

Urban History Review Revue d'histoire urbaine

URBAN HISTORY REVIEW
REVUE D'HISTOIRE URBAINE

Artibise, A.F.J., ed. *Town and City: Aspects of Western Canadian Urban Development*. Canadian Plains Studies, Volume 10. Regina: Canadian Plains Research Center, University of Regina, 1981. Pp. xix, 455. Tables, figures, maps, illustrations. \$15.00

William M. Baker

Volume 11, numéro 3, february 1983

URI : <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1019021ar>

DOI : <https://doi.org/10.7202/1019021ar>

[Aller au sommaire du numéro](#)

Éditeur(s)

Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine

ISSN

0703-0428 (imprimé)

1918-5138 (numérique)

[Découvrir la revue](#)

Citer ce compte rendu

Baker, W. M. (1983). Compte rendu de [Artibise, A.F.J., ed. *Town and City: Aspects of Western Canadian Urban Development*. Canadian Plains Studies, Volume 10. Regina: Canadian Plains Research Center, University of Regina, 1981. Pp. xix, 455. Tables, figures, maps, illustrations. \$15.00]. *Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine*, 11(3), 84–85. <https://doi.org/10.7202/1019021ar>

development are mutually exclusive processes must be rejected. Peter Jacobs, in the sixth volume of the series, forcefully argues that conservation must guide development ("eco-development"). If human settlements are to survive in both developed and developing societies, renewable resources must be exploited on a sustainable basis. Jacobs calls for a more adaptive environmental management process, one that involves what he terms "anticipatory planning" – seeking a desired future state of the environment by actively and forcefully manipulating present conditions. That this requires a coherent set of policies, a recognition that human settlements can only be improved if a *laissez-faire* approach to their development is abandoned, and the wisdom to see that land, housing and urban problems are closely linked, is perhaps one of the fundamental themes reappearing throughout all the volumes of this series.

Peter McGahan
Department of Sociology
University of New Brunswick

Artibise, A.F.J., ed. *Town and City: Aspects of Western Canadian Urban Development*. Canadian Plains Studies, Volume 10. Regina: Canadian Plains Research Center, University of Regina, 1981. Pp.xix, 455. Tables, figures, maps, illustrations. \$15.00

This hefty volume is divided into four sections. The first contains two essays on the economic framework and urbanization of the Prairies and British Columbia respectively. Parts two and three deal with the establishment and growth of towns and cities. These two sections, containing eleven papers, form the bulk of the volume. The concluding section, "Urban Social Problems," scratches the surface of this large topic with two articles. All articles in the volume are competent both in style and substance. All go well beyond the antiquarianism which the editor, Alan Artibise, suggests has dominated writings on western Canadian urban history.

No brief review can do justice to all the articles in the volume. Readers may well find interesting and useful the papers that I will ignore, such as R.A.J. McDonald on pre-World War I development of the economic system of B.C. with particular reference to Victoria and Vancouver; Selwood and Baril on "The Hudson's Bay Company and Prairie Town Development, 1870-1888"; Bill Brennan on the mixed blessing of business-government involvement in the early development of Regina and Moose Jaw; C.N. Forward on Victoria's functional character; P. Roy on pre-Depression Vancouver as "The Mecca of the Unemployed"; and L.H. Thomas on Saskatoon to 1920, an attractive, clearly presented paper, written by one of the

fathers of Prairie historiography nearly four decades ago but previously unpublished.

Paul Phillips' paper, "The Prairie Urban System, 1911-1961: Specialization and Change," is both interesting and frustrating. It has the advantage of surveying a long period of time and presenting a variety of economic and demographic statistical indices. The resultant interpretation, which concentrates on the rise and decline of the commercial empire of Winnipeg, is plausible but not entirely convincing. Statistics do not, of course, speak for themselves and careful readers of Phillips' essay will find themselves questioning the author's interpretation of the statistics, developing alternate hypotheses, and wishing for complete (rather than broken) statistical runs. Moreover, readers may also find themselves desiring a less dominant Winnipeg focus (indeed wishing for some examination of urban centres other than the "Big Five"). In short, this article engages the reader, not because it is perfect but because it is stimulating.

Another stimulating but more satisfying article is Carl Betke's "The Original City of Edmonton: A Derivative Prairie Urban Community." This conceptually advanced paper not only presents much good and useful information about Edmonton to 1906 but also adopts an approach that could be applied to other locations. Betke argues that a centre becomes a city when individualism is replaced by community in terms of its social interaction: "individual pursuits and the quality of individual lives [come] irreversibly to depend on the quality of the urban organism. A tyranny of community [is] exerted in which it becomes unimaginable to live without it" (p.306). By examining such topics as demographic patterns, the urban élite, the provision of civic services, efforts to increase economic prosperity, professionalism in civic administration, voluntary associations and recreational activities, Betke convincingly demonstrates that by 1906 Edmonton was indeed a city in reality as well as in law. The article thus presents not only a useful model but also a fine example of how to apply the model. Some caution must be exercised, of course, for as Potyondi's article on Minnedosa (population 1,300 in 1906) indicates, even small centres might have amenities and organizations similar to those of major urban places. Moreover, the concept of a transition from individualism to community lacks precision. Does community not exist in rural areas? But these are quibbles with a fine paper.

