

Renaissance and Reformation
Renaissance et Réforme



Zysk, Jay. Shadow and Substance: Eucharistic Controversy and English Drama across the Reformation Divide

Mark Albert Johnston

Volume 41, Number 3, Summer 2018

URI: <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1085726ar>

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.33137/rr.v41i3.31662>

[See table of contents](#)

Publisher(s)

Iter Press

ISSN

0034-429X (print)

2293-7374 (digital)

[Explore this journal](#)

Cite this review

Johnston, M. (2018). Review of [Zysk, Jay. Shadow and Substance: Eucharistic Controversy and English Drama across the Reformation Divide]. *Renaissance and Reformation / Renaissance et Réforme*, 41(3), 277–280.
<https://doi.org/10.33137/rr.v41i3.31662>

© Canadian Society for Renaissance Studies / Société canadienne d'études de la Renaissance; Pacific Northwest Renaissance Society; Toronto Renaissance and Reformation Colloquium; Victoria University Centre for Renaissance and Reformation Studies, 2018

This document is protected by copyright law. Use of the services of Érudit (including reproduction) is subject to its terms and conditions, which can be viewed online.

<https://apropos.erudit.org/en/users/policy-on-use/>

érudit

This article is disseminated and preserved by Érudit.

Érudit is a non-profit inter-university consortium of the Université de Montréal, Université Laval, and the Université du Québec à Montréal. Its mission is to promote and disseminate research.

<https://www.erudit.org/en/>

was compiled both to promote her cult and to serve as a rule for the convent; it consists of her biography by her confessor, her sermons transcribed by her fellow nuns, and a second, this time anonymous, biography.

The last chapter is devoted to the Bolognese nun Pudenziana *junior* (d. 1662). She was one of two Zagnoni sisters. The first, Pudenziana *senior*, was a Franciscan tertiary who died very young in 1608 in the odour of sanctity. After her death, her younger sister, Pudenziana *junior*, who had also been a Franciscan tertiary, joined the Clarisse and soon began having visions of her older sibling. Thanks to these visions, Giovanni Andrea Rota was able to compile a hagiography of the older sister whose fame as a saint not only spread but also allowed her Zagnoni family to acquire titles of nobility (a not uncommon process to nobility for some families in the seventeenth century).

With its variety of protagonists, from noble women to accused witches, from saints to heretics, from rulers to ruled, Zarri's volume presents the modern reader with a number of female protagonists who epitomize the diversity present in the lives of early modern women.

MATTIA ZANGARI

Università di Firenze

Zysk, Jay.

Shadow and Substance: Eucharistic Controversy and English Drama across the Reformation Divide.

Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 2017. Pp. 377, xiv. ISBN 978-0-2681-0230-2 (paperback) US\$45.

Shadow and Substance strives to elucidate how Eucharistic controversies over the exegetic meaning of Christ's body as a set of martyred signs not only transgress any putative pre- and post-Reformation periodic boundaries distinguishing medieval from early modern (and confessional designations like traditional versus reformed) but also raise pressing questions about the distance between textual representation and physical embodiment, the semiotic gaps and fissures characterizing the vexed relationship of all bodies—divine, human, sacramental, and dramatic—to language. Viewing the Protestant Reformation not as a decisive epistemological shift from the sacred to the secular but rather as a constellation

of diverse theological and semiotic positions asserted and interpreted over time, each section observes Eucharistic discourse's inflecting questions of embodiment and interpretation in religious, secular, and professional drama written and performed across the Reformation divide. Beginning with a survey of the complex semiotics of Eucharistic theology to frustrate simple binaries and narratives of teleological progress, the first chapter insists that Eucharistic discourse cannot be reduced to a series of esoteric debates about substance and accidents, and proceeds to unpack four interrelated concepts that demonstrate the dynamic relationship between theology and semiotics: body and sign; flesh and spirit; literal and figurative; and works and deeds. Five subsequent sections illustrate how a Eucharistic semiotics inflects dramatic representation; each gathers earlier and later forms of Eucharistic theology and English drama around a key topos: Christ's wounds; the king's sacred body; liturgical books and language; relics and devotional objects; and sacramental presence.

