

## Canadian University Music Review Revue de musique des universités canadiennes

Clifford Ford. *Canada's Music: An Historical Survey*.  
Agincourt, Ontario: GLC Publishers Limited, 1982, viii, 278 pp.  
Ian L. Bradley. *Twentieth Century Canadian Composers, Vol. II*.  
Agincourt, Ontario: GLC Publishers Limited, 1982, xii, 281 pp.

Elaine Keillor

---

Numéro 3, 1982

URI : <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1013835ar>

DOI : <https://doi.org/10.7202/1013835ar>

[Aller au sommaire du numéro](#)

---

Éditeur(s)

Canadian University Music Society / Société de musique des universités  
canadiennes

ISSN

0710-0353 (imprimé)

2291-2436 (numérique)

[Découvrir la revue](#)

---

Citer ce compte rendu

Keillor, E. (1982). Compte rendu de [Clifford Ford. *Canada's Music: An Historical Survey*. Agincourt, Ontario: GLC Publishers Limited, 1982, viii, 278 pp. / Ian L. Bradley. *Twentieth Century Canadian Composers, Vol. II*. Agincourt, Ontario: GLC Publishers Limited, 1982, xii, 281 pp.] *Canadian University Music Review / Revue de musique des universités canadiennes*, (3), 211–216.  
<https://doi.org/10.7202/1013835ar>

---

All Rights Reserved © Canadian University Music Society / Société de musique  
des universités canadiennes, 1982

Ce document est protégé par la loi sur le droit d'auteur. L'utilisation des  
services d'Érudit (y compris la reproduction) est assujettie à sa politique  
d'utilisation que vous pouvez consulter en ligne.

<https://apropos.erudit.org/fr/usagers/politique-dutilisation/>

---

**é**rudit

Cet article est diffusé et préservé par Érudit.

Érudit est un consortium interuniversitaire sans but lucratif composé de  
l'Université de Montréal, l'Université Laval et l'Université du Québec à  
Montréal. Il a pour mission la promotion et la valorisation de la recherche.

<https://www.erudit.org/fr/>

story is by no means ended. We anxiously await the French edition and look forward to the continuing work on all facets of Canadian musical life.

Gaynor Jones

CLIFFORD FORD. *Canada's Music: An Historical Survey*. Agincourt, Ontario: GLC Publishers Limited, 1982, viii, 278 pp.

IAN L. BRADLEY. *Twentieth Century Canadian Composers*, Vol. II. Agincourt, Ontario: GLC Publishers Limited, 1982, xii, 281 pp.

For those of us who have been struggling to teach courses on Canadian music without adequate resources, we can at last say that the situation has drastically changed. The *Encyclopedia of Music in Canada* has been quickly followed by two notable publications from GLC Publishers.

Clifford Ford's book is the first overview of the development of Canadian music from its origins to the present day. Ford has chosen, and cogently argues for, the kind of sociological approach adopted by Helmut Kallmann in *A History of Music in Canada, 1534-1914* (1960). As a complement to Kallmann's now out-of-print study, Ford devotes half his coverage to the post-World War I years, a period of decisive change that saw the gradual disappearance of colonial thinking in Canadian culture, particularly music, as Canada gained the status of fully independent nationhood. Ford pulls together several threads in his treatment of changing Canadian musical institutions, the impact of the emerging broadcasting and recording industries, the organization of instrumental ensembles, the beginnings of state support for the arts, as he explores their accumulative effects on music education, music publishing, instrument making, performance, and composition.

Ford's analyses of the sociological data are generally sound, despite the occasional tendency to lapse into generalizations and distortions of historical fact. For instance, the general competitive music festival began in Edmonton in 1908, not 1906 (as stated on pp. 12 & 86) when only preliminary plans were formulated. Rousseau's opera, *Le Devin du village*, was not "unfinished," as it had had numerous performances in Europe before its Quebec performance in May 1846. Napoléon Aubin, in writing out the parts, might have added some instrumentation to airs that originally had only continuo accompaniment. Ford seems to be somewhat confused about the existing organs at the Sharon Museum, which presently owns only one barrel organ (not more, as indicated on p. 232), and one keyboard pipe organ (1848). The extant barrel organ (ca. 1820) had two barrels containing ten sacred

tunes each. The other barrel organ, with three barrels of sacred and secular tunes, is not known to have survived. With regard to the manufacturing company of Fox in Kingston, it should be noted that there were a number of companies active between the death of J.C. Fox in 1868 and the founding of Weber & Co. in 1871; thus it is slightly inaccurate to state simply that "the John Fox company changed management and name to Weber & Co." (p. 59).

