

Canadian University Music Review Revue de musique des universités canadiennes

CanMus Documents 1 - Hymn Tunes in Canada, John Beckwith, ed. Toronto: Institute for Canadian Music, 1987. 165 pp.

0-7727-8550-3

CanMus Documents 2 - Hello out There!, John Beckwith and Dorith Cooper, eds. Toronto: Institute for Canadian Music, 1988. 197 pp. 0-7727-8551-1

CanMus Documents 4 - Three Studies. Toronto: Institute for Canadian Music, 1989. 194 pp. 0-7727-8554-6

Gordon E. Smith

Volume 11, Number 2, 1991

URI: <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1014204ar>

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.7202/1014204ar>

[See table of contents](#)

Publisher(s)

Canadian University Music Society / Société de musique des universités canadiennes

ISSN

0710-0353 (print)

2291-2436 (digital)

[Explore this journal](#)

Cite this review

Smith, G. E. (1991). Review of [*CanMus Documents 1 - Hymn Tunes in Canada*, John Beckwith, ed. Toronto: Institute for Canadian Music, 1987. 165 pp. 0-7727-8550-3 / *CanMus Documents 2 - Hello out There!*, John Beckwith and Dorith Cooper, eds. Toronto: Institute for Canadian Music, 1988. 197 pp. 0-7727-8551-1 / *CanMus Documents 4 - Three Studies*. Toronto: Institute for Canadian Music, 1989. 194 pp. 0-7727-8554-6]. *Canadian University Music Review / Revue de musique des universités canadiennes*, 11(2), 148-154. <https://doi.org/10.7202/1014204ar>

Now that this laudable tenth volume of early Canadian music published by the Canadian Musical Heritage Society is at hand, one can hope that the special gala concert (11 July 1990) by the National Arts Centre Orchestra, Victor Feldbrill, conductor, which launched this publication and included all but the MacMillan work will be rebroadcast by the CBC or otherwise be made available as an audible realization of this intriguing music.

Jack Behrens

CanMus Documents 1 – Hymn Tunes in Canada, John Beckwith, ed. Toronto: Institute for Canadian Music, 1987. 165 pp. 0-7727-8550-3

CanMus Documents 2 – Hello out There!, John Beckwith and Dorith Cooper, eds. Toronto: Institute for Canadian Music, 1988. 197 pp. 0-7727-8551-1

CanMus Documents 4 – Three Studies. Toronto: Institute for Canadian Music, 1989. 194 pp. 0-7727-8554-6

The three volumes discussed in this review were published under the auspices of the Institute for Canadian Music which, together with the Jean A. Chalmers Chair of Canadian Music, was established in 1984 at the University of Toronto through the generosity of the Floyd S. Chalmers family. Since its inception, the Institute has initiated and sponsored extensive work in such areas of Canadian music as musicology, ethnomusicology, composition, music education, and performance. The first occupant of the Chalmers Chair was John Beckwith, who retired from the position in 1989. Beckwith was a perfect choice to run the Institute and hold Canada's first chair in Canadian music. He was (and is) well known as a composer, educator, administrator, pianist, and scholar, and, in 1984, he was recognized for his contribution to Canadian music when he was named "Composer of the Year" by the Canadian Music Council. Although he has retired Beckwith remains an active spokesperson and promoter of Canadian music.

Since it was established in 1984, the Institute has organized several conferences on topics pertaining to Canadian music. Two of these conferences took place in 1986, the International Year of Canadian Music: "Sing Out the Glad News: Hymn Tunes in Canada" was held in February, and "Hello Out There! Canada's new music in the world, 1950–85" was held in November. The Proceedings of both conferences are published respectively in *CanMus Documents 1* and *CanMus Documents 2*.

The first conference took the form of seven paper presentations, a concert, and displays. That conference was a continuation of Beckwith's work on hymnody

in Canada which resulted in an anthology of 310 hymn tunes published as Volume 5 of *The Canadian Musical Heritage*. Regarding the relevance of the conference topic, in the preface to *CanMus 1* Beckwith notes the words of a colleague, Timothy Rice: "... the choice of Canadian hymnody as our first topic was appropriate, uniting by its grass-roots' character scholars in several disciplines—among them church history, historical musicology, and ethnomusicology – and focusing attention on a repertoire that is just as basic in Canada as in other countries" (p.1). Beckwith expands upon the appropriateness of the conference theme in the inaugural article of the proceedings entitled "On compiling an anthology of Canadian hymn tunes." Noting that "the musical aspects of Canadian hymnody have received far less notice than the literacy or church-history aspects," he proceeds to survey hymn-tune sources through a 130-year period beginning with the early 19th century. With scholarly thoroughness Beckwith studies musical, textual, and comparative details in a series of examples. Of note is his position throughout the article that this repertory is an important part of Canada's musical heritage. As he concludes: "We have recently stopped tearing down our old buildings. Could we also stop throwing away our old hymn tunes?" (p. 29).

