An Historian’s Notebook: 100 Stories – Mostly Peterborough By Elwood H. Jones

Thomas F. McIlwraith

Imagining New Worlds in the New World: Entertainment, Agency, and Power in Upper Canada
Volume 102, Number 2, Fall 2010

URI: https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1065588ar
DOI: https://doi.org/10.7202/1065588ar

Cite this review
https://doi.org/10.7202/1065588ar
ontifications. They victimized known union leaders, divided ethnic groups against each other and, in a series of strikes from 1903 to 1912, imported strikebreakers. They used their private police, municipal police, and the militia to confront strikers by force and in the courts. On 12 August 1909, a gun battle broke out between freight handlers and CPR police, the bloodiest labour riot in Canadian history. Up to forty men were wounded; twenty ringleaders were arrested, with nine convicted. Non-English immigrants became scapegoats for labour violence. A consensual approach to labour relations also failed. The CPR ignored the advice of the Conciliation Board of 1909, as did the Canadian Northern Railway in the 1912 coal handlers’ strike.

Class polarization culminated in the 1913 Street Railwaymen’s strike. Local middle-class politicians rejected the past practice of mediation through skilled workers and, instead, broke the union and established a low-wage model as a way to attract external investment. Better wages and working conditions for lesser-skilled workers had been achieved only once, in 1912. A prairie harvest labour shortage and socialist leadership with sympathy strikes at the docks made the difference, but a year later the political will to carry a general strike and maintain this victory could not be sustained.

These economic struggles gave rise to two labour political traditions in Thunder Bay, between the Independent Labour Party, committed to reform based on craft unions, and those swayed by revolutionary socialism and its promise of unionizing lesser-skilled industrial workers.

This polarization would shape the Canadian class struggle into the 1940s, until muted by transformed economic conditions, a purge of the political left, and a more comprehensive industrial relations system.

Morrison tells a powerful story about the making of one working-class community against polarization by employers and the state (and not by Eastern and Southern European workers), as a leading feature of early Canadian industrial capitalism. Well-chosen photographs enrich the story. But this study, largely written in the 1970s, has its limits. Labour Pains does not cover the whole of the Thunder Bay working class, leaving aside the First Nations and gender categories, as well as the unorganized majority who voted Conservative or Liberal. Rather, Labour Pains focuses—and usefully so—on those members of the working class who consciously fought for equity and improvements in the new wage-earning era, and who generalized politically from this hard experience to test reform, and perhaps even revolution.

Robin Wylie
Douglas College, Vancouver

An Historian’s Notebook: 100 Stories – Mostly Peterborough

By Elwood H. Jones


Ontario is filled with good stories, and An Historian’s Notebook exemplifies the best in the art of story-telling. Elwood Jones, the historian of the title, has composed 100 essays that put Peterborough—from brass bands to genealogy to Red Fife wheat to ever so much more—into the reader’s mind, invariably
with a surprise or two
and a lingering ort of
wisdom.
These are Jones’s
weekly columns pub-
lished in the Peterbor-
ough Examiner through
2007 and 2008, so the
material is readily avail-
able. But for most of us
it is entirely new. I imag-
ined a summary by cat-
egories, but “biography:
35” and “miscellaneous:
65” proved of little help.
How does one classify
elephants cavorting in
the Otonabee, the dis-
used clockworks from a church tower, and
which Mrs Lee of the six generals named
Lee of the American Civil War came to
Peterborough? This is indeed largely a bi-
ographical dictionary, and of ordinary, ge-
neric people whose lives are more impor-
tant than their names, types who may be
found in every town in Ontario. It is not
the Dictionary of Canadian Biography,
yet ever so valuable at its own scale. I would
argue, furthermore, that the life stories of
buildings—the Ashburnham Drill Shed,
St John’s Church, the Winch estate—are
themselves biographical, and the evolution
of bridge technology and fire brigade man-
agement not dissimilar. Paintings, draw-
ings and photographs give place to the nar-
rative and nourishment to the mind’s eye.

