

Urban History Review Revue d'histoire urbaine

URBAN HISTORY REVIEW
REVUE D'HISTOIRE URBAINE

Moodie, Susanna. *Voyages: Short Narratives of Susanna Moodie*, ed. John Thurston. Ottawa: University of Ottawa Press, 1991. Pp. xxix, 256

Campbell, Sandra, and Lorraine McMullen, eds., *New Women: Short Stories by Canadian Women, 1900-1920*. Ottawa: University of Ottawa Press, 1991. Pp. 333

Beverly Boutilier

Volume 20, Number 3, February 1992

URI: <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1019273ar>

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.7202/1019273ar>

[See table of contents](#)

Publisher(s)

Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine

ISSN

0703-0428 (print)

1918-5138 (digital)

[Explore this journal](#)

Cite this review

Boutilier, B. (1992). Review of [Moodie, Susanna. *Voyages: Short Narratives of Susanna Moodie*, ed. John Thurston. Ottawa: University of Ottawa Press, 1991. Pp. xxix, 256 / Campbell, Sandra, and Lorraine McMullen, eds., *New Women: Short Stories by Canadian Women, 1900-1920*. Ottawa: University of Ottawa Press, 1991. Pp. 333]. *Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine*, 20(3), 131–132. <https://doi.org/10.7202/1019273ar>

All Rights Reserved © Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine, 1992

This document is protected by copyright law. Use of the services of Érudit (including reproduction) is subject to its terms and conditions, which can be viewed online.

<https://apropos.erudit.org/en/users/policy-on-use/>

érudit

This article is disseminated and preserved by Érudit.

Érudit is a non-profit inter-university consortium of the Université de Montréal, Université Laval, and the Université du Québec à Montréal. Its mission is to promote and disseminate research.

<https://www.erudit.org/en/>

voluntary emigrants or unwilling exiles. Dr. McLean manages to come down more or less in the middle of this debate. They were not evicted but left voluntarily, even against the wishes of their landlords, yet they believed that they had been forced to go because as "a proud and self reliant people" they could not accept the changed conditions they were faced with, which included grossly higher rents and the conversion of much land to sheep farming. This conclusion is not so wishy-washy as it may appear, and in reaching it Dr. McLean firmly disagrees with much that has been written by others. She rejects the view that emigration before 1815 was not a form of protest against economic change, that emigration can be attributed to population increase, that emigration was a way of avoiding a commercial economy and preserving a traditional society, or that clearances for sheep were irrelevant before 1815 and were merely "invented" by the emigrants as a rationalization of their decision to leave. The evidence on which this revisionist position is based is on the whole convincing, especially since it derives from a specific case study of actual people in their actual setting and not on the kind of generalized studies of population and emigration which have usually been done.

Dr. McLean has done about as much as anyone could to get at the conditions and motives of ordinary Highlanders. They were "noted for their intense conservatism" but made a "radical" decision. But she also rightly puts a good deal of stress on the crucial role of the "Highland gentlemen" who were the leaders, organizers and go-betweens for the emigrants, both in Scotland and in Upper Canada. Her view of these men is not romantic; they were decidedly self-interested, seeing a chance to rebuild their eroding fortunes, prestige and authority in a new land, something they were in fact quite successful in doing, at least for

a couple of generations. Dr. McLean never explicitly says so, but the reader nonetheless gets the distinct impression that the successive group migrations (except for that of 1815) would probably not have happened at all without their initiative, and her explanation for the absence of group migration after 1815 includes the fact that there simply weren't any gentlemen left "as individuals and as a class" in the Highlands. A cynic might suggest that some not so self reliant sheep had been led away by their shepherds.

This book fits well with the recent work of other historians of immigration in finding that immigration was family and kin based and was drawn from people of at least modest resources, though Glengarry seems to have been somewhat unusual in the way in which the immigrants continued to remain fixated on a single destination and the extent to which the chain of migrants was made up of groups, rather than individual families. Such differences, from Irish migrants for instance, are not stressed in the book and while Dr. McLean notes that Glengarrians have always seen themselves as coming from a special place, she argues in her conclusion that Glengarry may in fact have been typical of Upper Canada as a whole since Highland characteristics "loyalty, defence of local interest and conservatism" were widely shared in the province. Widely shared to a degree perhaps, but one suspects that Upper Canadians in other areas and of other backgrounds (such as Americans and Lowland Scots) would have felt that Glengarrians had an excess of such virtues.

On one major subject which might have been assumed to be of some significance—religion—the book is curiously reticent. There are occasional references to priests and to the Roman Catholic church, but their role is treated, if at all,

as a minor one, though surely the emigrant groups were not defined by family and region alone, but also by a shared faith. Nor is there any suggestion of religious division within the Highland community; they are simply all assumed to have been Roman Catholic. How then are we to explain the fact that when the first reliable denominational census for Glengarry was taken in 1851, Catholics and Protestants were almost exactly equal in numbers in the county? Evidently there is a second "People of Glengarry" who remain to be given equally expert attention.

