

Papayanis, Nicholas. *The Coachmen of Nineteenth-Century Paris: Service Workers and Class Consciousness*. Baton Rouge and London: Louisiana State University Press, 1993. Pp. xvi, 247. Illustrations, bibliography, index

Elinor A. Accampo

Volume 25, Number 1, October 1996

URI: <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1016102ar>

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.7202/1016102ar>

[See table of contents](#)

Publisher(s)

Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine

ISSN

0703-0428 (print)

1918-5138 (digital)

[Explore this journal](#)

Cite this review

Accampo, E. A. (1996). Review of [Papayanis, Nicholas. *The Coachmen of Nineteenth-Century Paris: Service Workers and Class Consciousness*. Baton Rouge and London: Louisiana State University Press, 1993. Pp. xvi, 247. Illustrations, bibliography, index]. *Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine*, 25(1), 64–65. <https://doi.org/10.7202/1016102ar>

consolidation of women's position as home regulators "gave rise to several new occupations for middle-class women, including interior decoration and architecture, but it also represented the association — seldom explicated at the time but widely understood — that control over domestic space represented a form of feminism." (p.145)

Adams points out, however, that women who were educated in the proper functioning of a home could now be blamed for their own and their families' poor health; the consequences of lax attention or defective judgement became evident where there was improper implementation of sanitary controls. Medical advisors, unable to control or completely understand the 'enigma' and perils of pregnancy and childbirth, held pregnant women particularly responsible to provide a space for their confinement that isolated their potentially polluting bodies from the rest of their families.

Although the author's stated interest for this project was on the literature of health and sanitary reform, it is always a problem for social historians to determine how much of an effect prescriptive literature had on the everyday lives of ordinary people. While Adams has acknowledged that she turned to non-traditional sources, especially for architectural history, the lack of more personal materials, if indeed such exist, makes it difficult for us to know for instance, how closely middle-class women followed the ideal sick room arrangements, or if they really did inspect their homes in the ways that were suggested. Did women really employ hydrochloric acid and copper foil to detect arsenic in wallpaper? Nevertheless, the developments Adams traces between women's growing involvement in interior decoration, feminist political activism, and housing developments for single women suggest that, if only for a brief time, some women were finding creative uses for 'expert' advice.

While many historians have concentrated on middle-class interest in the health of the working class, much less consideration has been given to the improvements thought necessary to correct the health of the middle class itself. Adams' use of the urban middle-class home and the links she finds there among houses, women, and the medical community draw our attention to a part of material culture that has been neglected by both women's and medicine's historians. She has effectively contributed to an expanding body of work that challenges the pervasive ideology of domestic space as private space, and her work also stands as an fine example of what can be accomplished when historians expand their horizons beyond circumscribed boundaries.

Jayne Elliott
Department of History
Carleton University

Papayanis, Nicholas. *The Coachmen of Nineteenth-Century Paris: Service Workers and Class Consciousness*. Baton Rouge and London: Louisiana State University Press, 1993. Pp. xvi, 247. Illustrations, bibliography, index.

The point of departure for this study is the observation that Parisian coachmen managed to stage crippling strikes at every Paris exposition of the nineteenth century, inconveniencing Frenchmen and foreigners just when the capital was trying to put on its best face. The strikes thus brought into confrontation not just workers and employers, but low-paid laborers with the well-to-do. In telling the story of Parisian coachmen, Papayanis hopes to fill a gap in literature on the working class, male service workers have been ignored. What captures his imagination about Parisian coachmen is that they were not "traditional" members of the working class, in part because they had varying relationships to the means of production: some owned their own cabs, others belonged to coachmen's cooperatives, and many worked for cab firms whose size ranged broadly. Thus the structure of the industry and the ethic that prevailed within it provided for a good deal of autonomy, and held out the hope of cab ownership for all coachmen, undermining the development of a class consciousness based on wage labor.

In order to portray the lives and mentality of coachmen, this book examines the structure of the cab industry and the multifarious rules governing it, offers a statistical profile of the social and family status of cabbies, analyzes the formation of unions and the development of class consciousness, and compares the strikes of 1878 and 1889 to examine the evolution of a "revolutionary ideology" among coachmen. The period covered extends from the middle of the nineteenth century to 1907, a watershed year in the history of urban transportation with the introduction of the automobile.

Coachmen were predominantly migrants from rural areas who chose their occupational path because they believed it would lead to upward mobility. Although many drove cabs seasonally, coachmen exhibited an "intense desire" for social integration into Parisian life and constituted a social group "poised at the edge of the next higher class in the social hierarchy" (p. 67). But in the second half of the nineteenth century cab ownership became more difficult as larger cab firms gained more control over the industry at the expense of single-cab owners and hired coachmen. But by 1889, coachmen had abandoned a corporate mentality and adopted a rhetoric like that of other Parisian workers. Rather than insisting on a share of daily cab receipts, they demanded a fixed salary for a determined number of hours of work and no longer expressed common values and interests with small or large owners.

