

***Creed and Culture: The Place of English-Speaking Catholics in Canadian Society, 1750-1930.* Terrence Murphy and Gerald Stortz, eds.**

Christopher English

Volume 12, Number 2, Fall 1996

URI: [https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/nflds12\\_2rv04](https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/nflds12_2rv04)

[See table of contents](#)

Publisher(s)

Faculty of Arts, Memorial University

ISSN

1198-8614 (print)

1715-1430 (digital)

[Explore this journal](#)

Cite this article

English, C. (1996). *Creed and Culture: The Place of English-Speaking Catholics in Canadian Society, 1750-1930.* Terrence Murphy and Gerald Stortz, eds. *Newfoundland Studies*, 12(2), 142–143.

*Creed and Culture: The Place of English-Speaking Catholics in Canadian Society, 1750-1930.* Edited by Terrence Murphy and Gerald Stortz. Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1993, 253 pp., ill., bib., index. ISBN 0773509542.

## CHRISTOPHER ENGLISH

PROPOSED AS A groundbreaking scholarly analysis of the movement by English-speaking Catholics from sectarian isolation in the eighteenth century to integration into the mainstream of Canadian life in the twentieth — “so far as the current state of research will allow,” these eleven essays lay a solid basis for future research. The qualifier is crucial, for seven essays focus on the Atlantic region and Toronto. Nevertheless, the overarching historical introduction by Murphy, Choquette's survey of English-French relations within the Catholic community, and Miller's of anti-Catholicism, point the way to the larger picture of communities of Scots and Irish origin who were indistinguishable from their fellow Canadians except in their religious observance.

Raymond Lahey's study of the interaction of Catholicism and colonial policy in Newfoundland between 1779 and 1845 draws on an impressive array of archival sources here and abroad. Those familiar with his work will recognize the major actors, Bishops O'Donel, Lambert and Scallan, and a major theme: their advocacy of loyalty to the Crown as the best means of assuring official recognition, social peace, toleration and an expanded mission. Despite occasional setbacks the policy was successful until the 1820s when, for reasons which are not entirely apparent here, Governor Cochrane, the Colonial Office and the local supreme court at various times denied the Catholic community privileges extended to the Church of England: representation on the executive council; school funding; equal benefit of the statutes on both marriage and the removal of Catholic civil and political disabilities. The reasons are unclear. Canvassed here are: confusion — was the Church of England established in Newfoundland?; a lack of direction from London at a time of political tension over Catholic emancipation and political reform; an (undefined) “upheaval then taking place in the Colonial office;” and the Anglican propensities of local officials. It is unclear why the governor's instructions of 1825

reaffirming Catholic disabilities, the precise nature of which are not explained to the reader, should have prevailed over the imperial policy of emancipation in 1829. Lahey correctly notes opinion by the law officers of the crown that English domestic legislation did not apply here unless the statute specifically included Newfoundland. However, the important qualifier “not automatically” distinguished local practice. In addition, imperial statutes of general application (acts on trade and navigation, on smuggling and on slavery, for example) were good law in Newfoundland. It may be argued that the penal laws enshrining Catholic disabilities had the force of imperial statute, even of constitutional convention. Until we are better informed on just what law was received and operative in Newfoundland it is early to accept Lahey’s accusations of blatant discrimination and pettifogging legalism wilfully applied by officials and judges against local Catholics. However, the depth of research and the close reasoning embodied in the essay ensure that it will remain a benchmark for future enquiry.