

## Renaissance and Reformation Renaissance et Réforme



Shakespeare, William. *Macbeth*. Ed. Robert S. Miola. A Norton Critical Edition. 2nd ed.

Peter Paolucci

Volume 39, Number 2, Spring 2016

URI: <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1086573ar>

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.33137/rr.v39i2.26888>

[See table of contents](#)

Publisher(s)

Iter Press

ISSN

0034-429X (print)

2293-7374 (digital)

[Explore this journal](#)

Cite this review

Paolucci, P. (2016). Review of [Shakespeare, William. *Macbeth*. Ed. Robert S. Miola. A Norton Critical Edition. 2nd ed.] *Renaissance and Reformation / Renaissance et Réforme*, 39(2), 228–230. <https://doi.org/10.33137/rr.v39i2.26888>

XVII<sup>e</sup> siècle. L'ensemble laisse en effet l'impression qu'un compositeur, même de la stature de Schütz, travaillait dans un état de subordination étonnant. On est frappé de l'abaissement volontaire émanant des lettres de Schütz lorsqu'il s'adresse à ses employeurs, style qui mérite d'ailleurs qu'on s'interroge sur la perception qu'on en avait à l'époque, pouvant par exemple passer pour un discours des plus raffinés.

L'ouvrage de Johnston est d'une grande pertinence et d'une grande maîtrise. On aurait quand même apprécié que l'auteur nous indique dans sa préface, ne serait-ce qu'en quelques phrases, quelques thèmes qui, de son point de vue, rendent ces documents intéressants, ou qu'il les mette en relation avec certaines grandes questions que se posent les spécialistes de l'œuvre de Schütz. Malgré cela, cette publication s'avère incontournable pour tous ceux s'intéressant à l'œuvre et à la contribution de ce compositeur, ainsi qu'aux conditions de travail des compositeurs de cette époque. On ne peut que saluer la grande qualité de cette publication.

PASCALE DUHAMEL

Université d'Ottawa

### **Shakespeare, William.**

***Macbeth*. Ed. Robert S. Miola. A Norton Critical Edition. 2nd ed.**

New York: W. W. Norton & Company, 2014. Pp. xxiv, 381. ISBN 978-0-393-92326-1 (paperback) \$14.37.

Many of the differences between Norton's first and second critical editions of *Macbeth* are very small refinements. However, the second edition also newly foregrounds a variety of theatre-based topics. This review synthesizes these updates and offers an assessment of their merits.

Miola has added two new apparatuses, both dealing with theatricality. First, there is "The Actor's Gallery," a collection of excerpted and historical ruminations by actors and theatre observers about *Macbeth*. The timeframe extends from David Garrick (1762) through to Patrick Stewart and beyond. Many excerpts are quite short, but when taken as a whole this new feature provides some compelling historical perspectives on how the play's performances and productions were experienced over time. This is a welcome enhancement.

The other new apparatus, “Afterlives,” provides a selective glimpse of post-1623 adaptations of *Macbeth*. Presumably, the title is metaphorical, underscoring the idea that the quintessential *Macbeth* lives on in various reincarnations across time. Here you will find excerpts from William Davenant’s 1674 *Macbeth*, Francis Talfourd’s parody, *Macbeth Travesties*, and excerpts from both Giuseppe Verdi’s 1865 *Macbeth* and some letters he wrote about his opera. There are also excerpts from Eugene Ionesco’s 1972 *Macbeth*, and uMabatha’s 1996 *Welcome Msomi*, an adaptation re-contextualized in Zulu culture, and more.

Twelve illustrations have been added, all centred on moments of dramatic performance and further underscoring Miola’s editorial shift toward all things theatrical in this 2014 edition.

Everything else is small potatoes. Miola’s “Introduction” remains largely the same, but there are a few subtle changes consistent with the new emphasis on theatricality. For example, towards the end of the 2004 introductory essay Miola is discussing Macbeth’s “dizzying plunge” into the inevitability of his murderous actions. The point is that this descent is inextricably linked to the speed at which it all happens: “[t]he interconnectedness of conception, execution, and consequence” (xix). In the second edition Miola further underscores that point by citing a single extra sentence quoted from director Gregory Doran on the “furious pace” of the play’s events and the “terrible whirlwind” (xxii) of consequences. In the same essay when Miola is discussing the connections between “moral law” and the “exterior natural world” (xii), he inserts another single sentence that connects this phenomenon to an afterlife reverberation of this theme in Ninagawa’s *Macbeth*. Once again, the change is small, but it signifies Miola’s editorial and critical commitment to tracing and enhancing different theatrical elements where possible.

Under “Sources and Contexts” (historical, philosophical, political, and theological) the readings remain essentially the same. The first edition sub-heading, called “Cultural Controversies,” has now been re-renamed “Contexts.” You will see the occasional new vocabulary gloss and some small formatting changes such as line alignment here, but overall, this section strongly resembles the 2004 version.

“A Note on the Text” becomes “Textual Notes” which has been relocated from the front of the play to the back. In the first edition, Miola split the last scene into two (5.7 and 5.8) at the point where Macduff exits with Macbeth’s

body. In the second edition, that scene split no longer exists, so he now follows F1. The idea of splitting 5.7 into two scenes makes some sense given the exits and entrances of so many characters at one time, but Miola's current decision to follow F1 also has merit since it keeps his text faithful to F1.

In the same spirit of minor revisions, the "*Dramatis Personae*" of the 2004 edition now becomes "Character List" and has been both enhanced and re-sequenced. The new grouping of characters is by family allegiance, social status ("thanes"), and minor characters.

The "Selected Bibliography" of 2004 has been renamed "Resources" and includes a few newly added online resources, most of which are databases and portals that will redirect you to your own critical resources. The bibliography of print items is pruned and expanded: marginally related and outdated resources are gone; new, more obviously useful items are added.

Finally, and most tellingly, changes to the text itself are minor. For example, in 2004 Miola embedded his own scene locations into the headings of some scenes, but these are now demoted to footnotes, reminding us that these are editorial opinions and not part of F1. Miola's footnotes are either vocabulary glosses or annotations, and they remain largely the same. There are small changes in accidentals (capitalization, font formatting, and punctuation); for example, "His Majesty" (5.1.3 first edition) becomes "his majesty" in the second edition. Given the straightforward nature of this text's relation to other first generation editions, namely, that it only exists in F1, there are few problematic textual complexities in play to cause any great concern.

The substance of Miola's scholarly contribution to the criticism of *Macbeth* remains, of course, undiminished. His argument that the text rejects "the Protestant dichotomy between the elect and reprobate" and favours "the Catholic view of free will" (xix) remains a compelling alternative to Calvinist readings.

Actors, directors, and producers might find an enriched choice of resources to help them think about staging and performing *Macbeth*. Nevertheless, while all these modifications are welcome, the second edition does not supersede the first, at least in this reviewer's opinion.

PETER PAOLUCCI

York University