Perceptions of Hochelaga-Maisonneuve Neighborhood in Montreal: A Textual Analysis of Written Media
Les perceptions du quartier Hochelaga-Maisonneuve à Montréal : une analyse textuelle de la presse écrite

Sylvie Paré and Sandrine Mounier

Volume 7, Number 1-2, 2020

URI: https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1079405ar
DOI: https://doi.org/10.18192/clg-cgl.v7i1-2.4848

Article abstract

Many authors have documented the increasing diversification and gentrification in central city neighbourhoods. In the last few decades Montreal's, Hochelaga-Maisonneuve is among those with the highest rates of gentrification, creating new social dynamics and often generating socio-territorial conflicts. What is the significance of social changes for the population of Hochelaga-Maisonneuve? What role does recent immigration play in the mitigation or development of social conflict? In this paper we present the results of the analysis of 1,420 articles taken from the six principal daily newspapers published in Montreal. In our target neighbourhood, it would appear that a higher socio-economic status of newcomers is more disruptive than their ethno-cultural background because it is associated with a change in the way people live, shop and interact in public space. The data also reveal disruptive effects on the availability of affordable housing, a feature that means increasing displacement of lower income populations.

Sylvie Paré et Sandrine Mounier
*Université du Québec à Montréal*

**Abstract:** Many authors have documented the increasing diversification and gentrification in central city neighbourhoods. In the last few decades Montreal’s, Hochelaga-Maisonneuve is among those with the highest rates of gentrification, creating new social dynamics and often generating socio-territorial conflicts. What is the significance of social changes for the population of Hochelaga-Maisonneuve? What role does recent immigration play in the mitigation or development of social conflict? In this paper we present the results of the analysis of 1,420 articles taken from the six principal daily newspapers published in Montreal. In our target neighbourhood, it would appear that a higher socio-economic status of newcomers is more disruptive than their ethno-cultural background because it is associated with a change in the way people live, shop and interact in public space. The data also reveal disruptive effects on the availability of affordable housing, a feature that means increasing displacement of lower income populations.

**Keywords:** ethnic groups, diversification central city neighbourhood, gentrification

**Résumé:** Nombre d’auteurs ont documenté l’accroissement de la diversification et de la gentrification dans une variété de quartiers centraux. À Montréal depuis les dernières décennies, le quartier Hochelaga-Maisonneuve figure parmi ceux qui enregistrent les scores les plus élevés en matière de gentrification, créant ainsi de nouvelles dynamiques sociales et souvent, générant des conflits socio-territoriaux. Que signifient alors les changements sociaux dans la population de Hochelaga-Maisonneuve? Quel rôle l’immigration récente joue-t-elle dans l’apaisement ou le développement de conflits socio-territoriaux. Dans cet article, nous présentons les résultats d’analyse de 1 420 articles tirés de six quotidiens importants de la presse écrite de Montréal. Dans le quartier visé, il semble que le statut socio-économique élevé des nouveaux venus est plus dérangeant que leur appartenance ethnique parce qu’il est associé au mode de vie de cette population, leur mode de fréquentation des commerces et l’interaction dans l’espace public. Les données montrent aussi que les effets perturbateurs quant à la disponibilité de logements à prix abordables, une caractéristique qui signifie plus de déplacement de la population à faible revenu.

**Mots clé:** groupes ethniques, diversification des quartiers centraux, gentrification

Sylvie Paré is a Full Professor at l’Université du Québec à Montréal in Urban and Tourism Studies. Email: pare.sylvie@uqam.ca

Sandrine Mounier is a PhD candidate at l’Université du Québec à Montréal in Urban Studies. Email: mounier.sandrine@courrier.uqam.ca

*Culture and Local Governance / Culture et gouvernance locale, vol. 7, no. 1-2, 2020. ISSN 1911-7469*

Centre on Governance, University of Ottawa, 120 university, Ottawa, Ontario, Canada K1N 6N5
Introduction

In the age of neo-capitalist globalization (Dufour and Robitaille, 2011), that is, the socio-historical process leading to a more global economy, and the constant increase of international migration to Canada, our research examines an urban phenomenon of the utmost social and cultural importance: the socio-economic and ethnic transformation of central city neighbourhoods. Since the 1950’s, several Montreal neighbourhoods began a process of ethnic diversification, whereby, an unequal distribution of newcomers led to a concentration of several ethnic groups, including Jews, Italians, Greeks, and others in a French-Canadian or English-Canadian context. The neighbourhood of interest, Hochelaga-Maisonneuve, is mainly working class French Canadian, and is just starting to experiment with ethnic diversification.

Following the research traditions of various social sciences on the gentrification and increasing diversification of Western cities, we propose to explore the following question: what do immigrants and their descendants contribute to the changing face of economic and social transformations affecting central city areas? What kind of representation does the mainstream written media project about the Hochelaga-Maisonneuve neighbourhood and what are the impacts?

