

## Urban History Review Revue d'histoire urbaine

URBAN HISTORY REVIEW  
REVUE D'HISTOIRE URBAINE

Logan, Michael F. *Fighting Sprawl and City Hall: Resistance to Urban Growth in the Southwest*. Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1995. Pp. vii, 223. Illustration, tables, maps, index. US\$39.95 (cloth); US\$17.95 (paper)

James L. Wunsch

Volume 25, Number 1, October 1996

URI: <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1016111ar>

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.7202/1016111ar>

[See table of contents](#)

### Publisher(s)

Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine

### ISSN

0703-0428 (print)

1918-5138 (digital)

[Explore this journal](#)

### Cite this review

Wunsch, J. L. (1996). Review of [Logan, Michael F. *Fighting Sprawl and City Hall: Resistance to Urban Growth in the Southwest*. Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1995. Pp. vii, 223. Illustration, tables, maps, index. US\$39.95 (cloth); US\$17.95 (paper)]. *Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine*, 25(1), 71–72. <https://doi.org/10.7202/1016111ar>

Clark finds that radical cultural ideas from Petersburg (Lenin-grad) continued that city's pre-Revolutionary culture and its rivalry with Moscow for cultural leadership. She argues that anti-Tsarist intellectuals carried their pre-Revolutionary ideas into the Soviet Era and developed a symbiotic relationship with Communists during the 1920s based on a shared "fundamental loathing for the role of the marketplace in culture." Some Petersburg cultural activists remained active in the 1930s despite the Purges and Terror.

St. Petersburg artists expressed a wide variety of opinions before the Revolution. The avant-garde broke established rules in art and hoped to abolish social and political rules, as well. Even artists who celebrated St. Petersburg's neo-classical architectural heritage held a critical attitude towards the Tsarist establishment and the last emperors' preference for Muscovite styles. As the February Revolution's guns sounded, Vsevolod Meyerhold led the Petersburg theatre in trying to break with theatrical realism (unlike Stanislavsky's ultra-realistic theatre in Moscow).

Communist leaders supported experimental theatre generously after the October Revolution, seeing its potential for propaganda. Avant-garde artists eagerly took their skills to schools and factories as state subsidies free them from material concerns. One form of experimental theatre was the mass spectacle involving thousands of participants without any clear distinction between the cast and the audience. (Dmitri Tiomkin, composer of music for *High Noon* and other westerns, wrote music for revolutionary spectacles before leaving Russia in 1925.)

Communists reduced their artistic subsidies after 1921 when the New Economic Policy replaced War Communism. Artists looked to new ways of succumbing to the cultural marketplace. Some adopted the rhythms of the Jazz Age to build a new culture based on nervous energy and technological sophistication. Others self-consciously created artistic forms based on the Proletariat. Nicholas Marr's linguistic theories provoked efforts to find a new Revolution language expressed new realities; opera librettists and composers followed particularly carefully.

The tenth anniversary of the Revolution in 1927 gave rise to an effort to "institute a collective, proletarian culture." Young radicals revived and expanded the theatrical mass spectacle which often celebrated the factory and the machine. Architects designed the New Soviet City in which communal housing reduced privacy to a minimum. Music had to be written for the masses, not for the intellectual, and other artistic forms emphasized the superiority of the common citizen over highly trained professionals. This radical movement, which came largely from Petersburg, implied that decentralizing culture might proceed to decentralizing the increasingly centralized Soviet political machine.

Stalin and the Communists brought this Cultural Revolution to a halt before it posed a political threat. The Terror of the Purges

took harsh reprisals against many former avant-garde artists while others found their feet in the new circumstances and smuggled what they could into Socialist Realism. As a result, "Soviet culture of the 1930s may have been totalitarian, but it was far from homogenous or relentlessly grim." Post-war Stalinism turned out to be far worse.

Katerina Clark has illuminated this little-known aspect of Russian cultural history with skill and analytical depth. However, her highly theoretical approach creates unnecessary difficulties for readers who are not specialists in cultural history or Russian history. These readers might turn to Solomon Volkov's attractive, but far less rigorous, narrative account *St. Petersburg. A Cultural History* (1995). In addition, the distinction between what went on in Petersburg and what went on in the Soviet Union as a whole is not immediately clear.

Daniel Stone  
Department of History  
University of Winnipeg

---

Logan, Michael F. *Fighting Sprawl and City Hall: Resistance to Urban Growth in the Southwest*. Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1995. Pp. vii, 223. Illustration, tables, maps, index. US\$39.95 (cloth); US\$17.95 (paper).

During the nineteen fifties and sixties, Tucson and Albuquerque managed to consolidate within their boundaries, vast outlying areas. In *Fighting Sprawl and City Hall*, Michael F. Logan is less concerned with the boosters and promoters who made that possible than with those who contrary to prevailing opinion opposed urban expansion and development. His intent is to counter popular and scholarly writing which commonly depicts the Sunbelt as a region of movers and shakers who paved over God's little acre without the least opposition. Logan successfully describes the elements of an opposition dating back almost fifty years, but is less successful in showing how it altered, if at all, the shape of urban development.

