

## Book Reviews Comptes rendus

Volume 38, Number 1, 2015

URI: <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1036230ar>

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.7202/1036230ar>

[See table of contents](#)

Publisher(s)

CSTHA/AHSTC

ISSN

1918-7750 (digital)

[Explore this journal](#)

Cite this review

(2015). Review of [Book Reviews / Comptes rendus]. *Scientia Canadensis*, 38(1), 86–113. <https://doi.org/10.7202/1036230ar>

## Compte rendu

---

### "Book Reviews / Comptes rendus"

[s.a.]

*Scientia Canadensis: Canadian Journal of the History of Science, Technology and Medicine / Scientia*

*Canadensis : revue canadienne d'histoire des sciences, des techniques et de la médecine* , vol. 38, n°  
1, 2015, p. 86-113.

Pour citer ce compte rendu, utiliser l'adresse suivante :

URI: <http://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1036230ar>

DOI: 10.7202/1036230ar

Note : les règles d'écriture des références bibliographiques peuvent varier selon les différents domaines du savoir.

---

Ce document est protégé par la loi sur le droit d'auteur. L'utilisation des services d'Érudit (y compris la reproduction) est assujettie à sa politique d'utilisation que vous pouvez consulter à l'URI <https://apropos.erudit.org/fr/usagers/politique-dutilisation/>

---

Érudit est un consortium interuniversitaire sans but lucratif composé de l'Université de Montréal, l'Université Laval et l'Université du Québec à Montréal. Il a pour mission la promotion et la valorisation de la recherche. Érudit offre des services d'édition numérique de documents scientifiques depuis 1998.

Pour communiquer avec les responsables d'Érudit : [info@erudit.org](mailto:info@erudit.org)

## *Book Reviews / Comptes rendus*

### **Environment / Environnement**

***Temagami's Tangled Wild: Race, Gender, and the Making of Canadian Nature.* By Jocelyn Thorpe.** (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2012. xix + 194 p., notes, bibl., ill., index. ISBN 978-0-77482-201-5 \$32.95).

Anyone who has ever experienced the tranquility of the forests and lakes of Temagami, Ontario could be forgiven for not knowing that the region has, in the words of Jocelyn Thorpe, “long been a contested space” (8). They can be forgiven only because, as Thorpe argues in *Temagami's Tangled Wild*, the perception of tranquility is the product of over a century of colonizing efforts to construct the forests and lakes as a wilderness, devoid of human beings and their long history on the land. The Teme Augama Anishnabai have called n'Daki Menan home since long before Eurocanadians first set foot in what they now call Temagami. By combining post-colonial theory and social nature scholarship, Thorpe offers a clear and detailed account of how racial and gendered discourses were employed by conservationists, tourists, and the Canadian state to erase Temagami's Indigenous history and construct a hyper-masculinized and nationalized version of the region as a wild place.

Over the course of four main chapters, Thorpe examines the overlapping, at times contradictory, but ultimately mutually constitutive conservationist, cultural, governmental, and legal discourses used by settler colonial society to imagine and realize Temagami as a wild and virgin territory. Conservationists depicted the “wild,” “virgin” territory as a wasted resource awaiting scientific management, while tourists used the same language to romanticize an imagined history of the area and its vanishing people. Although government officials and tourists experienced the place as a site of commercial logging and its first peoples as long-standing and active residents, these realities could not dislodge the power of the rhetorical scaffolding used to legitimize the claims of the Canadian state and its citizens to Temagami.

Nowhere was the flawed logic that transformed Temagami into a wilderness more apparent than in the ways various colonizing agents constructed Indigenous history in the region. As Thorpe explains, “Whereas early-twentieth-century Temagami tourists never questioned the existence of Aboriginal people in the past, and tourism discourse actually worked to fix the Teme Augama Anishnabai in a prior time, Ontario's legal argument [against land claims] worked to evict the band from its past” (104). It did not matter that these interpretations of the past contradicted

one another, as long as they served to justify settler colonialism and the myth of wilderness in the present.

By detailing the racial and gendered discourses used by Eurocanadians to erase Indigenous peoples and their history, and construct in its place a myth of wilderness, Thorpe offers a valuable case study to demonstrate that William Cronon's canonic essay "The Trouble With Wilderness" applies not just to American frontier history, but equally well to the Canadian setting. Indeed, the great strength of *Temagami's Tangled Wild*, and the reason it will interest scholars of Indigenous Studies and Environmental History outside Canada, is Thorpe's use of discourse analysis to give Cronon's thesis a Foucaultian twist. "Trouble begins," Thorpe writes, "when we mistake our [cultural and historical] lens for the world itself" (14). Here Foucault's work on knowledge creation is used to elucidate one of environmental history's central tenets: that the idea of nature (and therefore wilderness) is socially constructed.

The other central tenet is that nature has a material reality that influences human perceptions of the world they inhabit. Culture shapes natures, yes. But nature also shapes culture. The concept of nature is constructed, but what is *not* constructed is the fact that the natural world has agency beyond the human imagination. In other words, the relationship between culture and nature is reciprocal. Thorpe does a brilliant job illustrating the ways that culture shapes ideas and the treatment of the natural world, but the material realities of the natural world receive much less attention.

This focus on the social construction of nature leads to a second, related problem, which is that Thorpe often conflates "nature" and "wilderness" in the discussion. There is an imprecision and inconsistency in the way Thorpe uses the terms nature, natural, and naturalized. The terms are never clearly defined. In some cases, natural is a description derived from a relationship to the non-human world. In other cases, Thorpe uses natural to denote an unquestioned and decontextualized typology or categorization. Occasionally, Thorpe uses the term in both ways in the same sentence, as with this example from Chapter 2 on the creation of the Temagami Forest Reserve (TFR): "Forest conservation discourse worked not only to make Canadian forests and forest conservation appear natural, but also to naturalize the Canadian nation and its place with the British Empire" (45).

The closest Thorpe comes to defining nature is during a discussion about "the fiction of a culture-free nature" (14). This, of course, could also be a perfectly good definition of wilderness. And there are many examples of where Thorpe writes nature but actually means wilderness. For example, in describing the way the TFR erased Indigenous history, Thorpe writes that the 1898 Ontario Forest Reserves Act "was what made the region,

legally speaking, into a natural, national space” (40). The region had always been part of the non-human world. The creation of the reserve made the region into a wilderness. This trend is most obvious in Chapter 3, on tourist representations of Temagami, when the term wilderness is used almost exclusively and nature gets dropped. The arguments in Chapter 3 are the book’s most consistent and persuasive, indicating that wilderness is a more useful term in Thorpe’s arguments.

At the same time as Thorpe outlines the ways settler colonialism erased and displaced the Indigenous presence in Temagami, this book also makes it clear that members of the Teme-Augama Anishnabai negotiated and resisted these colonial processes. From their official complaints and petitions to the Department of Indian Affairs for a reserve, to their defiance of hunting and fishing laws within the park, and their use of seasonal employment to subsist through discrimination and racist state oppression, the Teme-Augama Anishnabai exercised their own agency within and outside a system that denied them their rights. Indeed, Thorpe opens the book by describing the efforts of the Teme Agama Anishnabai to oppose the construction of new logging roads in N’Deka Menan during the 1980s. This account includes a brief mention of how environmentalists rendered the Indigenous struggle invisible through their protests and activism against the logging. This would have been a nice way to bring this excellent history to a close, but Thorpe does not return to this subject in the conclusion.

In arguing that Temagami’s wilderness was constructed, Thorpe is also arguing that we can *deconstruct* the narrative that legitimized Indigenous dispossession. “We are shaped by and left with these legacies [of colonization and dispossession], albeit in differing ways depending upon where we fit within the nation, but we do not need to pass them along unquestioned to future generations” (5). Understanding the past is the first step towards correcting the legacies of historical injustices.

ANDREW WATSON  
*University of Saskatchewan*

***Wet Prairie: People, Land, and Water in Agricultural Manitoba.* By Shannon Stunden Bower.** (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2013. xx + 218 p., notes, bibl., ill., index. ISBN 978-0-77481-853-7 \$34.95).