Our paper focuses on identifying the actors involved and their perceptions of Hochelaga-Maisonneuve’s transformation. We seek to identify both those actors promoting increased ethnic diversity and gentrification and those who oppose this two-pronged movement. We are currently conducting two types of preliminary analysis. First of all, using Canadian Census data, we are performing a descriptive analysis of the changes observed in one of Montreal’s central city neighbourhoods, Hochelaga-Maisonneuve, colloquially referred to as HoMa by newcomers. Secondly, we are conducting a documentary analysis of textual data provided by the newspaper media (Le Devoir, La Presse, Journal de Montréal, Journal Métro, 24 Heures, The Gazette). Our goal in this part of our program of research is to determine of the critical actors involved in promoting or resisting the changes documented in our descriptive analysis, together with the impact of journalistic reporting on the creation of public image attached to this specific neighbourhood.

Objectives

It has often been noted that the transformation of central neighbourhoods leads to both the homogenization and to relatively high levels of social exclusion (Zukin, 1995; 2008; Harvey, 2005). Our research seeks to discover the mechanisms by which socio-ethnic and socio-economic factors are intertwined in the residential transformations occurring in central cities, the results of which should interest not only the scientific community but also provide greater understanding for political actors at both the municipal, provincial and federal levels. We have established the following objectives:

1) identify the critical actors involved in residential transformation, the manner in which they are organized and their relationships with one another;
2) ascertain and measure the mechanisms related to residential mobility both within Hochelaga-Maisonneuve and on its periphery;

3) discover how current (previous) residents and new arrivals represent and appropriate urban space and explore tensions between these two representations;

4) identify the role of international immigrants in these processes of socio-ethnic and socio-economic transformation.

**Background**

As a result of more than thirty years of deindustrialization, and the acceleration of local, national and international mobility, many urban centers have been degraded and impoverished. However, some were transformed dramatically by an urban economy which adapted well to both local and global market competition, in addition to which their housing stock enjoyed significant upgrading (Zukin, 1995; 2008). Some underwent important revitalisation projects, becoming considerably more diverse in terms of ethnicity as a result (Savitch and Kantor, 2002; Sassen, 2011; Scott and Storper, 2014). According to Atkinson and Bridge (2013), gentrification has taken on a more global scope. Other authors have argued that gentrification needs to be examined by taking into account multiple socio-demographic variables, such as socio-economic class, ethnicity and gender (Zuk and al., 2015; Lees and al., 2016). At the same time, central cities have entered the age of diversity (Wood and Landry, 2008, p.7). Some central city neighbourhoods in Montreal have undergone these types of changes, one example of which is Hochelaga-Maisonneuve.

Historically, Hochelaga-Maisonneuve\(^1\) played an important role in the industrial structure of Montreal, having had multiple manufacturing facilities within its boundaries. It was an industrial area where workers, who lived near their place of work, could find rental housing at reasonable prices and eventually purchase modest homes. According to a study by the CMHC in 2016, it continues to be an area where young people, with or without children, can find housing they can afford near the city center. Hochelaga-Maisonneuve is recognized as an area undergoing gentrification (Sénécal and Vachon, 2016; Maltais, 2016) despite that its local population has remained relatively stable, a feature which tends to insulate against the radical transformation of other surrounding neighbourhoods that have become highly multi-ethnic in character (Apparicio and al., 2006). In the perceptions of most people however, Hochelaga-Maisonneuve remains a largely French-Canadian\(^2\) (Québécois) neighbourhood.

Nonetheless, the data indicates that this neighbourhood has undergone significant transformation, not only in terms of such socio-economic variables as education and household revenue, but also around the diversity of the population’s ethnic origins, specifically second or third generation descendants. There has also been an increase in recent immigrants\(^3\) like Haitians, Moroccans, French and Mexicans. In fact, the rate of increase of recent immigrants in Hochelaga-Maisonneuve exceeds that of the island of Montreal as a whole (Centraide, 2012; Statistics Canada,
2006; 2016), although its overall ethnic diversity is far from that observed in other boroughs such as Saint-Laurent or Parc-Extension.

Several social scientists have investigated the social dynamics of gentrification within city cores. McClintock (2018) explored how the phenomenon of “ecogentrification” in the case of Portland has two types of effects: direct, such as increased housing costs; and indirect, such as the loss of identity of the living environment (housing costs, change in the supply of shops). These changes often lead to socio-territorial conflicts in both public and private space. Zukin (1995; 2008) showed the ways in which gentrification functions as a mechanism of exclusion and accentuates existing social divisions. In contexts where racial and ethnic divisions exist, even if the precariousness of low-income groups does not depend in the early stages on ethnic origin or race, conflicts are often perceived in ethnic or racial terms. According to Polat (2018), gentrification can aggravate negative perceptions and inter-ethnic conflicts, affecting not only relations between new residents and former residents, but also relations between long-term residents. In the neighbourhood of Hackney in London where many people of Turkish, Vietnamese and Orthodox Jewish origin live, as well as new residents classified as hipsters⁴, Wessendorf (2013) stressed that intergroup tensions are not necessarily related to ethnic origin, but often to social class. In contrast, in Halifax, Gosse and al. (2016) observed that most residents perceived changes in their neighbourhood as neutral or for the better (economic, social and cultural changes). However, economic advantage, sense of belonging and age have an impact on perceptions of change.

