

Solen Roth, *Incorporating Culture: How Indigenous People are Reshaping the Northwest Coast Art Industry*, Vancouver/Toronto: UBC Press, 2018, 240 pp. 7 b/w photographs \$ 90.00 (hardcover) ISBN 9780774837385 \$ 32.95 (paperback) ISBN 9780774837392 \$ 32.95 (epub) ISBN 9780774837415

Carolyn Butler-Palmer

Volume 45, Number 2, 2020

URI: <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1073953ar>

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.7202/1073953ar>

[See table of contents](#)

Publisher(s)

UAAC-AAUC (University Art Association of Canada | Association d'art des universités du Canada)

ISSN

0315-9906 (print)

1918-4778 (digital)

[Explore this journal](#)

Cite this review

Butler-Palmer, C. (2020). Review of [Solen Roth, *Incorporating Culture: How Indigenous People are Reshaping the Northwest Coast Art Industry*, Vancouver/Toronto: UBC Press, 2018, 240 pp. 7 b/w photographs \$ 90.00 (hardcover) ISBN 9780774837385 \$ 32.95 (paperback) ISBN 9780774837392 \$ 32.95 (epub) ISBN 9780774837415]. *RACAR : Revue d'art canadienne / Canadian Art Review*, 45(2), 161–163. <https://doi.org/10.7202/1073953ar>

for Peace and Stéphan Crétier and Stéphanie Maillery Wing for the Arts of One World—to complement its vision (155). However, as Dymond demonstrates in winning reviews of post–2016 exhibitions showcasing work by Indigenous and Black artists, the MMFA’s hegemonic humanism appears to be tone-deaf to systemic power imbalances, the history of colonialism, critiques of Eurocentrism, and much else besides.

Dymond’s concluding “Calls to Action” suggest a host of avenues for reforming our exhibiting institutions and the agencies that fund them to realize societal commitments to inclusivity. As she underlines, *Diversity Counts* is a contribution toward this effort, but not the last word. On that score, one could envisage follow-up studies of transgender representation; noteworthy galleries in the Prairies and Maritimes addressing Indigeneity; or a critical examination of the Sobey Awards. Analysing how the art market and commercial galleries interface with collectors, curators, and museum boards to structure what art ‘counts’ and what art doesn’t is another angle. The history of non-commercial ARCS and artist-run journals might also yield lessons in how horizontal decision-making and structures of accountability can further diversity. Additionally, exploring degrees of political radicality in the arts could surely nuance any study’s intersectional dimensions. Which is to say, *Diversity Counts* got me thinking. This is a path-breaking study and an invaluable contribution to our understanding of the contemporary art scene in Canada. ¶

Allan Antliff is a Professor in the department of Art History & Visual Studies at the University of Victoria.
—allan@uvic.ca

1. “Letter from Victoria” (March 10, 2018), *Runggh Magazine* (April 2018): <https://rungh.org/samachar/letter-from-victoria/>

2. “Statement from the Interim Board of Directors” (March 13 2018), *Runggh Magazine* (March 13, 2018): <https://rungh.org/samachar/open-space-forms-new-interim-board-of-directors-former-board-resigns/>

Solen Roth
Incorporating Culture: How Indigenous People are Reshaping the Northwest Coast Art Industry

Vancouver/Toronto: UBC Press, 2018
240 pp. 7 b/w photographs
\$ 90.00 (hardcover) ISBN 9780774837385
\$ 32.95 (paperback) ISBN 9780774837392
\$ 32.95 (epub) ISBN 9780774837415

Carolyn Butler-Palmer



Incorporating Culture: How Indigenous People are Reshaping the Northwest Coast Art Industry takes a fresh look at Northwest Coast art through the exploration of economic, legal, and social issues. This is an innovative approach, although there have been books on the conventional potlatch economy and the development of the capitalist souvenir industry in the Northwest Coast, as exemplified by Kate Duncan’s landmark text *1001 Curious Things: Ye Olde Curiosity Shop and Native American Art* (2001) and later work such as Daina Augaitis, Jim Hart, and Robin K. Wright’s *Charles Edenshaw* (2013) and Ronald W. Hawker’s *Yakuglas’ Legacy: The Art and Time of Charlie James* (2016). Roth’s book forges a new path, however, as she pieces together a complex picture of how these ecologies intersect in the twenty-first century with issues of authenticity, appropriation, globalization, contracts, and identity.

