Document generated on 10/12/2024 6:27 a.m.

Urban History Review
Revue d'histoire urbaine

LoRomer, David G. *Merchants and Reform in Livorno 1814-1868*. Berkeley, California: University of California Press. 1987. Pp. x, 387. Illustrations, tables and index

Anthony L. Cardoza

Volume 17, Number 1, June 1988

URI: https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1017708ar
DOI: https://doi.org/10.7202/1017708ar

See table of contents

Publisher(s)

Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine

ISSN

0703-0428 (print)
1918-5138 (digital)

Explore this journal

Cite this review

Cardoza, A. L. (1988). Review of [LoRomer, David G. *Merchants and Reform in Livorno 1814-1868*. Berkeley, California: University of California Press. 1987. Pp. x, 387. Illustrations, tables and index]. *Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine*, *17*(1), 52–53. https://doi.org/10.7202/1017708ar

All Rights Reserved © Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine, 1987

This document is protected by copyright law. Use of the services of Érudit (including reproduction) is subject to its terms and conditions, which can be viewed online.

https://apropos.erudit.org/en/users/policy-on-use/

This article is disseminated and preserved by Érudit.

Érudit is a non-profit inter-university consortium of the Université de Montréal, Université Laval, and the Université du Québec à Montréal. Its mission is to promote and disseminate research.

https://www.erudit.org/en/

in 1837 and the Know Nothing Party in the 1850s.

Gilje examines the transformation of New York's social structure in relation to its experience of economic change. Although the author is not an economic determinist, recognizing the many motives behind violence in a city as diverse as New York, he devotes considerable attention to disturbances originating in labour disputes. Labor violence generated by wage and other disagreements increased by the 1820s, as did anti-enclosure riots in response to attempts by the wealthy to bar the "hoi polloi" from their estates. New York was both a microcosm and belle-weather for later national cleavages and violence, as the author notes in his closing remarks on the context of the terrible 1863 draft riots. Gilje is most effective in focussing the context of the turbulent times and the character of the rioter. He is somewhat less successful in portraying the middle-class, who branded all disturbances as threats to order, and whose economic and political power enabled them to define the limits of socially acceptable behavior.

While this is a good book, it is not without some flaws. Gilje does not deal, for example, with New York's loss of autonomy to the state government, nor does he provide a broad enough context for understanding city's ethnic strife. Finally, the references appear properly as footnotes, but the bibliography is not comprehensive. Readers must leaf through the text to locate relevant secondary sources or see Gilje's historiographical references.

At the same time, however, this lively analysis exploits neglected and familiar sources - city directories, court records and newspapers - with care and imagination. Gilje has a firm grasp of the literature relating to multiple aspects of urban history, including republican ideology, partisan politics, mob action, urban change and social stratification. He brings the city's communities and street culture to vivid life. This clearly conceived and organized, persuasively argued, engagingly written, and generously illustrated book expands our understanding of urban history. It provides a stimulating framework for the comparative analysis of America's complex ante-bellum urban disorder.

Reginald C. Stuart
Department of History
University of Prince Edward Island

LoRomer, David G. *Merchants and Reform in Livorno 1814-1868*. Berkeley, California: University of California Press. 1987. Pp. x, 387. Illustrations, tables and index.

The last few years have witnessed an impressive growth of scholarly interest in 19th century Italian cities and the urban middle-class. While the venerable Laterza publishing house, for instance, has launched a new series of urban histories, a group of bright young scholars led by Professor Raffaele Romanelli of the University of Pisa has been carrying out pathbreaking explorations in the social history of urban elites and the middle-class from Venice to Naples. LoRomer's study of the reform efforts of the Livorno merchant community is not only a valuable addition to this body of historical literature, but also a useful corrective to the narrowly political interpretations of the Risorgimento. The book is the result of some 15 years of archival work, writing and reflection. This time and care are clearly reflected in the depth of its research, the clarity of its conceptualization, as well as in its polished prose style.

In opening chapters, LoRomer sets the context for the reform efforts of his merchants by providing a general portrait of the economy, social structure and demographic trends of the Tuscan port city in the first half of the 19th century. He challenges the conventional wisdom that Livorno suffered a severe decline after 1814, arguing that the city's traditional commerce of deposit and trans-shipment remained dominant largely because of the growing importance of the grain trade. The impetus for reform came instead from the general drop in price levels in the period of restoration that put new pressure on old economic and social relationships. The predominant commercial activity of the port strongly shaped the local social structure, nourishing a special community of interests that linked together members of different strata.

At the top of Livorno's social hierarchy stood the elite of merchants, who had been largely foreigners in the past. Using tax, probate and heraldic records, the author shows that in the first half of the 19th century real estate investment and acquisition of noble titles reflect their increasing assimilation into the economy and society. With assimilation came basic changes in the economic views of the merchant community, views strongly influenced by the writings of Benjamin Franklin and the doctrines of Saint-Simon. These views found institutional expression in the local chamber of commerce which formulated and articulated new concerns for the merchant community.

