

## Canadian University Music Review Revue de musique des universités canadiennes

Joseph Kerman. *Write All These Down: Essays on Music*.  
Berkeley: University of California Press, 1994. xii, 359 pp. ISBN  
0-520-08355-5 (hardcover)

Kjellrun Hestekin

Volume 16, Number 2, 1996

URI: <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1014437ar>

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.7202/1014437ar>

[See table of contents](#)

### Publisher(s)

Canadian University Music Society / Société de musique des universités  
canadiennes

### ISSN

0710-0353 (print)

2291-2436 (digital)

[Explore this journal](#)

### Cite this review

Hestekin, K. (1996). Review of [Joseph Kerman. *Write All These Down: Essays on Music*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1994. xii, 359 pp. ISBN 0-520-08355-5 (hardcover)]. *Canadian University Music Review / Revue de musique des universités canadiennes*, 16(2), 142–145.  
<https://doi.org/10.7202/1014437ar>

and locales deemed marginal by 'the centre'—no matter how the centre is defined—also control the ways by which they create and authenticate their existence as individuals."<sup>22</sup> Diamond and Witmer are obviously acutely aware of their great responsibility in this assumption of cultural authority: as editors they are inevitably and inescapably in a position of control. Thus it is curious (at least to this soul observing from the Western margin of the country) that while there is representation—undoubtedly carefully considered—from both Western and Atlantic provinces as well as from Quebec, there is such a marked emphasis on the view from Ontario, or, shall we say, from the centre. Even giving recognition to notions of representation by population, it is still notable that seventeen of the thirty-three contributors are Ontario residents, and of those, nine (including the editors) teach at York University. One could argue that a Yorkocentric view is an almost inevitable consequence of the significant and vital work being done there in Canadian studies and interdisciplinary research, yet we are still advised, I think, to reflect once again on the problems and paradoxes inherent in the ways cultural discourse is defined and created.

Implicit in the strength of this anthology—that is, its vast scope and its profusion of intellectual perspectives—is its basic weakness: the tremendous variety of approaches is paralleled by a disparity in the quality of the articles. Stated simply, some of the essays are much better than others. This is inevitable in any anthology, of course, but at times it appears that the concept of the book is more significant than some of the articles themselves.

Obviously, if the essays themselves present such a varied range of critical perspectives, there is a danger that an anthology of this size (it runs to over 600 pages) will lack a cohesive focus, a central defined framework that holds the diverse ideas together. But, ironically, in this lies the most exciting feature of this text, for it acts as a mirror of the Canadian identity. At times fragmented and fragmentary, absorbed with the problems of defining and expressing its identity, wrestling with the sensitive issues of power and control, of margins and centre, and ultimately attempting to be inclusive and hospitable to all comers: these are the very issues that absorb the country as a whole. Beverley Diamond and Robert Witmer have successfully challenged our understanding of how these larger concerns are played out in the act of writing about our diverse musical traditions. As a result, this anthology represents a valuable step towards the definition and practice of a distinctive Canadian musicology.

Joan Backus

Joseph Kerman. *Write All These Down: Essays on Music*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1994. xii, 359 pp. ISBN 0-520-08355-5 (hardcover).

I. Criticism: "A Profile for American Musicology"; "How We Got into Analysis, and How to Get Out"; "A Few Canonic Variations"; "Critics and Classics"; II. Byrd, Tallis, Alfonso Ferrabosco: "William Byrd and Elizabethan Catholicism"; "Byrd,

---

<sup>22</sup>Robert Wallace, *Producing Marginality: Theatre and Criticism in Canada* (Saskatoon: Fifth House Publishers, 1990), 30.