While I have been reading this book and pondering over my review, Manitobans have been bracing for the flood season with some apprehension. Recent falls of wet snow in the Red river watershed have

increased the likelihood of flooding. Heavy spring rains could change a threat into a disaster. Such are the facts of life for those who live in the wet prairie. While farmers look to their dykes and fill sand bags, and Winnipeggers go about their business secure in their trust of their massive Red River Floodway, Aboriginal people, whose reserves are in the Interlake area, look forward with despair to yet another year dispossessed and away from their homes. They feel—with some justification—that floodwater diverted upstream is dumped in their homelands.

*Wet Prairie* helps us to understand how this situation came to be. Spanning more than one hundred years, the book explains how Manitobans have wrestled with the ironic truth that some of the richest and most productive soils found on the prairies are plagued with too much water rather than too little. Drainage is the solution to bringing this wealth to fruition, not irrigation. It has taken several generations to grasp the extent and complexity of the problem, and the fact that providing drainage is not a “one off” achievement, but rather a relentless on-going campaign. The provincial government has shouldered most of this responsibility, and has been hampered in its efforts by a lack of resources and a hesitant and piece-meal grasp on technology. The results were tragic for many incoming farm families. Moreover, here—as in the dry portion of eastern Alberta and western Saskatchewan—land was ploughed up which should have remained in its natural state.

One of the roots of the problem was the imposition, by the federal government, of a uniform grid system of survey and settlement completely at odds with the infinitely complex mosaic of micro-topography of the province. To frame it in the author’s words: “To understand the significance of drainage in Manitoba it is important to consider the administrative structures and communities of interest that emerged from the tension between the settlement system enacted by the Dominion Government and the province’s wet prairie landscape.” (48)

The story takes us from the formation of Municipalities and Drainage Districts in the Nineteenth Century, to the emergence of Conservation Districts in the second half of the Twentieth century. A particularly insightful chapter deals with the international implications of the cross border movements of water, and the flight paths of migrating birds. The cooperative success of the International Joint Commission on the Roseau River drainage basin stands in contrast to the intransigent ‘head butting’ which characterized more local debates. Moreover, the cross border work of Ducks Unlimited brought new expertise and resources to bear on old problems and helped to transform Big Grass Marsh.

This is a scholarly book. The notes and bibliography demonstrate admirable breadth and depth. The book tackles a topic, which has largely been ignored, in an innovative manner. The text is focused, lean, and provocative. The author links her story to broad themes such as “state formation.” She argues that wrestling with water management “bore on the ultimate shape of the [Manitoba] government itself” (9). Likewise, the tension between the rights of individual landowners, and their need to cooperate to confront the challenges of “foreign water,” is linked to the ongoing discussion of “liberalism” (13). The author’s light touch and sophistication are demonstrated towards the end of the book. She develops a nuanced argument that the momentum generated by new ideas and money was absorbed by the inertia brought on by generations of disappointments and broken dreams.

For all its manifest strengths, the book is not without shortcomings. To achieve brevity and clarity of focus, Bower is forced to compress her discussion of the physical geography of the region into a few introductory paragraphs. For me, this environmental history had too much history and not enough environment. The author’s soup bowl analogy to describe the topography of Manitoba’s wet prairie did not resonate with me (2, 3, 6, etc). All my bowls are closed systems, and the Manitoba lowlands are manifestly not! Seriously, to come to grips with water movements in the region we have to understand the characteristics of the major rivers. We have to look at gradients, discharge, velocity, bed load, channel characteristics, and changing base levels. It is not reasonable to separate catastrophic flooding from agricultural flooding (8). What is needed is a brief outline of the typology of floods, and an expanded analysis of the matrix of variables which give rise to them (7). It is the vegetation and soils of the wet prairie that are their distinguishing characteristics. The “scrubby vegetation” shown in the photograph represents a complex response to edaphic and atmospheric conditions, and the vegetation in turn “creates” the soil (123). Each water body is surrounded by a catena of soil types.

The township plan, produced by Henry Law, Deputy Land Surveyor, in 1872, gave me my only glimpse of the micro-topography, and consequent differences in soils and vegetation, within a 36-square-mile area. It gave me a real understanding of the different points of view of those favoured with lighter soils and fewer drainage problems, and those saddled with land that was underwater for prolonged periods. G.S. Howard complained: “It is injurious to our health to go about from day to day wet footed” (25). More analysis at this scale would have been helpful. There are ten excellent maps, but all of them are small scale covering most of the province. Finally, those who occupied this land before Manitoba

joined Confederation get short shrift. The wetlands were a seasonal storehouse to hunters and collectors; a veritable Eden. Moreover, the first settlers with their long-lot system, stretching back from the rivers adopted an adaptive strategy which accommodated periodic inundation in marked contrast to the grid imposed later. Now that the “heavy lifting” of the historical and political story has been so elegantly outlined, other scholars may be tempted to elucidate other aspects of the wet prairie, the hydrology, vegetation, soils and ecology.

SIMON M. EVANS  
*University of Calgary*

***Wilderness and Waterpower: How Banff National Park Became a Hydroelectric Storage Reservoir.* By Christopher Armstrong and H.V. Nelles.** (Calgary: Calgary University Press, 2013. xviii + 267 p., notes, bibl., ill., index. ISBN 978-1-55238-634-7 \$41.95).

In their latest collaboration, Christopher Armstrong and H. V. Nelles return to southeastern Alberta’s Bow River, a subject they explored in *The Painted Valley* (University of Calgary Press, 2007) and with Matthew Evenden in *The River Returns* (McGill-Queen’s University Press, 2009). Drawing on corporate records, letters, newspaper articles, and other archival sources, the authors effectively use tables, graphs, and maps to illustrate how the current boundaries of the Banff National Park were delineated by a private power corporation. As the Bow River system was dammed and rerouted for urban energy demands, the park constricted. The authors trace how the metropolis of Calgary and the imagined wilderness of Banff were locked in a close embrace—one bridged and built by the river, ideology, and capital investment. The book’s twelve chapters explore this relationship chronologically, each illustrating unique episodes of tension between different interests, external pressures, and environmental constraints.

As Armstrong and Nelles argue, the Calgary Power Corporation (now TransAlta) was entranced by a “very Canadian obsession with hydroelectricity” (33), which saw its members repeatedly favour hydroelectricity over cheaper and more efficient coal or natural gas. Calgary Power’s predecessor first looked to the Bow to generate electricity at the turn of the nineteenth century. Since the river is fed by glaciers in Banff National Park (formerly Rocky Mountains National Park), this meant negotiating with the federal Parks Branch to develop Lake Minnewanka, Spray Lakes, and other parts of the river system. The



Nakoda (Stoney) First Nation, whose reserve adjoined the river, also pushed for fair compensation. Beginning in the 1910s, the company recognized that maximizing profits necessitated even more development in order to continuously produce and sell power.

But the river did not naturally lend itself to the type of flows the company needed. To even out streamflow, the company had to dam the river system within the park. For half a century, Calgary Power marshaled its arguments for these projects, while the Parks Branch and conservationists countered that re-engineering the river would tarnish the park and destroy fish-spawning habitat. Developing the Bow became entangled in everything from inter-regional resentments to the Catholic Schools question, leading to the involvement of every level of government. In what Armstrong and Nelles call a process of “policy hardening” (x). Parks officials came to see hydroelectric generation as antithetical to the uses of a national park—even though a zoo and golf course were acceptable. Despite these objections, Banff’s boundaries were redrawn again and again to accommodate hydroelectricity generation. Only in the 1950s, when Calgary Power ran out of falling water on the Bow, did the company shift to coal instead,

Armstrong and Nelles clearly show how the various stakeholders were preoccupied by internal disagreements about how to manage the river and park. Although the authors warn that theirs is no “moral tale” (xii), the Bow made for an uneven playing field as a few dozen businessmen, bureaucrats, and entrepreneurs disproportionately managed and profited from it. Their political and economic success was often contingent on the river behaving in predictable ways. Yet even as three diversions, eight storage reservoirs, and eleven generating stations re-engineered the Bow’s flow and reshaped its ecology, the river did not always oblige. Armstrong and Nelles evoke Richard White’s exploration of the Columbia River in his influential *The Organic Machine* (Hill and Wang, 1996) as they show that the Bow River maintained its natural, unmade qualities even as Calgary Power repeatedly exceeded its drawdown limits, destroying fish spawning beds at Spray Lakes and flooding land adjacent to the river. Calgaryans have become accustomed to the river’s “second nature,” so much so that any calls to remove Calgary Power’s dams have been rejected. In the wake of the 2013 floods that devastated southeastern Alberta, it is worth asking whether the city’s relationship with the river will take another turn.

