

Review of Settler City Limits: Indigenous Resurgence and Colonial Violence in the Urban Prairie West by Heather Dorries, Robert Henry, David Hugill, Tyler McCreary, and Julie Tomiak (Eds.). Winnipeg, MB: University of Manitoba Press, 2019.

Jillian Baker

Volume 6, Number 2, Fall 2020

URI: <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1076791ar>

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.15402/esj.v6i2.70742>

[See table of contents](#)

Publisher(s)

University of Saskatchewan

ISSN

2369-1190 (print)

2368-416X (digital)

[Explore this journal](#)

Cite this review

Baker, J. (2020). Review of [Review of Settler City Limits: Indigenous Resurgence and Colonial Violence in the Urban Prairie West by Heather Dorries, Robert Henry, David Hugill, Tyler McCreary, and Julie Tomiak (Eds.). Winnipeg, MB: University of Manitoba Press, 2019.] *Engaged Scholar Journal*, 6(2), 158-160. <https://doi.org/10.15402/esj.v6i2.70742>

© Jillian Baker, 2021



This document is protected by copyright law. Use of the services of Érudit (including reproduction) is subject to its terms and conditions, which can be viewed online.

<https://apropos.erudit.org/en/users/policy-on-use/>

Érudit

This article is disseminated and preserved by Érudit.

Érudit is a non-profit inter-university consortium of the Université de Montréal, Université Laval, and the Université du Québec à Montréal. Its mission is to promote and disseminate research.

<https://www.erudit.org/en/>

Settler City Limits: Indigenous Resurgence and Colonial Violence in the Urban Prairie West by Heather Dorries, Robert Henry, David Hugill, Tyler McCreary, and Julie Tomiak (Eds.). University of Manitoba Press, 2019.

Opening with the definitive (and ultimately central) assertion that “[cities] are places where Indigenous peoples have continually resisted and challenged the normalizations of colonial settler violence” (p. 1), *Settler City Limits: Indigenous Resurgence and Colonial Violence in the Urban Prairie West* is a well-woven collection of essays, each of which pulls at the frayed edges of colonial narratives that continually dress and address the “city” as a distinct settler space. Editors Heather Dorries, Robert Henry, David Hugill, Tyler McCreary, and Julie Tomiak compile diverse sets of essays, ranging in focus from colonial discourse analysis to examples drawn from lived experience and art that actively enact Indigenous kinship with the land, all vitally hinging upon either disrupting or dismantling arbitrary urban/non-urban binaries that impact Indigenous lives. The collection as a whole problematizes the idea that urban and non-urban spaces exist in isolation from one another, stating that “[r]ather, they are relationally entwined outcomes of a particular process of geographical production grounded, fundamentally, in colonial relations” (p. 3). Notably, while the collection is split into four distinct parts (“Life and Death”; “Land and Politics”; “Policing and Social Control”; and “Contestation, Resistance, Solidarity”), the boundaries between the sections prove no more absolute than the colonial borders, terms, and narratives the essays within work to contest. The common undercurrents of both the violent perpetuation of settler-colonialism on Indigenous lands and bodies and the unceasing vitality of Indigenous resistance efforts—along with what contributor Nick Estes calls “anti-colonial common sense” (p. 48)—illuminate how relationally entwined the essays in the collection are, despite their widely varied subject matter.

The first section, entitled “Life and Death,” opens with a contribution from editor Heather Dorries, who takes an in-depth look at a now-infamous *Macleans* magazine article from 2015 that labelled Winnipeg “Canada’s most racist city”. Her analysis of both the article and the public responses it elicited within the city reveals attitudes that rationalize Indigenous death and disappearance “and normalize the settler-colonial logic of elimination” (p. 26). Similarly, Nick Estes introduces the colonial concept of “anti-Indian common sense,” the lived repercussions of which he examines through the histories of Rapid City, South Dakota and other “border towns.” David Hugill’s essay draws a connection between territorialization in the “settling” of both Winnipeg and Minneapolis, in part to dissolve the arbitrary distinctions so often made between settler-colonial studies in Canada and the United States. As a collective, the essays draw attention to unique manifestations of settler-colonialism: an ill-informed attempt at anti-racist journalism and its tangible repercussions; the dangers of racially motivated, “held-in-common senses of justice” (p. 47); and the continued threat of “authorized knowers” that operate to depoliticize inner-city Indigenous issues, respectively. The essays also shed light on Indigenous-driven efforts, which render irrefutable the potency and viability of the Indigenous “Life” invoked in the section’s title, particularly concerning the “Death” each essay shows are externally imposed upon Indigenous communities.