Incorporating Culture is also an important complement to another vein of scholarly research, exemplified by Robert J. Miller’s *Reservation Capitalism: Economic Development in Indian Country* (2012), which examines the role of capitalism within Indigenous communities yet overlooks the importance of the art market as a part of the economy. By contrast, Roth focuses on the intersections between art and capitalism. Throughout the book, she asserts that these politically charged junctions provide clues to the continuity of the potlatch values that still operation within a capitalist economy, generating what she refers

to as a “culturally modified capitalism”—an evocative expression that draws from the ethnological term “culturally modified tree,” which describes a cedar tree harvested using Indigenous practices that allow the tree to still continue to grow and thrive across centuries).

The book’s first chapter provides a general overview of both the historical and current Indigenous “artware” market, charting out the complex dynamics between Indigenous artists and the owners of artware companies, who are usually white settlers. Artware company owners forge various sorts of relationships with different artists, ranging from one-off commissions to long-term friendships. Roth deploys Anna L. Tsing’s concept of “friction” as a means of mapping, within these dynamics. The frictions Tsing describes are the points of contact necessary to create cultural movement or change, necessary catalysts for the indigenization of the artware industry. Over the next five chapters, Roth charts out varying ways the concept of friction plays out across case studies featured in the following five chapters.

In the second chapter, Roth traces the history of the industrial artware market from the early 1900s, while the potlatch ban was in effect, to its present-day “frictions,” more than fifty years after the ban was quietly erased. She begins in 1905 on the Northwest Coast with a Skagway manufacturer of Tlingit objects, and then delves into the ideas of settler Canadians such as Harlan Smith,

Emily Carr, and Eric Brown, who were early advocates for the transfer of Indigenous designs to household wares such as rugs to produce uniquely “Canadian” ware. As early as the 1930s some settlers also saw the sale of Indigenous artware as a means of supporting Indigenous livelihoods, as the writings of Reverend George Raley and Alice Ravenhill indicate. Roth describes the year 1948 as milestone, when the now-celebrated Kwakwaka’wakw artist Ellen Neel publicly endorsed the development of the capitalist Indigenous art market as a viable new economy that could raise the standard of living for Indigenous artists, whose livelihood and lifeways had suffered due to the forces of colonialism, and especially due to the brutal legal actions taken against the economies of the traditional potlatch system, which was the primary patronage system for painters, carvers, and textile artists. Alongside her advocacy for the development of a new economy, Neel levied a potent critique of work that, to the eyes of White tourists, looked to be Indigenous but was often cheaply manufactured abroad by settler producers, devaluing both the aesthetics and the economy of Indigenous art and the inalienable rights of Indigenous people. Although Ellen Neel is now celebrated for her visionary thoughts, Roth insightfully points out that her words were not well received by government officials, who were able to introduce protectionist legislation against mass-produced, imported souvenir items but failed to implement such measures. The devastating effects of this failure were felt for another half century. In the twenty-first century, Ellen Neel’s granddaughter Lou-ann Neel helped establish the Authentic Aboriginal program within the Aboriginal Tourism Association of British Columbia as a means of returning power and financial gain to Indigenous producers. In describing this history, Roth

lays out the challenges of balancing the equation between protectionism and marketability throughout the twentieth century.

