

Urban History Review Revue d'histoire urbaine

URBAN HISTORY REVIEW
REVUE D'HISTOIRE URBAINE

Van Slyck, Abigail. *Free To All: Carnegie Libraries and American Culture, 1880–1920*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1995. Pp. xxvii, 276. 121 black and white illustrations, graphs, bibliography, index \$29.95 (U.S.)

Christine Pawley

Volume 25, Number 2, March 1997

URI: <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1016078ar>

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.7202/1016078ar>

[See table of contents](#)

Publisher(s)

Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine

ISSN

0703-0428 (print)

1918-5138 (digital)

[Explore this journal](#)

Cite this review

Pawley, C. (1997). Review of [Van Slyck, Abigail. *Free To All: Carnegie Libraries and American Culture, 1880–1920*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1995. Pp. xxvii, 276. 121 black and white illustrations, graphs, bibliography, index \$29.95 (U.S.)]. *Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine*, 25(2), 69–70. <https://doi.org/10.7202/1016078ar>

als, but others, discontented over the dearth of black priests and nuns, left the Church. At the same time, Catholics of all ethnic backgrounds sought parishes whose practices suited their personalities and requirements; few young people were attracted to religious orders. By the 1990s many urban parishes were simply shut down.

On a positive note, McGreevy points out that by the mid 1980s there were ten African-American bishops, and in 1990, almost 10 per cent of Afro-Americans were Catholic (although this 10 per cent might equally be interpreted as an indication of the Church's failure to reach out to Afro-Americans.) McGreevy applauds present-day Catholicism for fostering a sense of community and for its receptivity to newcomers from around the world, but he cannot deny that, in the final analysis, caring for the white majority in the parish made Catholics, like members of other religious denominations, unable and unwilling to extend their concern to Afro-Americans whose immigrant experience so closely mirrored their own encounters with the dominant culture a generation earlier.

McGreevy should be commended for his energy in tackling this complicated and sensitive aspect of urban history. Far more than an examination of the interaction of Catholicism and racism, the book charts the rocky course of a two thousand year old institution, its personnel and its members trying to come to terms with the modern world. In his quest to validate Catholicism's part in shaping historical consciousness, McGreevy may have glossed over the nuances of gender (women religious seem badly neglected) and the relationship between class and religion in forming racial attitudes, but overall this is a very significant contribution to urban history that Canadian historians would do well to consider.

Rosemary R. Gagan
Faculty of Education
Simon Fraser University

Van Slyck, Abigail. *Free To All: Carnegie Libraries and American Culture, 1880-1920*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1995. Pp. xxvii, 276. 121 black and white illustrations, graphs, bibliography, index \$29.95 (U.S.).

Between 1886 and 1917, by donating funds to build public libraries in large cities and small towns across the United States, Andrew Carnegie followed existing trends towards free public library establishment and philanthropic support of cultural institutions. However, according to Abigail Van Slyck, Carnegie's emphasis on efficiency and corporate practices helped transform both the design and use of public libraries and the exercise of philanthropy in general.

Van Slyck's approach to studying Carnegie libraries places architectural processes firmly in their social context, stressing that Carnegie buildings as material culture should be under-

stood as components of a "larger cultural landscape" that includes both physical surroundings and interior furnishings. Time frames, she argues, must be expanded to include the impact of buildings on their users long after completion of construction. Participants should include not only architects and their wealthy patron, but bureaucrats of the Carnegie Corporation, city councillors in recipient communities, librarians who worked at the charging desks, and the men, women and children who crossed library thresholds to borrow books.

To incorporate these various perspectives, Van Slyck divides her study into six chapters, each focusing on a different set of participants. In the first two chapters, she discusses the role of Carnegie himself, his influence on the practice of philanthropy, and the interplay between design, construction, professional and market factors. In chapters three and four, she examines the local responses to Carnegie's proposals, showing how in large cities, class and nativism influenced the style and use of library buildings, while in small towns, gender perspectives and boosterism often clashed over the definition of the library's place in the community. In her final two chapters, Van Slyck turns to those principally affected by Carnegie's benevolence: the librarians and citizens—mainly children—who used the facilities. Van Slyck analyzes thirteen libraries as case studies, drawing on original designs, records of the Carnegie organization and recipient communities, correspondence among the various participants, and contemporary newspaper and periodical articles.

Such a multi-perspective study requires the researcher to draw on a variety of disciplines. Van Slyck's social and cultural analysis of the libraries' construction and design is thoroughly convincing. In the negotiations between the Carnegie organization and local elected officials, architects and leaders of the emerging library profession, she elucidates the often conflicting social agendas of the major players, and shows how the process of accepting a Carnegie donation stimulated an ongoing debate about the role of "culture" in early twentieth century America. In her discussion of the experiences of the librarians who worked in Carnegie libraries, she makes perceptive use of library literature of the day, in addition to diaries and correspondence of the (mainly female) librarians themselves.

