

Canadian University Music Review Revue de musique des universités canadiennes

Diane E. Peters. *Canadian Music and Music Education: An Annotated Bibliography of Theses and Dissertations*. Lanham, Md.: The Scarecrow Press, 1997. xvii, 476 pp. ISBN 0-8108-3275-5 (hardcover)

Glenn Colton

Volume 20, Number 1, 1999

URI: <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1015650ar>

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.7202/1015650ar>

[See table of contents](#)

Publisher(s)

Canadian University Music Society / Société de musique des universités canadiennes

ISSN

0710-0353 (print)

2291-2436 (digital)

[Explore this journal](#)

Cite this review

Colton, G. (1999). Review of [Diane E. Peters. *Canadian Music and Music Education: An Annotated Bibliography of Theses and Dissertations*. Lanham, Md.: The Scarecrow Press, 1997. xvii, 476 pp. ISBN 0-8108-3275-5 (hardcover)]. *Canadian University Music Review / Revue de musique des universités canadiennes*, 20(1), 104–107. <https://doi.org/10.7202/1015650ar>

significance of the WMC and an overview of the women's musical club movement in North America.

While I may have wished for more emphasis on the "living history" of the WMC (i.e., less reliance on archival and printed materials and more first hand interviews with living performers and WMC members), Elliott has succeeded admirably in compiling a well-written and exceptionally thorough narrative of the club's first century of activities. The minute attention to details of individual performances and administrative matters, while of limited appeal to a general readership, makes the book a valuable reference tool for researchers with an interest in women's musical clubs in general and the Women's Musical Club of Toronto specifically. As the author points out in his closing chapter, "the study of the women's musical club movement is still in its infancy, despite the fact that thousands of such organizations have flourished in centres large and small throughout North America during the past 125 years" (p. 221). Elliott's book may well pave the way for future research into the accomplishments of these remarkable women.

Glenn Colton

Diane E. Peters. *Canadian Music and Music Education: An Annotated Bibliography of Theses and Dissertations*. Lanham, Md.: The Scarecrow Press, 1997. xvii, 476 pp. ISBN 0-8108-3275-5 (hardcover).

The field of Canadian music research has come a long way in recent decades. With courses in Canadian music now firmly established as an integral part of the curriculum in many of our music departments and a plethora of recently completed publications, dissertations, and theses on aspects of music in Canada, books such as Diane Peters's annotated bibliography of theses and dissertations on Canadian music and music education are welcome additions to this rapidly growing field.¹

As Peters rightly points out in the introduction to the book, existing dissertation abstracts are of limited value when searching for current scholarship on Canadian music, and Master's level works completed at American or foreign universities are often extremely difficult to uncover.

The present volume includes annotated bibliographic citations of over 1,200 theses and dissertations relating to aspects of Canadian music or music education in Canada. The scope of the entries is impressive, with the bibliography partitioned neatly into 15 sections as follows: (1) Analytical Studies: General; (2) Analytical Studies: Instrumental Music; (3) Analytical Studies: Vocal Music; (4) Bibliographies/Inventories/Repertoire Lists; (5) Ethnomusicology/Folk Music; (6) Historical/Bibliographical Studies; (7) Music and Literature; (8) Music Education; (9) Music Journalism/Criticism; (10) Music Recording/Broadcasting;

¹ Mention must also be made here of Carl Morey's informative annotated bibliography, *Music in Canada: A Research and Information Guide* (New York and London: Garland, 1997). Morey's book, while more selective than the present volume by Peters, includes both published and unpublished sources.

(11) Musical Instruments; (12) Original Compositions; (13) Psychology of Music/Music Therapy; (14) Sacred Music; (15) Sociological Studies.

There are many attributes which make this book a valuable reference tool. The numbered, categorized abstracts are clear and concise, yet detailed enough to give the reader a precise summary of the subject, methodology, and contents of each thesis and dissertation. While approximately forty per cent of works listed were written in French and a small number in German and other languages, all of the abstracts have been translated into English with the title of the work indicating the language in which it was written. An especially useful feature is that entries available through University Microfilms in Ann Arbor, Michigan, or in the National Library of Canada's Canadian theses series, are followed by order numbers for purchase. Separate indices by author, title, institution, and subject are given at the end of the book.

