
Karyn Huenemann

LGBTQ+ Print Culture: Overviews and Perspectives
L’imprimé LGBTQ+ au Canada et ailleurs : bilans et perspectives
Volume 57, 2019

URI: https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1069865ar
DOI: https://doi.org/10.33137/pbsc.v57i0.33785

See table of contents

Publisher(s)
The Bibliographical Society of Canada/La Société bibliographique du Canada

ISSN
0067-6896 (print)
2562-8941 (digital)

Explore this journal

Cite this review
https://doi.org/10.33137/pbsc.v57i0.33785
that it refers to a database and not to another book (akin to *Illness as Metaphor*) (121). Short explanatory references and phrases within the discussion would ensure that the reader does not trip into unrelated lines of thinking and have to backtrack. One wonders whether the production of *Reading Popular Newtonianism* itself may be a factor: if discursive footnotes in the manuscript were converted to endnotes for Miller's book, more re-arrangement and rewriting of text had to occur to achieve readability after publication.

Unfortunately, this elliptical stylistic tendency is accentuated by lengthy quotations from literature either with unanalyzed overt metaphoric allusions (132-3) or with belaboured explanation of the obvious (66-7). As well, something discussed by Miller too often “gestures,” tending to increase a modern reader’s sense of having to look elsewhere for the necessary background or interpretation. Discussion also frequently connects this study to its subject authors in ironic ways: unlike Newton, its prose is not “lucid” (76), and its integration of image and text does not allow “for greater ease of reading” (49); but perhaps similar to Algarotti, its “signaling would alert those who were only interested in [book history] to skip ahead” (113).

Perhaps the analysis of books borrowed from a late eighteenth-century library in New York will inspire similar studies to expand our knowledge of the spread of European science in a formative period in North America. Otherwise, *Reading Popular Newtonianism* unfortunately is likely to disappoint book historians.

JENNIFER J. CONNOR

Memorial University of Newfoundland


On September 17, 1888, “Miss Sarah [sic] Jeannette Duncan (Garth Grafton) of the Montreal *Star* left Brantford”\(^2\) for a journey “round the world the wrong way around” (175). During their travels, she

---

and fellow Canadian journalist Lily Lewis contributed articles to the *Montreal Daily Star* and *The Week* (Toronto) respectively. Duncan’s submissions—which became the novel *A Social Departure: How Orthodocia and I Went Around the World by Ourselves* (1890)—launched her career in the international literary community. Edited by Linda Quirk and Cheryl Cundell, Tecumseh Press’s critical edition of *A Social Departure* (2018) contains excellent supplementary material that situates the novel within its nineteenth-century transnational socio-historical context, providing a valuable resource for scholars of early Canadian literature.

The editorial introduction begins with Duncan’s journalistic career, which led to the publication of *A Social Departure*. The transformation of Duncan’s articles into a novel signalled her transition from Canadian journalist into “a best-selling novelist of international stature” (3), providing her with a forum in which to express her views on issues such as women’s rights, international politics, and cultural difference. Like Duncan’s signature ironic wit, these themes appeared in Duncan’s early journalism and later novels as well, but it is with *A Social Departure* that they were first presented to an international reading public. As Quirk points out, “the trip itself serves as a platform upon which to explore the insights that may be gained from cultural displacement. The ethnographic element in Duncan’s first novel is an important element in many of the novels that follow it” (7).

The introduction, supporting documents, and critical analyses included in this edition provide readers with new insight into the themes Duncan explores. The supporting documents present comments on the illustrations in the original edition, as well as a discussion of editorial decisions made by Quirk. The “List of Selected Writings by Sara Jeannette Duncan” itemizes the original articles published in the *Montreal Daily Star*, five of which are provided in full, along with two articles written by Lily Lewis on their journey. The incorporation of some of F. H. Townsend’s original illustrations into the main body of the Tecumseh edition contributes to an authenticity, a feeling of the era in which the text was written, although personally I would like to have seen more of them: of the original 111, only 24 are reproduced. The five critical articles by a number of specialists in early Canadian literature address issues of genre, theme, biography, and bibliographic detail.