*Wilderness and Waterpower* is a thorough and readable contribution to the field. Armstrong and Nelles carefully tie together the explosive growth of Alberta’s largest city, the many compromises shaping Canada’s most famous national park, and Calgary Power’s transition from a struggling

syndicate into one of the province's largest energy suppliers. They even fit in a compelling explanation of how long-serving Alberta Social Credit Premier Ernest C. Manning's distrust of state-owned industry led him to successfully resist nationalizing the province's electricity in the late 1940s. This book is essential reading for science and technology researchers focusing on business history, Western Canada, rivers, national parks, and public policy, as well as for southeastern Albertans intrigued by the river that defines their home.

ANNE DANCE

*Memorial University of Newfoundland*

***Histoire véritable et naturelle de la Nouvelle-France. Par Pierre Boucher (Texte moderne établi par Christophe Horguelin, Postface de Thomas Wien).*** (Montréal: Almanach, 2014. 247 p. ISBN 978-2-9814849-0-1 \$28.00).

La dernière édition de cette Histoire véritable et naturelle remontait à 1964, soit 300 ans après la première édition. Publié par la Société historique de Boucherville, l'ouvrage était offert au public en fac-simile de l'original, mais était accompagné d'études spécifiques relatives aux différents sujets traités par Pierre Boucher, aussi bien que de textes plus anciens portant sur l'auteur et son oeuvre. La version proposée par Christophe Horguelin est établie d'après l'exemplaire ayant servi à l'édition de 1964. Le texte, transcrit en français moderne, conserve toutefois la graphie ancienne des noms de lieux et de variétés végétales ou animales. Cette édition étant prévue pour un usage courant et un lectorat non spécialisé, les notes de bas de page sont absentes et on a reporté les précisions sur la flore et la faune en fin de volume.

La présentation du texte de l'Histoire véritable et naturelle est suivie d'une postface de Thomas Wien. Avant de revoir à sa façon les incontournables que sont la genèse, le contenu et la réception du livre, il nous propose un regard neuf sur la vie de Pierre Boucher. Quoi de mieux qu'un curriculum vitæ pour situer le personnage ! Toutes les sections habituelles d'un tel document sont présentes : renseignements personnels, stage, langues, expérience professionnelle, publications, prix et récompenses. Une telle entrée en matière met le lecteur dans de bonnes dispositions pour le reste de cette étude.

La vie et l'oeuvre de Pierre Boucher ont bien servi les élites religieuses et académiques d'avant 1960, qui étaient en quête de figures édifiantes pour la Canada français. Thomas Wien explique qu'en rapprochant le

personnage de ses contemporains, on lui donne une dimension plus humaine, permettant ainsi de mettre en place le contexte entourant la genèse de l'Histoire véritable et naturelle. C'est la voie qu'il emprunte. Décrivant « La vie mouvementée de Pierre B. », il relate les principales actions qui ont contribué à façonner un héros composite, mais d'une manière plus organique, reliant l'homme à son époque et sa société.

Dans « Un Éden à conquérir », Wien décrit la situation de la colonie française aux prises avec les attaques iroquoises, la mission de Boucher en France en 1661-1662 et explique comment il en est venu à écrire l'Histoire véritable et naturelle à son retour. Il poursuit avec une description du contenu, qui correspond parfaitement à la demande de Colbert qui incite Boucher « à coucher par écrit et à publier les éléments de réponse qu'il a fournis à ses interlocuteurs en France » (169). Thomas Wien identifie ainsi les objectifs de Pierre Boucher et les moyens littéraires pour y parvenir. Relativement à la question des relations avec les Amérindiens, Wien fait ressortir les perspectives (ethnographique, militaire ou religieuse) adoptées par l'auteur, qui a passé quatre ans dans une mission jésuite en Huronie.

Dans « L'histoire de l'Histoire », Thomas Wien tente de cerner l'influence qu'a eue l'Histoire véritable et naturelle. Il s'attache à découvrir les preuves de la disponibilité de l'ouvrage et à montrer, selon une trame chronologique de 1664 à aujourd'hui, les utilisations qu'en ont fait les historiens. En contextualisant ces données littéraires et historiographiques, il donne une bonne idée des sensibilités propres aux différentes époques.

Cette édition de l'Histoire véritable et naturelle se termine par quelques annexes explicatives. Après un court texte sur les « Peuples autochtones cités », des tableaux sur la faune et la flore indigène font les liens entre les espèces nommées par Pierre Boucher et les dénominations actuelles, de même que leurs habitats.

Les éditions Almanach auront donc fait oeuvre utile en reproduisant cet ouvrage. Le lecteur intéressé par la Nouvelle-France pionnière, et surtout par les écrits qui ne sont pas d'origine religieuse, pourra prendre connaissance d'un des textes importants dans une livraison au langage facile d'accès grâce à Christophe Horguelin. Le chercheur, historien ou ethnologue, trouvera lui aussi son compte dans l'étude fouillée de Thomas Wien, garnie de nombreuses notes de bas de page qui permettent de poursuivre la réflexion sur les pistes historiques ou historiographiques ouvertes par l'oeuvre de Pierre Boucher.

JEAN-FRANÇOIS PLANTE  
*Université Laval*

**Technology / Technologie**

***Architecture and the Canadian Fabric.* By Rhodri Windsor Liscombe (ed.).** (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2011. xxii + 514 p., notes, bibl., ill., index. ISBN 978-0-7748-1940-4 \$39.95).

Rhodri Windsor Liscombe's anthology *Architecture and the Canadian Fabric*, which consolidates the recent research of eighteen scholars of Canada's built environment into broader themes of Canadian history, is an important contribution to the literature. It offers a "sequence of investigations of architectural form-making and architectural formations of Canadian society through the material and symbolic disposition of structure and space" (6). As a compilation of contrasting perspectives framed within more recent cultural theory, it moves forward from Harold Kalman's two-volume survey *A History of Canadian Architecture* (Oxford University Press, 1994) and mirrors the productive network of exchange that has been established by the Society for the Study of Architecture in Canada. It both outlines new questions regarding what we can learn about Canada from its architecture, and demonstrates the evolving methods of architectural historians from varied disciplinary backgrounds.

The book is organized into seven themes that follow a roughly chronological sequence, taking us from early colonial encounters of New France to the 21<sup>st</sup> century real estate of British Columbia. The essays address French Canada, Upper Canada, Confederation, Reconstruction, Modern Nationhood, and the Late/Postmodern Era. This chronological arrangement, and a final section on "Identities of Canadian Architecture," highlights the book's primary theme—the contribution of architecture to the construction of Canadian social fabric—and its capacity to carry political and cultural symbolism. Essential texts to making this case are the editor's substantial introduction "Writing into Canadian Architectural History" and a conclusion that reviews methods deployed across the book while defining gaps for future writing to address.

Architectural history has evolved from diverse disciplines, including primarily art history, architecture and geography. This is reflected in the differing roles it is perceived to play by scholars, architects, and communities. Histories focused on the oeuvre of influential architects, iconic works, and characterization by style, have often neglected broader social questions raised in studies of vernacular architecture, or more critically engaged theories of design and its representations. This collection brings together these perspectives, up to a point.

The focus is on ‘social fabric,’ as fabricated representation, rather than the usual use of ‘built fabric,’ to mean constructed substance. This perhaps explains why large, collective buildings, both public and commercial (churches, museums, market halls, hockey arenas, office towers) still tend to dominate. As truly public building diminishes, the connections between private and public architectural legacies may be muddled. Here governmental endeavors to house Canadians are treated under the rubric of “Reconstructing Canada.” Contributions by Lucie Morisset, Alan Marcus and Liscombe, expand on the significance of housing forms from suburban bungalows to urban towers, as memory, shelter and real estate, to Canadian collective identities. Nicolas Olsberg’s chapter on how Arthur Erickson became “Canada’s greatest architect” personalizes the larger public building commissions of the recent past. He then also links this design/political process to private but iconic house designs.