Peters has obviously spared no effort in assembling this wide-ranging compilation of unpublished sources, many of which lie outside the realm of what would normally be considered "Canadian music." Indeed, Peters's definition of the term is considerably broader than most, encompassing not only writings about Canadian composers, performers, musical styles, genres, etc., but also works such as music-related psychological studies in which some or all of the participants are Canadian. Within this eclectic fusion of disparate subjects and methodologies, it then becomes possible for the abstracts of non-music specialists to appear alongside specialized works from the more "traditional" fields of musical inquiry (analysis, musicology/ethnomusicology, music criticism, music education, composition, performance pedagogy, etc.). How else could one open up a music bibliography and find an entry titled "Shame, Body Image and Locus-of-control in Male and Female Exotic Dancers" (p. 307)?² The risk with this type of approach is that the scope of entries becomes so broad as to be unmanageable. While I do not think this is necessarily the case here, there are some questionable choices of cross-referencing and indexing and, in certain instances, some unfortunate omissions of important dissertations pertaining to Canadian music.

To test the usefulness of Peters's bibliography, I first searched for theses and dissertations on two Canadian composers whose music I have researched fairly extensively—S. C. Eckhardt-Gramatté and the subject of my own doctoral dissertation, Jean Coulthard.³ With respect to Eckhardt-Gramatté, I found (as I had hoped) detailed entries on Glen Carruthers's exhaustive thesis ("The Career and Compositions of S. C. Eckhardt-Gramatté," M.A. thesis, Carleton University, 1981), Lorne Watson's study of the composer's piano techniques ("The E-Gré Piano Techniques [and] Cadences in Debussy's Preludes, Books I and II," D.Mus. diss., Indiana University, 1976), and Mark Rodgers and Mary Smith's works on her string music (Mark A. Rodgers, "The Concertino for

²Dean J. M. Mooney, "Shame, Body Image and Locus-of-control in Male and Female Exotic Dancers" (Ph.D. diss., University of Detroit, 1992).

³My dissertation, "The Piano Music of Jean Coulthard" (Ph.D. diss., University of Victoria, 1997), not included in the book, was completed in the same year that Peters's bibliography was published and, understandably, was not likely known to Peters prior to the publication of the present volume.

Viola da Gamba and Harpsichord of S. C. Eckhardt-Gramatté: A Critical Edition for Cello and Piano," M.Mus. thesis, University of Western Ontario, 1987; Mary Smith, "The Cello Works of S. C. Eckhardt-Gramatté, M.Mus. thesis, University of Western Ontario, 1978). However Murray Decock's dissertation on the piano sonatas has been omitted completely (Murray Decock, "The Piano Sonatas of S. C. Eckhardt-Gramatté," D.M.A. diss., University of Maryland, 1993).

A search for pertinent Coulthard sources turned up similar mixed results. I was pleased to find David Duke's excellent dissertation on the composer's orchestral writing ("The Orchestral Music of Jean Coulthard: A Critical Assessment," Ph.D. thesis, University of Victoria, 1993), and Vivienne Rowley's discussion of her piano works to 1973 ("The Solo Piano Music of the Canadian Composer Jean Coulthard," Mus. A.D., Boston University, 1973). In addition, Coulthard's name appears in a number of genre-based studies encompassing the music of several composers. Yet once again there is a glaring omission: Barbara Lee's dissertation on the piano works (Barbara Lee, "The Solo Piano Works of Jean Coulthard," D.M.A. diss., Catholic University of America, 1986).

With respect to the cross-referencing of entries, a search for information on the same composer turned up further problems. The Duke and Rowley dissertations are both listed under the heading "Analytical Studies: Instrumental Music," which is a fair categorization given the content of both works. Yet there are errors and inconsistencies in the manner in which these sources are cross-referenced and indexed. Under the heading "Historical/Biographical Studies," there is a cross-reference to the Rowley dissertation (which offers a brief biographical sketch of Coulthard), but no such cross-reference exists for the Duke dissertation. This is a significant omission given the fact that the Duke work not only has a strong biographical component, but is arguably one of the most comprehensive biographical sources on Coulthard available. The problem becomes more acute after examining the Coulthard entry in the subject index. The composer's name and a list of works appear, each followed by references to appropriate entry numbers. Yet no orchestral works are listed, despite the fact that Duke's dissertation deals extensively with a wide range of orchestral works.

