

## Urban History Review Revue d'histoire urbaine

URBAN HISTORY REVIEW  
REVUE D'HISTOIRE URBAINE

**Bullough, William A. *Cities and Schools in the Gilded Age: The Evolution of an Urban Institution*. Port Washington, N.Y.: Kennikat Press, 1974. Pp. 193. \$12.50**

Robert M. Stamp

Number 1-77, June 1977

URI: <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1019603ar>

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.7202/1019603ar>

[See table of contents](#)

### Publisher(s)

Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine

### ISSN

0703-0428 (print)

1918-5138 (digital)

[Explore this journal](#)

### Cite this review

Stamp, R. M. (1977). Review of [Bullough, William A. *Cities and Schools in the Gilded Age: The Evolution of an Urban Institution*. Port Washington, N.Y.: Kennikat Press, 1974. Pp. 193. \$12.50]. *Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine*, (1-77), 115–117. <https://doi.org/10.7202/1019603ar>

All Rights Reserved © Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine, 1977

This document is protected by copyright law. Use of the services of Érudit (including reproduction) is subject to its terms and conditions, which can be viewed online.

<https://apropos.erudit.org/en/users/policy-on-use/>

**é**rudit

This article is disseminated and preserved by Érudit.

Érudit is a non-profit inter-university consortium of the Université de Montréal, Université Laval, and the Université du Québec à Montréal. Its mission is to promote and disseminate research.

<https://www.erudit.org/en/>

Chicago's White City of 1893 deals with the multifaceted aspects of the fair - its architecture, artworks, music, technological achievements and so on. But the book's most important contribution is a discussion of the exposition's theme - the potentiality of fashioning the "Kingdom of God on Earth". While the most important and well-known after effect of the fair was the City Beautiful movement, its influence extended also to such ordinary concerns as well-lighted streets, efficient waste disposal, and honest government. [A.F.J. Artibise, University of Victoria].

\* \* \*

Bullough, William A. Cities and Schools in the Gilded Age: The Evolution of an Urban Institution. Port Washington, N.Y.: Kennikat Press, 1974. Pp. 193. \$12.50.

Urban historians in both Canada and the United States are increasingly turning their attention to the relationship between schooling and the social, economic and political dimensions of the urban landscape. American researchers can profit from the work of Stanley Schultz, Michael Katz and Marvin Lazerson on Boston educational development, Carl Kaestle and Selwyn Troen on the schools of New York City and St. Louis, plus the more comprehensive works of Joel Spring and David Tyack. Valuable beginnings in the Canadian context have been made by Katz, Susan Houston and Alison Prentice on mid-nineteenth century urban schooling, and by Neil Sutherland and Terrence Morrison on urban education at the end of the nineteenth century.

William Bullough's Cities and Schools in the Gilded Age is one of the less satisfactory contributions to this growing field of historical literature. Drawing on both the published works of other historians plus his own research on San Francisco schools, Bullough attempts to portray American urban schools and school systems in the last quarter of the nineteenth century - the so-called "Gilded Age".

The issues dealt with will be familiar to Canadian urban and educational historians. Individual chapters treat rising school enrolments and the problem of classroom accommodation, the concern with efficiency and the resulting growth of centralized administration, professionalization and bureaucratization and administrative change, and the relationship between school reform and municipal politics. Such a topical approach results in a series of vivid snapshots of late nineteenth century urban schooling in the United States. But some readers may prefer the moving picture to the snapshot, which necessitates more of a chronological approach. Despite a concluding chapter entitled "Urban Schools at the Close of the Century", the author does not adequately explain and analyze the changes (or lack of change) that occurred between 1875 and 1900.

There are at least two additional major weaknesses in Bullough's Cities and Schools in the Gilded Age - one of particular interest to urban historians, the second of general concern to anyone working in the discipline of history. The first is a matter that Gilbert Stelter first pointed out to his Canadian colleagues: Bullough tends to treat everything that happens within an urban environment as an "urban" phenomenon. But the feminization of the North American teaching force in the latter half of the nineteenth century was as much a result of rural developments as of urban. Likewise, moves for upgraded teacher training and in-service inspection and supervision of teachers were more an attempt to address rural, not urban, school problems. Bullough might well pay heed to Stelter's plea that urban historians concentrate, not on everything that happens within the city, but on those developments that arise from the uniqueness of the urban environment.

Finally, Bullough is too much influenced by the radical school critics and radical educational historians of the late 1960's and early 1970's. He tends to locate the roots of virtually all contemporary educational problems in the ideologies and power struggles of the Gilded Age. Racism, segregation, sex-stereotyping, middle-class bias - too

much is blamed on late nineteenth century urban school leadership. At times it is short-sightedness on the part of the city school superintendents; occasionally Bullough even hints at a conspiracy thesis. Historians must assess these people in an 1870's context, rather than a 1970's, and match them against the circumstances of an earlier time.

Bullough and his fellow urban educational historians in both Canada and the United States have to date given us much valuable information and insight in such areas as school attendance, school administration, and educational aims. Perhaps we are now ready to move on to the next stage, a stage that highlights the central players of the historical drama - the pupils. We tend to conclude that by the turn of the twentieth century, the school had replaced the home and the church as the most important experience in the child's process of "growing up". Maybe so, but what of the school's continuing competition with the playground, the tenement building, the street market, and the part-time job? What of its later competition with Hollywood movies, comic books, radio and television? In short, we will never get close to the crux of the urban school experience until educational historians pay more attention to the history of popular culture as it influenced childhood and adolescence. That may be our task for the late 1970's and the 1980's. [Robert M. Stamp, University of Calgary].

\* \* \*

Brownell, Blaine A. The Urban Ethos in the South, 1920-1930. Baton Rouge, Louisiana: Louisiana State University Press, 1975. Pp. xxi, 238. Tables. \$12.50.

This study of seven southern cities (Atlanta, Birmingham, Charleston, Knoxville, Memphis, Nashville, and New Orleans) during what the author calls the "crucial period" of the 1920's has several goals. First, it attempts to demonstrate that a more or less consistent