In Montreal, research was conducted in several neighbourhoods, notably the Centre-Sud, the Plateau Mont-Royal, Mile-End, and included the first signs of gentrification in Hochelaga-Maisonneuve. Twigge-Molecey (2014) reported the negative effects of increased housing costs due to displacement of the long-settled population in the Mile-End, a topic around which others have outlined two aspects that deserve particular attention. Firstly, this phenomenon is driven by individuals attracted by an “authentic” urban lifestyle in a central city neighbourhood, who purchase and renovate their house or condo, a bottom-up process which improves the area architecturally increasing its desirability (Rose, 1984; Sénécal and Vachon, 2016). Secondly, the neighbourhood itself is promoted by a series of top-down decisions as public policy makers and their cultural partners, entrepreneurs, real estate agents, local associations of commercial business leaders and community activists intervene in order to advance their economic and/or social objectives (Cossette, 2013; Rose and al., 2013; Bernier, 2016).

The process of gentrification increases tensions between the original residents and the newcomers with respect to the nature of the neighbourhood and the use of both private and public space. For example, Bélanger (2010) and Twigge-Molecey (2014) have shown that while the cohabitation of these two groups appears peaceful, many original residents find themselves obliged to move toward unaffected areas of the neighbourhood or other boroughs, in part because of the increasing cost of rental housing. In addition, interaction between the two groups remains minimal and the original residents criticize the transformation of their way of life. This is particularly true of the elderly who, feeling that they are being pushed out from their places of camaraderie and socialization such as public parks and local commerce, tend to retreat to the safety of their homes.
At the same time, marginalized groups such as itinerants, prostitutes and the unemployed, are more or less driven from the neighbourhood by the concerted action of private and public authorities (Morin and al., 2008; Margier, 2013; Chabot-Demers, 2016). Consequently, while gentrification apparently entails a dynamic of social exclusion, both scientific and journalistic publications suggest that at least in the early stages of the process, central city neighbourhoods undergoing socioeconomic transformation also face problems of social diversification and social conflict between existing residents and the newcomers (Morin and al., 2008; Rose and al., 2013; La Presse, 2016).

Independent of the gentrification problem, a number of research projects have looked at dynamics related to socio-ethnic transformations in Montreal’s neighbourhoods. These studies showed that immigrants are more evenly dispersed throughout the city and its suburbs than were immigrants of previous generations (Germain and Poirier, 2007; Leloup, 2015). While the distribution of ethno-cultural groups in the Montreal area has never given rise to ghettos or high levels of segregation (Apparicio and al., 2006), most neighbourhoods have become multi-ethnic in character and generally more cosmopolitan (Germain and Poirier, 2007; Radice, 2016). Other studies have suggested that ethnic diversity has always influenced the morphology of urban neighbourhoods in Montreal, not only during the settlement of previous waves of European immigration (McNicoll, 1993; Germain and al., 2012) but also more recently, as immigrants from all over the world have added signatures of their presence, most notably marking the urban landscape with ethno-cultural, neighbourhood businesses (Paré, 2008; Manaï, 2015; Lejeune, 2012).

While the central city neighbourhoods have become more diversified and the newer ethno-cultural groups have left their mark on local commercial businesses, studies have shown that inter-ethnic relationships are generally characterized by indifference and/or indulgence, as would normally be the case in any urban situation of close proximity between groups (Germain and al., 1995; 2014). At the same time, the expression of ethnic differences in public areas generates a certain degree of reticence and questions concerning the appropriation of public space by certain ethnic groups (ethnic shops, hijab). While it is widely recognized that the increased ethnic diversity of the central city neighbourhoods of Montreal has been a relatively peaceful process compared to other cities where segregation/ghettoization has been much more normative (Massey and Denton, 1989; Massey and Tannen, 2018; Apparicio and al., 2006; Hiebert, 2015), research has shown that it is important to remain vigilant with respect to the latent tensions between different ethnic groups and between these groups and the French Canadian majority (Bouchard and Taylor, 2008; Paré, 2009).

It is with respect to these previous observations as reported in the literature that our research seeks to explore the mechanisms by which Hochelaga-Maisonneuve as a central city neighbourhood is being simultaneously transformed by both gentrification and increased ethnic diversity. Not only does the literature on the transformation of Montreal’s central neighbourhoods testify to this fact, but US reports have noted that immigrants have participated in the revitalization of similar neighbourhoods in several ways: buying and renovating available housing, forming community organizations to fight criminal activity, developing a variety of community services, buying
commercial stores and creating new innovative businesses, some of which exploit economic niches which were previously abandoned or neglected (Vigdor, 2013; Hiebert and al., 2015). The contribution of immigrants is thus multifaceted and contributes to the economic well-being not only of specific neighbourhoods but to the city as a whole.

In terms of the research on more gentrified neighbourhoods in Montreal, it has been observed by Lavoie and Rose (2012) that senior citizens in La Petite-Patrie were more frequently concerned about transformations associated with ethnic diversification rather than gentrification although Canadian Census data suggests that gentrification in this neighbourhood has proceeded more rapidly than the growth in ethnic diversity. This perception could be linked to the emergence of ethnic entrepreneurship and a minority place of worship in the neighbourhood at the same time that spaces associated with the French Canadian identity have disappeared (bingo, church).

