

Yigael Yadin, ed. *Jerusalem Revealed: Archaeology in the Holy City 1968-1974*. New Haven, Yale University Press, and Jerusalem, The Israel Exploration Society, 1975. 139 + viii pp., illus., \$12.95

Sheila D. Campbell

Volume 5, Number 2, 1978–1979

URI: <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1077033ar>

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.7202/1077033ar>

[See table of contents](#)

Publisher(s)

UAAC-AAUC (University Art Association of Canada | Association d'art des universités du Canada)

ISSN

0315-9906 (print)

1918-4778 (digital)

[Explore this journal](#)

Cite this review

Campbell, S. D. (1978). Review of [Yigael Yadin, ed. *Jerusalem Revealed: Archaeology in the Holy City 1968-1974*. New Haven, Yale University Press, and Jerusalem, The Israel Exploration Society, 1975. 139 + viii pp., illus., \$12.95]. *RACAR : Revue d'art canadienne / Canadian Art Review*, 5(2), 149–150.
<https://doi.org/10.7202/1077033ar>

part, merely playful? How widespread was the impulse to match form to the existing cityscape and to habitual use? What possible meaning does the internal clutter have? Lambton does not wrestle with these matters, resting content with vague assertions that whatever answers there may be – and we do not have them – Victorian values were healthier than ours. But enough of this: regardless of one's views, the present has a crushing way of defending itself through its uniquely insistent presence.

JOHN M. ROBSON
University of Toronto

AMBROISE VOLLARD *Recollections of a Picture Dealer*. New York, Hacker Art Books, 1978. 326 pp. 33 illus., \$30.00.

The photocopying of the printed word has had both bad and good consequences in the intellectual world. The copying of books and magazine articles of living authors by academics has enriched the manufacturers of photocopying machines at the expense of authors and publishers. The reissuing of older books (especially art books, which often appeared originally in very small editions), on the other hand, has made such volumes broadly available in a very welcome way.

An example of the interesting reprint is Vollard's *Recollections*. As the title indicates, this is a series of reminiscences of the author's experiences as an art dealer. Vollard deliberately avoided criticism or analysis of the work of the artists he sold, and the value of the book lies in the picture he recreates of the Paris art scene before World War I, particularly of the less familiar traditional art world. Vollard loved good stories and the book is packed with anecdotes about artists, dealers and collectors, many of them no doubt true. Nevertheless, there are some illuminating passages on the painters, notably Manet. Vollard presents himself in a modest, self-

deprecating way that reveals little of how the young provincial from La Réunion in the Indian Ocean came to appreciating the best artists of his time, and especially his brilliance in giving Cézanne his first one-man show in 1895. Even at that late date, it was a bold venture.

Vollard's vanity, commented on by Picasso, is indicated more openly in his account of how he became a publisher of *livres d'artiste*. He claims that it was seeing by chance a fine title page with 'Ambroise Firmin-Didot, éditeur' beautifully printed on it, that inspired him to think that 'Ambroise Vollard, éditeur' would look rather fine too. By becoming a publisher, Vollard found a way to stamp his name on his artists' work. He thus achieved recognition as a creative force rather than simply as a middle man of art.

The present book is well produced and does not have the seedy look of some reissues, though it suffers from the inevitable greyness of photo reprints. This might not have pleased Vollard, who is praised in the new foreword for tirelessly seeking skilled printers and demanding their best efforts. One drawback is the price, which may discourage many potential buyers. At this price a critical edition is to be expected, rather than the simple reprint with a brief biographical foreword by Una E. Johnson. When so many books of this kind are being cheaply reprinted by paperback publishers, the volume under review seems to fall between two stools. We hope that Hacker finds a way to make its books more accessible, as it is a worthwhile enterprise.

GERALD NEEDHAM
York University
Toronto

YIGAL YADIN, ed. *Jerusalem Revealed: Archaeology in the Holy City 1968-1974*. New Haven, Yale University Press, and Jerusalem, The Israel Exploration Society, 1975. 139+ viii pp., illus., \$12.95.

This volume, the first of a planned series, is clearly described in the foreword as a reply to the criticism levelled at Israel by UNESCO for extensive archaeological investigation of the Jewish Quarter of the Old City. The text consists of thirty-two articles by a total of twenty-seven contributors. It is divided into three sections: The Ancient City (twenty-one articles), The Mediaeval City (seven articles), and The Modern City (four articles), and within each section there are studies on secular as well as on religious sites. Although the vast majority of topics deal with specifically Jewish subjects, Christian and Islamic themes are also represented and in fact together make up the entire mediaeval section.

An anthology of this nature, covering many different topics and a vast chronological span, is extremely difficult to review in any detail. The following remarks therefore, of necessity, will be confined to fairly general considerations.