Tallis, and the Art of Imitation"; "'Write All These Down': Notes on a Song by Byrd"; "The *Missa Puer Natus Est* by Thomas Tallis"; "An Italian Musician in Elizabethan England"; III. Beethoven: "Tovey's Beethoven"; "*An die ferne Geliebte*"; "Taking the Fifth"; "Beethoven's Minority"; IV. Opera and Concerto: "Translating *The Magic Flute*"; "Wagner: Thoughts in Season"; "Verdi's Use of Recurring Themes"; "Two Early Verdi Operas: Two Famous Terzetti"; "Reading *Don Giovanni*"; "Mozart's Piano Concertos and Their Audience"; "*Tristan und Isolde*: The Prelude and the Play."

Joseph Kerman's *Write All These Down* is a collection of twenty essays on diverse musical topics. The group includes some older essays which were not widely circulated in their initial incarnations, half a dozen essays written since 1990, and a few heretofore unpublished items. As the author notes in the Preface, such a collection allows him to display the varied repertoires, approaches, and methodologies with which he has been involved, and as they have evolved. Kerman also exhibits in this literary retrospective a variety of voices, from music critic for the *Hudson Review* to respected musicologist addressing his peers.

While the essays are arranged into four general topic headings, there is considerable diversity within each category. Reviewing such a collection in a few paragraphs is a challenging and even frustrating task. The temptation to address each essay individually is strong, in part because each *is* so individual, but particularly because there are so many gems in the collection. Nonetheless, a more general summary follows.

The opening essay in this collection introduces a major and recurring issue in Kerman's writing and, in so doing, establishes the philosophical background for the remainder of the book. The essay, initially an address delivered at a plenary session of the 1964 annual meeting of the American Musicological Society, was a reaction to the recently released *Musicology* volume in the Princeton Studies of Humanistic Scholarship in America. The series investigates the nature and function of humanistic scholarship; the *Musicology* volume looks at the same questions in the context of its specific discipline. One of the authors, F.L.I. Harrison, expresses the concern that historical scholarship without a social aim becomes an exclusive and uncommunicative exercise. He proposes that while musicology must, of course, "contribute to the understanding and recreation of music by a close analysis of the composer's musical thought and style in the light of the technical and aesthetic principles of the day," its ultimate goal becomes "the study of men in so far as they express themselves through the medium of music."<sup>23</sup>

Kerman proposes reversing the focus (with apologies in the preface for dated language) to "Men in society are studied as a means of furthering the comprehension of works of art" (p. 4). Thus history, sociology, and even style analysis are not ends but, rather, steps leading to "insight into individual works of art ... in a context" provided by those steps (p. 5). This critical approach is

---

<sup>23</sup>Frank L.I. Harrison, Mantle Hood, and Claude Palisca, *Musicology* (Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall, 1963), 74, 80.

not the addition of another layer of scholarship so much as a philosophical reorientation—a return to what brought most music researchers to their fields of study in the first place, a passion for music.

The case for criticism is extended and expanded in “How We Got into Analysis.”<sup>24</sup> Here, Kerman begins with the premise that musical analysis typically sets out to demonstrate organic unity within a work, a task that is also the main focus of most *criticism* in the other arts. While being an advocate for organicism, Kerman recognizes its shortcomings, principally its limited applicability outside its historical domain of German common-practice instrumental music. As an illustration, Kerman examines the *ur-organicist* Heinrich Schenker’s analysis of Schumann’s “Aus meinen Thränen spriessen” from *Dichterliebe*, demonstrating how much of what makes the piece special is either stripped away in the foreground sketch (i.e., nuances of text setting), or “regularized” into something completely unremarkable (i.e., the echoed cadences in the piano). By taking these very instances of non-conformity as his point of departure, traversing the fields of history, sociology, and style analysis, Kerman arrives at a broader, deeper understanding of the work. The point is not that Schenkerian analysis (or organicism) is invalid, rather that any single analytical approach yet developed is limited. Kerman closes with an exhortation to use all the means currently available for critical analysis, while striving towards an ideal of a universally applicable and effective critical approach.