Should one expect a collection on architecture erected across the immense Canadian territory to represent all its regions? A cross reading of the book by region does reveal the general absence of the Atlantic provinces, despite their rich built heritage. More general chapters that tap into examples from Charlottetown to Calgary, and one essay about the North, do help to round out a focus on Toronto, Ottawa, and the provinces of Quebec and British Columbia. Numerous essays on BC provide the most complete picture of a region. This includes Geoffrey Carr’s positioning of Vancouver’s World Building in the colonial production of place; Justin McGrail’s elucidation of Langford’s ‘New Retail’ big box landscape; Rhodri Windsor Liscombe’s parsing of the Vancouver condo market’s language; and Daniel Millette’s cross-cultural analysis of new Coast Salish longhouse designs. The juxtapositions of these seemingly distinct lines of enquiry show the value of expanding on regional studies that have emphasized climate, materials and tradition. It is, however, surprising to see nothing in this selection that explicitly addresses how environmental ideas have colored the evolution of design in that province, now known for its innovative sustainable design.

This series of essays also suggest that historians of the built environment are paying more attention to the perspectives of Canada’s Aboriginal communities and designers. The chapters by Judy Loach, Geoffrey Carr, Alan Marcus, Laura Hanks and Daniel Millette, provide multiple insights into the roles of architecture in the social and engineering experiments of colonization. Alan Marcus examines English/Swedish architect Ralph Erskine’s abandoned design for housing at Qausuittuq (Resolute Bay), Nunavut. Latent segregation articulated under the veil of climate-oriented planning reveals the hubris of Canadian engagement in international

modernist planning. Laura Hanks explores the material and metaphoric expressions embedded in exhibitions, architecture and landscape of the former Canadian Museum of Civilization in Gatineau, Quebec. This discloses the paradoxical responses of Douglas Cardinal, Canada's foremost Aboriginal designer, to this nation-building museum project. Such reassessments are essential if we are to define roles for architecture in reconciliation.

Certain chapters contribute more substantially to questions of Canadian identity, such as those that examine fabrication of national character through architectural styles. The ambivalence and/or mutability of architectural 'language'—even as it is appropriated for political purposes—is established in two essays, on the use of 'Gothic Revival' in pre-confederation Ottawa (Christopher Thomas), and the variable uses across the country of 'Brutalism' to celebrate confederation a century later (Rejean Legault). But if language is an ongoing theme of architectural histories, the book also reflects on communication technologies, be it radio's role in channeling hockey's public space (Michael Windover) or the connecting discourses of mass urbanization/media and McLuhan's global village (Richard Cavell). Architecture in/as various forms of advertising—coined here by Liscombe as "archi-tizing"—is also acknowledged in multiple texts. The communication theme is expanded when you consider the range of materials cited, from colonial texts and maps to oral histories and trade publications. If there is one thing that the reader might have wished for, it might have been a proportionally greater use of images.

Rhodri Windsor Liscombe is a long time professor at UBC's School of Art History, Visual Art and Theory, and currently Associate Dean of Graduate Studies. Through this publication by UBC Press, he has shared with a wider audience the insights first discussed in a lecture series at UBC's St John College. In seeking to establish the roles of architecture in building Canadian society, this collection of distinct voices and approaches is more effective than a single author volume. The work of consolidating these individual histories into a coherent if not cohesive narrative is no mean feat, and the resulting anthology will be of great value to those studying and teaching the history of Canada from many perspectives.

SUSAN ROSS  
*Carleton University*

***The Computer Boys Take Over: Computers, Programmers and the Politics of Technical Expertise.* By Nathan Ensmenger.** (Cambridge: The MIT Press, 2010. x + 326 p., notes, bibl., index. ISBN 978-0-26205-093-7 \$55.00).

***Recoding Gender: Women's Changing Participation in Computing.* By Janet Abbate.** (Cambridge: The MIT Press, 2012. x + 254 p., notes, bibl., index. ISBN 978-0-26201-806-7 \$34.00).

In 2010 and 2012, MIT Press published two books that examined the same thing: the professionalization of post-war computing. The manner in which they approach this topic, however, is strikingly different. Nathan Ensmenger's *The Computer Boys Take Over* focuses chiefly on programmers, specifically "the ways in which these specialists constructed for themselves a unique occupational identity based on their control over the nascent technology of electronic computing" (12). Janet Abbate's *Recoding Gender* on the other hand, aims to uncover "how gender has influenced the culture and structures of opportunity in the computing professions over time" (2). This review article will place these books in dialogue with one another to probe the importance of gender to the professionalization of computer programming. As this review underlines, gendered representations of computer expertise are not merely incidental to computing's history, but structure the status and power of those involved in it. The dynamics of professionalization thus reflect, as well as shape, the social and political role of computing in society.

Nathan Ensmenger presents his study as a response to the lack of scholarship about computer programmers, as historians have focused more on hardware matters. Ensmenger artfully charts the conflicting agendas of the individuals who became invested in computer programming, including business managers, scientific personnel as well as associations and corporations, not to mention the programmers themselves. One of the most intriguing aspects of his history is the discussion of the formation of "computer science"—a story that is largely one of science in the making. Struggles for authority and recognition marked this enterprise, while several critics argued that computer work should not be classified as a science at all. These dissenting voices typically emerged from the corporate world, but also from individual programmers, all of whom argued that making computer programming into a science was neither desirable nor practical (111-136). The reasons why computer science overcame this opposition are complicated, but Ensmenger provides a straightforward summary: "computer science exists because the computer scientists wanted it to" (124).

Professionalization of computer work, as Ensmenger documents, took a different path in the corporate world. Managers were keen on standardizing computer programming and established different credentials, training, exams, and oversight. They helped redefine programming as “computer engineering,” a term that gained traction after an international conference in Germany in 1968. Ensmenger repeats the claim that the conference, sponsored by NATO, “marked a major cultural shift”: it solidified programming as a professional field even as it reformed and repackaged programming practices.

Janet Abbate agrees in some respects with Ensmenger’s historicization of programming, but applies a deeper, gendered analysis in her book *Recoding Gender*, published two years later in 2012. Her study is not the first to examine gender in the history of computational work. Both Jennifer S. Light and David Alan Grier, for instance, have shed important light on the role of women in early computing work. Abbate contributes to this history by extending it into the decades after the Second World War, the same period that Ensmenger examines. Yet Abbate makes the marginalization of women central to her analysis, rather than just one of a multitude of factors that contributed to emergent conceptions of computer expertise.

Abbate’s and Ensmenger’s different approaches to their subject are evident in their treatment of the NATO conference. While Abbate views the formative NATO conference in a similar light as Ensmenger—that it helped re-conceptualize computing as a branch of engineering—she notes how the adoption of the language of “engineering,” replete with gendered associations, served to limit women’s participation in the field (97). Abbate’s treatment of the so-called “software crisis” also diverges from Ensmenger. By the early 1960s, companies and organizations began to complain of the lack of skilled computer programmers, which they argued would threaten the continued growth of the industry. While Ensmenger generally accepts this interpretation, Abbate challenges it with her reading of the gendered assumptions about computer work. As she argues, “probing behind the rhetoric reveals that the labour shortage really referred to a specific, privileged category of workers—male programmers with traditional technical qualifications and no childcare obligations” (91).