In the first critical article, Denise Heaps positions *A Social Departure* (understandably) as “women’s travel writing,” a genre popular at that
Within that genre, *A Social Departure* stands out for its ironic juxtaposition of society’s expectations of demure maidenhood with Duncan’s more strident representation of women’s capabilities. Heaps describes Orthodocia, the narrator’s British travel companion, as “a bundle of feminine conventions and prime fodder for Duncan’s travel satire … a female ‘foil’ to the narrator” (463). The two travellers form an “ambivalent combination of feminist grit and unthreatening, fumbling femininity” (468–69).

Emily Bruusgaard’s article on “Dress and *A Social Departure*” also discusses how Duncan’s narrative “afford[s] the reader significant insights into the constrictions, challenges and attitudes faced by Victorian women travellers” (475). She identifies the conflict, not just the narrative irony, in Duncan’s representation of her characters—especially Orthodocia—which is suggestive of Duncan’s own conflicted position vis-à-vis feminism and femininity. Bruusgaard’s analysis succeeds in convincing us that “SJD’s wry commentaries on dress are anything but frivolous” (475).

In their discussion of “Japanese Food in *A Social Departure*,” Caroline Lieffers and Aya Fujiwara delve into the cultural customs surrounding food—procuring, preparing, serving, consuming—the “complex social and physical space in which cultures meet” (486). Lieffers and Fujiwara present a cogent investigation into the characters’ growing cultural awareness, as exemplified in their conflicted response to Japanese food etiquette: “Japan challenges the Western women’s assumptions about what constitutes correct behaviour … By putting her travellers in intimate, complex, and deeply unfamiliar social situations, Duncan finds the best comedy not in mocking the Japanese, but in upending Western superciliousness” (502).

Peggy Martin’s biography of “The ‘Real’ Orthodocia,” based partially on her full-length biography of Lily Lewis, reveals how different Orthodocia was from Duncan’s real travel companion. As Quirk points out, the fictional Orthodocia had a “less complex gender identity” (4) than Lewis, who was far from naïve. As Martin points out, as an “educated scholar,” a “talented impressionist” (512), and experienced journalist in her own right, Lewis would not have made a successful narrative foil for *A Social Departure*’s narrator. Like Duncan, Lewis was, in the words of Misao Dean, an

---

“independent, thinking woman [who] consciously challenges the conventions of everyday life as a woman.” While their journey and articles launched Duncan into an international career, Lily Lewis’s life was fraught with troubles. Martin’s short critical biography helps readers to understand the different sensibilities of these two early Canadian journalists.

The final critical article is Eli MacLaren’s explication of the publishing history of *A Social Departure*, which is significant in understanding Duncan’s success as a novelist. Part of the justification for a new edition of *A Social Departure* is that it was the most widely read of Duncan’s novels; while exact numbers cannot be determined, it “probably sold over a million copies” (535). The reason for this, MacLaren explains, is that easy access to American pirated editions ensured a far greater reading audience than after the Copyright Act of 1891: “the copyright-liberated popularity of her first [two] books thus became her passport to literary sovereignty … Piracy was a factor in the making of Sara Jeannette Duncan” (522). MacLaren’s careful bibliographic description of all known editions of *A Social Departure* will thrill literary biographers and is a valuable contribution to the current edition.

Writing in 1915, Marjory MacMurchy describes Duncan’s book of travel as exemplary of the genre. It was “so fresh, so delicate, so airy, so pungent, so full of delicious humour, [that it] found thousands of friends and admirers.” *A Social Departure* was the first—and some say best—of novels in which Duncan “explores life on the margins as an artist, as a woman, and as a colonial. Whether as a journalist or as a novelist,” Quirk has convinced us, “Duncan is at her best when she explores these points of cultural intersection and negotiation” (7).

KARYN HUENEMANN
Simon Fraser University
