
Lucy A. Powell

Volume 16, Number 1, 1994

URI: https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1083322ar
DOI: https://doi.org/10.7202/1083322ar

Cite this review
Le regard de ces autobiographies apporte des éléments pour un approfondissement des questions liées à la représentation de «soi» et des «autres», mais aussi à celles qui inscrivent les gens dans un mouvement de redéfinition et de re façonnement de la société. Les narrateurs n’en adoptent pas moins un point de vue critique qui pourrait faire penser à une tolérance suspecte. Ils ne se sont pas limités à décrire leurs expériences, mais se sont efforcés aussi d’en faire un bilan qui identifie tant les éléments de continuité que les éléments de rupture. À la fin de l’exploration des récits, on reste un peu surpris, non pas de la différence d’intérêt et surtout de niveau entre les diverses contributions, mais surtout des types de discours ou de pratiques répertoriables. L’intérêt certain de la constitution d’un corpus des récits comme ceux que donne ce livre est de fournir la base de matériaux qui permet de construire une réflexion, qu’elle soit ethnologique ou historique.

Martin KALULAMBI PONGO
CÉLAT, Université Laval
Sainte-Foy, Québec


Occupational folklore has been gaining attention in North America recently with the 1991 Labor Song special issue of the Journal of Folklore Research (vol. 28, n°s. 2/3) and the new book Songs About Work edited by Archie Green (Indiana UP, 1993). A welcome addition from the other side of the Atlantic is Porter’s thesis, The English Occupational Song. Porter’s work is a careful blending of evolutionary theory and semiotics applied to songs which mention occupations. His discussion and analysis is based on an examination of over 4 000 texts and recordings of songs covering over 100 different occupations including prostitution, smuggling, and poaching as well as more typical occupations such as mining, weaving, and seafaring. Most of the book, as would be expected in a semiotic study, focuses on work as metaphor or symbol, and how these symbols have changed over time.

Porter divides songs related to occupations into three groups: rhythmic songs, which are performed during work; songs about work but not performed in the work setting, including a large collection of broadside ballads; and labour songs which emerged with unionization. His discussion concentrates on the last
two types. These types are useful, although they are not always as clear in his
discussion of particular subjects as they are in the original model.

Porter rightly examines how broadside ballad printers and folksong
collectors mediated and commodified the song texts. The song texts studied are
often several steps removed from the oral performance, mediated either by the
broadside ballad printer or the song collector. With reference to the broadside
ballad printers, Porter states, "the broadside market acted as both a powerful
initiator of new songs and as a mediator of songs from oral tradition. In both cases
the single most important factor was that the song had to be a salable commodity"
(33). Broadside publishers also created metaphors which were chosen to serve
society and reinforce norms. The song collectors mediated by gathering items in
a narrow range and reworking many of the texts.

Porter wisely does not restrict himself to song texts for symbolic analysis
of work, but incorporates related items such as the iconography on trade union
membership certificates, worker's clothing, and machinery, as well as exploring
how all of these are related to the non-work part of the worker's life. The
expression of work in a song, he argues, should be seen as symbolic rather than
as an accurate representation of working life.

In the core of The English Occupational Song, Porter perceptively
discusses how specific attributes of occupations are codified. With codification,
their symbolism is broadly recognized in general life experiences, such as in
courting and in war. The occupational metaphor can take an active or passive role,
and can be portrayed either with positive or negative qualities. Sometimes the
metaphor, especially if it is part of the machinery or tools of work, takes on an
erotic quality.

In his move from occupational to labour songs, Porter convincingly
explains how the latter were used to promote group cohesion. Cohesion occurs
when there is a growing sense of community among occupational groups. For
example, miners, arguably the first group of industrial workers in Britain, gained
a sense of community and collective identity through unionization and through
the shared experience of pit disasters. Porter does not see community as defined
by geographical boundaries, but rather "as a plurality of allegiances, constantly
forming and reforming" (103). His application of this account of songs engender-
ing community to the development of women's sense of group identity is
particularly illuminating. Early broadside ballads by men portrayed as women as
erotic objects. As women started printing, selling, and buying street literature,
and, significantly, also working in factories, the songs began to present a less
erotic and more empowered image of women workers. In addition, Porter points
out that women performers often changed the gender of the typically male
protagonist to give many songs a women's perspective.

Porter's indices of occupations and sources are thorough, and will be quite
useful to the folksong scholar. Indeed, the extraordinary number of texts Porter
has assiduously unearthed suggests one minor criticism: occasionally he only provides a reference to a song when one would greatly like to see its full text. Should Porter choose to publish an expanded version of this work, the inclusion of a greater number of full song texts would be welcome. Porter’s book is an important contribution to the study of occupational folksong, and is highly recommended.

Lucy A. POWELL
Memorial University of Newfoundland
St. John’s, Newfoundland