Abbate’s argument has unintentional support from some of Ensmenger’s evidence. Discussing the rhetoric around professionalization, Ensmenger cites a 1962 editorial in the magazine *Datamation*, which insisted that professionalization, through standards and training, was required to stem allegedly incompetent “amateur programmers” from flooding the labour market (164). Abbate shows that this language, which draws on older associations of the amateur and the feminine, masked a more basic unease



with women's participation in computer programming. Abbate's assessment of the "software crisis" was that "it was neither a distinct event nor a coherent description of prevailing conditions in the industry. It may be better viewed as an all purpose complaint that reflected inflated expectations, labour tensions, and gendered assumptions about who could do programming and how they should behave" (96). Abbate also uses U.S. Census data to refute the crisis. If there really was a crisis, she argues, salaries would have risen as scarce professionals enjoyed competition for their services. But there is no indication that salary levels markedly changed during the crisis. Interestingly, Ensmenger also refers to salaries, and contemporary fears that they would rise. Rather than examine the statistical data as Abbate does, he accepts the representation of the crisis in the flurry of commentary and speculation that accompanied it (71).

Both Ensmenger and Abbate make interesting and unique contributions to the literature even if the two books overlap. Yet their perspectives on the importance of gender to the formation of the computer profession remain at odds with one another in key respects. Whereas Ensmenger portrays gender as one of many elements that contributed to the messy process of professionalization, Abbate places gender squarely at the heart of her analysis, viewing it as a key element that shaped the profession. Ensmenger's narrative portrays programmers in a largely heroic light that beat all odds. Abbate's appraisal is more critical as she tracks how women were increasingly alienated from a profession that was gradually 'coded' male.

BETH ROBERTSON  
*Carleton University*

***La pièce et le geste. Artisans, marchands et savoir technique à Londres au XVIII<sup>ème</sup> siècle. Par Liliane Hilaire-Pérez.*** (Paris: Albin Michel, 2013. xiv + 450 p., notes, bibl. ISBN 978-2-22624-630-1 €24.00).

For those concerned with the early history of industrialism, this book may prove a revelation. Unlike most studies of the first industrial revolution, the remarkable research of Liliane Hilaire-Perez does not focus on the macroeconomic determinants historians have often assumed gave the British an advantage. Neither commercial policy, nor imperial markets, nor population growth, nor theories of production have much sway here. That is not to say they were not lurking behind the detailed and remarkable archaeology into business records which Hilaire-Perez has

mined for the everyday activities of producers. She is completely convincing, to this reader, that the responses to the rapidly transforming commercial markets by makers in London reveal a side to industrialism about which we hitherto have known too little.

It is surely the case that there have been studies of instrument workshops, like those of Anita McConnell for example, that have shown the complexities of production across a number of sites. But, by exploring work books, day books, insurance records, and inventories of workshops, artisans are thereby discovered, manufactories revealed, and the dynamics of local markets explained in a depth which had not often proved possible. By mining archives little used by economic historians, the result is a remarkable book, sometimes complex and daunting, but with a microeconomic richness seldom encountered in the history of the daily life of manufacturers.

This is one of the most important studies of what might be described as the toyshop of Europe, this time beyond Birmingham to the workshops of London. Hilaire-Perez delves into the shops of the toy man Georges Willdey at the turn of the 17<sup>th</sup> century, through the range of the market of instrument makers like Christopher Pinchbeck and, especially fascinating, of the family of clockmakers surrounding Benjamin Vulliamy by the late 18<sup>th</sup> century. Here are a host of makers, artisans, and entrepreneurs, from carriage makers to ironmongers, and the trade in materials from leather to steel, that created what Hilaire-Perez describes as “au coeur de l'esthétique utilitariste des Lumières.” (221) London's makers and merchants became emblematic of “a montée d'entreprises artisanales” (234). Such a conclusion is possible because the empiricism of Hilaire-Perez is incontrovertible. It is founded on a profound appreciation of business records, such as insurance policies, work books revealing costs and customers, and the precise details of inventories and locations of interlocking enterprises throughout London and linked even to celebrated manufacturers in the Midlands like Matthew Boulton and Josiah Wedgwood. Hilaire-Perez succeeds where others have not tread, such as in revealing sites as of the metal worker Richard Wagg, an “entrepreneur polyvalent, à la tête d'une économie sectorielle, productive et commerciale” (255).

In this deeply intriguing catalogue of many shops, merchants, makers, and buyers, we encounter the “techniques d'assemblage...au coeur de l'économie marchande” (302) at the heart of industrial transformation. The result is a remarkable study of the artisanal enterprises of London, which puts paid to the notion of industry as applied science. There are so many examples excavated from the day books and the insurance policies a dynamic economy emerges. But, much more important, Hilaire-Perez has

provided an entirely convincing case that the daily life of industry was a place of “une grande complexité” (439). With so many makers, across a multiplicity of sites, of outworkers and networks of tradesmen, we find ourselves face to face with the traces not the pin workers of Adam Smith, or those toiling on the grand factories of the Midlands, or the scientific organizations of Josiah Wedgwood, but the polyvalence of production in a market economy. This is the image revealed in the archives and this is the face of luxury, the decorative trades, and the necessity of repair. As Hilaire-Perez describes it, these many enterprises in London, from Long Acre to Hampton Court, reflect “...l’adaptation des marchés de production a une économie de la variétés, de la composition, imposant la gestion de flux et de circuits segmentés” (315). This provides a remarkable insight into the daily experience of industrial life.

LARRY STEWART  
*University of Saskatchewan*

***The Color Revolution.* By Regina Lee Blaszczyk.** (Cambridge: The MIT Press, 2012. xiv + 386 p., notes, ill., bibl., index. ISBN 978-0-26201-777-0 \$55.00).

This book convincingly claims that a specific type of color revolution took place in industrial America from around 1850 to 1970, one that created the ‘chromo-utopia’ (298) in which we, as consumers, now live but of which we are not particularly mindful. The goal of this book is therefore to refocus our attention on the color innovations of American manufacturing and on a resulting color industry managed by long-forgotten ‘colorists,’ forecasters, artists and taste-makers. Regina Blaszczyk, a cultural historian whose previous books have explored the relationship between mass culture, design and fashion, studies this revolution and its major figures through a wide range of topics, including the automotive, electric, defence and fashion industries; urban illumination; mood conditioning and much more.

Blaszczyk's focus is trained entirely on the American experience of “invention and innovation,” but also weaves into her narrative much information regarding earlier European developments of the color and dye industries that would stimulate an enduring American fascination with German and French innovation and design. The resulting ‘color revolution’ (although one that had evolved from nineteenth century developments in color technologies) that Blaszczyk demonstrates took place in American consumer and design culture is thus a hybrid, one that

began with the emulation of German dye technology and an embrace of French fashion, but increasingly became part of a unique American consumer culture.

The book's historical research is detailed and deep, with the author having trawled extensively through corporate archives, trade journals, popular magazines, and advertisements. Blaszczyk is persuasive in having the reader 'see' the color revolution through an arrangement of chapters that often focus on a single color. The chapter on 'mauve' for instance, traces the history of this color from its accidental discovery during the search for anti-malaria drugs to its becoming the 'Queen's lilac,' so named after Victoria chose the colour for the outfit she wore to her daughter's 1858 wedding. It is gratifying that this and all other chapters of the *Color Revolution* are well supplied with visual materials, many of which, such as posters, advertisements, color wheels and design drawings are not well known and many of which are a visual delight.

Blaszczyk's book is dense with not only these visual documents, but also facts, figures and names which will provide many directions for future research. Blaszczyk's main concern, and one she has amply fulfilled, is to thoroughly investigate the people, systems and foundations which would create the wholly new concept of 'color management' and of a color standardization that could promote the efficiency goals of industry. Her research into the Munsell Color Foundation (developed by the drawing teacher Albert Munsell, one of several examples of the role of artists in industry), the Textile Color Card Association (promoted by the suffragette Margaret Haydon Rorke, one of the few women stylists of the time and the first color forecaster) and the Standard Color Card of America provide insight into the increasingly important relationship between color and American industry. Blaszczyk's exploration of the development of 'Standard Colors' as an American phenomenon is strongly argued, and encapsulated in her statements: "Only in America did a trade association determine the basic colors and circulate data among competitors for the sake of better business practice. Only in America did collaboration among experts generate fashion forecasts that could be applied across a broad range of style industries" (92).

