

**Dagenais, Michèle, Irene Maver, and Pierre-Yves Saunier.**  
*Municipal Services and Employees in the Modern City: New Historic Approaches.* Burlington, VT: Ashgate Publishing, 2003.  
Pp. xii, 238. US\$84.95 (hardcover)

Caroline Andrew

---

Volume 33, Number 1, Fall 2004

URI: <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1015682ar>

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.7202/1015682ar>

[See table of contents](#)

---

Publisher(s)

Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine

ISSN

0703-0428 (print)

1918-5138 (digital)

[Explore this journal](#)

---

Cite this review

Andrew, C. (2004). Review of [Dagenais, Michèle, Irene Maver, and Pierre-Yves Saunier. *Municipal Services and Employees in the Modern City: New Historic Approaches.* Burlington, VT: Ashgate Publishing, 2003. Pp. xii, 238. US\$84.95 (hardcover)]. *Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine*, 33(1), 60–61.  
<https://doi.org/10.7202/1015682ar>

While such an analysis would have required some different research questions, Rudin occasionally does not consider more fully what his evidence does show. In 1878, 1898, and again in the spring of 1908, Rudin demonstrates how various stakeholders within Quebec City used the memorialization of Laval and Champlain to affirm, extend, and even transcend a number of community boundaries central to the everyday lives of Quebecers. Even when the intent was to reach out to people from outside of Quebec City, the intent was to (re)connect these others to the city and what the city had historically meant for French-Canadian identity. In the case of the tercentenary, when this message was of little interest to Earl Grey's organization, Armand Lavergne told the House of Commons that "we must remember that we are now in 1908; that Quebec was founded in 1608 and that we are not celebrating the second centenary of the battle on the Plains of Abraham, but the third centenary of the founding of the city of Quebec." Rudin provides this quotation by remarking that Lavergne "was no doubt speaking for many Quebecers" when he said this (173).

What Rudin's evidence also suggests is that there were two different notions of community at work in Quebec City during 1908. For the monument of Laval, there was—as was the case with Laval's body in 1878 and Champlain's monument in 1898—an intense effort by organizers to create horizontal bonds of community that sought to address various sub-communities (ethnic, religious, class, and gender) within the city. Even when there were hierarchies, such as in the case of the 1898 celebrations, there were also efforts to reach across boundaries of difference to create a larger and more inclusive civic community. This was not the case for the tercentenary, where the specific elements of Quebec City were of little or no interest to organizers who sought instead to talk about the imagined community of Canada as a nation-state. The tercentenary did not speak to the citizens of Quebec City directly, and the bonds of community it celebrated were, despite their efforts to be inclusive (British, French, Aboriginal) undeniably vertical, with a triumphant Anglo-Canadian nation at the top and all others equally below.

Rudin seems to understand the role of neo-imperialism, but his overriding concern with "French-Canadians," which he explicitly defines (236n7) as referring to all of Quebec, rather than "French-Canadians in Quebec City," sometimes hinders the analysis and relegates the city to the role of stage for another, seemingly larger and thus more important, history. Place, however, matters more than this, and urban historians in particular will lament its relative unimportance here. But for those scholars of the city interested in the politics of commemoration, and the production of commemorative space, there is much in this book to absorb and to consider.

John C. Walsh  
Department of History  
Carleton University

**Dagenais, Michèle, Irene Maver, and Pierre-Yves Saunier. *Municipal Services and Employees in the Modern City: New Historic Approaches*. Burlington, VT: Ashgate Publishing, 2003. Pp. xii, 238. US\$84.95 (hardcover).**

This is an important book. Not only do we learn a great deal about the ways in which services have been delivered at the municipal level and all the complexities about who delivers them, we also gain valuable insights into issues of professionalization and its links to expertise, training, unionization, bureaucratization, management theories and practices, creation of new knowledge and new methods of acquiring knowledge, and the impact of industrialization and urbanization on urban public services. From this we gain a fresh perspective on the crucial role played by municipal governments at the turn of the century in the development of the new knowledges of the 20th century: engineering and the social sciences. And finally, the material in the book brings strong support to those who find the literature on "rescaling" an important perspective for understanding the processes by which societies decide who does what, where, and why. In looking at municipal services and municipal employees across Europe, and North and South America, the contributors provide rich material for examining the interrelations of local and central levels of the state and of local and central levels of voluntary and professional associations and the ways in which state and non-state actors maximize their interests through scalar strategies. It is always useful to be reminded of the multiplicity, and the complexity, of strategies that have been used. Industrialization and urbanization were transforming cities all across Europe and the Americas in the late 19th century, and the collection of detailed case studies brought together in this book illustrate the rich variety of strategies used to develop municipal services, policy transfers from one city to another, "jumping scale" to use the resources of different levels of political action or to avoid barriers or opposition at some particular level, multi-level governance in combining state and civil society strategies for change.