Following this historical review, there are six articles on specialized subjects. Two of these deal with hymn singing in native cultures. In her study of hymn singing among the Northern Athapaskan Dogrib Indians, Elaine Keillor proposes that within this culture there is a hymn singing tradition which combines elements of Christianity with indigenous ones. Keillor builds her thesis on a discussion of missionization processes, on the examination of publications, and through her own field work (two trips in 1984). In her paper, Beverley Cavanagh studies the performance of hymns in three Eastern Woodland and Indian communities (Iroquois, Micmac, and Naskapi-Montagnais). Through examination of the literature, historical and recent, Cavanagh, like Keillor, points to the high level of syncretism which is the result of the encounter between native cultures and Christianity. Further, through comparisons of such performance practice elements as social and religious contexts for hymn singing within the three cultures, Cavanagh argues that perhaps "interpretations of native hymnody as products of missionization" should be re-evaluated, and that "...it would seem that native hymody must be regarded not as a linguistic adaption of Euro-American traditions but as a unique one shaped by its own context" (p. 55). Cavanagh's article is based on her own field work (Nasakpi-Montagnais) and that of two of her colleagues in the S.P.I.N.C. (Sound Producing Instruments in Native Communities) research project now near completion, Franziska von Rosen (Micmac) and Sam Cronk (Iroquois).

Nicolas Temperley's article on the second edition of Stephen Humbert's *Union Harmony* (1816) and J. William Lamb's on Alexander Davidson's *Sacred Harmony* (1838) are detailed accounts of two of the central sources of 19th-century Canadian hymnody. The *Union Harmony* was one of the first music publications in Canada (the first edition from 1801 has never been located) and is the earliest surviving Canadian book of hymn tunes. Temperley's article grew out of a research project at the University of Illinois. The subject of the project is a Hymn Tune Index which, when completed, will contain all printed sources of tunes associated with English-language hymns, wherever published, from the Reformation to the year 1820. Published in 1816, the second edition of *Union Harmony* is the only Canadian source that falls within that time frame. Temperley describes the methodology of the index and analyses the provenance of the source's contents from textual and musical viewpoints thereby placing the source in a continental perspective: *Union Harmony* is a hybrid source built on a combination of American and Canadian roots. Temperley maintains, however, that the *Union Harmony* was not just "an offshoot of an American publishing house put into Canadian covers," but that Humbert "chose the contents to suit his own purposes, not simply taking over the contents of some American tunebook wholesale" (p. 59). His examination of provenance details from the source's repertory demonstrates this fact.

In Lamb's article on *Sacred Harmony* this author emphasizes that this source "was probably the most widely used tunebook in Canada in the mid-nineteenth century" (p. 91). Along with discussions of publication details, the provenance of the book's title, and biographical information on Alexander Davidson, Lamb describes the source's Methodist context. As a church historian, Lamb sheds new light on an important, relatively unknown source, but he concludes that further study could include a musicological investigation which would trace the source's musical origins and its impact on the Canadian musical scene.

Stephen Blum's paper on the fuguing tune in British North American demonstrates the pervasiveness of this genre in the Maritimes and Upper Canada in the 19th century. Along with studying various settings of fuguing tunes in Canadian hymn tune books, Blum also emphasizes the importance of the social element in their performance. Further, as in Temperley's study of Humbert's *Union Harmony*, Blum's article is useful in that the author establishes the Canadian perspective of his subject.

