

Urban History Review Revue d'histoire urbaine

URBAN HISTORY REVIEW
REVUE D'HISTOIRE URBAINE

Artibise, Alan F. J. *Winnipeg: An Illustrated History*. Toronto: James Lorimer and Company and the National Museum of Man, 1977. Volume One, *History of Canadian Cities Series*. Pp. 224. Illustrations, maps, notes, bibliography. \$8.95 soft cover; \$12.95 hard cover

H. J. Selwood

Number 3-77, February 1978

URI: <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1019515ar>

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.7202/1019515ar>

[See table of contents](#)

Publisher(s)

Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine

ISSN

0703-0428 (print)

1918-5138 (digital)

[Explore this journal](#)

Cite this review

Selwood, H. J. (1978). Review of [Artibise, Alan F. J. *Winnipeg: An Illustrated History*. Toronto: James Lorimer and Company and the National Museum of Man, 1977. Volume One, *History of Canadian Cities Series*. Pp. 224. Illustrations, maps, notes, bibliography. \$8.95 soft cover; \$12.95 hard cover]. *Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine*, (3-77), 122–126.
<https://doi.org/10.7202/1019515ar>

All Rights Reserved © Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine, 1978

This document is protected by copyright law. Use of the services of Érudit (including reproduction) is subject to its terms and conditions, which can be viewed online.

<https://apropos.erudit.org/en/users/policy-on-use/>

Érudit

This article is disseminated and preserved by Érudit.

Érudit is a non-profit inter-university consortium of the Université de Montréal, Université Laval, and the Université du Québec à Montréal. Its mission is to promote and disseminate research.

<https://www.erudit.org/en/>

moyenne importance sont laissés dans l'ombre. Si, pris individuellement, chacun de ceux-ci peut paraître sans intérêt à côté d'un McGill ou d'un Molson, il n'est pas dit que, comme groupe, ils ne représentent pas une force économique importante, surtout à cette époque.

En somme, Tulchinsky a sans doute bien réalisé son objectif mais cet objectif même était trop restreint. En choisissant de s'en tenir à certains secteurs d'activité et à une couche de la bourgeoisie, l'auteur imposait, au départ, d'étroites limites à son travail. The River Barons n'est donc qu'une première étape. Il reste encore beaucoup de recherches à faire pour connaître l'ensemble de la structure économique de Montréal à cette époque. Tulchinsky a tout de même le grand mérite d'avoir ouvert la voie et posé les premiers jalons en rédigeant cet ouvrage important.

Paul-André Linteau
Département d'histoire
Université du Québec à Montréal

* * *

Artibise, Alan F. J. Winnipeg: An Illustrated History. Toronto: James Lorimer and Company and the National Museum of Man, 1977. Volume One, History of Canadian Cities Series. Pp. 224. Illustrations, maps, notes, bibliography. \$8.95 soft cover; \$12.95 hard cover.

No mere pretty picture album for decorative coffee table display is Artibise's latest book on Winnipeg, but a work of substance and scholarship offering a provocative interpretation of the city's history. It launches the proposed History of Canadian Cities Series to be produced for the National Museum of Man; a project designed to meet growing public demand for publications of widespread popular appeal. The intent of the series is also to provide a set of studies that will eventually permit a comprehensive, comparative history of Canada's urban centres to be produced. These two objectives establish the framework for the book.

Well over a hundred magnificent photographs by themselves meet the book's first objective. They demand attention and anyone picking up the book is bound to be captivated. The illustrations have

been selected mainly from the Manitoba Archives' general collection and from a special collection of L. B. Foote's photography recently purchased for the Archives. Foote was a well-known commercial photographer in Winnipeg for many years and his sensitive reproductions of local scenes and personalities illustrate very powerfully the spirit of the period in which he worked. Many of the pictures have not previously been widely circulated and this makes the book attractive to the casual browser. However, the selection of photographs is designed to do more than just titillate this audience. Artibise, except for his less than representative portrayal of Winnipeg's harsh winters, dynamically succeeds in illustrating all of the themes developed in his text. Thus even the dilettante is exposed to the book's main topics and points of view. The chances are that most people who pick it up will be encouraged to look at the text. Furthermore, the photographs and several very useful maps are appropriately located in relation to the written material so that the serious reader will find that each effectively complements the other.

To write a comprehensive history is no mean task, especially when the work is to be addressed to a very wide audience with divergent expectations. Artibise's approach is to produce an urban biography - an "attempt to see the community as a whole and to relate the parts to a larger context." (Foreword, p. 7). The material is organized in essentially chronological sequence but each major period is discussed in terms of standard, unifying themes. The four major periods are: Winnipeg's origins and its incorporation as a city, its formative and boom years, the crisis and decline of war-time and depression, and the transformation and challenge of recent decades. Within each period Artibise examines aspects of economic growth and development, population growth and ethnic relations, the evolution of the urban landscape, and Winnipeg's political, social and cultural life. Such highlights of Winnipeg's history as the schools question, general strike and the 1950 flood are covered in some detail. However, the main theme running throughout the book is Artibise's argument that Winnipeg's economic fortunes and the nature of its community can be interpreted through the attitudes and activities of its charter group or ruling elite.

