' to the attention of the court, Myers also discusses other issues of interest to urban historians including the geography and architecture of domesticity in two Montreal reformatories.

Lastly, Myers teases out some of the experiences of girls labelled delinquents and manages to illuminate some aspects of their lives, despite the methodological limitations of reading case files. These stories are often heartbreaking and, while the girls themselves remain elusive historical characters, Myers' sensitivity to reading these case files for the possibility of recovering aspects of their experience adds an important dimension to the book. In chapter 6, for example, Myers investigates the MJDC's, female probation officers', and medical experts' readings of the sexual histories of 'sex delinquents,' and delineates moments of agency where girls advocated for themselves in a system that sometimes saw them paradoxically as both defenceless and the problem. In regard to the sexual histories, Myers finds that the stories varied from romance narratives, to tales of seduction, to horror stories of rape and incest, but that in telling their histories, the girls sometimes found ways to defend and explain their 'delinquent' behaviour. As Myers argues however, class and gender structures as well as the court's desire to uphold patriarchal familial control meant that girls' often precarious family position was downplayed in favour of punishing "errant female sexuality" (202).

This is an excellent book. Myers has managed to tell an immensely complex tale in an engaging way. For this reason and others, the book will appeal to urban historians in the Canadian field and beyond as well as to cultural, social, and women's historians.

Jane Nicholas
Lakehead University

Penfold, Steve. *The Donut: A Canadian History*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2008. Pp. 256. Illustrations, photographs, notes, index. ISBN: 978-0-8020-9797-2; Paper: 978-0-8020-9545-9.

This review begins with a warning: reading this book will make you hunger for a donut. And not just any donut, but those gloriously crunchy, deep fried, cinnamon-sugar coated 'old-fashioned' donuts associated with grandma's home cooking in the past and carnival donut wagons today. Not to worry; the craving recedes by Chapter 3.

In *The Donut*, Steve Penfold details the history of one of contemporary Canada's most cherished cultural icons. He weaves

the story of the donut's rise to fast food fame and fortune with an in-depth exploration of the social, cultural and economic trends which influenced donut production and consumption over the last half century in Canada. The author makes extensive use of primary evidence collected through interviews with donut shop franchisees and patrons and secondary source material gleaned from newspaper clippings, industry reports, and company promotional materials.

The history of the donut is, at least for a time, part of the story of the city: the product of industrialization and standardization processes, increasing urbanization, our infatuation with car culture, and the desire for social affiliation and 'time out' space. Early donut shops located on busy thoroughfares and in suburban strip malls, taking advantage of features of mass transportation such as bus and subway stops, and characteristics of industrialized labour such as shift workers seeking a place to decompress before heading home or truck drivers looking for a 'break along the way.' More recently, as the donut and coffee habit took hold among consumers, the donut shop has reached out into rural Canada as the small town proved itself capable of financially supporting a donut franchise.

Although the book as a whole is well-structured, the most interesting chapters are 2 to 4. In Chapter 2, Penfold relates the history of the coffee and donut shop in Canada. This discussion is nicely contextualized in terms of, first, the influence of the automobile and 'convenience culture' on the urban landscape and consumption practices, and, second, other 'drive-in' businesses of the time. For those residents of central Canada of an age to remember the era, the author's description rings true, but who of us can recall that ice cream, fried chicken, and hamburger joints vastly outnumbered the lowly donut shop in the so recent past? Penfold makes effective use of industry and government statistics to illustrate the growth of the industry from a position of relative insignificance to one where today in Canada Tim Horton franchises out number McDonald's franchises.

A discussion of the franchise as a business form takes place in Chapter 3. Here, the author paints a nuanced and well-informed picture of the tension inherent in the franchisee's position—in need of the franchisor's business expertise but resisting the control of 'head office.' The author identifies the appeal of the franchise to immigrants and blue collar workers desirous of an entrepreneurial opportunity which they hoped would lead to financial independence and upward social mobility. He takes care to note also the gendered division of labour that so often occurred. As someone familiar with the management issues of donut franchise operation throughout the 1980s, I felt the author's discussion of the 'trouble with bakers,' that is, of attracting and retaining semi-skilled labour, was only too accurate.

Chapter 4 moves closer to contemporary times, as the author discusses the national expansion of the donut chains. The donut industry appears 'recession proof' as it weathers the difficult economic times of the late 1980s and early 1990s. Key to the donut shop's expansion during the 1990s was