J. K. Johnson
Department of History
Carleton University

Moodie, Susanna. *Voyages: Short Narratives of Susanna Moodie*, ed. John Thurston. Ottawa: University of Ottawa Press, 1991. Pp. xxix, 256.

Campbell, Sandra, and Lorraine McMullen, eds., *New Women: Short Stories by Canadian Women, 1900-1920*. Ottawa: University of Ottawa Press, 1991. Pp. 333.

The imaginative lives of two generations of women short story writers in Canada is the subject of two new literary anthologies from the Canadian Short Story Library of the University of Ottawa Press. Regarded together, *Voyages: Short Narratives of Susanna Moodie* and *New Women: Short Stories by Canadian Women 1900-1920*, will help literary scholars chart the development of the short story genre in Canada and the contribution of women writers to it. Their historical value extends further, however, for the stories also suggest how some English Canadian women used literature to give meaning to the personal and social upheavals affecting their lives in nineteenth and early twentieth century urban Canada.

Susanna Strickland Moodie (1803-1885) began contributing short stories to the growing number of popular and religious periodicals in England after the death of her father left the Strickland family in reduced economic circumstances in the late 1820s. In *Voyages: Short Narratives of Susanna Moodie*, editor John Thurston has brought together fourteen of Moodie's numerous short sketches published between 1828 and 1871. Although the majority of stories collected here were written after the Moodie family moved from their backwoods farm to Belleville in 1839, all but one are set in England.

Drawing inspiration from her own life, these sketches reveal Moodie's preoccupation both with the social decline experienced by gentlewomen upon the death of a male breadwinner and with the heroine's decision to marry and, in at least five of the stories, to emigrate in order to regain a measure of economic security. Significantly, however, these narratives all end before or just as Moodie's heroines embark upon the adventure of emigration. Thurston's description of these stories as "tentative acts of discovery" is thus apt, for in them Moodie attempts, but ultimately fails, to reconcile her own family's chronic economic instability and inferior social station in Upper Canada with her heroine's unspoken expectation that marriage and emigration will restore her own fortune and rank. In *Voyages*, Moodie's personal disillusionment is palpable.

The response of women short story writers to a challenge of another kind is the subject of *New Women: Short Stories by Canadian Women 1900-1920*. As the title of the volume suggests, editors Sandra Campbell and Lorraine McMullen link women's literary production in this period with the emergence of that archetype of 'modern' urban life, the New Woman, whose development mirrored and, in part, symbolized Canada's transforma-

tion from a rural and agrarian society to one increasingly dominated by the exigencies of urban and industrial life. Campbell and McMullen argue that a new kind of woman writer and a new kind of female subjectivity emerged in the English-Canadian periodical press between 1900 and 1920. Accordingly, the twenty stories included in this collection were selected either for their contributions to the short story genre or for their commentary on women's changing social roles.

As Campbell and McMullen note in their introduction, whether well known or obscure, the authors of these stories were fully engaged in "the momentous transitions underway in women's status and society." The stories feature women in new roles, attempting to resolve the apparent disjunction between the promise of economic and sexual freedom on the one hand and their continued expectations of romance and marriage on the other. The female Maritime out-migrant in Boston, the middle-class temperance worker, the working-class munitionette, and the immigrant domestic from the British Isles are just a few of the familiar—although still obscure—historical figures given life in this group of stories.

These two collections underscore the importance of fiction writing as a source for the history of English Canadian cultural and social life. Not only do these stories illuminate the artistic and social vantage points of female short fiction writers, but they also suggest that attention to women's changing literary sensibilities can add a subtle richness and depth to our explorations of all women's experience of the past.

Beverly Boutilier
Department of History
Carleton University

Owen, Carrigan D. *Crime and Punishment in Canada – A History*. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart Inc., 1991. Pp. 554. Tables, appendices. \$24.95 (paper).

This book will be of particular interest to those readers concerned with urban affairs, as Carrigan makes it clear that the great bulk of criminal action in Canada, aside from that attributed to native peoples, has taken place and is still taking place in an urban setting. While there are obvious exceptions to the rule, the dark side of human nature manifests itself or is detected when people are grouped together in close proximity. The factual material in this book, often presented in time series for easy comparison, will aid serious students of social history, criminology and the administration of law in reaching conclusions in as objective a manner as possible.

Professor Carrigan is one of the first historians to analyze the subjects in a comprehensive way in Canada. He captures our interest by his citation of some of the first cases of crime in Canada from the early days of French settlement. He mentions theft, murder and the plotting of revolution that were punished by both Roberval and Champlain. His work is divided into two parts: a review of the kinds and frequency of criminal activity, with detailed discussions of white collar crime, organized and juvenile crime and the offenses committed by women; followed by a segment on the treatment of those convicted of the crimes discussed, again with specialized accounts of the treatment of juveniles and women.

Carrigan raises many pointed questions on the causes of criminal activity and the utility of the various options for punishment, including incarceration. These will doubtless continue to occupy discussion agendas for many years to come. He points out convincingly how the crime