While conceding that other factors were at times of significance, Artibise claims that it was their commitment to growth that caused Winnipeg to outstrip other prairie centres prior to the first world war and their earlier excesses and later conservatism that led to stagnation and decline in subsequent years. The initiatives shown by Winnipeg's elite in bridging the Red River and securing Winnipeg as a railway centre are unquestionable, and certainly support Artibise's observation that they did not hesitate to use public funds to encourage growth. Railways generated massive inflows of population and capital giving Winnipeg a decided advantage over other communities. So long as Winnipeg's charter group was able to maintain the advantage their boosterism was effective. Immigrants and capital inflow continued. However, to suggest that reversals occurred largely due to the ugliness of the general strike and the elites' resting on their laurels is to carry the argument too far. The other factors briefly mentioned by Artibise - Winnipeg's disproportionate Provincial tax burden, the consolidation of western settlement and growing competition from other prairie cities, and the rise of truly national firms - are almost certainly of greater importance than implied. Indeed, one can argue that Winnipeg's economy did remarkably well under the circumstances. For example, manufacturing employment in the city rose by 12,425 between 1921 and 1941, significantly more than the 8,251 increase of the previous two decades of much higher rates of population growth. These figures are rather misleading, but so are those selected by Artibise. Winnipeg has lost the dominance it once enjoyed, but the decline has been relative as the capitalist and his capital and the labourer and his labour have migrated to centres offering better return on investment.

Comments in a similar vein are germane to Artibise's interpretation of social conditions in the city. Both the eastern European immigrant and W.A.S.P. capitalist originally came to Winnipeg with the intention of improving their lot. Exploitation of the poor by the rich through ignorance, selfishness and fear was widespread it is true. However, to dismiss any charitable gestures by the middle and upper classes as mere 'diversions' (p. 54) is almost certainly to distort

the actual situation. The charter group did see it to be in their own interest to demand compulsory education in English, but then, as now, education was perceived as a pre-requisite by both the establishment and the rural-urban migrant to a better, more productive life. The eastern European migrant was ghettoized in Winnipeg's north end. Nevertheless, as Artibise admits, this was to a large extent a voluntary movement. Cheap land was available elsewhere in the city and its suburbs.

Sanitary conditions were appalling in the north end, but major sewer and water works were extended into the area at the turn of the century concurrently with service first being provided to other parts of the city. The area was not, therefore, ignored by the ruling elite. Poverty was a factor, but the incoming peasants' ignorance of even the more rudimentary necessities of urban living was also a major hurdle.

Winnipeg's role around the turn of the twentieth century was equivalent to that of the British city a century or so earlier and of the developing world's cities today. It probably handled the difficult task of transforming society from medieval peasantry into an educated urban citizenry little worse than elsewhere. Perhaps the human cost to the immigrant would have been less had Winnipeg grown more slowly, but at what cost to the peasant forced to remain in Europe? A very great many of the early immigrants have lived to see their offspring enjoy a level of living that must surpass even their most fanciful dreams.

In dealing at length with the class struggles, Artibise devotes less space to Winnipeg's physical growth and relationships between the city and its suburbs than he might have done. Suburban growth is treated lightly unless it involves extension of the city's boundaries. This leads to some confusion and to a distortion of statistics. Even in 1901 Winnipeg's suburban communities amounted to more than ten per cent of the city's population. Their increasing population, employment centres and political power could have been given more consideration. Whereas the Winnipeg Electric Company's political activities are treated in some detail, the intriguing story of their operations in the suburbs is barely mentioned. Neither is much attention given to the suburban land development industry.

On the other hand, bibliographic material on Winnipeg is very comprehensive and most usefully annotated. Using it, the reader can pursue many avenues which must necessarily have received cursory treatment in Artibise's text.

However, one shortcoming is the lack of reference to comparative studies. Artibise treats Winnipeg as a rather isolated entity, attributing to the city a uniqueness that is unfounded. This is perhaps to be expected in the first book of a series and it certainly reinforces the need for a systematic, comprehensive and comparative study of Canadian urban history.

Artibise's book is likely to be received with mixed reaction. Professional scholars will be frustrated to find little material in the work that has not already been published. On the other hand, it very effectively draws together what has been produced. It offers a fresh interpretation of many events in Winnipeg's past, yet the account is often overly simplistic. It will undoubtedly generate lively debate. The comprehensive referencing and annotated bibliography will be well received and the excellent selection of photographs applauded.

The lay reader will undoubtedly find the illustrations appealing and will probably sympathize with the points of view so fluently expressed in the text. The large amount of detail might, however, be intimidating. Nevertheless, the book meets its immediate objective and could well stimulate the casual reader into taking an even greater interest in history and its impact on the contemporary scene. The other principal objective is timely. As the first of a series of comparative urban histories, the Winnipeg study is a necessary step towards the development of greater understanding of the general processes that have created urban Canada. Artibise and the National Museum are to be congratulated for this. Other books in the series are awaited with eager anticipation.

H. J. Selwood
Department of Geography
University of Winnipeg