“Canonic Variations” completes the group of premise-setting essays (the fourth essay in this section being a summary of others’ writings on the subject of criticism). As its name implies, it is a set of musings on the nature of the canon. Subheadings like-wise wittily hint at the content; “Thema” sets the basic premise: that there is inherent difference between written and oral traditions, a difference between object and activity; “Canon perpetuus” gives a brief historical background on the development of the concept of canon as including works not only of one’s own time and place, and so forth. “Quarendo invenietis” concludes with a charge consistent with those expressed in the first two essays: “Those critics who still believe in the canon must work to keep it viable, and work freshly” (p. 49).

The remaining essays in the book are more specific studies of individual composers or compositions. They also serve as models for the eclectic approach to critical analysis advocated in the opening section. The dilemma of being a devout Roman Catholic in Protestant England, the influence of a rather obscure Italian madrigalist who spent some 18 years in London, and a close reading of a 1611 song, all shed light on Byrd’s sensitivity to text and its effect on his compositional style. A slight inconsistency in the symmetry and internal rhyme scheme of the poetry of Beethoven’s *An die ferne Geliebte* leads to an investigation of the cycle incorporating biography, literary and music history

---

<sup>24</sup> This is one of the most widely-published articles in the collection. First presented as a Thalheimer Lecture in Philosophy at The Johns Hopkins University in 1979, it has subsequently been published in *On Criticizing Music: Five Philosophical Perspectives*, ed. Kingsley Price (Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1981), in *Critical Inquiry* 7 (1980) and in *Criticism and Analysis*, The Garland Library of the History of Western Music, vol. 13 (New York: Garland Publishing, 1985).

and analysis, sketch study, and a bit of psychology—a classic example of getting “the best illumination for the matter at hand by using as many spots and gels as one can assemble and manipulate” (p. xii).

Without exception, each essay is informative and a pleasure to read. The most technical are the essays from which the book draws its title and the following study of the Tallis Mass. Only “How We Got into Analysis” presumes familiarity with Schenkerian reduction techniques.<sup>25</sup> The challenge in many of the essays is in absorbing and assimilating all the information offered. This is not intended as a negative comment; Kerman’s presentation is clear and well organized, with chapters typically divided into subtopics. But in following his own prescription for a multi-faceted, critical examination of a work, Kerman offers a wealth of approaches and viewpoints. Rather than taking a single, more-or-less direct pathway to understanding a single aspect of a work, the reader is guided along numerous routes, leading to a deeper, broader appreciation. Multiple (at times contradictory) points of view are examined for both strengths and shortcomings in some essays, while in others (notably the Byrd and Beethoven essays) the historical, social, and textual data are all considered as a means of discovering how the composer achieves his musical effects. In short, the book offers one of the same pleasures as the compositions it examines; one can revisit these essays time and again and find new insights at each reading.

Kjellrun Hestekin

Ezra Schabas. *Sir Ernest MacMillan: The Importance of Being Canadian*. Toronto, Buffalo, London: University of Toronto Press, 1994. 374 pp. ISBN 0-8020-2849-7 (hardcover).

Elaine Keillor. *John Weinzwieg and His Music: The Radical Romantic of Canada*. Composers of North America, no. 15. Metuchen, N.J., and London: The Scarecrow Press, 1994. 317 pp. ISBN 0-8108-2849-9 (hardcover).

As Canada embarks upon the last years that lead toward the end of this century—and indeed the end of the millennium—we are witnessing an awakening interest in our country’s cultural and intellectual history. Although ours cannot be measured against that of other cultures that have been developing throughout the millennium, Canada’s young cultural story nevertheless is unique and different, due to the geographic, political, and social forces that have shaped this country.

A number of books published over the last decade begin to illuminate the creative energy and the personalities of specific individuals who have provided artistic and intellectual leadership throughout the current century. Information presented through biographies, monographs, and memoirs illuminates our

---

<sup>25</sup> This approachability may be in part a reflection of the strong influence of Tovey, for whom Kerman expresses great admiration. Kerman’s essays seem to be targeted, in the main, for Tovey’s “naïve listener.”