Papayanis argues that the transformation from corporate to working-class mentality resulted from increased surveillance by the police and employers, and from the continued concentration of ownership in one segment of the cab trade, intensified by the severe economic crisis of the 1880s. The economic cri-

sis also produced a revolutionary syndicalist movement in Paris, which created a new rhetorical framework and source of identity for coachmen. But despite the emergence of a collective consciousness that extended to workers outside their occupation, coachmen remained relatively powerless as a labor force and their strikes failed because the presence of coachmen-owners weakened the ideological and tactical force of the union, splitting the ranks on issues such as pay structure and the introduction of cab meters.

While the uniqueness of this group as workers and as members of the service sector makes them very interesting, it also makes generalizing from this case study and appreciating its broader significance for working class history more difficult. The study of public transportation—a quintessentially urban phenomenon—highlights the fact that if social class is a relationship, in the service sector it extends well beyond that of worker-employer. This occupation brought coachmen under routine surveillance by the police, and also brought them into daily contact with those in higher social classes. What impact did these relationships have on the formation of class consciousness. Papayanis notes that “traditional” workers looked down on those in the service sector for their putatively servile relationships with employers and clients. But what of the coachmen’s self-identity, especially if he viewed his occupation as a path out of the working class? This question relates to another issue Papayanis raises but might have pushed further: the huge gap between the popular image of coachmen as “sluggards, drunkards, country bumpkins and unreliable nomads” (p.45) who were both rude and dangerous, and the “reality” portrayed in company evaluations of coachmen as stable, responsible, and no less sober than any other group of workers. How did this popular mythology emerge and what function did it play in class identities and class relations? These questions are among the many fascinating issues this book raises that should inspire other scholars in research on service sector workers.

Elinor A. Accampo
Department of History
University of Southern California

Engel, Barbara Alpern. *Between the Fields and the City: Women, Work, and Family in Russia, 1861–1914*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994. Pp. xi, 254. Illustrations, tables, maps, index. \$59.95 (U.S.).

Si la nature même de l’émancipation des serfs en 1861 intensifie grandement le besoin des paysans pour de l’argent comptant, la révolution industrielle, pour sa part, lente d’abord, puis accélérée à partir des années 1890, réduit (la machine étant plus productive que l’être humain) les possibilités de gagner ce numéraire à la campagne, affligée par surcroît d’une très forte croissance démographique. Dans ce contexte difficile de pauvreté quasi généralisée, le travail à la ville représente une alter-

native valable, tant pour les hommes que pour les femmes. Davantage une série d’essais qu’une monographie analytique, ce livre traite de la nature et des conséquences de la migration (en provenance des provinces de Tver, Iaroslavl, Kostroma, Moscou, Vladimir et Nizhnii Novgorod) de milliers de femmes paysannes — veuves, célibataires, mariées — vers les villes, quelles soient de petite, de moyenne ou de grande taille.

En quoi l’existence de ceux et celles qui empruntent ce chemin, menant du village à la ville, est-elle transformée? A l’aide de nombreuses données statistiques, Engel dépeint une dynamique sociale fort complexe: un relâchement des liens familiaux, particulièrement apprécié des femmes que le traditionnel système patriarcal pénalise et, en certains cas, opprime; un réaménagement des relations d’autorité à l’intérieur de la maisonnée paysanne; un élargissement des horizons culturels des femmes, de même qu’un meilleur contrôle de leur sexualité et, finalement, l’émergence d’un nouvel ordre familial, fruit de la rencontre entre la culture paysanne de ces hommes et de ces femmes et les conditions matérielles prévalant dans les villes — Moscou et Saint-Pétersbourg, par exemple. Si donc la ville offre à la paysanne russe un certain nombre d’avantages — liberté, indépendance, anonymat et emploi (travail à l’usine ou comme domestique, lequel impose cependant, à des degrés divers, à la fois exploitation et dégradation) — elle recèle aussi d’indéniables dangers: illégitimité et prostitution. En outre, la ville ne change pas fondamentalement le statut de la femme: même dans un nouvel environnement, celle-ci est encore perçue par l’homme comme une menace potentielle à la stabilité de la société et, donc, sujette au contrôle de l’homme. Sans surprise, l’auteure conclut au caractère ambigu, contradictoire même de l’expérience de la ville: “Even as the city attracted some women away from the village, the limited opportunities for women and the hardships of urban life left other women longing for home and the shelter of a village roof” (p. 242). Nostalgie du village qu’explique en partie le fait que la femme paysanne, indispensable au bon fonctionnement de l’économie rurale, acquiert un nouveau statut et davantage de pouvoirs lorsque le mari est absent, parti à la ville en quête de travail.

Utilisant abondamment et judicieusement sources primaires (pétitions et requêtes en demande de divorce, par exemple) et secondaires — rendues disponibles depuis la glasnost’ de Gorbatchév et l’effondrement de l’Union Soviétique en 1991 — Engel décrit avec une grande sensibilité les sentiments et les aspirations de ces femmes aux destins multiples. Elle adopte en outre une méthodologie qui fait place à des parallèles avec la situation des femmes aux Etats-Unis et dans certains pays européens (particulièrement la France et l’Angleterre). Pour toutes ces raisons, ce livre intéressera les historiens des femmes, du travail, du loisir, du milieu urbain et de la famille.

D’une lecture à la fois facile et agréable, *Between the Fields and the City* apporte une autre dimension à l’histoire sociale d’une Russie impériale en pleine mutation, à la suite de l’aboli-