Given the literature review, a variety of research questions are important to consider around the transformation of the Hochelaga-Maisonneuve neighbourhood, focusing on economic (gentrification) and social (diversity) factors. How have immigrants participated in these changes? When the gentrifying group is composed of immigrants, does this accentuate tensions between the various groups? Do these tensions change the image of the Hochelaga-Maisonneuve neighbourhood perceived by its inhabitants, but also its reputation outside? If so, how does the media report these tensions and participate in the transformation of the image of the neighbourhood?

In this paper, we focus on the role of the media in furthering or inhibiting the process of gentrification in Hochelaga-Maisonneuve. In an era characterized by hyper-communication (traditional and social media), the use and manipulation of the media may play a significant role in urban development and the transformation of its central areas. Their constant presence contributes to the construction of urban images and social relationships (De Rudder, 1990; El Yamani, 1997; Benali, 2007; Brown-Saracino and Rumpf, 2011). Even though journalistic reporting often presents stereotypes and reproduces popular prejudice, the press may modify the reputation of a neighbourhood by either presenting negative images or on the contrary, positive ones. Consequently, they contribute to the creation of a symbolic geographic frontier between the social reality actually lived by its residents and the collective representations of that reality. Our study of the press explores this link between the representation of Hochelaga-Maisonneuve by the media and the transformations actually occurring in this neighbourhood. One of the more common collective representations of Hochelaga-Maisonneuve evokes an image of poverty and criminality because there have been massive employment losses, an impoverishment of the population, deterioration of the built environment, drug trafficking and wars between juvenile gangs.

Nonetheless, in an era where gentrification is a common phenomenon in central city neighbourhoods, Hochelaga-Maisonneuve has proven to be an attractive destination since the 1990s. It has undergone an urban revival and demographic transformation both due to the installation of middle-class residents (gentrification) and to the increasing heterogeneity of the population in terms of ethnic origin. These transformations have created some tension between groups and a certain degree of socio-territorial conflict which have been widely reported in the media.
Methods

In order to describe the complexity of the phenomenon under study, our research selects a methodological approach that is both quantitative and qualitative. The first issues considered in this paper focus on two sources. On the one hand, we exploited the data provided in the censuses of Canada (2006 and 2016) to illustrate ongoing social and ethnic transformations both temporally and geographically. The variables of income, level of education, type of household, age, gender, immigration status, visible minority status, ethnic origin and mother tongue were processed in both tabular and cartographic manners, permitting us to better identify the sections of the borough most affected by these processes.

On the other hand, we conducted documentary analysis of the coverage of Hochelaga-Maisonneuve by the French and English newspaper media over a period of 8 years (2010 to 2018). The goal has been to better understand the public image of the neighbourhood, in particular with respect to increasing diversity as well as to identify the main actors involved in the process of residential transformation. To populate our database, we searched databases such as Eureka (24 Heures, Le Devoir, Le Journal de Montréal, Métro and La Presse) and Proquest (The Gazette) using the words “Hochelaga-Maisonneuve” or “HoMa”. Covering the six sources, we found 5 200 articles. After eliminating repetitive dispatches (less than 200 words) and articles which dealt with very general subjects (politics, elections, weather, etc.), we retained 1 420 articles for analysis (Table 1).

Table 1. Daily Media Sources Referencing “Hochelaga-Maisonneuve” or “HoMa”, 2010-2018

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sources</th>
<th>Total articles</th>
<th>Relevant Articles</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>24 Heures</td>
<td>582</td>
<td>183</td>
<td>12,9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Le Devoir</td>
<td>773</td>
<td>287</td>
<td>20,2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Gazette</td>
<td>335</td>
<td>182</td>
<td>12,8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Le Journal de Montréal</td>
<td>1 278</td>
<td>240</td>
<td>16,9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Métro Montréal</td>
<td>746</td>
<td>197</td>
<td>13,9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>La Presse</td>
<td>1 039</td>
<td>331</td>
<td>23,3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>5 200</td>
<td>1 420</td>
<td>100,0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

To study the role of the press, we examined all articles published by six Montreal daily newspapers. In order to discover the common themes and symbolic representation by the media we developed a qualitative, textual analysis of the data. Five phases of the analysis include:

- An inductive approach based on either the summary or the first paragraph of each article. This research permitted us to identify key words such as gentrification, poverty, revitalization or vandalism which repeated throughout the corpus.
We used N’Vivo to search for these key words and other frequently associated words. This procedure lead to two different types of results, the first offering more specific associations with a key word, e.g., the key word ‘commerce’ is often defined as a restaurant or boutique; the second lead to the emergence of words which were grouped together to suggest a theme or more general concept, e.g., commercial and economic development;

The study of these key words and derived themes led to the development of a series of definitive themes and their sub-classes;

Once the themes and their sub-categories were defined, we then counted the number of articles in which each was mentioned and the number of mentions per article. Consequently, a single newspaper article often mentioned more than a single theme or sub-theme, a feature which gave rise to the total number of articles in the sub-themes being greater than the total number in each theme;

Given the qualitative nature of the N’Vivo results and as a means to enrich the discussion, we presented a certain number of citations to illustrate the data presented in our tables.

In this paper we present three types of analyses derived from this methodology. The first focusses on positive and negative symbolic representations of the neighbourhood; the second on ethnic and social class dimensions and the third on social tensions.

