Document généré le 18 avr. 2024 21:11

Relations industrielles
Industrial Relations

Chris ARGYRIS : *Reasoning, Learning and Action*. San Francisco, Jossey-Bass, 1982, 499 pp., ISBN 0-87589-524-7

Naresh C. Agarwal

Volume 39, numéro 1, 1984

URI : https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/050015ar
DOI : https://doi.org/10.7202/050015ar

Aller au sommaire du numéro

Éditeur(s)

Département des relations industrielles de l'Université Laval

ISSN

0034-379X (imprimé)
1703-8138 (numérique)

Découvrir la revue

Citer ce compte rendu

Agarwal, N. C. (1984). Compte rendu de [Chris ARGYRIS : *Reasoning, Learning and Action.* San Francisco, Jossey-Bass, 1982, 499 pp., ISBN 0-87589-524-7]. *Relations industrielles / Industrial Relations*, *39*(1), 206–208. https://doi.org/10.7202/050015ar

Tous droits réservés © Département des relations industrielles de l'Université Laval, 1984

Ce document est protégé par la loi sur le droit d'auteur. L'utilisation des services d'Érudit (y compris la reproduction) est assujettie à sa politique d'utilisation que vous pouvez consulter en ligne.

https://apropos.erudit.org/fr/usagers/politique-dutilisation/

Cet article est diffusé et préservé par Érudit.

Érudit est un consortium interuniversitaire sans but lucratif composé de l'Université de Montréal, l'Université Laval et l'Université du Québec à Montréal. Il a pour mission la promotion et la valorisation de la recherche.

https://www.erudit.org/fr/

The chapter dealing with the legal environment discusses the concepts of human rights and employment standards. It emphasizes the differences appearing among Canada's thirteen jurisdictions. It would be very useful to go much beyond the legal differences and show how much the personnel policies are influenced in Canada by the **territorial** differenciation.

The recession has different consequences in different parts of the country. If the management strategies have partial responsibility for the constant decline of productivity (p. 394) and the underutilization of industrial potential, this issue should be much better covered in the textbook. The same is valid for the lack of labour-management consensus. The Canadian tendency for more government intervention should be discussed with the focus on the federal-provincial interrelationships. The learning potential and the role of personnel officers in its activization should be more elaborated in a direct relationship to the Canadian specificity. The same is valid for the need to lower the cost of production.

Most of the book is taken by chapters dealing human resource planning, job analysis, recruiting, selection, introduction of new employees, training and development, performance appraisal, career planning, compensation, job evaluation systems, assigning pay to jobs, fringe benefits (they have grown during the 1960s and the 1970s from 16 per cent to 33 per cent of direct labour costs), health and safety (in 1980 the time lost because of injuries and diseases was 50 per cent higher that the time lost because of strikes). The material covered by the above mentioned chapters is at a good level of a standard textbook. This is the most useful part of the whole book but only fragmentally related to the Canadian reality.

Labour relations are squized to one chapter containing only 8 per cent of the whole text and this definitely seems too little when taking into consideration the growing importance (and complication) of them in Canada. Such facts as that the Canadian rate of unionization is almost double the American, or that in the period 1965-1982 the membership of national unions has grown from 24 per cent to 52 per cent of the total, would need much elaboration in order to make clear for the readers their significance in the long run.

The growing split within the Canadian trade union movement may be of a major importance for the further development in the field of union-management relations. The 'psychological' contract definitely is an essential part of good employee relations but the power and orientation of the trade union movement, as well its internal coherence, are significant in this respect. The propensity to unionize is a more complicated matter than it was presented in the book (pp. 376-378). The authors admit that "Labour relations and collective bargaining are a complex and specialized part of the personnel function" (p. 390) but a very limited coverage of this important subject in the book does not support the above quoted statement.

Alexander J. MATEKJO

University of Alberta

Reasoning, Learning, and Action, by Chris Argyris, San Francisco, Jossey-Bass, 1982, 499 pp., ISBN 0-87589-524-7

Argyris' contributions to the field of individual and organizational learning are well known. He along with Donald Schon first introduced a theory of reasoning and action in 1974 (Theory in Practice). Subsequent research work by Argyris on this subject resulted in Increasing Leadership Effectiveness (1976) and Organizational Learning (1978). The present book is designed to offer "tested strategies for improving individual and organizational performance — strategies that will help executives, managers, and supervisors deal more effectively with people and problems."

The book is divided into four parts. Part I (Chapters 1 through 7) focusses on sources of ineffectiveness. Here Argyris distinguishes between two types of problems: single loop and double loop problems. The former are defined to be routine in nature with fairly certain outcomes and the latter to be more involved and complex with uncertain outcomes. Argyris also distinguishes between two problem solving strategies: Model I and Model II. Model I strategy is based on four "governing variables": a) achieving one's self-perceived goals, b) maximizing winning and minimizing losing, c) minimizing eliciting negative feelings and d) emphasizing rationality and avoiding emotionality. These premises produce an action strategy which tends to avoid examining implicit assumptions or underlying values, raising confrontational issues, and accepting responsibility for one's behaviour. Argyris argues that Model I strategy may suffice for dealing with single loop problems but certainly not for dealing with double loop ones. In the latter case, Model II strategy will be more effective. This action strategy is based on the following "governing variables": a) valid information, b) free and informed choice and c) internal commitment to the choice and constant monitoring of the implementation. Argyris claims that Model I strategy is the prevalent behavioural mode in the society and as such it is applied to not only single loop problems but also double loop ones. Clearly in the latter case, ineffectiveness will result. Thus, according to Argyris, the primary source of individual and organizational ineffectiveness is the dominance of Model I behavior and its indiscriminant use.