Moving from biblical and civic cycle drama—in which Christ blazons his wounded body to turn sacramental encounters into semiotic encounters, and in which his body becomes central to an ecclesiological vision of social community forged through linguistic bonds—to Shakespeare's *Coriolanus*—wherein the eponymous hero iconoclastically removes his scarred body from systems of signification and performance, thereby throwing the Roman body politic out of joint—the second chapter demonstrates how both Christ and Coriolanus variously participate in a semiotics that would transform wounds into words in an effort to forge community. The third chapter applies the same principle to the mystical body, or *corpus mysticum*, by examining representations of the king's sacred body as a sign of social discord and/or community in three distinct contexts, beginning with John Lydgate's performative verses commemorating *Henry VI's Triumphal Entry into London*, which fashions the king's royal presence in scriptural and liturgical terms, and his *Procession of Corpus Christi*, which conversely employs images of kingship to describe the majesty of the Eucharistic sacrament. In concert with Lydgate's texts, Zysk positions two plays: John Bale's *King Johan*, which connects royal and sacramental bodies in terms of social communities and forges an alternate semiotic of kingship based upon Scripture rather than Catholic ritual; and Shakespeare's *Macbeth*, which stages regicide as a desecration of the king's sacred body that jeopardizes the integrity of the *corpus mysticum* in religious and political registers. Whereas Bale attempts to divest the mystical royal body of the Eucharistic symbolism

evident in *Lydgate*, Shakespeare depicts the rejection of sacramental kingship as a catalyst for political chaos.

Chapter 4 effectively compares signs of Eucharistic confection and efficacious (or performative) language in the medieval morality play *Everyman* and Christopher Marlowe's *Doctor Faustus*. While the former highlights the importance of confecting priesthood to sacramental life by upholding the priest's power to cure the soul via the sacramental rights he is authorized to administer, the latter repurposes claims about liturgical language by relating magical conjuration to Eucharistic confection, with Faustus suffering from "priest envy" in his attraction to necromantic books, conjurations, and spells. A fifth chapter charts the semiotics of relics or holy matter, beginning with the contested readings of the host in the Croxton *Play of the Sacrament*—which dramatizes several acts of misreading prior to the host's ultimately revealing its status as the true body of Christ—before turning to John Webster's *The Duchess of Malfi* and Middleton and Rowley's *The Changeling*, both of which repurpose the semiotics of sacred matter to stage fragmented and dismembered bodies functioning as vehicles for both devotion and deceit, thereby locating the power of the relic not in its divine agency per se but rather in its semiotic pliancy. Finally fixating on bodies that are physically present but unrecognizable, chapter 6 considers the Emmaus episodes of resurrection drama, wherein Christ's disciples are unable to recognize their risen Lord despite his material presence; the early Tudor *Jack Juggler*, in which the eponymous Jack not only steals the identity of the simple page boy Jankyn Careaway but also perpetuates that semiotic rupture by convincing the boy that he is no longer himself; and Shakespeare's *The Winter's Tale*, in which Leontes's supposedly-dead wife Hermione is restored to him in the flesh once he correctly interprets her statue as a living body. While Zysk's argument throughout the book is complex, erudite, and convincing, it falters here slightly only because he seems overzealous to emphasize the role of interpretation over transformation; ironically, this final reading unnecessarily diminishes the play's complex ambiguity by insisting that the statue is never actually stone, that the only transformation is hermeneutic, and that Paulina's command for Hermione to "be stone no more" constitutes a declarative stage cue rather than performative confection. Clearly, Hermione's statue is not a Eucharistic host; nevertheless, Shakespeare's late romance emphasizes—for both its audiences and its characters—the vital importance of fostering faith in the possibility of miracle, even if everyone knows all along

that special effects usually consist of a good deal more *hocus pocus* than *hoc est corpus meum*.

MARK ALBERT JOHNSTON

University of Windsor