**Socio-demographic description**

Hochelaga-Maisonneuve is a neighbourhood which is part of the Mercier-Hochelaga-Maisonneuve borough, located in the south-eastern part of the Island of Montreal (Figure 1), the fourth largest in terms of population in 2011 with 136 024 inhabitants (Statistics Canada, 2016)².

![Figure 1. Location of Hochelaga-Maisonneuve Neighbourhood on Montreal Island.](image)
Population growth was relatively weak between 2006 and 2016 (+3.6%) with, however, a strong increase in single-person households while those with children decreased (+14.5% versus -2.6%). At the same time, the median income of individuals increased by 40% as shown in Figure 2.

The area is largely francophone (French Canadian by origin), with 85% of its population speaking only French at home. Immigration has increased more rapidly in this borough (25%) compared to the rest of the City of Montreal (17%), as is shown in Figure 3 for each of the census tracts. In an area where French Canadians used to be entirely dominant, the latest data revealed that 16.3% of the population was born in another country, half of whom arrived the last ten years (51.5%). The most important countries of origin are, in order, France (20%), China, Morocco and Algeria with approximately five percent each of the immigrant population. Viewed in terms of the percentage increase of immigrants from any given country during the ten year period, immigration from Haiti increased by 178% and from Mexico by 84%. In addition, 17% of the population is now comprised of “visible minorities”. Again, the most important growth from 2006 to 2016 was among immigrants identifying as Black (35%), Latin-American (19%) and Arab (17%).

To give the reader a general idea of the socio-demographic changes in the target area between 2006 and 2016, we present in Table 2 the increase or decrease of selected variables for each of the census tracts included in our study. The data is color-coded to indicate higher levels of the increase of each variable (black), medium (gray) or low (light gray).
The data reveals a rapid change in the socio-ethnic diversity in the neighbourhood. On the other hand, it reveals that some areas are more impacted than others. Particularly, we observe not only higher increases of immigrants, visible minorities and persons who do not have French for their first language, but also higher increases of income and persons who have a university degree in sectors located in the center and the north of the neighbourhood (14.01, 15.00, 22.00, 25.00 and 26.00). Some of these sectors are located around the place Simon-Valois and the Maisonneuve Market.
(denoted by the ovals in Figure 3), two public spaces which have undergone important revitalization projects these last twenty years (Figures 4 and 5).

![Figure 4. Place Simon-Valois, 2018. Source: Zerini-Le Reste 2018.](image)

![Figure 5. Place du Marché-Maisonneuve Source: http://www.vanishingmontreal.com/2014/09/more-on-maisonneuve-market-plus-sur-le.html](image)
In summary, the transformations have not been uniform throughout the Hochelaga-Maisonneuve neighbourhood. Residents with highly contrasting socio-demographic profiles rub shoulders and social tensions are sometimes felt. We will now examine how this is treated in the newspapers.

**Thematic analysis of newspaper articles**

The image of Hochelaga-Maisonneuve neighbourhood

To better understand the image of Hochelaga-Maisonneuve neighbourhood, we classified the words and the text passages in different categories and subcategories that present either positive or negative representations. To begin with, it should be noted that any single newspaper article may present both positive or negative views of the current state of this neighbourhood; similarly, any given article may present more than one dimension of what we view as a negative or positive appreciation of Hochelaga-Maisonneuve. Consequently, the total of the subcategories is always greater than the overall index of positive or negative comments; likewise, the total of positive and negative comments is greater than 100%. It should also be noted that the majority of written media articles presented quite polarized opinions because almost three-quarters of the articles present only negative or positive representations (72%). The remainder presented a more nuanced, balanced and analytic view of the situation. Given these caveats, we present in Table 3 the results of our N’Vivo analysis.

**Table 3. Classification of Data Derived from Media Sources, Positive and Negative Images, Hochelaga-Maisonneuve, 2010-2018**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Negative Images</th>
<th>Number of articles</th>
<th>Positive Images</th>
<th>Number of articles</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Vulnerability</td>
<td>939</td>
<td>66.1%</td>
<td>879</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Criminality</td>
<td>606</td>
<td>42.7%</td>
<td>Art and Culture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Insecurity</td>
<td>420</td>
<td>29.6%</td>
<td>Economic/Cultural Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Tensions</td>
<td>335</td>
<td>23.6%</td>
<td>Urban and Residential Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>278</td>
<td>19.6%</td>
<td>Community Development</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

N = 1 420

Generally speaking, the data reveals there were a greater number of articles presenting a negative image of our target neighbourhood (66.1%) than a positive image (61.9%). In terms of negative images, the vulnerability of the neighbourhood appears the most important, referring largely to the continued presence of poverty, unsanitary housing conditions, prostitution and drug use. As an example of this category, an opinion piece published in *Le Devoir* put it this way:

Tenants lose their apartments, others do not eat adequately while some breathe mold, because they can’t afford the exorbitant rent being demanded. Many people live on the street or rent unsanitary lodging at exceptionally high prices, where the pawnbroker acts as a king and master. (Our translation)⁷
Criminality is another facet of the neighbourhood’s reputation for 29.6% of newspaper articles, notably crime, violence and drug-trafficking. In a related way, the third theme classified amongst negative representations is insecurity (23.6%), associated alongside such terms as fear, danger and concern. Finally, we identified that one fifth of the samples deal with social tensions (19.6%), a category related to vandals and vandalism, conflict and controversy, in particular around the development of commerce catering to the newcomers.