Part II (Chapters 8 through 12) of the book discusses methods for producing effective learning, or that is, Model II behaviours. Argyris holds that "without help, people are unable to produce action congruent with Model II even if they espouse it, value it, wish to learn it and practice it." Accordingly, Part II highlights the role of the interventionist and how that role should be played. Argyris suggests that the interventionist should help the individual realize that he/she does not already have Model II skills and will not be able to exhibit them. To begin with, the interventionist "must design an environment for the meaningful surfacing of confusion and nonsense". One the individual becomes aware of the need to acquire Model II skills, the interventionist must encourage a climate of experimentation and public testing. Part II also includes cases of individuals and groups going through the process of learning Model II skills and behaviours.

Part III (Chapters 13 through 18) of the book is essentially a detailed case study of a consulting organization with which Argyris worked for eight years. The case study consists of selected episodes; each episode is presented in the form of verbatim transcripts of monthly meetings of the Executive Office (four partners) and/or of the top management group. The episodes were selected to highlight the pros and cons of applying Model II to deal with the issues involved in growing organization such as integrating new members, building an effective management team, educating and training new officers and managers, and dealing with ineffective performance.

Part IV (Chapters 19 and 20) focusses on linking theory and practice. Here Argyris reiterates the conditions necessary for Model II or double loop learning and then goes on to specify the responsibilities of interventionists and clients for producing those conditions. The book ends with a discussion of the essential features of action science and the role action scientists can play in producing change.

Overall, the book appears to be most useful to professional O.D. consultants/interventionists. It explains their critical role and provides detailed guidance on how that role should be performed. Managers and other readers may find the book somewhat abstract and difficult to follow. The numerous cases presented are a very useful feature of the book and help the reader better grasp the process of reasoning, learning, and action. In this regard, some more background information in the cases could have made them even more useful. One may also question Argyris' claim that Model I is the most

prevelent behavioural mode in our society. It appears to be too broad and sweeping a generalization. Finally, Argyris' advocacy of Model II makes sense, but the role played by organizational factors such as size, structure, technology and the like in learning Model II is not fully spelled out.

Naresh C. AGARWAL

McMaster University

Worker Capitalism. The New Industrial Relations, by Keith Bradley and Alan Gelb, London, Heinemann, 1983, 186 pp., ISBN 0-435-82084-2 Pbk.

This is an overview of various contemporary attempts to overcome the destructive tendencies and regenerate industry on the basis of employee ownership. There is a substantial potential in this respect as long as these are not the last-ditch expedients for already exceptionally weak companies. The cases analysed in the book are from the U.S., Canada, Britain, France, and Malta.

The conversion of declining firms into wholly or partially employee-owned enterprises is a risky business, especially if it is done from the taxpayer's pocket. However there are several advantages: the possibility to slow or avoid redundancy, a powerful consensus-creating mechanism, a shift of responsibility away from government towart the parties directly involved, the savings on the unemployment benefits, an opportunity for workers to learn how to cooperate in running their businesses, a considerable help to the local community by keeping the business intact.

The survival is a common denominator of all cases analysed in the book. Employees, management as well as various involved businesses and agencies have a common interest in the rescue operation. To maintain the ailing plant is more or less expensive depending how capital-intensive it is. The assignment of joint responsibilities may prove to be more or less successful. New initiatives appear. "Workforce initiatives are likely to be valuable in broaching suggestions for reorganization and cutting production costs which management cannot or will not insist on" (p. 88). People organize themselves and take sacrifice in order to rescue their jobs and the benefits to the community. There is a screening out of people who represent a liability to the business. There is an internal pressure towards efficiency. For the state, conversion to employee-ownership is usually more attractive than nationalisation.

Of course, the risk of bancrupcy is high and, from the perspective of the public interest, it is very often not worth to subsidize the employee-ownership initiatives. However, this strategy "at least increases the range of choice by offering an alternative to redundancy" (p. 93). It is significant that most of the employee takeovers do not involve a significant move to worker control and the traditional patterns of adversarial industrial relations continue under the new circumstances. This does not mean necessarily that the relations are bad. The opposite is rather true. Attitudes of employees versus their jobs are improving. Productivity of work is good.

The stability of cooperatively-run enterprises proves to be relatively low. The more successful among them switch often to the private form. The need of additional finance makes room for transformation. The expectations of employees as "owners" may become frustrated. There is not enough of a genuine job reform in order to justify the collective character of the enterprise. Employee firms born out of conventional closures are not equipped to socialize their members appropriately, a process which anyway, would take time (p. 97).

The restructuring of ownership patterns, even if only temporary, may offer some attractive prospects for an interventionalist policy. It is not possible to expect much out of it because in most of the cases it just remains a transient phase. The fact that people vulnerable to the failure of the enterprises employing