The second section, “Land and Politics,” opens with a poignant quotation from Leanne Betasamosake Simpson that reminds the reader that *all* Canadian cities are on Indigenous lands; this is an anchoring point for a grouping of essays that challenges the idea that cities like Edmonton, Winnipeg, and Missoula are free, or somehow less guilty, of settler-colonial territorial politics. In her contribution, editor Julie Tomiak uses the reclamation of the Kapyong Barracks in Winnipeg for the purposes of ceremony in 2016 as a case study to illustrate not only the sustained resistance of Indigenous collectives in urban spaces but also to assert that the complications that the land dispute represents suggest that colonial claim to the territory is far from “settled.” Nicholas Brown, in the essay to follow, similarly articulates that the distinctions between urban and non-urban spaces are not perhaps as concrete as they have been made out to be, arguing that settler cityscapes are informed by regional circumstances and attitudes which far exceed the geographic boundaries of cities like Missoula, Montana, and others. Tyler McCreary’s conversations with Chris Andersen, Brenda Macdougall, and Adam Gaudry round out the section with an exploration of the distinctness of Métis identity and the inextricable connection between Métis histories and the establishments of urban spaces such as Saskatoon, Winnipeg, Edmonton, and Regina. This section as a whole acknowledges the vital links between Indigenous communities, identities, and cultural practices and the lands on which they are able to take place. It asserts how communities and individuals have retained this connection, even within urban spaces that are often constructed as diametrically opposite to living on or with the land.

The third section of the collection, “Policing and Social Control,” draws together essays that touch on not only the violent involvement of state institutions in the maintenance of settler-colonialism but also the pervasive nature of rhetorics of control, deficiency, and criminality which affect the lives of Indigenous peoples on the Prairies. Rhetoric and discourse, both concepts peppered throughout the collection, come to a particular focus in this section. This includes Elizabeth Comack’s assessment of ways in which racialized inhabitants of particular areas of Winnipeg are configured as more in-need-of police surveillance; in Michelle Stewart and Corey La Berge’s exploration of “rhetorics of benevolence,” which perpetuate narratives about moral and parental deficiencies in Indigenous communities to justify the entry of Indigenous children into the so-called child welfare system; and very clearly in editor Robert Henry’s assertion that sensationalized journalism regarding Indigenous gangs has contributed to the continued hyper-policing of Indigenous communities and individuals in Saskatoon. In keeping with the essays in the preceding sections, each essay acknowledges and problematizes the systemic issues that persist in justifying the over-policing of Indigenous communities, and respectively sheds light on organizations or projects that have taken up the work of actively repudiating racialized policing.

The final section of the collection, “Contestation, Resistance, Solidarity,” draws together the concepts brought forth in the earlier chapters and focuses on resisting a trauma-centred approach to viewing the city by giving examples of an active community and artistic efforts aimed at solidarity. Lindsey Claire Smith opens the section with an analysis of the works of Seminole and Creek filmmaker Sterlin Harjo, whose films about meaning-making and place-

making in and around the city of Tulsa provide a nuanced view into the urban-Indigenous experience, effectively combatting monolithic representations of Indigenous lives on film. Her assertions about the power of media lead nicely into Sharmeen Khan's discussion of Muslim and Indigenous solidarity on the Prairies. Khan's essay uses the CBC produced show *Little Mosque on the Prairie* to explore how the narrative of Canadian multiculturalism works to erase Indigenous history effectively, therefore upholding settler-colonial ideals, even while appearing hospitable to "Others." The collection is capped off with the work of Zoe Todd. Her assessment of settler-created public art displays that "aim" at solidarity with Indigenous causes is taken up in a voice that acknowledges both "the human and more-than-human beings" (p. 289) that shape and co-constitute urban localities in what is now known as Canada. The essay's framework establishes a narrative distance for the reader that allows for the hypocrisy of settler-colonial institutions to shine through the author's voice with remarkable clarity. The tone and direction of Todd's essay work perfectly to conclude the volume, as they address both the arbitrary nature of urban and non-urban distinctions that are a consistent focus of the essays that precede it, and gesture to a "fishy future devoid of white possessive logics" (p. 307) that neatly and resiliently mirrors the spirit of resistance that undergirds the collection at large.

This book will be of interest to a wide array of scholars whose research touches on the multiplicitous intersections of urban-Indigenous identity and is a must-read for community-engaged researchers working in collaboration with Indigenous folk! While the theoretical focus of many of the articles might prove daunting for some community readers, the breadth of material and the immediate relevance of subject matter position it as a text that will likely be of interest to those outside of the academy as well.

Jillian Baker
Ph.D. Candidate, University of Saskatchewan
Email: jillian.baker@usask.ca