However, her analysis of users' experience is restricted by an apparent lack of primary sources and secondary literature. It is no fault of Van Slyck's that, despite the existence in public library archives of primary materials, including accessions and circulation records, historians of the book and reading have so singularly neglected the public library as a source of data about historical reading experiences. Lacking appropriate material, Van Slyck is forced to rely mainly on three sets of published reminiscences, all by educated and relatively affluent adult women. Despite this shortcoming, Van Slyck makes a notable achievement in highlighting the turn-of-the-century contest over the production of cultural meaning that brought into play factors of race, class, gender and ethnicity, and in showing how the Carnegie library phenomenon was such a wide-reaching cul-

tural development, that during the course of the twentieth century, Carnegie libraries became a natural and almost invisible part of the social and physical landscape.

Christine Pawley
Department of Information Management
College of St. Catherine
St. Paul, Minnesota

Joseph, Gilbert M. and Mark D. Szuchman, eds. *I Saw the City Invincible: Urban Portraits of Latin America*. Wilmington, Delaware: Scholarly Resources, 1996. pp. xiii, 213. Preface, acknowledgements, suggested readings. \$45.00 (cloth).

Lutz, Christopher H. *Santiago de Guatemala, 1541–1773: City, Caste, and the Colonial Experience*. Norman, Oklahoma: University of Oklahoma Press, 1994. Pp. xv, 346. Preface, illustrations, maps, appendixes, glossary, bibliography, index.

Latin America's history, culture and society is delineated by its urban centres. Both during pre-Colombian times and after European colonization, cities and towns in Latin America have served as benchmarks in the historical development of the region. The great empires of the Inca and Aztecs radiated out of highly developed urban centres and the European conquerors dotted their empire with recreations of the towns and cities they grew up in. Despite the importance of cities in the history of the region, much of the existing literature on the urban centres of Latin America tends to be antiquarian in nature and has not kept up with recent trends in historical writing. For this reason, *I Saw the City Invincible* and *Santiago de Guatemala* offer something new to students of Latin American history and society.

The editors of *I Saw the City Invincible* present a chronological survey of the city in Latin America. Mark Szuchman introduces the book with a chapter outlining the history of the city in Latin America. He argues that the vision of the city, both to its inhabitants and to historians, has changed over the last five hundred years. The chapters in the book reflect the changes by offering views of the Latin American city from a variety of angles. The study focuses on Latin America's largest cities and attempts to provide different perspectives on everyday life in these centres. From colonial accounts to modern descriptions of cities past and present, the collection makes a valuable contribution to the field of urban history in Latin America.

Santiago de Guatemala is a monograph on the demographic and social history of the most important urban centre in colonial Central America. The city was founded by Spanish conquerors who settled in the heart of indigenous Guatemala. Christopher H. Lutz traces the evolution of Santiago as a multiethnic community where Africans, Indigenous peoples and Europeans intermingled. The author uses parish and tributary records to examine marriage patterns in order to demonstrate the growth

of the ladinos as an intermediate group that came to dominate Guatemalan society. The author's preoccupation is with the course of events that led to the rise of ladino society.

Lutz sees in *Santiago de Guatemala* a history of the entire region. For the author the trajectory is clear, like the other important urban centres of Central America, the development of the city was a threat to indigenous society. Unlike other centres, Santiago de Guatemala's transformation was "delayed and probably averted" by natural disaster. The author concludes that indigenous Guatemala was therefore preserved because colonial officials moved their capital to the site of present day Guatemala City.

Both books illustrate the importance of urban centres in the history, culture and society of Latin America. *Santiago de Guatemala* and *I Saw the City Invincible* are well worth the purchase price and are suitable for classroom use. *Santiago de Guatemala* can be used at the undergraduate level, while *I Saw the City Invincible* is more suited to advanced seminars where students have some appreciation for Latin American history and society.

R. Harpelle
Department of History
Lakehead University

Garc-a, Mar-a Cristina. *Havana USA: Cuban Exiles and Cuban Americans in South Florida, 1959-1994*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1996. Pages ix, 279, preface, bibliography, index.

Havana USA is the best study to date of the Cuban exile community in the United States. Mar-a Cristina Garc-a offers an analysis which does not focus on the anti-Castroism that makes much of the existing literature on the subject so tedious. Garc-a does not seek to merely criticize the Cuban Revolution and Fidel Castro, nor does she write as though more than three decades of residence in the United States have not had an effect on the aspirations and orientation of Cuban exile community in South Florida. On the contrary, the author provides a clear overview of Cuban immigration to the United States since 1959 and a discussion of the impact of exile on those who now live in Florida.

The book is divided into two parts which can be defined as cause and effect. The first section is on immigration and is an examination of the different waves of Cuban exiles. The author discusses the conditions of Cuban immigration to the United States since 1959. Garc-a argues that the people who arrived in the United States from Cuba between 1959 and 1973 were political and not economic exiles. They were, therefore, distinct from those who arrived in during the Mariel Boatlift of 1980 when Fidel Castro allowed almost 125,000 people to leave Cuba and