For the third chapter, “Globalization/Localization,” Roth charts the complex interchange between Northwest Coast artware and globalized production. Drawing upon Robert J. Foster’s concept of the “commodityscape,” Roth examines how the imprinting of mass-produced, offshore objects such as coffee mugs and tee-shirts with Indigenous designs renders them seemingly local.¹ Although these objects contain elements of offshore mass-production, the fact that the designs are created by Indigenous people—and, in some cases, Indigenous people are engaged in other aspects of productions—separates such contemporary pieces from twentieth-century fakes, in Roth’s eyes. She also brings forward an important and very original argument about the differences in the market for Northwest Coast and other non-Western art products. African artware, she observes, enjoys a worldwide market system sustained, in part, by African diasporic communities. By contrast, Northwest Coast artware is mostly sold in the Northwest Coast region, except for gift shops at museums with large Northwest Coast collections, and there are no large diasporic Northwest Coast Indigenous communities outside of the region. The commodityscape for Northwest Coast artware is therefore not global; rather, it is connected to the Northwest Coast and specifically Vancouver. This process of localizing mass-produced and even globally produced objects is one that Roth refers to as “reterritorialization.” It allows artware companies to protect their market and Indigenous people to protect their cultural property. Some Indigenous artists may broker deals with local artware manufacturers, though it is sometimes difficult to avoid connections to China where the cost of production is significantly lower. Roth successfully argues that some artists

see brokering deals internationally as a means of protecting and perpetuating Indigenous sovereignty.

Chapter Four, “Stewardship and Relationality,” covers a range of topics including differences in conceptions of ownership, fairness, and benefits to the artist. Roth considers intellectual property, contracts, and stewarding relationships between artware companies and Indigenous artists, and charts out how Indigenous perceptions of intellectual property differ from those of the Western capitalist tradition in that intellectual property and image ownership are generally considered to be collectively held and, in most cases, not to be commodified, though each community would have its own more nuanced interpretation. The impact on future generations is always a key concern. Because contract law does not currently recognize Indigenous perspectives, Roth notes, Indigenous artists who work in concert with artware companies have to balance multiple systems of stewardship along with earning and income. Among the topics she discusses is the culturally bound basis for determining what is fair and what rewards are produced during an economic transaction. Often Indigenous communities and artists must rely on the vocabulary of the Western legal system to push back against the tide of misappropriation. Roth shows how Indigenous artists negotiate these complexities of their relationships with artware companies, some working for single-time flat fees and others getting a share of the royalties. Some engage with artware companies to increase their public exposure and gain name recognition, and others find it important to have a say in all steps of the production process. No matter the form of contract, Roth emphasizes that developing a relationship of trust is key to a successful relationship between artware manufacturer and artist—sometimes more so than the financial return for all parties.

In the final chapter, “Accumulation and Redistribution,” Roth

cleverly turns around the discussion in Chapter Two about the rise of the artware business and Indigenous artists' incorporation into the capitalist system by demonstrating how the artware industry can be used to replenish and renew the connections, wealth, and social structures of the potlatch system. To Roth, potlatching is a process that is important if companies want to continue to build good relations with Indigenous artists. Culturally modified capitalism thus supports Indigenous lifeways.

Overall, Roth's book demonstrates the ideal within contemporary Indigenous arts scholarship of positioning oneself within the framework of one's own subjectivity. She also does much to protect the contributions of her research subjects from potential retaliation by artware companies, as most quotes by Indigenous artists rename anonymous. While this protective strategy fits with current human-subjects research principles, it also comes at the expense of developing more complete pictures of individual artists and the breadth of their work. The hardcover edition of the book is beautifully crafted and pleasing to hold, though with only seven black-and-white photographs, the publisher missed an important opportunity to visually document the rich array of artware that Roth so eloquently discusses within the pages of her text. *Incorporating Culture* is well-written and would make a valuable contribution to graduate-level courses on Indigenous arts of the Northwest Coast, the art economy, consumer culture, souvenir and tourism studies, and economics.

