

**Dolan, Jay P. *The Immigrant Church: New York's Irish and German Catholics, 1815-1865*. Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press, 1975. Pp. xiv, 221. Maps, Tables. \$10.00**

**Harold Troper**

Number 1-77, June 1977

URI: <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1019601ar>

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.7202/1019601ar>

[See table of contents](#)

Publisher(s)

Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine

ISSN

0703-0428 (print)

1918-5138 (digital)

[Explore this journal](#)

Cite this review

Troper, H. (1977). Review of [Dolan, Jay P. *The Immigrant Church: New York's Irish and German Catholics, 1815-1865*. Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press, 1975. Pp. xiv, 221. Maps, Tables. \$10.00]. *Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine*, (1-77), 113–114. <https://doi.org/10.7202/1019601ar>

Dolan, Jay P. The Immigrant Church: New York's Irish and German Catholics, 1815-1865. Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press, 1975. Pp. xiv, 221. Maps, Tables. \$10.00.

In discussions of multiculturalism or cultural mosaic in Canada one often hears the phrase "unity with diversity" - that is, a single nation-state retaining the loyalty of different groups. Jay P. Dolan's study of the Catholic Church in the life of two urban immigrant communities before 1865 explores "unity or diversity". In this case, however, Dolan writes of one Church composed of distinct cultural units.

Unlike so much urban Church history, Dolan's focus is not the pulpit but the pews, not the priest but the parishioners. He centers on two New York City parishes, an Irish parish and a predominantly German parish into which Irish Catholics are slowly drifting. He begins by exploring each parish within its physical and social space then proceeds to examine the role of the Church, with its internal ethnic divisions, as related to the parallel issues of immigrant socialization and continuity of ethnic identity. The indifferences of many immigrants to their Church, social mobility and interethnic tension, especially as manifest in conflict over education, language and ritual, are also investigated.

Woven through Dolan's study is the thesis that urban ethnic parishes and the development of what have been called National Churches worked to establish and maintain an environment which was at once reminiscent of the old world yet aided in the gradual transition of foreigner to citizen. The National Church is thus both a remnant of the old world and a part of the process of adjusting to the new. Persistence of ethnic identity and the militancy with which it is pursued, Dolan concludes, grows as much out of desire for group language maintenance as it does from the will to retain traditional religious ways in the new urban industrial context. English speaking Irish were far less concerned with using the urban parish as a vehicle

for preservation of ethnic identity than were German Catholics, a fact which explains, in part, the lower degree of Irish Church activism compared to that of German Catholics in New York.

Canadian historians might be interested in testing Dolan's thesis in our urban context. How, for instance does Dolan's work relate to post-famine Irish and French parishes in Montreal or, closer to the present, Italian, Portuguese, Polish or Anglo-Catholic parishes in centres like Toronto or Winnipeg? Historians interested in pursuing this issue would be wise to not only read Dolan's study but also to carefully examine his useful "Essay on Sources". [Harold Troper, Ontario Institute for Studies in Education].

\* \* \*

Burg, David F. Chicago's White City of 1893. Lexington: The University Press of Kentucky, 1976. Pp. xvi, 382. Illustrations. \$17.00.

In 1893, the year that marked the four hundredth anniversary of the landing of Columbus in the New World, Chicago was host to an exposition to mark the occasion. Although the World's Columbian Exposition was the fifteenth world's fair, it was of vastly greater scope than any of its predecessors. Chicago created a veritable new city. In this study of the "White City", the author shows America at a crossroads in its development. It was in the process of moving from a largely agricultural society to a predominantly urban and industrial one. The exposition was then an index of American values, achievements, and expectations in this era of profound and complex change. The exposition also demonstrated, perhaps for the first time, that both artistic capacity and technology were available to transform burgeoning industrial cities into well-designed centres of business, culture, and community.