Jones frequently addresses heritage
conservation too. Reform MPP James
Hall’s cemetery legislation in the 1850s is
valuable background for the current role of
the Ontario Historical Society in cemetery
management. Destruction by fire is part of
almost every building site, giving glimpses
into heritage altered or lost; one ponders
the replacement that seems bland today
but may be of heritage
appeal tomorrow.

It is not so much
the substance of An His-
torian’s Notebook as it is
the style that has caught
my attention. By dem-
onstrating the joys and
rewards of historical re-
search Jones makes read-
ers want to care about
which Mrs Lee may have
come to Peterborough.
The Lee story may be
no more than an urban
legend, but it helps de-
fine the place; you may
know of similar myths in
your own town. Jones appreciates his access
to what he describes as three excellent local
newspapers, plus a range of manuscripts and
fonds in the Trent Valley Archives, and he is
an accomplished book fair and flea market
sleuth. In almost every essay he acknowl-
edges the TVA, an obvious destination for
the avid local historian or genealogist. Jones
also takes to the field, creating reasons for
readers to go and stand where he stood,
and see what he saw (or maybe something
else). This interplay between field and file is
essential to good story-telling. References
work their way into the prose; there are
no footnotes, but one feels well-informed
and confident about Jones’s use of sources.
Should his lucid prose inadvertently initiate
new urban legends, that would be jolly, and
no author can control how others read be-
tween the lines.

An Historian’s Notebook is written in
a lively, conversational manner, befitting
an author excited by a decorative gable
on Mark Street or a new accession in the
Archives. Chapter titles are catchy and
beguiling: “the Peterborough pedestrian”,
for example. And I love the aspirate ‘h’ in
the title, Jones has arranged the essays in a rough chronology, and readers who proceed from cover to cover will get a quirky history of the town. But one can read the stories in any order, any time, much in the manner of the weekly column where they first appeared. I could wish that Jones had listed the publication dates of the essays, allowing me to appreciate the randomness of his experience, the way so much history comes to us. I admire a scholar who can jump deftly from topic to topic, and accept the resultant repetition. The names Dobbin and Duffus echo throughout, not a problem unless one tries to read the book in a single day. One really shouldn’t.

A few essays stand out: Trent University’s history through its landholdings, the Barnardo children reception centre, the big brass band war involving a bandmaster by the name of Rackett. Then there is the voter in Harvey Township whose rowboat capsized, whereupon he swam to the polling station to cast the tie-breaking vote in the 1875 provincial by-election. Jones marvels at a collection of old photos, offers thoughts on the Americanness of Peterborough, and explores heritage politics. And who can overlook Robertson Davies, Examiner publisher and voice of small-town Ontario, admonishing a local historian who had lost his literary way? (Jones may consider himself fortunate not to be of the Davies era.)

Lingering questions: Why does the bibliography omit the names of publishers? Do we need the biography of the inventor of the pianoforte who died in England in 1832? And did the essay on Canadians’ displeasure with the Brown-Macdonald coalition of 1864 give pause to Opposition leaders plotting in Ottawa late in 2009?

Jones has come up with an extraordinary book. One learns just about enough to write one’s own ordinary history of Peterborough; in that sense An Historian’s Notebook is a primary source. More than that, however, Jones offers entertainment and enlightenment sufficient to stir some readers to compile their own stories of village life in landscapes and eras yet to be recorded. Jones shows how an archive opens doors, and unselfishly shares a career of steering people through those doors into a world of surprises and fun, all of it making the study of history the great pleasure that all of us, I hope, feel.

Thomas F. McIlwraith
University of Toronto Mississauga

One Hundred Rings and Counting: Forestry Education and Forestry in Toronto and Canada, 1907-2007

By Mark Kuhlberg

Before reading One Hundred Rings and Counting, I doubted that the history of one small faculty at one university could have wide appeal. However Professor Mark Kuhlberg of Laurentian University has largely dispelled my doubt in this chronicle of the Faculty of Forestry at the University of Toronto. Forestry at U of T has been, at least at times, unloved by its own university and province and has dealt its share of obstinacy to higher-ups over its century-long history. Kuhlberg sup-