On the other hand, data from media sources also show positive representations of the Hochelaga-Maisonneuve neighbourhood. The main theme is art, culture and recreation (33.5%), connected to words such as artist, festival and heritage. Then, two similar themes emerged from the analysis: economic and commercial development, as well as urban and residential development (27.7% and 25.4%). The first involves terms related to the appearance of boutiques, and other types of neighbourhood investment and entrepreneurship while the second refers to urban planning, neighbourhood revitalization and real estate development (condominiums). One example of the latter is this quote concerning the attractiveness of the Maisonneuve area:

Morgan Avenue is an urban architectural jewel in the neighbourhood. The Morgan family from the department store of the same name, as of the Dufresne family in the same era, promoted the « City Beautiful » movement, creating large avenues and mansions built of grey stone that gave the best architectural landmarks to the neighbourhood. (Our translation)

The last theme is associated with community identification and development (17.8%), such as the name of a local organization, local events and collective kitchens and/or gardens.

These results reveal a complex portrait of Hochelaga-Maisonneuve. While a segment of the data exposes deep-rooted social difficulties, another shows a more optimistic atmosphere. A number of these articles illustrate the important changes taking place in Hochelaga-Maisonneuve, including the following citation:

What a hell of a neighbourhood, Hochelaga-Maisonneuve! A venue of social encounters (and juxtapositions) of different worlds: the bourgeoisie in their thirties, workers and people on social welfare who cross one another and look up or look down at each other. In any case, the new commercial businesses are principally meant for the first and not the second. (Our translation)

Consider also the following which was published in La Presse:

**HoMa against Hochelag, the Clash of Two Different Worlds.**

Extreme transformation. Resist it or embrace it. (alternatively: Love it or hate it) Either way, one can be certain Hochelaga-Maisonneuve has undergone an extreme transformation in the last 20 years! Hochelag used to be synonymous with poverty and social welfare. Hochelag, the former Hells Angels turf, has been transformed
into a mixed neighbourhood where fine bakeries neighbour with Dollarama discount stores, and the rich who drive BMWs neighbour with the poor who can barely pay a bus ticket. Sometimes, even on the same little section of a street. (Our translation)

Ethnicity and Social Class

In order to examine the contribution of ethnicity to the image of Hochelaga-Maisonneuve, we searched the data set using indicators of immigration status, ethnic origin, visible minorities\(^{11}\) and religion\(^{12}\). We also searched the data set for terms associated with social class such as poor, rich and gentrification. In Table 4, we observed that only 9.2% of the newspaper articles make reference to an ethnic type variable; on the other hand, 23.5% refer to social class. In addition to the presentation of this data, we also reported the number of times each set of terms was referenced in the selected articles. For example, Table 4 shows the set of terms referencing Islam and its adherents was only mentioned in 3% of the articles; however, these terms were used nine times on average in each article. In general, terms dealing with ethnic factors appear more frequently in newspaper articles than those referring to social class.

### Table 4. Compilation of data related to ethnicity and social class, Hochelaga-Maisonneuve, 2010-2018

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social Class</th>
<th>Number of articles</th>
<th>Citations per article</th>
<th>Ethnic variables</th>
<th>Number of articles</th>
<th>Citations per article</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The poor, poverty</td>
<td>146</td>
<td>10.3%</td>
<td>Immigrants. new arrivals</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>3.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disadvantaged</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>6.3%</td>
<td>Muslims. Islam</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>3.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Embourgeoisement, anti-embourgeoisement</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>6.2%</td>
<td>French Canadians. French-speaking</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>2.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gentrification, anti-gentrification</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>4.9%</td>
<td>English Canadians. English-speaking</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>1.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The rich, well-off</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>4.1%</td>
<td>(Ethnic) Origins</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>1.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Socially mixed</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>2.0%</td>
<td>Social Integration</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>1.0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* N = 1 420

Two important conclusions can be drawn from Table 4. First of all, neither indicators of social class nor ethnicity are dominant themes in the newspaper citations under study. In fact, social class variables are present in only 23.5% of the newspaper articles and ethnicity in only 9.3%. Stated otherwise, 76.5% did not mention the social class variables presented in the table and 90.8% did not refer to the set of ethnic variables retained for analysis. Secondly, we can tentatively conclude that social class factors were approximately 2.5 times of greater interest to journalists than were the ethnic characteristics of the residents of Hochelaga-Maisonneuve.
Within the category of Social Class, poverty, the poor and the disadvantaged were more often the subject of newspaper articles (16.6%) than the twin themes of gentrification and its French equivalent, “embougeoisement” (11.2%). Given that newspaper articles focus less frequently on ethnic variables, none of the categories emerging from the analysis are very prevalent, presenting in fewer than 3.2% of the articles under study.

It would appear then the question of poverty remains a dominant theme in Hochelaga-Maisonneuve, a factor which is picked up and/or amplified by journalists throughout this period. As we can also see from Table 5, we observed very few citations related to growth in immigration in the neighbourhood or increased ethnic diversity, neither of which appear to intersect with social class.