According to Professor Logan, the opposition included those living in unconsolidated areas beyond the cities who feared that intrusive city government would through consolidation impose increased property taxes on them. Then there were environmentalists, including the famed naturalist and Tucson retiree Joseph Wood Krutch, concerned that urbanization might destroy the delicately balanced ecology of the desert and mountain foothills. Finally, Hispanics residing either within or outside the cities feared that a declaration of blight or consolidation might lead to their vital ethnic neighbourhoods being "urban renewed" out of existence.

Since these three groups often had little in common except opposition to city hall, the book appears at times to be more a collection of discrete essays—a form not without merit—than a cohesive study of opposition to development. Adding to the

problem of cohesiveness, however, is Logan's decision to tell the story as a tale of two cities. First, we are given the Tucson story, then Albuquerque's, but with little connecting tissue. The reader seeks discussion of the similarities and differences, but this is an approach in which the author seems reluctant to engage. Thus, the Tucson environmentalists appear in chapter four, but we must wait for chapter nine to find out about their Albuquerque counterparts. Integrating corresponding chapters might have produced a more systematic and thoughtful analysis.

Broad issues which might have established a solid foundation for the book are touched on, but the author was apparently so committed to focus on the three, distinct anti-city hall groups that he manages to deal with certain fundamental matters only in passing. For example, more than half way through the book, the reader learns that whereas Tucson resisted a proposed cross-town freeway (fearing it might turn the city into another Los Angeles), Albuquerque welcomed as many freeways as it could get. Since the automobile was the instrument which made possible the post-war settlement and expansion of both cities, the reader is left wondering how these different approaches shaped the respective cities and the degree to which opposition to city hall really influenced highway decision-making. An issue which should have dealt with front and centre is consigned to a paragraph toward the end.

One finishes *Fighting Sprawl* feeling pessimistic. Here were two small cities (each the seat of their respective state universities) which at the beginning of the century were courting health seekers and retirees with the promise of a pleasant life of abundant sunshine and clean, dry air within a spectacular mountain-desert setting. After World War II defense and high tech industries moved in and development leapfrogged from the city to the foothills and ecologically sensitive parts of the desert. Polluted air now obscures the mountains; strip development and suburban lawns insult the desert aesthetic, and the Southwest has become ANYWHERE, USA. The opposition to thoughtless development may be stronger now, but in the absence of much historical evidence from Professor Logan, one is left with the old saw—"You can't fight city hall."

James L. Wunsch  
Corporate/College Program  
Empire State College  
State University of New York

---

Macdonald, Catherine. *A City at Leisure: An Illustrated History of Parks and Recreation in Winnipeg*. Winnipeg: City of Winnipeg, Parks and Recreation Department, 1995. Pp. xiii, 220. Black and White Photographs. paper.

This volume traces, in text and illustration, the development of Winnipeg's parks and recreation system from its beginnings in

1893, to 1993. It was produced as part of the system's centennial celebrations.

*A City at Leisure* is rooted in theory, even though well-established theory, an uncommon touch in commemorative productions, which tend to favour a rather unshaped chronology. In brief, Macdonald's book argues that changes in urban society generated changes in leisure and recreation needs, which in turn led to changes in services. It has, in this respect, much academic as well as popular interest.

The book also argues that the Winnipeg experience was a North American one. Winnipeg experienced rapid urbanization and industrialization and in meeting the problems thus created, the city responded to the influences of the Public Parks Movement of the 1890s and, subsequently, to the "environmental" influences of the City Beautiful Movement and the "educational" ones of the Playground movement.

Macdonald's book says that the history of Winnipeg parks began in the 1890s with the Public Parks movement. As with many urban centres in Canada and the United States, it was based on a combination of economics, altruism, a sense of fair play, and a fear of public disorder. The provincial *Manitoba Public Parks Act* was passed in April of 1892, allowing the creation of parks boards that, in turn, worked to acquire, improve and maintain public parks. The social, economic and environmental benefits of parklands and recreation areas in the growing city were recast in the early 1900s in response to the City Beautiful Movement. Yet another response to alarming increases in urban crowding and impoverishment emerged as the Playground Movement, devised to encourage health, morality and overall respectability in children.

Through the discussion of the acquisition, the improvement, and the maintenance of public parks, community centres and other recreation facilities such as pools and outdoor theatres, this book generates a clear view of the processes involved in the building of a city. But this view would not be complete without an understanding of the urban society, its motivations and its changing needs, both in the organizations and in the community. In this regard, the book not only considers the developments in the central urban area but also devotes considerable attention to the suburban municipalities and their role in the provision and growth of parks and recreation services. Revealing a keen awareness of the significance of political groups and individuals as well as organizations, this volume explores the visions, motivations, and even shortcomings of prominent leaders involved with the advancement of the city's parks and recreation interests.

*A City of Leisure* is written in an accessible and engaging style, and maintains the reader's interest, as the ideas remain clear, succinct, and focused throughout. As well, the use of newspaper-style columns allows for quick and easy consumption of the material. The numerous and highly detailed particulars reveal painstaking research, while the author's lively written style suits