In the final article of *CanMus I*, F.R.C. Clarke examines the genesis and contents of the joint hymn book of the Anglican and United Churches of Canada published in 1971. A member of the original 1963 committee, Clarke chaired the later

subcommittee on tunes. Now in use in United Churches across Canada and in many Anglican Churches, this hymnal replaced the United Church's *Hymnary* (1930) and the Anglican *Book of Common Praise* (1938). Clarke outlines committee policies on music and hymn texts and he also details the matter of Canadian content in the hymn book observing that there are forty-seven original hymn tunes by twenty 20th-century Canadian composers. Most of these pieces were written between 1935 and 1970, and many of these were written especially for the 1971 hymnal with the exception of the approximately fifty folk or traditional melodies used for hymn settings, Clarke also notes that "there are no pre-twentieth-century Canadian tunes in HB71, with one possible exception..." (p. 154). Himself a contributor to this hymnal, Clarke includes in his article an interesting paragraph on "Writing a Good Congregational Hymn Tune Today" The Clarke article is a fitting conclusion to *CanMus 1* in that it provides a 20th-century vantage point from which may be viewed the rich hymn tune tradition described in the book's preceding articles.

CanMus 2 contains the proceedings of the Institute for Canadian Music's second conference which focussed on issues pertaining to the promotion and acceptance of contemporary Canadian music. The conference theme, "Hello Out There!" "represents an expression of the isolation often voiced by Canadian composers regarding the evidently limited contact between their repertoire and the world at large" (p. 1). The conference consisted of panel presentations and discussions and three contemporary music concerts, the programmes of which are included near the end of the volume; it brought together composers, performers, scholars, administrators, media representatives, and foreign delegates. Six topic areas (The Cultural Agencies, The Media, Visitors, Criticism and Education, The Performers, and The Composers) provided the organizational framework for the conference.

In his opening remarks, Louis Applebaum recalls the International Conference of Composers sponsored by the Canadian League of Composers and the Stratford Shakespearean Festival which took place in Stratford, Ontario in August of 1960. It is Applebaum's opinion, shared by many, that this event was "a turning point in Canada's musical history" (p. 5). An organizer of that conference, Applebaum states that while many strides have been made towards disseminating Canadian music since then, progress has been slow in some areas. Many of the same problems continue to exist in 1986. Not surprisingly, one of the most conspicuous is insufficient or misdirected funding. We read in Gilles Potvin's piece on Radio Canada International, for example, that of the total RI budget of more than 16 million dollars, only 0.3% is spent on musicians (p. 61). And George Ullmann points to the decline of the Canadian music publisher,

especially since 1965; the reasons for this include lack of government funding of the performing arts, and the lack of support from concert audiences for contemporary music performances (pp. 62–63).

If, as most of the “Hello Out There!” conference participants agree, concert audiences still struggle with contemporary music, and performers still have to fight various problems surrounding the stigma of performing “Canadian” abroad, so too has there been grudgingly slow movement towards publishing accurate studies of CanMus in foreign works. John Beckwith expands on this theme in his piece entitled “A ‘Failure’ re-visited: new Canadian music in recent studies and reference works.” The “failure” Beckwith is re-visiting is the lack of (and misrepresentation of) Canadian music coverage in foreign publications which he outlined in his “PR failure” article, published in *Musicanada* in 1969. In *CanMus 2*, he updates this review. As well as bringing some improvement to his 1969 survey, Beckwith’s spotcheck reveals a number of newer inconsistencies and inaccuracies. Among the most flagrant is the perception of Canada in recent American publications on music. For example, Beckwith questions the appropriateness of the title of Charles Hamm’s excellent book, *Music in the New World* (1983) when the “‘New World’ means the United States.” Beckwith takes exception as well to John Rockwell’s *All American Music* (1984). Quoting from the end of the book’s preface in which Rockwell writes that “America stands at the forefront of the music of tomorrow,” Beckwith concludes: “For us up here in the boonies, that is the last word from Trendsville” (p. 122).

The perception of CanMus abroad on all levels, especially performance, was a recurrent theme throughout the “Hello Out There!” conference. Some presentations were based on personal observations by performers and composers (Robert Aitken, Norma Beecroft, Gilles Tremblay, Bruce Mather, and Robert Rosen), while others were based on research in a specific area (Karen Keiser, John Beckwith, David Melhorn-Boe, Catherine McClelland, and Dorith Cooper). In terms of style, *CanMus2* contains a welcome mix of scholarly and informal opinion which, for the most part, is consistent with the conference theme. Of note, however, are several important issues raised by two of the final speakers. Indirectly, Gilles Tremblay brought up the question of the English–French barrier in Canada by mentioning that the Toronto Symphony has never performed (at least to that date) a work by the late Serge Garant, a composer, who, in Tremblay’s words “...did most in this country for Canadian music, over a span of more than thirty years” (p. 174). Further, Tremblay questioned the value of self-promotion at the expense of “not knowing” the music and musicians from such countries as Hong Kong, Brazil, and Peru. He referred to the importance of “an authentic exchange” among musicians, not just between “rich countries, but

on a North–South basis.” Citing several examples, Bruce Mather took further the “not knowing” idea by questioning the timeliness of the conference’s theme: “One cannot expect Canadian music to be taken seriously in other countries when it is [still] not taken seriously by Canadians themselves” (p.180).