Carolyn Butler-Palmer is Associate Professor and Legacy Chair in Modern and Contemporary Arts of the Pacific Northwest in the Department of Art History and Visual Studies at the University of Victoria, in Canada.
—cbpalmer@uvic.ca

1. Robert J. Foster, "Tracking Globalization: Commodities and Value in Motion," in *Handbook of Material Culture*, ed. Mike Rowlands et al. (Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, 2006), 285–302.

Ariane Varela Braga
Une théorie universelle au milieu du XIX^e siècle. La Grammar of Ornament d'Owen Jones

Rome, Campisano Editore, 2017
278 p. 45 ill. en noir, 83 pl. en coul.
40 € (papier) ISBN 9788898229789

Leila el-Wakil

Ariane Varela Braga a livré en 2017 un ambitieux ouvrage, issu de sa thèse de doctorat soutenue en 2013 à l'Université de Neuchâtel, sous la direction du professeur Pascal Griener, qui donne, dans une contextualisation stimulante, une lecture renouvelée de la *Grammar of Ornament* (1856), l'ouvrage majeur de l'architecte et spécialiste d'arts appliqués londonien Owen Jones (1809–1874). La publication personnelle de cette chercheuse prometteuse fait suite à l'édition des actes de trois colloques: *Ornamento, tra arte e design: interpretazioni, percorsi, e mutazioni nell'Ottocento* (Bâle, 2013), *Splendor marmoris. I colori del marmo, tra Roma e l'Europa, da Paolo III a Napoleone III* (Rome, 2016), co-édité avec Grégoire Extermann, et *The Myth of the Orient. Architecture and Ornament in the Age of Orientalism*, co-édité avec Francine Giese (Berne, 2017).

L'ouvrage s'organise en six chapitres se déclinant entre une introduction et une conclusion. Une partie est consacrée aux annexes qui comportent la liste des éditions et des traductions de la *Grammar of Ornament*, la liste des principes théoriques, qui sont des axiomes quasi-indépendants des développements qui figurent dans les chapitres, une notice biographique succincte d'Owen Jones, la liste de ses œuvres écrites, éditoriales, architecturales et décoratives, la bibliographie générale et les index des noms de personnes et de lieux. Quarante-cinq figures en noir et blanc et un cahier de quatre-vingt-trois planches couleurs sur papier



glacé, rassemblés au milieu de l'ouvrage, complètent la publication.

Dans son introduction, Varela Braga replace d'abord son sujet dans le contexte du regain d'intérêt pour l'ornement qui marque l'historiographie contemporaine. Elle introduit ensuite brièvement l'architecte Owen Jones (1809–1874) et son ouvrage majeur, *Grammar of Ornament*. Après avoir fait un état de l'art très complet relatif à la *Grammar of Ornament* et à son auteur, Varela Braga relève l'importance du Grand Tour dans la vie et la carrière de Jones et particulièrement son passage en Orient. De ce voyage déterminant dans sa carrière et son œuvre, Jones ramène de quoi publier un ouvrage singulier sur l'Alhambra, *La Alhambra, Plans, Elevations, Sections, and Details of the Alhambra* (avec Jules Goury et Pasqual de Gayangos), Londres, 1836–1845, qui dénote précocement son intérêt manifeste pour l'art «mauresque» (sic). L'introduction annonce ensuite le contenu de l'ouvrage.

Le premier chapitre, «Regard global et recherche d'unité», envisage les différents éléments constitutifs de la genèse de la *Grammar of Ornament*. Varela Braga revient sur la mise en couleurs du Crystal Palace, dispositif polychrome remarqué à partir des trois couleurs primaires, inventé par Owen Jones qui devra s'en justifier dans une conférence, «On the Decoration Proposed for the Exhibition Building in Hyde Park» (RIBA, 16 déc. 1850). La reconstruction du Crystal Palace à Sydenham, pour en faire un