Blaszczyk demonstrates the far reach of color standardization and color management in discussions that range from the battleship coloring strategies of the military 'camofleur' artist H. Ledyard Towle, to the use of 'reverse camouflage' and streamlining color strategies used by General Motors to market automobiles, or the 'Sunshine Yellow' experiments of Frigidaire (a division of General Motors) in the marketing of appliances. Towle's importance is also noted in his work with the Duco Color Advisory Service in New York, which advised Dupont and General

Motors in the use of their recently developed Duco Finish, a durable lacquer that not only competed directly with Ford black, but would forever bring color to cars.

Especially fascinating is Chapter 9, which studies ‘mood conditioning’ through color use in factories and schools to improve not only morale, but also “learning and discipline” (232) and to generally influence “human beings into desired patterns of action” (240). Blaszczyk here provides a case study of Pan Am and its careful development of an ‘airy’ blue to calm skittish passengers on the airline’s pioneering long-distance flights.

*The Color Revolution* however is more than the excavation and recuperation of color practices and color managers such as Towle or Margaret Hayden Rorke. It also relates ‘hard’ research to social and cultural values, and to several important themes that recur throughout. I will briefly elaborate on these themes, which are often muted beneath the impressive discussions of colorists, associations, systems, companies, color managers and forecasters, but which are important. The book’s early chapters introduce the idea of the “democratization of color” created by American industry and a resulting “chromatic anarchy” (40) and ‘loud’ colors made available by new dye techniques and synthetic fabrics. Blaszczyk points out the tensions that mass color accessibility could cause in the context of differing popular, racial and ‘tasteful’ color preferences. This tension between American industry’s need to create a mass consumer whose choices could be regulated by ‘color management’, and the competing need to keep color ‘tasteful’ and ‘upscale’ (hence, elitist) is similarly noted in a chapter entitled “L’Ensemble Americain” which deals with women’s fashion.

Here, the real cause of the tension becomes clear—how can an American industry that is reliant on both serving and creating a mass consumer at the same time maintain a notion of exclusivity and refined taste in American women’s fashion? This theme is raised once again in a chapter entitled “Rainbow Cities,” which deals with the very interesting problem of color in urban architecture, specifically color supplied by illumination, and hence, electricity, itself supplied by the American giants of industry, General Electric and Westinghouse. Blaszczyk here discusses the Century of Progress Exhibition of 1933, where the polychrome visions of Joseph Urban, Léon Solon and Daniel H. Burnham were countered by a mainstream WASP culture with a liking for a tasteful and what was seen as a non-ethnic taupe.

Blaszczyk also examines the relationship of color and women consumers (as one contemporary author put it, “the proper study of markets is *Woman*”) who were assumed to be particularly receptive to color psychology, according to the new Freudian theory of the

subconscious. As in other sections of the text, the importance of color-strategy-based advertising and marketing campaigns is foregrounded as critical to the new color industry and the creation of a new consumer. Blaszczyk's short forays into the complicated relationship between the construction of the female consumer, the role of gendered images, and of avant garde art (think Marie Laurencin, Kees van Dongen, Georgia O'Keefe) in the chapter entitled "Entente" are welcome and will stimulate further study of discourses of mass consumption, specifically the formation of gender identity through consumption, and a high modernist aesthetic during this period.

*The Color Revolution* will be of use, and provide delight, to anyone with an interest in the fields of design, art, history, marketing, consumer behaviour and also gender and cultural studies, for whom it will provide much original source material. The book's abundant research, in terms of both textual and visual sources, should make it a welcome addition to any researcher, and its beautiful colors and arresting cover image of a woman twirling in a mass of colored fabric ensure that it will attract readers in a way of which their original designers would have been proud.

ANNE-MARIE LINK  
*University of Alberta*

### Medicine / Médecine

***L'incontournable caste des femmes. Histoire des services de santé au Québec et au Canada.*** Par Marie-Claude Thifault. (Ottawa: Presses de l'Université d'Ottawa, 2012. 372 p., notes, bibl., index. ISBN 978-2-7603-0782-7 39.95\$).

Voici un ouvrage qui rassemble des contributions de chercheur.es préoccupé.es par le rôle des femmes dans le champ de la santé, principalement au Québec et surtout au XX<sup>ème</sup> siècle, à partir de perspectives historiographiques diverses. Établi.es des deux côtés de la rivière des Outaouais, ces chercheur.es ont défriché chacun.e à leur façon les milieux d'intervention des femmes pour réaliser une histoire des services de santé au Québec et au Canada. S'il est sans doute exagéré de parler d'une histoire des services de santé, car n'y figurent que quelques exemples de cas pour certaines périodes données, on peut dire toutefois que ce livre contribue à jeter un autre éclairage sur une histoire encore en train de se faire, à partir d'une perspective « genrée » et en langue française (plusieurs articles ont été ainsi traduits de l'anglais).

À l'initiative de Marie-Claude Thifault, elle-même historienne spécialiste de l'univers asilaire et des religieuses hospitalières, les contributions rassemblées dans cet ouvrage permettent de reconstituer la richesse et l'importance de soins prodigués par des femmes, qu'elles soient des religieuses, des bénévoles, des infirmières ou des « paramédicales ». Le titre de l'ouvrage suggère qu'elles forment une caste. Si cette notion de caste est censée nuancer et/ou remplacer celle de classe, ce qui constitue l'objet de cet ouvrage est plutôt l'incontournable travail réalisé par ces femmes dans les services de soin, à travers une notion peu abordée dans ces pages et qui pourtant est considéré comme essentiel pour caractériser la nature de ce travail, le « care ».

Les deux premières contributions présentées dans l'ouvrage ont fait l'objet de travaux déjà anciens. L'article que Strimelle consacre aux œuvres des Filles du Bon Pasteur auprès de délinquantes est le sujet de sa thèse, et celui de J. Harvey a fait l'objet de plusieurs articles concernant l'action de philanthropes de la bourgeoisie anglo-montréalaise dans les services de santé publique. Plus novateur, l'article de Glassford relate les œuvres de cette organisation transnationale avant la lettre qu'est la Croix-Rouge. Charles et Guérard étudient quant à eux de façon assez neuve et originale le réseau international des sœurs hospitalières. Cette première période du tournant du XX<sup>e</sup> siècle montre bien la diversité des lieux et des modes d'intervention de ces femmes, en dehors des grands hôpitaux, qui désormais vont structurer l'institutionnalisation des services de santé, la grande nouveauté de cette période.

Un second chapitre rassemble trois contributions sur les pionnières des soins infirmiers. Le parcours particulier d'une infirmière de la Croix-Rouge, la suédoise d'origine Louise de Kriline, infirmière d'un dispensaire du Nord de l'Ontario est étudié avec précision par J. Elliott, tandis que J. Daigle rappelle l'importance du travail des infirmières dans les régions isolées du Québec, et C. Toman analyse le travail des infirmières militaires pendant la seconde guerre mondiale. Pionnières chacune dans leur domaine, leurs parcours montrent la diversité du travail infirmier et l'autonomie professionnelle dont elles ont fait preuve dans leur pratique, à cause de leur éloignement.

Avec la réforme des soins de santé, les tâches se spécialisent et les femmes deviennent à leur tour des professionnelles de la santé, objet du troisième chapitre. On y trouve rassemblées ici aussi des contributions montrant la porosité des frontières entre les différents services (infirmière et travailleuse sociale, par exemple) mais aussi la spécialisation progressive de ces fonctions, avec deux articles importants sur le rôle des infirmières et assistantes sociales en psychiatrie. L'article sur les autres professions paramédicales élabore davantage sur la notion de « caring »

qui a permis à ces nouvelles professionnelles de l'ergothérapie, de la nutrition etc, de se trouver une place plus autonome dans le système de santé, loin du couple infirmière-médecin. Enfin dans un dernier chapitre sont présentées les versions plus contemporaines du travail des femmes, en particulier le militantisme des sages-femmes pour la reconnaissance de leur métier.

Au total ce volume fait état de travaux qui témoignent des différentes perspectives adoptées par les chercheur.es sur la question complexe de l'infériorisation du travail des femmes dans les services de santé au XX<sup>e</sup> siècle, ouvrant ainsi quelques nouvelles perspectives dans l'étude d'un domaine complexe.