Unlike the first two *CanMus Documents* volumes which are published conference proceedings, *CanMus 4* contains three scholarly studies. Rebecca Green’s article entitled “Gaudeamus igitur: college singing and college songbooks in Canada” is a detailed study of a heretofore unexamined part of the Canadian musical tradition. Green was a research assistant at the Institute for Canadian Music between 1986 and 1988 and the basis for her work was the examination of over thirty songbooks from universities across Canada. She observes that the “core repertoire is found in Ontario, Quebec, New Brunswick, and Nova Scotia from a period spanning the turn of the century (1879–1928)” (p. 3). In her outline of the history of college singing, Green distinguishes between British and European roots and North American connections. She distinguishes as well between the centuries-old tradition of student songs in Europe and the more recent “North American phenomenon,” the beginning of which was marked with the American college songbook, *Songs of Yale*, in 1853. Green observes that in the second half of the 19th century, the college song gained in importance in American and Canadian universities. College songs were associated with “tradition,” which, in turn, was lined to “ancient and venerable histories.” Such attachments to the past were vital in establishing North American universities as respectable places of higher learning.

In addition to her evaluation of the tradition’s historical dimension, Green emphasizes the primary use of college songs to foster a sense of community and spirit. She also identifies themes found in the repertoire: parody, nostalgia, devotion to the university, and racism are pervasive examples. With regard to repertoire, Green notes as a distinguishing feature the inclusion of “several” French songs in Canadian collections. She continues with the hypothesis that, since no songbooks from French-language Canadian universities were found, “the phenomenon [college singing] was dependent on British influence, and the (English-language) American songbooks” (p. 47). This statement should be questioned given that the “phenomenon” – French-language college songbooks in Quebec (the province with the oldest university in Canada) – was pervasive in the 19th century. Indeed, one valuable project would be to compare the contexts and repertoires of French-language college songbooks in Quebec (e.g., the *Chasonnier des Collèges*) with those from the English-language tradition.

The other two articles in *CanMus 4* are chronicles. Gaynor Jones’s article on

“The Fisher years: The Toronto Conservatory of Music, 1886–1913,” is the first publication from her large research project on the history of The Royal Conservatory of Music (originally the Toronto Conservatory of Music). This is a fascinating study in that, for the first time, light is shed on the rather tangled background of one of Canada’s pre-eminent music institutions. Jones’s work is based on extensive archival research, and the article is documented fully with references to heretofore unpublished Conservatory records as well as with some engaging photographs, courtesy of the University of Toronto archives. Of particular interest is the author’s discussion of the contributions and personalities of Edward Fisher and F.H. Torrington and of the background of the examination system which remains the backbone of the RCM. The third article in *CanMus 4* is a detailed chronicle by Colin Eatock of the contemporary music group known since 1982 as Arraymusic. Eatock examines the group’s original goals, financial problems, participants (composers and performers), concert activity, and changing motivations and directions. Perhaps most important is the group’s dedication to contemporary Canadian music. As Eatock suggests, this dedication and much hard work have made Arraymusic a vital part of the music scene in Toronto.

CanMus Documents Volumes 1, 2, and 4 represent an important contribution to musical Canadiana. The range of subject areas covered in these volumes – conference proceedings on historical topics and contemporary issues to scholarly studies – demonstrates the diversity and the commitment of the Institute for Canadian Music.

Gordon E. Smith

MARCELLE GUERTIN. *De la lecture à l’audition d’un texte musical : une étude des thèmes dans le Livre I des Préludes pour piano de Debussy*. Montréal : Presses de l’Université de Montréal, collection « Sémiologie et analyse musicales », 1990, 245 pp.

Pour ceux et celles qui ont suivi le développement de la théorie d’analyse sémiologique proposée par Jean-Jacques Nattiez, en 1975, dans *Fondements d’une sémiologie de la musique*¹, le livre de Marcelle Guertin constitue le guide pédagogique essentiel à l’application de cette théorie dans ses volets « neutre » et « esthétique ».

¹ Paris : Union Générale d’Éditions, coll. « 10/18 ».