A recurring theme in the book is the link between the new scientific methods of the early 20th century, key municipal officials, and innovative public services. This emerges around the key role of engineers in Italian cities in the chapters by Filippo De Pieri on Turin and by Roberto Ferretti on Italy-wide trends in local government. Michèle Dagenais' chapter on municipal management in Montreal in the 1930s emphasizes the importance of new management techniques (reforms to financial and personnel systems) introduced by new and more professionalized bureaucrats whose expertise came more from formal training than from municipal experience. Another version of this theme comes out in the chapter on American fire departments by Amy Greenberg, in which she argues that the change from volunteer to professional fire departments had more to do with the ideology of professionalism (along with the introduction of steam engines and the role of fire insurance companies) than the traditionally accepted interpretations of an inevitable reaction to urbanization and/or as a means to control unruly volun-

teer firefighters. In the case of São Paulo, Cristina Mehrtens describes the links among municipal officials, new survey techniques for understanding the local population, and the development of the social sciences in Brazil. These developments involved the municipal structures and services, the universities and programs that trained the new municipal officials, and the professional associations that built expertise and strengthened the position of the relevant professional groups. In the São Paulo case, many of the key figures were foreign intellectuals living in São Paulo who brought their international experience to bear. The importance of international contacts also comes up in the chapter by Irene Maver on Glasgow, but here it is delegations from Glasgow that visited not only London, but also Paris, Brussels, Amsterdam, and a variety of German cities. Her chapter is full of examples of what the Glaswegians learned—from Paris, the ability “to reinforce the aesthetic qualities of urban design by means of sanitary control” (192), from the Belgian museum and gallery system, “the kind of integrated approach that fostered both community identity and national unity” (193), and from Germany, “the power of the professionals” (194). And Maver makes the more general point about the importance of these international connections: “The growth of professionalism has been a recurring theme, not only in the context of education and training, but in the dissemination and exchange of ideas locally, nationally and internationally” (197).

The importance of networking and contacts beyond the municipality is also highlighted in Emmanuel Bellanger’s chapter on the town clerks in the Paris region. In this case, these key municipal officials combined the resources of their knowledge of the local terrain with a strong associational network that linked them across municipalities. In the early period, they were not a particularly highly educated group, but they made up for it, in terms of resources for exercising power, by this combination of local knowledge and associational ties.

The book is primarily interested in municipal employees, and even more particularly in the key municipal officials, but there is also much to be learned about the role of elected officials. Michèle Dagenais’ chapter on Montreal in the 1930s is noteworthy in this regard. The growing importance and professional expertise of the key officials was supported by the politicians as they began to realize that professional management of the city not only pleased the financial community, but could also be popular with the general electorate. This led to the realization that an alliance between elected officials and key civil servants could be more productive, but also more successful politically, than earlier conflictual relationships. This is certainly a theme that resonates today in looking at municipal policy and at sources of municipal innovation.

Another theme of current importance is the relationship between municipal officials and civil society, and the role of community participation in the programming and delivery of municipal services. The chapter by Bénédicte Zimmermann on municipal unemployment policies in Germany in the period 1871–1918 is one to be read by all those interested in the

municipal potential for innovative policy-making. Zimmermann’s argument is that, in this period, it was the municipal governments and not the national government that were the innovators, and the reason was the proximity of municipalities to local civil society. The participation of trade unions in municipal policy-making created a variety of policies across German cities, and this policy innovation moved the policy agenda from programs around poverty to programs related to employment and unemployment. The link between proximity, the participation of civil society, and policy innovation is a lesson that should be picked up by all those interested in good urban policy, be they at the municipal, provincial, or federal level.

The book is a delight to read. The detailed case studies give an intricate sense of the ways in which personalities, structures, and contexts interrelate in the development and mobilization of professional competence, scientific research, and political commitment to produce the services of modern cities. At the same time, we are continually drawn to reflect on the vast themes raised by the authors: the importance of bureaucracy and of professions to the modern world, the role played by the new emerging sciences of the 20th century, and the rescaling strategies of the various actors, particularly those of the key officials. The first chapter, by Michèle Dagenais and Pierre-Yves Saunier, nicely develops the themes of the book and reflects on what we might learn about comparative analysis by comparing cities rather than national experiences. This book is certainly a good argument for doing just this.

Caroline Andrew  
School of Political Studies  
University of Ottawa

---

**Blum, Alan. *The Imaginative Structure of the City*. Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen’s University Press, 2003. Pp. x, 330. \$44.95 (hardcover).**

*The Imaginative Structure of the City* is a product of the Culture of Cities project, one of the very large Major Collaborative Research Initiatives (MCRI) funded by the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council. The project is a broadly interdisciplinary comparison of Montreal, Toronto, Berlin, and Dublin, looking at the ways in which these cities are influenced by global trends and express their own distinctiveness. The project is centred on the cultural expressions of the cities, *culture* being understood in a broad way relating to the daily patterns of life.

The context of the book is to me essential to understanding the complex, many-layered reading of the city that Alan Blum proposes to us. The book seems to me both an intellectual argument for a project on the culture of cities and an intellectual argument for why a broad knowledge of political and social theory is useful to laying the foundations for understanding the modern city. Seen in this light, the book is first and foremost a contribution to, and a celebration of, an interdisciplinary approach to looking at cities. An incredibly rich and varied set