The first question arises within the first article and remains unanswered throughout the remaining thirty-one: what is the intended audience? The foreword states that the content consists of abridged translations of material published in the Hebrew quarterly *Qadmoniot*, but the end result seems too detailed for the lay reader yet not detailed enough for the professional archaeologist. Many of the articles assume a degree of background knowledge beyond what might be expected of the general public; at the same time, the lack of an extensive bibliography or of any footnotes whatsoever suggests that the publication is not geared towards the scholar.

The articles are presented chronologically, beginning with 'Jerusalem in the Biblical Period.' This adherence to chronology

lapses with the fourth essay, 'Excavations in Jerusalem – Review and Evaluation,' which would have provided a very useful introduction to the rest of the volume by giving a summary of the problems currently under investigation. The articles are of a fairly uniform length, generally three or four pages. Some topics can be summarized adequately in this space but others suffer from this restriction, such as, for example, the essay on 'The Lintels of the Holy Sepulchre.'

The black-and-white illustrations which accompany the text (Fig. 1) are of excellent quality, but they are not numbered or referred to in the body of the text; consequently, the reader never knows when to look for illustrations of particular points. The four colour plates, on the other hand, appear rather flat, almost like reproductions of watercolours. The bibliography for the entire volume consists of one page, approximately thirty entries, with no attempt to link these entries to the individual articles. In addition, most of the references are to the periodical IEJ (Israel Exploration Journal), but the meaning of this abbreviation is not given anywhere.

On the positive side, the book contains many maps, tables and indexes which are clear and useful, and the volume is printed on good quality paper. A volume which goes from pre-Davidic times to future plans for a national park, referring to such topics as the aqueducts of

Jerusalem, Islamic architecture, Crusader Jerusalem and the Holy Sepulchre, could suffer problems of unity and cohesion, but this is not the case, and the text flows smoothly. On the whole the book provides a very useful summary of the archaeological problems under investigation in the city of Jerusalem to 1974. The reader is given a picture which extends over a wide period of time, wider than one usually finds in an archaeological publication, and the result is comprehensive and coherent, and more than a 'tourist manual.' Other major cities of antiquity which are still flourishing in the twentieth century could benefit from a similar treatment.

SHEILA D. CAMPBELL
Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval
Studies
Toronto

ELISABETH B. MACDOUGALL and RICHARD ETTINGHAUSEN, eds. *The Islamic Garden*. Washington, D.C., Dumbarton Oaks, 1976. 135 + xxxvi pp., illus., \$15.00.

The art of garden construction and design is the most ephemeral of a culture's efforts to force some aspect of its physical environment into conformity to that culture's idea of 'nature.' Scarcely any other creation of man's architectural imagination is so vulnerable to accident or digression. Any gardener knows that a single season's inattention can return his or her ordered world to wilderness. And since the basic components of garden design – wood, water, grass, plant and flower materials – are light and flexible, no comparable physical structure has lent itself with such fluency to destructive transformations of taste. The international garden Anglomania of the eighteenth century, for example, virtually eradicated the tradition of the private formal garden in France.

As a result, the garden historian, far more than the art historian, must work with secondary source

materials: ground plans, old photographs, engravings, cartoons describing a fête or *plein-air* theatrical performance. The opportunities provided for archaeological deduction are often considerable, as F.H. Hazelhurst has demonstrated in his brilliant reconstruction of Le Nôtre's design for the garden of the Archbishop of Paris at Conflans. Nevertheless, the emotion most frequently experienced by the garden enthusiast as he or she surveys the history of the subject is regret for so much that has been destroyed.

Any serious attempt to interpret the surviving fragments of civilization's most exquisite contradiction of perceived chaos must be welcome. For the past decade, the Center for Studies in Landscape at Dumbarton Oaks in the District of Columbia has published the results of a series of symposia discussing the major, national garden traditions of the Western world. The Italian, French and English garden have been considered. The present volume deals with the Islamic garden.

The Islamic Garden offers the student of garden history, and of Islamic culture, significant rewards. Not the least of these is Richard Ettinghausen's cogent justification of a selective cross-cultural, rather than strictly regional, presentation of the subject. Like Islam itself, the Islamic garden exists as a nexus of attitudes and responses which have been translated into the visual languages of societies as diverse politically, and as distant physically, as Umayyad Spain and Safavid Iran. But while cultural idioms may have varied, basic expressive relationships – the relationship of artificial to 'natural,' of garden setting to architectural focus, of walled to non-walled areas – demonstrate a binding continuity over space and time. The streams that nourished the Islamic garden flowed out from a single, central source, as Ettinghausen suggests. The fact that the five essays which follow the introduction elaborate specific aspects of this perceptive text imposes upon the collection a thematic structure



FIGURE 1. Stone vessel. Yadin, p. 48.