Perhaps Ford followed Kallmann's example in referring to Alexis Contant's *Caïn* as the first Canadian oratorio; the entry "Oratorio, Canadian" in the *Encyclopedia of Music in Canada* lists at least three oratorios that preceded it. The information on the three early Anglo-Canadian composers who achieved international recognition is somewhat garbled. Gena Branscombe never lived in Toronto, and W.O. Forsyth was born in 1859 (not 1863) near Aurora. The Metropolitan School of Music of which he was head was absorbed by the Canadian Academy of Music (formerly Columbian Conservatory of Music) in 1912. Clarence Lucas was born in Smithville, near Hamilton, and taught at the Toronto College of Music from 1888, not 1889, as stated by Ford (p. 68).

There are inaccuracies as well about the orchestras of the early twentieth century in Toronto. The name Toronto Permanent Orchestra was used by Frederick Torrington for an organization that seems to have been active only in 1900. In 1906, Frank Welsman formed the Toronto Conservatory Symphony Orchestra, which became the Toronto Symphony Orchestra in 1908, remaining active until 1918.

The Ottawa Choral Society was not founded by Edgar Birch but grew out of the Schubert Club, founded by F.M.S. Jenkins in 1894. Birch took it over in 1895 and reorganized it the following year as the Ottawa Choral Society. In Winnipeg, the Women's Musical Club began as early as 1894, although its constitution was not adopted until 1899. Hugh Ross founded the Winnipeg Orchestral Club (not Symphony Orchestra) and the Winnipeg Philharmonic Choir (not Society); his successor for both choirs was Douglas Clarke (1927-29), followed by Peter Temple.

The discussion of composers and musical compositions is on the whole competently done, with a judicious use of short musical examples. One rather important omission might be noted, however. In the discussion of Rodolphe Mathieu, it is surprising that no mention is made of the *Trois Préludes* (1912-15) — originally for piano and later orchestrated — considering that the use of atonality in the third *Prélude* predates the composer's period of study in Europe.

Considering Canada's rich heritage of folk song, it is gratifying that Ford has included some discussion of this extensive body of music. There are, however, a few major references missing. For further exploration of French-Canadian folk songs, the reader should be directed to the magnificent work of Conrad Laforte, in particular the

six-volume *Catalogue de la chanson folklorique française* (Québec: Archives de folkore, 1977- ). In the area of Anglo-Canadian folk song, Gerald Doyle has continued to publish pamphlets of Newfoundland folk songs (1967 and 1978). Research west of Ontario is proceeding apace, and an important publication from British Columbia is Philip J. Thomas's *Songs of the Pacific Northwest* (1979). The most disturbing aspect of the commentary on Indian music is Ford's use of the term "nonsense syllables" rather than the term "vocables," preferred by ethnomusicologists. It is now known that these vocables, in most if not all cases, do in fact have meaning, not only for Pacific tribes, but for various Eastern and Central ones as well. Alexander Cringan's research on Seneca songs (mentioned on p. 141) was printed in the form of appendices to the *Report of the Minister of Education of Ontario* (not the *Ontario Archeological Report*) in 1898, 1899, 1902, and 1905). It is surprising that only passing mention is made of Inuit music, considering that much more research has been done in this area than on Indian music. It should be noted that the most important work by Franz Boas is omitted from the listing of his works (p. 141). Boas's *The Central Eskimo* (1888) includes several pages of musical transcriptions. Reference might also have been made to the publication by Helen Roberts and Diamond Jenness, *Songs of the Copper Eskimos* (1925), to which composers as diverse as John Weinzweig and Udo Kasemets have turned. Finally, it might be noted that Laura Boulton (not Bolten, p. 142) is an important collector of Inuit material.