Further questions can be raised about the categorization of sources. In particular, some of the category headings might be more useful if they were more narrowly defined, although Peters states in the introduction to the book that this was avoided since it would have resulted in more extensive cross-referencing. Despite the excellent indices, however, additional cross-references may ultimately prove more advantageous to the reader than broad "analytical" sections which include not only theoretical works, but also studies in performance pedagogy, aesthetics, and acoustics.

Another aspect of the book which could benefit from further clarification is the listing of degrees for each author. Specifically, it would be helpful in many instances to include the discipline as well as the degree designation, since a wide range of disciplines are encompassed under each subject heading. This way a Ph.D. in musicology could be easily distinguished from one in theory, for example, or an M.A. in folklore distinguished from one in ethnomusicology.

Such criticisms aside, Peters's bibliography is not without considerable merit and, on balance, represents a significant achievement in the compilation of Canadian music reference materials, particularly lesser known works at the master's level. The author's generally good descriptions of works, useful indices, and impressive range of subjects make the book a worthwhile addition to the music libraries of scholars in a broad range of music-related disciplines.

Glenn Colton

William E. Caplin. *Classical Form: A Theory of Formal Functions for the Instrumental Music of Haydn, Mozart, and Beethoven*. New York et Oxford : Oxford University Press, 1998. xii, 307 p. ISBN 0-19-510480-3 (couverture rigide).

L'intérêt que suscite chez les musicologues et théoriciens l'organisation formelle de la musique classique, et plus particulièrement celle de l'école de Vienne, ne semble pas près de s'éteindre. L'ouvrage de Caplin, *Classical Form : A Theory of Formal Functions for the Instrumental Music of Haydn, Mozart, and Beethoven*, s'ajoute à une abondante et riche littérature, aux tendances diverses. Au cours des dernières décennies, nous avons eu droit à l'approche « critique » (au sens anglais du terme) de Charles Rosen (1972), à l'identification d'un schéma stylistique par Robert Gjerdingen (1988), à la perspective rhétorique de Mark Evan Bonds (1991), aux propositions polémiques remettant en question l'unité du style classique chez James Webster (1991), à l'étude des topiques classiques chez Leonard G. Ratner (1980), et à l'impressionnante postérité que cette dernière a suscitée chez des auteurs aussi différents que Kofi Agawu (1991), Robert Hatten (1994) et Elaine Sisman (1997). Plus récemment, Scott Burnham (1995) a scruté l'impact des œuvres de la période héroïque de Beethoven sur les techniques d'analyse majeures développées depuis le XIX^e siècle. L'ouvrage de Caplin se distingue des travaux récents en ce qu'il renoue avec un genre négligé, celui du manuel d'analyse formelle du genre *Formenlehre*. Cette tradition, à laquelle se rattachent des ouvrages aussi respectés que le traité d'Adolf Bernhard Marx, *Die Lehre von der musikalischen Komposition* (1847), ou le *Form in Tonal Music* de Douglass M. Green (1965), tente d'établir des généralisations à partir d'un corpus d'œuvres circonscrit et essaie d'identifier les conventions qui en régissent l'organisation formelle. Caplin cherche à dépasser la simple taxinomie de l'organisation du groupement et s'intéresse à ce qu'il appelle les « fonctions formelles », c'est-à-dire à la manière dont les segments musicaux expriment une fonction dynamique. Celle-ci est généralement liée à la caractérisation temporelle d'un segment, soit à sa capacité d'exprimer une fonction d'initiation, de continuation ou de conclusion sur un plan hiérarchique donné. Cette approche s'inscrit dans le prolongement direct du *Fundamentals of Musical Composition* d'Arnold Schoenberg (1967) — dont l'importante contribution avait déjà été signalée à l'attention des lecteurs francophones par Célestin Deliège en 1984 — et du *Einführung in die musikalische Formenlehre* de son élève Erwin Ratz (1973).