YOLANDE COHEN

*Université du Québec à Montréal*

***Autour de la médicalisation. Perspectives historiques, pratiques et représentations (XV<sup>e</sup>-XX<sup>e</sup> siècles). Par Joceline Chabot, Daniel Hickey et Martin Pâquet (dirs.).*** (Québec: Presses de l'Université Laval, 2012. xv + 231 p., notes, bibl. ISBN 978-2-7637-8912-5 25.00 \$).

Fruit d'un colloque sur « La relation patient-soignant à travers les âges » ayant eu lieu en 2008 à l'université de Sherbrooke, cet ouvrage dirigé par les historiens canadiens Joceline Chabot (Université de Moncton), Daniel Hickey (Université de Moncton) et Martin Pâquet (Université Laval) entend explorer l'évolution sur la longue durée du processus de médicalisation dans les sociétés occidentales. Pour ce faire, il rassemble douze contributions d'historiens canadiens et français questionnant « les modalités des multiples rencontres entre soignants et soignés en France et au Canada, surtout au Québec » (2) du XV<sup>e</sup> au XX<sup>e</sup> siècle. L'enjeu de ce collectif est, selon ses coordinateurs, de mettre en lumière et de problématiser « la saisie difficile de la relation complexe entre les soignants et les soignés comme objet d'étude et de recherche en histoire » (2). Après une introduction détaillée présentant les enjeux historiques et historiographiques d'une telle étude de la médicalisation, les contributions sont réparties en quatre parties abordant chacune une dimension différente de ce processus complexe et pluriel.

La première partie est consacrée aux voies juridiques de la médicalisation depuis Moyen-âge jusqu'à l'époque contemporaine. Tout d'abord, Steven Bednarski et Andrée Courtemanche étudient le cas, extrait du registre d'un notaire provençal du XV<sup>e</sup> siècle, d'une demande de césarienne postmortem. Ils explicitent ainsi la pluralité des acteurs



impliqués dans la relation entre un soignant et un patient, et particulièrement l'importante place de la loi et de ses représentants. Geneviève Dumas interroge ensuite la relation de soin du point de vue du problème de la gestion de la douleur. Le carnet de notes d'un maître allemand de passage à Paris au début du XV<sup>e</sup> siècle lui permet de suivre, au plus près de la clinique de l'époque, les réactions des médecins face à la douleur et d'ainsi confirmer, contre certaines idées reçues, l'existence d'une véritable prise en charge de la souffrance des malades au Moyen-âge. Finalement, Jeremy Hayhoe tente pour sa part d'analyser, grâce aux inventaires après décès, l'accès de villageois bourguignons de la fin du XVIII<sup>e</sup> siècle aux services médicaux, en vue d'explicitier la manière la médecine savante faisait son entrée dans les campagnes.

La seconde partie de l'ouvrage aborde plus spécifiquement, autour de trois études de cas, le rôle des infirmières dans le processus de médicalisation à l'époque contemporaine. Daniel Hickey y analyse la réintégration controversée des congrégations religieuses dans les hôpitaux français au début du XIX<sup>e</sup> siècle, en mettant notamment en lumière leur rôle de médiation dans la relation nouvelle entre le corps médical et les patients qui se constituait alors. Mélanie Morin-Pelletier explicite, grâce à l'analyse de leurs journaux et leurs écrits privés, la relation spécifique qu'entretenaient les infirmières canadiennes et les soldats blessés pendant la Première Guerre mondiale. Tandis que Johanne Daigle détaille le rôle essentiel joué par les infirmières de colonie dans la médicalisation du Québec entre 1932 et 1972, en particulier du fait de leur pleine appartenance à leur communauté et du rôle de support et de personne de confiance qu'elles y jouaient.

La troisième partie est dédiée à l'analyse de l'élaboration et de la propagation depuis le XIX<sup>e</sup> siècle de règles normatives dans la pratique médicale, mais aussi dans la gestion de la relation soignant-soigné. C'est la transmission, par le mouvement de la Jeunesse Ouvrière Chrétienne, de discours et de pratiques de santé aux jeunes Français des milieux populaires entre 1942 et 1965 que Joceline Chabot étudie tout d'abord. Elle montre que les enquêtes menées par ce mouvement ont tenté de diffuser une conception de la santé entendue comme capital et comme norme, tout en insistant sur la responsabilisation personnelle mais aussi collective des jeunes à l'égard des questions sanitaires. Jérôme Boivin présente ensuite la campagne antivénéérienne mise sur pied par le Dr Desloges dans le Québec de l'entre-deux-guerres. Il en précise les ressorts autant que les failles, et s'attarde notamment sur le rôle de l'État québécois dans la protection de la santé publique de ses citoyens. Finalement, Denis Goulet retrace les étapes de régulation de la relation

médecin-malade qui ont vu le jour dans la province au cours du XX<sup>e</sup> siècle et dévoile leur impact sur la dynamique même de cette relation.

Les trois contributions qui composent finalement la quatrième et dernière partie apparaissent comme une ouverture de la réflexion sur la médicalisation. L'historien de la santé Olivier Faure présente une étude particulièrement originale des concurrences mais aussi des complémentarités qui ont existé en France au XIX<sup>e</sup> siècle et au début du XX<sup>e</sup> siècle entre les différents professionnels de santé, afin de montrer l'influence de cette double relation sur l'évolution du système de santé français. Le Britannique Matthew Ramsay s'interroge lui sur les cadres historiographiques et les présupposés anthropologiques à l'œuvre dans l'analyse des pratiques médicales contemporaines. Il met en particulier l'accent sur l'importance de la notion de « culture médicale » pour cerner les tensions et les transformations à l'œuvre dans l'évolution de la relation soignant-soigné. Enfin, l'historien québécois Jean-Marie Fecteau, décédé peu avant la parution de ce volume, propose, dans ce qui est donc l'un de ces derniers textes, une réflexion aussi pertinente que fine sur les outils et les moyens de penser la santé et la maladie comme objet historique. Sous prétexte de la réalisation d'un bilan des contributions de l'ouvrage, il présente un vibrant plaidoyer historiographique et philosophique pour une histoire « socio-politique de la santé comme objet de régulation sociale » (226), dans lequel il en appelle très justement à un renouvellement de la pensée historique, mais aussi sociale, des rapports à la santé et à la maladie.

Ce volume présente ainsi un ensemble intéressant de contributions diverses mais riches touchant à l'histoire de la santé et plus particulièrement aux enjeux sociaux et sociétaux qui la traversent. Certes, l'unification des différentes études présentées semblent parfois avoir été problématique. La première partie qui traite des voies judiciaires ne comporte par exemple qu'un seul texte réellement consacré à cette question. Le choix des parties semble, en outre, répondre davantage à une problématique d'organisation pratique du volume qu'à un choix historiographique ou historique précis et délibéré. Enfin, si la médicalisation a été choisie après-coup comme thématique unificatrice de l'ensemble, beaucoup de textes semblent privilégier la thématique du colloque originel, soit la relation soignant-soigné, et ce, sans que le lien entre les deux thématiques, pourtant intimement reliées, ne soit jamais établi de manière claire et convaincante. Le titre même fait d'ailleurs écho à cette incertitude : l'ensemble se contentant le plus souvent de tourner *autour de la médicalisation*. Mais au-delà de ces difficultés, que rencontrent d'ailleurs nombres de volumes collectifs issus de colloques ou de journées d'étude, cet ouvrage s'impose comme une contribution de

qualité à l'historiographie francophone de la santé. En plus de rassembler des travaux originaux, au fait des avancées historiographiques et méthodologiques actuelles de ce champ de recherche, et de traiter une question importante sur une longue période et de manière variée, ce volume participe de l'affirmation et de la reconnaissance d'un champ et d'un regard encore peu exploités en l'histoire de la santé. En centrant leur ouvrage sur les dynamiques sociales et les enjeux sociétaux non pas conséquents, mais bien inhérents à l'histoire de la santé et à son écriture, les coordinateurs font œuvre d'originalité et réaffirment l'importance de cette démarche historiographique, que théorise et revendique si bien Jean-Marie Fecteau, et qui consiste à aborder historiquement la santé comme objet de régulation sociale. L'histoire de la santé, qui connaît actuellement tant un renouveau de ses méthodes et de ses objets qu'une consolidation de son affirmation disciplinaire, ne peut que s'enrichir de ce type de démarche qui allie pertinence du propos et qualité des interventions à l'originalité de la démarche. L'histoire sociopolitique de la santé comme objet de régulation sociale a toute sa place dans une histoire globale et inclusive de la santé telle qu'elle est aujourd'hui pratiquée et revendiquée dans le milieu francophone. Et c'est à ce titre que l'ouvrage de Chabot, Hickey et Pâquet s'impose comme un volume de choix pour tous les historiens intéressés par les questions de santé.