It is unfortunate that Ford was not able to see the *Encyclopedia of Music in Canada* before the publication of his manuscript or to check his information with their files in the late stages of his work. If he had done so, he probably would have referred to the recently compiled material on music-making in New France. Recently discovered manuscripts, such as *Le Livre d'orgue de Montréal*, and collections of motets by Campra, Du Mont, Jacquet de la Guerre, Marchand, and others, as well as inventories of libraries of well-to-do residents have provided evidence for much more musical activity than was originally thought to have taken place. Moreover, the *Encyclopedia's* files would have clarified a number of dates; for example: the Vogt Society, 1936-45 (p. 12); William Waugh Lauder, born 24 October 1858 - died after 1911 (p. 93); Harry Marshall Field, born 14 December 1862 - died 1945? (p. 93); Allard de Ridder, died in 1966 (p. 127); the Dubois Quartet was active until Dubois's death in 1938 (p. 129); farewell concerts of the Hart House Quartet were given in 1946 (p. 129); the first exclusively musical periodical was the *Canadian Musical Review* (Toronto 1856); *The Musical Journal* continued at least until 1890 (p. 178); in 1980 Denis Brott replaced Marcel St. Cyr in the Orford Quartet, which, moreover, was formed at the Jeunesses musicales du Canada Orford Art Centre in 1965, its association with the University of Toronto beginning only in 1968 (p. 208). This last item brings up the matter of

how up-to-date the information is in Ford's book. Some changes up to 1981 seem to have been incorporated while others have not. On pages 168 and 242, for example, the Canadian Association of University Schools of Music is not given its new name, the Canadian University Music Society (1980) with its new journal, *Canadian University Music Review/Revue de musique des universités canadiennes*. And Contemporary Music Showcase (mentioned on p. 175) is the name of the biennial festival, but since 1978 the name of the sponsoring organization has been Alliance for Canadian New Music Projects.

It is to be hoped that a later edition will correct a number of annoying misprints: Kubálek, not Kubalik (p. 5); John G. Seebold, not Secbold, and George Back, not Black (p. 73); Isidor Philipp, not Isador (p. 124); Canadian, not Candian (p. 136); dealership, not dealship (p. 138); Kathleen Parlow, not Pavlow (p. 159); Mae Daly, not Daley (p. 173); Miramichi, not Miramachi (p. 194); two bass clefs for the lower system of Figure 10 (p. 230); Serge Garant, not Garrant (p. 248).

Minor errors notwithstanding, it is most gratifying to have a history of Canadian music that is appealing to the general reader, generously supplemented with photographs and illustrations at the end of each chapter and helpful charts and musical examples within the text. Ford's book should make every Canadian proudly aware of the rich diversity of Canadian musical life.

\* \* \* \*

Because he has chosen to deal with all aspects of Canadian musical life, Ford devotes only some thirty-five pages to contemporary Canadian composition. In order to examine twentieth-century compositional activity in more detail, we must turn to George Proctor's *Canadian Music of the Twentieth Century* (1980), the dictionaries *Contemporary Canadian Composers* (1975) and *Compositeurs canadiens contemporains* (1977), and the two volumes of Ian Bradley's recent *Twentieth Century Canadian Composers*.

Designed primarily for use by music educators, each of Bradley's volumes includes a discussion of ten major composers. A biographical sketch, based to some extent on personal interviews where possible, is followed by a musical analysis of three works, and in each volume four composers agreed to the inclusion of a complete song or vocal work suitable for school choirs.

In the first volume (1977) Bradley dealt with the major composers of the early twentieth century, Healey Willan, Claude Champagne, Ernest MacMillan, and from the later generations he singled out Murray Adaskin, John Weinzweig, Jean Papineau-Couture, Robert Turner, Harry Freedman, Pierre Mercure, and R. Murray Schafer. The second volume (1982) begins with three women from the West: Jean Coulthard, Barbara Pentland, and Violet Archer. The representatives from

Toronto are Oskar Morawetz, Godfrey Ridout, and Harry Somers, and from Montreal, Serge Garant, Gilles Tremblay, André Prevost, and Bruce Mather. All of these persons justifiably meet Bradley's criterion as composers "whose musical achievements and influential leadership are widely recognized" (p. viii). Because of the format of the book, there is an unrelieved sameness to each chapter, but the factual information should be of great assistance to music educators and students alike.

In the biography of Barbara Pentland, *Studies in Line* (1941), a Canadian classic, is a glaring omission. It is a work that could well illustrate Bradley's reference to "linear focus" (p. 36) and one which, moreover, would most surely be of interest to students of the almost contemporaneous development of abstract art in Canada. One last minor point: Pentland's *Suite Borealis* was commissioned by the A.R.C.T. (not A.R.T.C.) Association of Vancouver.