Gramsci's idea of hegemony provides LoRomer with the basic conceptual framework for his analysis of the economic and social reforms undertaken by the Livorno merchants in the decades after 1814. Economic concerns brought on by declining prices and profits led to demands for tariff reform, rationalization of business practices and improved transportation and port facilities. Economic reforms went hand in hand with a set of social reforms designed to reinforce patterns of deference and to inculcate merchant norms and values in the masses. Accordingly, the commercial elite strongly supported schools of reciprocal instruction and kindergartens to help socialize the city's labouring classes, as well as popular savings banks to encourage thrift.

Although the merchant community did succeed in building effective alliances with

certain "responsible popular elements", it did not achieve any enduring consensus or stability. The general uncertainty of the economic situation and an overcrowded labour market led increasingly to demands by the city's workers for special privileges and guaranteed employment that clashed with elite principles of free trade and eroded confidence in reform possibilities. LoRomer argues convincingly that the Revolution of 1848 marked a decisive turning point for Livorno's merchant community. The trauma of popular revolt combined with the economic dislocations of the revolutionary period to destroy both its optimism and its commitment to reform. Significantly, the author concludes that the experience of Livorno in 1848 reflected in microcosm, not only the defeat of radical democratic forces, but also the collapse of locally based liberal reform programs. Indeed, it led to a fundamental realignment of power among Italian moderates as movements based on autonomous economic and social reform gave way to more centralized, disciplined and authoritarian initiatives by the Piedmontese state.

LoRomer's study is not devoid of problems. His evaluation of the Livorno merchant community's achievements is ambiguous, if not contradictory. While at one point he praises it imaginative and energetic efforts at reform (p.253), two pages later he writes that the reformers' efforts were "highly tentative, excessively paternalistic, and on occasion even hypocritical." Perhaps part of the difficulty arises from the author's uncritical reliance on Gramscian categories of bourgeois comportment, which are highly abstract and schematic. In addition, the book would have benefited from some exploration of the informal mechanisms of power exercised by the merchant community, such as marriage alliances and cousinhoods. Finally, the book needs more fully developed comparisons between Livorno's experience and other Italian cities. These problems, however, do not seriously detract from what is otherwise an excellent monographic study.

Anthony L. Cardoza
Loyola Univerity, Chicago

Lacelle, Claudette. *Urban Domestic Servants in 19th-Century Canada*. Translated from the Original French. Hull: Environment Canada - Parks, 1987. Pp. 254. 32 illustrations, maps, plans. $15.50

Claudette Lacelle investigated domestic service in 19th century Canadian cities to aid the government in the restoration and interpretation of historic houses. Her study is greatly needed. Visitors to historic houses all too frequently find that servant's quarters have been ignored or used for storage and offices. Concentrating on life "upstairs" and failing to portry the conditions for servants conveys only a partial and distorted view of the household. While Lacelle's guide is intended to aid in the comprehensive preservation of our material heritage, her research offers important new information for historians interested in 19th century urban social history.

To illustrate the continuity and change in domestic service during the 19th century, Lacelle examines two specific periods, 1816-20 and 1871-75, primarily because of the availability of statistical sources. The early period includes Curé Signay's 1818 Quebec City census, which gives information on the members of each Catholic household. The later period includes the 1871 census, the first sufficiently uniform across Canada to make possible comparison between different cities and regions. Within each period, Lacelle concentrates on particular cities: Quebec City and Montreal for 1816-20, and Toronto, Quebec City, Halifax and the wealthy district of Montreal for 1871-75. She selects the cities with the largest population in each period and concentrates on wealthy districts that contain a majority of houses to be restored. Her choice for the early period is also restricted because only the Archives Nationales du Québec possesses sufficient documentation for a study of domestic service. As Lacelle notes, an advantage of the forced concentration on Quebec City and Montreal is the possibility of comparing anglophone and francophone patterns of service. Unfortunately, such a comparison is not developed, possibly because she detects few differences. In order to develop the demographic analysis of urban domestic service, Lacelle chooses to open two windows on the 19th century rather than undertake a general survey. The approach, however, has inherent limitations. Although she can show changes between the early and late periods, her evidence does not enable her to explain when or how changes occurred. Domestic service in Ontario and the Maritimes during a critical period in their growth remains unexamined.

Because the work is to aid interpreters of historic houses, Lacelle concentrates her research on explaining the "everyday" life of servants. She does not attempt to set domestic service within the broader economic and social context of work of women's roles. Instead, she investigates relationships within the households where live-in servants were employed. In each period, she profiles the people involved, both servants and masters, and examines the hiring process and servant's duties. Then, using European and American literature, as well as Canadian evidence, she assesses the advantages and disadvantages of service and interprets the behavior of masters and servants.

Lacelle finds that between 1820 and 1870 the character of servants changed more than the households employing them. She attacks the stereotype that most people in the 19th century had domestic staff, showing a minority of households - 20 percent in 1818 and 10 to 15 percent in 1871 - as including live-in servants. In both periods, approximately