 [...] the district’s relatively affordable property prices and proximity to downtown Montreal have also attracted developers, who over the last several years have been putting up a handful of modern condominiums. All of these factors combined have led to an influx of new residents to HoMa. “Its population is a mix of working-class Quebecois, students, and recent immigrants from Europe and Asia,” Tiffanie Rothwell said. “It has truly become a culturally rich home for families, couples, seniors, professionals, as well as investors looking to capitalize on the neighbourhood’s growing demand.13

Julie Gagnon recently moved into Hochelaga-Maisonneuve. She likes the neighbourhood because it is both cool and affordable. The rents are still lower than those for similar housing on the island of Montreal. Hochelaga-Maisonneuve still has a strong French-speaking majority, but over the past twenty years, its immigrant population has tripled, in particular Latinos, Haitians and Africans. (Our translation)14

With continued gentrification, ethnic factors may become more important but currently, access to decent housing, good schools and quality food seem to be priorities:

For the past 40 years, Hochelaga–Mai sonneuve has tried desperately to regain its former glory. Originally prosperous and working class, this Montreal neighbourhood became a ghetto of poverty and crime at the beginning of the 1980’s [...] The problem of Hochelaga, is not one of the mixing of social class or gentrification, but the vicious circle of poverty and misery. It is not at all the new wealth that is destroying this neighbourhood but the very visible distress of a segment of its population. (Our translation)15

That being said, a time-based analysis using the number of articles published in each year (Figure 6) shows a spike in both the number of ethnic-related newspaper articles and the total number of articles for the year 2015. This was largely the result of a project for a Muslim community center operated by a “controversial” Imam. Although the center was located just in Mercier, very close to its border with Maisonneuve, we can safely assume that this case impacted the image of the whole
borough of Mercier–Hochelaga-Maisonneuve. During 2015, nearly a quarter of the newspaper articles used a term related to ethnicity (24.2%). Since then, such articles have not exceeded ten percent; indeed, most articles published during this latter period refer specifically to the fact that this is largely a French-Canadian neighbourhood.

![Figure 6. Selected Themes in Newspaper Articles by Year of Publication, Hochelaga-Maisonneuve, 2010-2018](image)

**The actors of social tensions**

To identify the main actors of social tensions and how they are represented, we isolated and examined the subset of articles referring to this theme. First, as observed previously in Table 3, the data reveals that terms related to vandalism are dominant in the theme of social tensions (284 citations in 5.6% of the sample). “Vandals” are identified as groups who fight against gentrification.

The hooligans who vandalized businesses in the Hochelaga-Maisonneuve neighbourhood last Sunday night have claimed responsibility on a website promoting anarchist ideas. ‘Montreal Counter-Information’. The group says they are fighting against the process of gentrification in the neighbourhood. (Our translation)

Similarly,

In HoMa or Saint Henri we have seen vandalism by radical groups opposed to gentrification. They do not want shops selling fine products or more expensive
restaurants - they perceive these as ‘fine cheese for bourgeois mice’. They fear the ensuing increase of the cost of rental housing. (Our translation)\(^{17}\)

Data presented in Table 5 shows that vandals are described as anarchists, radicals, anti-capitalists and people adhering to radical left ideologies. They target new local businesses because these “trendy” shops are blamed for altering the cheaper, traditional commercial offerings like Dollar Stores or Tim Horton’s coffee shops.

Table 5. Compilation of Data Related to Social Tensions, Hochelaga-Maisonneuve, 2010-2018

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Vandalism</th>
<th>Number of articles</th>
<th>Citations per article</th>
<th>Social Class</th>
<th>Number of articles</th>
<th>Citations per article</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Business, commerce</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>24.5%</td>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>Gentrification</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Condos</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>11.2%</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>Poor, disadvantaged</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Housing</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>6.1%</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>Renters</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anti-gentrification</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>7.2%</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>Rich, well-off</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anarchists</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>5.8%</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>Artists</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Radicals</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>2.9%</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>Students</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anti-capitalists</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2.5%</td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>Couples</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Radical Left</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1.4%</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>Young professionals</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

N= 278

Table 5 also makes clear that the issue of housing is at the heart of these conflicts. Activists denounce rental housing conversions and new condominium developments. They pressure public officials to prioritize affordable housing.

Gentrification is a phenomenon denounced by community organizations and which produces vandalism in its wake. The important increase in the number of condos in Hochelaga-Maisonneuve is one aspect of gentrification. (Our translation)\(^{18}\)

For better or for worse, Hochelaga-Maisonneuve is changing, and gentrifying. Some would like to see it become the new Plateau Mont-Royal, but the neighbourhood resists. Cheap condos are appearing in the landscape, but the newcomers would rather renovate the beautiful Victorian houses in the neighbourhood, relegating the poor to live in small apartments with 3 ½ rooms, since there is no social housing. How long will the rich and the poor be able to live together like this? (Our translation)\(^{19}\)