ALEXANDRE KLEIN  
*Université d'Ottawa*

***Infirmières de colonie. Soins et médicalisation dans les régions du Québec, 1932-1972.*** Par Nicole Rousseau et Johanne Daigle. (Québec: Presses de l'Université Laval, 2013. xxx + 466 p., ill., notes, bibl. ISBN 978-2-7637-1968-9 44.95 \$).

Cet ouvrage additionne les sources écrites (rapports officiels, correspondance entre les acteurs concernés) et les témoignages oraux (48 infirmières, 15 anciennes bénéficiaires de l'Abitibi-Témiscamingue, 1 médecin et 1 veuve de médecin) pour cerner la figure de l'infirmière de colonie au Québec. Les travaux sur ce point étant à peu près inexistant, cette publication est une contribution importante et incontournable sur ce moment de l'histoire de la médecine québécoise.

Nicole Rousseau et Johanne Daigle tentent de répondre à plusieurs questions. La première concerne les représentations et les pratiques des infirmières de colonie : que faisaient-elles, quel modèle de services de proximité ont-elles esquissé, quels étaient leurs liens avec la communauté

des bénéficiaires et leurs motivations. La deuxième relève des rapports interprofessionnels : comment, dans ces contrées peu fréquentées par les médecins, la division du travail a-t-elle évolué entre médecins et infirmières et en particulier quel était le degré d'autonomie dont disposaient ces dernières ? La troisième concerne les savoirs mobilisés lors des soins : quel a été le rôle joué par les infirmières de colonie dans la dynamique des accommodements et oppositions entre savoirs populaires et savoirs scientifiques en matière de santé ?

Le livre retrace d'abord la création et l'évolution du *Service médical aux colons* créé pour encadrer au plan sanitaire l'aventure de la colonisation de nouvelles terres comme réponse à la crise des années 1930. Cette aventure coïncidait avec l'émergence des politiques en matière d'hygiène et de prévention. Les médecins entendaient bien conserver les prérogatives dont ils disposaient déjà dans les zones urbaines, mais ils n'avaient pas envie de s'installer dans ces contrées... inhospitalières. Leur supervision est donc restée lointaine et fragmentaire. Cette situation a accordé de fait une autonomie aux infirmières, que chacune a aménagée avec plus ou moins de détermination : autonomie de diagnostic, de médication, de gestion du temps, de liens avec les patients. Un jeu s'est installé dans lequel les médecins affirmaient leur souveraineté de principe tandis que les infirmières euphémisaient leurs pratiques pour les rendre hiérarchiquement acceptables. Avec quelques tensions bien sûr. Urgences obligent et voilà les infirmières en train de réparer des bras cassés, de soigner de graves brûlures, d'accompagner des accouchements problématiques, de tenir le rôle de pharmacien, d'administrer des antibiotiques et autres médicaments normalement délivrés sous ordonnance, avec ou sans la permission téléphonique du médecin. Cet espace de jeu se rétrécira progressivement à partir des années 1950. La Commission Castonguay-Nepveu a présenté l'infirmière de colonie comme une assistante médicale, mais c'était pour mieux justifier son élimination dans les années 1970.

L'essentiel de l'ouvrage se donne pour objectif de tracer les contours des activités de ces infirmières d'exception, qui faisaient « tout à tous ». Elles étaient d'abord sages-femmes, travaillant à la chandelle ou à la lampe à huile, dans des maisons parfois mal chauffées, aidées s'il le faut par une voisine ou quelqu'un de la famille, dans des conditions d'asepsie approximatives. Les distances jusqu'aux domiciles des parturientes étaient souvent importantes, parcourues à cheval, en char à bœufs, en traîneau tiré par des chiens, plus tardivement en voiture ou en motoneige, par tous les temps et toutes les températures. Un accouchement pouvait s'étendre sur plus d'une journée, ou deux accouchements survenir simultanément... Atteindre un hôpital, dans les cas extrêmes, était toute une entreprise. Il

est impossible de résumer en quelques lignes la richesse des informations recueillies. Les auteures ont réussi à reconstituer les procédures suivies par les infirmières, leur gestion du temps, l'usage de certains médicaments, le suivi post-natal, jusqu'aux premiers conseils de contraception.

Livrées à elles-mêmes ou presque, chacune responsable d'environ 1000 à 2000 personnes, les infirmières de colonie devaient également faire face aux maladies et accidents. Elles procédaient souvent dans l'urgence, avec des moyens limités, posaient les diagnostics, décidaient des moyens thérapeutiques, désinfectaient et recousaient les plaies, réduisaient les fractures, plaçaient des attelles, etc. La plupart du temps, elles étaient sollicitées pour des petits problèmes ou des maladies courantes, plus rarement pour des cas de typhoïde ou de diphtérie, ou pour des grands blessés qu'il fallait acheminer à l'hôpital. Responsables aussi de la prévention des maladies et partiellement des vaccinations, elles étaient disponibles 7 jours sur 7 et 24 heures sur 24. Le dimanche, elles recevaient au dispensaire, situé en général près de l'église.

Quels savoirs mobilisaient-elles ? Ici l'enquête se fait très attentive, avec inventaire des produits locaux et des produits technico-scientifiques, présentations aussi des procédures de soins. Il y a eu cohabitation pendant longtemps des savoirs et pratiques de tradition orale et technico-scientifiques. Les bénéficiaires interrogées étaient beaucoup plus enclines à recourir à des remèdes traditionnels que les infirmières. Celles-ci, selon les cas, se situaient entre tolérance et rejet des remèdes populaires, et elles ont donc contribué à la médicalisation de la santé, en popularisant les termes médicaux, en poussant aux consultations, en vendant des produits pharmaceutiques et en introduisant des mesures de prévention.

En résumé, l'infirmière de colonie agissait selon un modèle de soins composé de plusieurs éléments complémentaires : elle réalisait des interventions proprement médicales, procédait aussi comme une soignante infirmière plus classique, connaissait bien le contexte socio-économique et la situation des familles, tissait des liens approfondis avec les habitants, agissait en confidente et psychologue et dispensait des conseils sanitaires. Ce modèle ne fonctionnait qu'avec une disponibilité complète, dans un contexte communautaire vivant, et avec une autonomie à l'égard de la corporation des médecins. Il va exploser par la suite en sous-spécialités : infirmière, sage-femme, assistant social, psychologue et médecin, parallèlement à une explosion de la demande en santé et services sociaux et à une réduction du temps de travail.

Ici et là, aussi en préface et en postface, cette remarquable reconstitution du métier d'infirmière de colonie laisse deviner certains engagements normatifs qui auraient gagné à être explicités, que ce soit en faveur des

savoirs populaires, d'une polyvalence opposée à la spécialisation, d'une approche globalisante de la santé et d'une autonomie des soignants de première ligne. L'époque, que l'on peut qualifier d'héroïque, des infirmières de colonie a encore un message à nous transmettre concernant les soins de proximité, suggèrent les auteures. Ce message n'aurait pas été recueilli lors de la période qui a suivi, marquée par d'intenses batailles territoriales entre professionnels de la santé, batailles qui ont accompagné la spécialisation et la fragmentation des soins, ainsi que la mise en place d'une assurance-maladie universelle<sup>1</sup>.

ANDRÉ PETITAT  
*Université de Lausanne*

---

<sup>1</sup> Voir notamment A. Petitat, *Les infirmières. De la vocation à la profession* (Montréal, Boréal, 1989).