

CLARK, S.D., *Church and Sect in Canada*, University of Toronto Press, 1948. pp. XIII, 458

Gordon O. Rothney

Volume 2, Number 4, mars 1949

URI: <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/801507ar>

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.7202/801507ar>

[See table of contents](#)

Publisher(s)

Institut d'histoire de l'Amérique française

ISSN

0035-2357 (print)

1492-1383 (digital)

[Explore this journal](#)

Cite this review

Rothney, G. O. (1949). Review of [CLARK, S.D., *Church and Sect in Canada*, University of Toronto Press, 1948. pp. XIII, 458]. *Revue d'histoire de l'Amérique française*, 2(4), 596–599. <https://doi.org/10.7202/801507ar>

CLARK, S.D., *Church and Sect in Canada*, University of Toronto Press, 1948. pp. XIII, 458.

Dr. Clark, who is associate professor of sociology in the University of Toronto, believes "that sociology has much to gain from a greater use of historical material". He therefore sets out to study "the sociological significance of certain general movements of religion in Canadian social development". Noting the similarity between Henry Alline, a Newlight preacher in Nova Scotia in 1775, and William Aberhart who emerged in Southern Alberta in 1922, he says the "social development of Canada has been characterized by a succession of such religious movements of protest". "Disruption and schism have been more characteristic of the Protestant than of the Roman Catholic Church", he admits, "and the concern of this study is almost wholly with the former... The study is confined to the period 1760

to 1900". Inevitably, however, there are a some points at which the book touches the history of the French Canadians.

In the period 1760-1783, the author's attention is centred on the "Great Awakening" in Nova Scotia. He begins with the statement that the "conflict of the French and British Empires in America, in terms of religious organization, represented a conflict between church and sect forms of religious control", and argues that the "bitter opposition of New England Protestantism to efforts of the Roman Catholic Church to maintain the attachments of the Acadian and native populations of Nova Scotia was reflected in the insistence upon the evacuation of the Acadians". The rapid expansion of New England during the eighteenth century brought about increasing conflict, also, with British imperial interests. Thus, the "destruction of Louisbourg in 1745 was a military undertaking promoted by New England, but the return of Louisbourg to France in 1748 and the founding of Halifax the next year represented efforts of Britain to strengthen the lines of empire", — a policy which involved also the establishment in the colony of state-supported English religious institutions which were soon in conflict with New England religious sectarianism.

What about the St. Lawrence Valley? "The military battles fought in the interior of the continent and the final campaign against Quebec were the culmination in many respects of a prolonged and deep-rooted conflict between the New England way of life, represented on the religious side by Congregationalism, and the French-Canadian way of life, represented on the religious side by Roman Catholicism — a conflict fundamentally between the sect and church forms of religious organization". But after 1760, the "army acquired a dominant position in the political life of Quebec, as the navy never could in Nova Scotia, and army dominance assured the dominance of the church form of religious organization". Hope was entertained that "the new Catholic subjects could be prevailed upon to change their religious attachments" in favour of the established Church of England, which "formally assumed the role which had been played by the Roman Catholic Church during the French regime". French-speaking missionaries were sent to Quebec, Montreal, and Three Rivers. Meanwhile, the "bitter hostility which developed between the merchants and the French-Canadian population and between the merchants and the army, reflected the opposition of the nonconformist religious group to Roman Catholicism and Church Establishment, but this group did not succeed in securing either the evacuation of the Catholic Population as it had been evacuated in Nova Scotia on the dis-establishment of the Church of England". On the other hand, continues Dr. Clark, the Catholic Church's "concern with maintaining the conditions of a stable peasant society secured for it the favour of the governors [Murray and Carleton], hostile to the demands of the military group as well as to the demands of the 'rabble of unprincipled traders' in Montreal". Thus Roman Catholicism in the new world "was able to escape the challenge of the French Revolution through the... highly centra-

lized controls of the British imperial system which led to the exclusion of French rationalist influences". This meant, also, the complete failure of the Church of England among French Canadians, and in Quebec, Montreal, and Three Rivers, it did not have much support even among the English-speaking people. The policy "of relying upon close co-operation with the Roman Catholic Church was justified by the failure of the invasion of American forces" (1776), and when large-scale commercial organization grew in Montreal it was under Scottish leadership, belonging not to American evangelical religious movements, but to the Church of Scotland.

After 1795, there was a sudden expansion of population and sectarianism in Upper Canada. But "geographical and ethnic barriers to communication and the retention of the seigniorial system of land holding, had the effect of preserving the isolation of the French-Canadian society... and the supremacy of Roman Catholicism continued to receive no serious challenge". The Church of England still had hopes, however. A Bishop at Quebec was added to the one in Nova Scotia, and many new missionaries in both the Canadas were added to those already "located at Quebec, Montreal, Three Rivers, and St. Henry". (In Trois-Rivières, the Church of England still occupies the old Recollet buildings on the rue des Ursulines). But in 1790, the first minister from the Methodist Episcopal Church in the United States entered Canada, and thereafter Methodism spread rapidly from the American frontier settlements to the settlers on the Canadian frontier. It even entered Lower Canada, where the work was organized by its New York Conference, reaching Montreal in 1803, Quebec in 1806, and Three Rivers and St. Francis River in 1810. ("The old Methodist chapelin Trois-Rivières was situated on the rue Bonaventure, approximately where the home of Premier Duplessis now stands). Methodist growth was much greater, however, in the Eastern Townships and in Upper Canada. While the Bay of Quinte (in Upper Canada) reported 655 Methodists before 1812, Quebec had only 26, Montreal 35, and Three Rivers 18. The movement flourished only where there were Loyalist and other American settlers.

The rest of the book is an account of the numerous other sects which have sprung up since then among people who had lost a sense of belonging to any organized society, whether on the rural frontier, or, particularly since 1885, in the city. Some of these conducted themselves in a way that was particularly offensive to Catholics, with the result that the "authorities of the law were torn between protecting the rights of individual freedom and the rights of religious freedom". The account of the experiences of the Salvation Army in Montreal about 1885 makes one immediately think of the experiences of Jehovah's Witnesses in Montreal in recent months. In time these sects often settle down and become quite "respectable". R.P. Bennett, for example, was a Methodist ! And that denomination forms part of the highly "respectable" United Church of Canada.

The book undoubtedly contains generalizations which the historian will not be ready to accept until he has more evidence. But it is thought-

provoking, and the main fact which it reveals is how great have been "the limitations of the church in attracting the support of large sections of the population at various times".

G.O. ROTHNEY