Furthermore, data shows that social tensions in Hochelaga-Maisonneuve are typically represented as a class struggle between the new and long-term residents. To illustrate (and perhaps exaggerate) the differences between the two groups, some articles use sensational titles like: difficult cohabitation, two solitudes, HoMa versus Hochelag, the clash of two worlds, etc. The long-term
residents are associated with the old-working-class, low income and tenant status, the newer with a more privileged social class: artists, students or young professionals. While the second settle in the neighbourhood and develop a new economy, the former have difficulty fitting into the new reality:

Therefore, it is that the neighbourhood of my birth, working class Hochelaga-Maisonneuve, pursues its transformation from a poor to a hip place. I worry about this. At turn of the new millennium, the established residents were happy to see the neighbourhood come back to life after its factories had closed in the 1980’s. But then people began to grumble: “Hey, will there still be place for us?” Gentrification, in spite of its charms, tends to empty working class neighbourhoods of their lower income residents, replacing them with a young, professional middle class seeking an authentic urban experience, hip businesses, and above all, cheap rent. (Our translation)

The dimension of “identity” is the most complex. In fact, all neighbourhoods inevitably change over time, just like the whole society. Newcomers arrive with their own habits of consumer spending, which transforms the offerings of commercial services to suit their needs. This explains why students, who themselves are not very rich, may be considered ‘gentrifiers’ … The area changes, slowly but surely. One can understand the discomfort created among the original residents who see the marketing gurus of the real estate industry go so far as to change the name of their neighbourhood, now called HoMa, the eldorado of hipster families living alongside the Green metro line. (Our translation)

Place Valois is probably where the two planets of the neighbourhood come closest to touching one another. On this lovely public place, shaded by trees and surrounded with high class businesses, live a variety of very different people: some elderly people are driving their motorized wheelchairs; a salesperson of L’itinéraire, a journal produced by former homeless people; carelessly dressed young people who reek of marijuana; just beside, hipsters with big-rimmed glasses are eating $8 sandwiches from the Arhoma bakery; and now, this properly-dressed couple on their way to a hip bar or restaurant in the neighbourhood. [...] In spite of this diversity, some militant groups think, that Place Valois is a symbol of huge failure. “The place [Valois] has been the epicenter of gentrification”. (Our translation)

Absent from Table 5 are the topics of immigration and increasing ethnic diversity as sources of social tension, not surprising given the overall lack of importance of these factors as revealed in Table 4.

**Discussion and conclusion**

Studies that aim to understand transformations of central city neighbourhoods usually focus on gentrification and too often ignore the ethnic factor that accompanies and/or drives that transformation (Zuk and al., 2015). This exploratory research is an attempt to contribute to the
advancement of knowledge in the field of socio-ethnic relations in the city, by examining Hochelaga-Maisonneuve, where gentrification has been progressing since the 1990’s and more so in the past ten years.

The Hochelaga-Maisonneuve borough has experienced both phenomena: gentrification and a recent, rapid rise in immigration. Socio-territorial conflicts such as vandalism and attacks on commerce have emerged since 2008 and have intensified over time. The majority of the population is of modest French-Canadian working-class origin, a feature that contrasts markedly with the newcomers who purchased condominiums built in the last ten to fifteen years. The different groups do not shop at the same stores or have coffee in the same kind of venues (for example, Starbucks vs Tim Hortons). To a certain extent, this resembles a “social segregation” of public space and housing.

From a cursory appraisal of our media literature, it would appear the main actors cohabitate peacefully, to varying degrees, within a complex system of social and ethnic relations (Juteau, 2015; Glick Schiller and Çağlar, 2016), both formal and informal. While some actors defend those who need reasonably priced housing and good quality schools for their children, a small group of activists try to frighten newcomers to “avoid more gentrification”. Newcomers are comprised of young urban professionals and families, seeking affordable housing in Hochelaga-Maisonneuve. The process of gentrification is supported by the borough of Mercier-Hochelaga-Maisonneuve, and the mayor encourages new business owners to remain in the borough despite vandalism by some activists.

Both gentrification and ethnic diversification are likely to contribute to physical transformations of the city’s human landscape. The presence of Muslim women with hijabs, people from the Indian subcontinent and Haitians are part of the new face of Hochelaga-Maisonneuve, their adopted place of living. When these types of changes occur in neighbourhoods, they are frequently accompanied by tensions of representation and appropriation of space (Lavoie and Rose, 2012; Germain and al., 2014). For the moment however, our data does not indicate that this is an important factor in Hochelaga-Maisonneuve.

The next phase of our research will include interviewing the main actors involved in the transformation of our neighbourhood. We will develop a brief questionnaire for those using certain public spaces, commercial areas, etc. which should permit us to better appreciate the relative contribution of ethnic diversification and social class to socio-territorial conflicts in Hochelaga-Maisonneuve.

---

1 The abbreviation HoMa references similar neighbourhoods in San Francisco (SoMa—South of Market) and New York (SoHo—South of Houston).

2 In its sociological definition.

3 Recent immigrants” means 5 years and under, according to Statistics Canada.

4 Young adults living mainly in gentrified parts of a city.

5 We discovered that the geographical limits of Hochelaga-Maisonneuve may vary from one source to another. This could have an impact on the number of articles found.
Hochelaga-Maisonneuve represents approximately one-third of the residents of the borough (47,835 inhabitants).

References