It should be noted that Godfrey Ridout's reconstruction of *Colas et Colinette* was based on the surviving manuscript parts for voices and second violin (not "only a voice and 2nd violin part," as Bradley states on p. 116). In the discussions of Serge Garant and Gilles Tremblay, Mme. Honegger is mentioned in both places with a different version and wrong spelling of her name. Why not consistently refer to her as Mme. A. Vaurabourg-Honegger? Finally, although Garant's *Trois Pièces pour quatuor à cordes* (1958) is mentioned, it might have been stated that it contains the first use of aleatoricism in Canada.

The works chosen for analysis have been selected largely on the basis of availability of recordings and scores. The musical analyses, essentially an identification of important "tunes," are accurate as far as they go (unlike Volume I, where serious errors occur in the commentary on Jean-Papineau-Couture's *Pièce concertante No. 3* and John Weinzweig's *Divertimento No. 3*). In the discussion of Garant's *Offrande I*, it would be helpful if the reader had some guidance on how the composer obtained the proportions from the "royal" theme; that is: C - E flat = three semitones; E flat - G = four semitones; G - A flat = one semitone, etc. From the series of semitones for the last nine notes of the theme, Garant derived the last two proportions, 2 - 5, by grouping F sharp - F natural - E = two, and E - B, = five, semitones.

In the discussion of Harry Somers's *Louis Riel*, the libretto of the opera is referred to in the plural, leaving the impression that there are three texts going on simultaneously in three languages. Rather, *Louis Riel* has a trilingual libretto in English, French, and Cree. Bradley uses the term "cluster" without regard for its standard meaning as three or more pitches adjacent to one another in a semitonal relationship. For example, the term is used (p. 185) to refer to the vertical aggregate C - C sharp, an augmented octave, and C sharp - B, a minor seventh. This is not a classic cluster, but rather might be referred to as a spread-out cluster. In any event, the reader should have some guidance on how this term is being used.

Inevitably there are a number of annoying misprints which should be corrected in a later edition: for example, the date of Coulthard's String Quartet No. 2 should be 1954, revised 1969 (p. 22); Saarinén, not Saainen (p. 70); *Tafelmusik*, not *Tafel Musik* (p. 118); *Enkidu*, not *Enkido* (p. 144); C.F. Peters, not C.P. Peters (p. 152); commissioned, not comissioned (p. 180); *Symphonic Ode*, not *Symphonique Ode* (p. 246); *Bläsermusik*, not *Blässermusik* (pp. 274 & 281). Finally, many of the references to recordings are out-of-date and need to be amplified and/or corrected.

The Ford and Bradley books are welcome additions to the material on Canadian music. They can be highly recommended, and both authors and publishers have earned our gratitude for providing two badly needed reference works.

Elaine Keillor

CHARLES M. KEIL. *Tiv Song*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1979, xiii, 301 pp.

*Tiv Song*, it would be safe to say, is not a standard ethnomusicological work. There are two reasons for this. Firstly, the book is only an "introduction to future research on Tiv song and dance. It cannot be otherwise, for I have not done the fieldwork that an ethnographic treatment requires" (p. 1). Secondly, Keil is singularly unimpressed with extant musicological and cultural anthropological theory. The former he finds largely ethnocentric, unable to deal with the fact that many African societies do not possess a semantic category, "music," let alone our concern for frozen, abstract notions such as "rhythm" and "harmony." The latter is criticized as "idealist" in assuming that "'styles' of expression have a life and logic of their own" (p. 7), "floating symbolically above the events of everyday life" (p. 6). The lack of full social contextualization in attempts to understand "cultural systems" allows much cultural anthropology, in Keil's view, to become a servant of imperialism. "Traditional" societies are reified and packaged to make them amenable to the imposing weight of Western intellectual tradition, a process furthered ethnomusicologically through the application to "pre-literate" musics of categories of analysis having little in common with the categories of musical understanding developed by the "pre-literate" societies themselves. Keil senses, therefore, that "Western thought has been, is, will always be, the primary obstacle between me and Tiv *imo* [song]" (p. 182).

The lack of systematic fieldwork (attributable to some shortcomings on the author's part as well as to the Nigerian civil strife of 1966) and of a firm theoretical approach clearly lays the book open to criti-