The subject-matter of Henry Klassen's "In Search of Neglected and Delinquent Children: The Calgary Children's Aid Society, 1909-1920" is fascinating. Klassen's perspective is almost exactly the one promoters of the Children's Aid Society would have wished for. A quite different approach could have been adopted, one that stressed social control by the élite rather than altruistic *noblesse oblige*. And what control!

In the same year [1917], someone informed the Children's Aid that returned soldiers were occasionally visiting the home of a mother with three children in the absence of her husband. Although a visit to the home by a lady probation officer revealed a tidy house and no evidence of serious neglect, the reported goings-on of the mother were enough to have the home placed under the watchful eye of the probation officer.... The mother was allowed to keep her children (p.388).

Despite Klassen's failure to consider class conflict as an interpretative model for understanding the work of the society the article provides much interesting material on an important issue of urban social history whatever conceptual framework one wishes to adopt.

Although the Phillips, Betke and Klassen articles, and many others, are interesting in their own right, many of the papers raise the perennially important issue of the relative importance of individual or group initiative (free will) and uncontrollable forces (determinism). Should the historian who wishes to explain the development and growth of urban centres be concentrating upon the "booster" or such factors as physical geography, initial advantage, or even the CPR? The volume stresses individualism, a necessary counterbalance to the most forceful contemporary trends in the discipline of history, but for my money the determinist case is stronger. That is, historians would do well to commence their study of the rise and decline of urban centres with the "forces," bringing in individual initiative as a subsidiary, though not insignificant, consideration.

One of the corollaries of the booster school of historiography is that it attempts to assign winners and losers in the urban development sweepstakes. This has some utility but certainly creates problems in interpretation. Did winners attempt, or wish to do, anything substantially different from losers? What about the comparative initiative and skill of winning and losing boosters? In fact, it is difficult to detect significant differences in entrepreneurial goals, strategies and abilities; more important were the forces boosters could assist or exploit. As well, the rules for ascribing boosters and their urban centres to the categories of winners and losers are unclear. In this volume Minnedosa is presented as a mild success story by Barry Potyondi, Lethbridge as a mild failure by Andy den Otter, and Strathcona as a failure by John Gilpin. Using different criteria one could challenge all these judgements. Moreover, Max Foran's article on Wesley Orr, a Calgary booster, complicates the issue even more since Orr turns out to be a booster ahead of his time, that is, a failed booster in his own day, but a prophetic and therefore ultimately successful one from the perspective of today. Given this variety, Artibise's article on the widespread phenomenon of boosterism on the Prairies, wherein the characteristics of boosterism are presented and the use of

the concept in historical analysis is discussed, is most appropriate. Artibise and his colleagues in this volume have established that boosterism will be an important consideration whenever urban development on the Prairies is considered. Paul Voisey's article on southern Albertan towns clearly demonstrates the fruitful use to which the concept of boosterism may be put. This paper, based on wide research, including oral history, shows real sensitivity in examining the various factors, boosterism included and highlighted, related to the development, stagnation or decline of towns.

The articles in this volume, taken individually or collectively, are creditable additions to Canadian historiography. The Canadian Plains Research Centre is to be commended for publishing this book, not only because of the material contained therein, but also because of its high technical quality – good binding, careful proofreading and useful statistical tables (although the reviewer noted two discrepancies in the statistics and there may be others). Even at a softcover price of \$15, this volume is good value.

William M. Baker
Department of History
University of Lethbridge

Ramirez, B., and Del Balzo, M. *The Italians of Montreal: From Sojourning to Settlement, 1900-1921*. Montreal: Les éditions du Courant, 1979. Pp.54.

As the title indicates, the authors of this slender but informative volume have sketched the quite normal process by which the Italian immigrant to Montreal went from sojourning to settlement. The two decades covered deal with a period of important immigration into Canada, to be repeated after World War II. The inter-war years were years of rigid quotas, and during the Depression of almost total exclusion.

This slim volume emphasizes the early social history of Italians in the large metropolitan centre. To anyone familiar with the problem of adjustment immigrants faced, nothing here comes as a revelation or surprise. The authors do touch, necessarily sketchily, on every aspect of the process by which sojourners gradually became settlers; the 1,398 of the 1901 census became 13,970 by 1921.

The most interesting part of the story deals with the conflict between the Italian consular officials and the "old" established Italians on the one side and entrepreneur Antonio Cordano, the agent the CPR used to hire immigrant labour, on the other. In January 1909, Cordano organized a parade for himself and had two of his foremen crown him, with a replica of the Italian crown, as