

Cadman, David & Geoffrey Payne, eds. *The Living City: Towards a Sustainable Future*. New York and London: Routledge, 1990. Pp. x, 246. Tables, index
Gordon, David, ed. *Green Cities: Ecologically Sound Approaches to Urban Space*. Montreal: Black Rose Books, 1990. Pp. 299. Tables, black and white plates, maps, appendices. \$34.95 (hard); \$19.95 (soft) (U.S.)
Gottmann, Jean and Robert A. Harper, eds. *Since Megalopolis: The Urban Writings of Jean Gottmann*. Baltimore and London: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1990. Pp. xii, 294. Black and white plates, index. \$36.00 (hard); \$14.95 (soft)
Logan, John R. and Todd Swanstrom, eds. *Beyond the City Limits: Urban Policy and Economic Restructuring in Comparative Perspective*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 1991. Pp. xii, 276. Index. \$39.95 (U.S.)

Bruce Tucker

Volume 21, numéro 1, octobre 1992

URI : <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1019250ar>
DOI : <https://doi.org/10.7202/1019250ar>

[Aller au sommaire du numéro](#)

Éditeur(s)

Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine

ISSN

0703-0428 (imprimé)
1918-5138 (numérique)

[Découvrir la revue](#)

Citer ce compte rendu

Tucker, B. (1992). Compte rendu de [Cadman, David & Geoffrey Payne, eds. *The Living City: Towards a Sustainable Future*. New York and London: Routledge, 1990. Pp. x, 246. Tables, index / Gordon, David, ed. *Green Cities: Ecologically Sound Approaches to Urban Space*. Montreal: Black Rose Books, 1990. Pp. 299. Tables, black and white plates, maps, appendices. \$34.95 (hard); \$19.95 (soft) (U.S.) / Gottmann, Jean and Robert A. Harper, eds. *Since Megalopolis: The Urban Writings of Jean Gottmann*. Baltimore and London: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1990. Pp. xii, 294. Black and white plates, index. \$36.00 (hard); \$14.95 (soft) / Logan, John R. and Todd Swanstrom, eds. *Beyond the City Limits: Urban Policy and Economic Restructuring in Comparative Perspective*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 1991. Pp. xii, 276. Index. \$39.95 (U.S.)]. *Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine*, 21(1), 64–66. <https://doi.org/10.7202/1019250ar>

All Rights Reserved © Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine, 1992

Ce document est protégé par la loi sur le droit d'auteur. L'utilisation des services d'Érudit (y compris la reproduction) est assujettie à sa politique d'utilisation que vous pouvez consulter en ligne.

<https://apropos.erudit.org/fr/usagers/politique-dutilisation/>

érudit

Cet article est diffusé et préservé par Érudit.

Érudit est un consortium interuniversitaire sans but lucratif composé de l'Université de Montréal, l'Université Laval et l'Université du Québec à Montréal. Il a pour mission la promotion et la valorisation de la recherche.

<https://www.erudit.org/fr/>

Users are cautioned to read carefully the section that details what is *not* included. While *Mapping Upper Canada* is itself a veritable treasure map for Ontario historians, the exclusions are fairly substantial. Anyone looking for maps of, say, Indian reservations, timber limits, engineering plans of railways, or maps still in British PRO correspondence series will find few of them here. Winearls excludes many maps at the Survey Records Office that detail areas smaller than a township, including many fascinating plans of individual farms, drawn to illustrate boundary disputes but including interesting information about farm layout and land use. Also excluded are many "minor military maps," mostly in classifications 440 and 450 at the National Archives. She has tried to include most maps of entire townships, towns, and villages, all registered subdivision plans, and maps in published books that are not found elsewhere. I was pleased to see a listing for the 1826 map of Upper Bytown (#1723), picked up in A.H.D. Ross' *Ottawa Past and Present* (1927). Following Ross, Winearls notes the original as being in a private collection, but it has long been at the Archives of Ontario, the only map in the Thomas Burrowes collection of watercolour views. Winearls of course has searched for such needles only in the most promising of non-cartographic haystacks. She also began this work in the early 1970s and does not tell us whether acquisitions during the 1980s have been included comprehensively for all repositories.

So the historian will not find everything here and will always have to examine the catalogues, lists, and indexes in the various repositories. But this essential reference work will guide the researcher to many unexpected treasures and will assist immeasurably in interpreting the maps themselves.

Bruce S. Elliott
Department of History
Carleton University

Cadman, David & Geoffrey Payne, eds. *The Living City: Towards a Sustainable Future*. New York and London: Routledge, 1990. Pp. x, 246. Tables, index.

Gordon, David, ed. *Green Cities: Ecologically Sound Approaches to Urban Space*. Montreal: Black Rose Books, 1990. Pp. 299. Tables, black and white plates, maps, appendices. \$34.95 (hard); \$19.95 (soft) (U.S.).

Gottmann, Jean and Robert A. Harper, eds. *Since Megalopolis: The Urban Writings of Jean Gottmann*. Baltimore and London: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1990. Pp. xii, 294. Black and white plates, index. \$36.00 (hard); \$14.95 (soft).

Logan, John R. and Todd Swanstrom, eds. *Beyond the City Limits: Urban Policy and Economic Restructuring in Comparative Perspective*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 1991. Pp. xii, 276. Index. \$39.95 (U.S.).

My first reading of the four books under review left me with an uneasy sense of what historian Allan Megill, in "AHR Forum: Fragmentation and the Future of Historiography," *American Historical Review* (95, June 1991), has called the "blindness of historians who argue only with other historians, philosophers only with other philosophers, economists only with other economists, and so on." The contributors to these edited collections of essays include political scientists, economists, urban planners, activists, urban geographers, and sociologists, but historians are noticeably absent. Most of the authors seek to affect public policy, and thus they address the future rather than the past. They are more interested in pointing out the mistakes of past urban planners rather than in asking the historical question of why now discarded plans and visions once made sense to their inventors. Yet it would be a mistake to evaluate these

books according to the criteria of conventional *historical* modes of explanation. We may lack experience in listening sensitively to the discourses of other disciplines, but in the case of these books, we have much to gain from the attempt.

These books aim to diagnose and prescribe for the resolution of contemporary problems, focusing particularly on environmental issues and economic development. The contributors to *The Living City*, *Green Cities*, and *Beyond the City Limits* cover a broad range of topics, including the politics of third-world urban development, the politics of "green" urban agendas, citizen participation in urban planning, and current economic theories about urban restructuring. *Since Megalopolis* offers a retrospective selection of essays by French urban geographer Jean Gottmann.

The essays in *Beyond the City Limits* were originally given as papers at a conference on the economic restructuring of cities at the State University of New York at Albany in 1989. Economic restructuring refers to a cluster of grand changes in the modern history of cities: the crisis in the international capitalist order which analysts date from the emergence of the OPEC cartel in 1973; the transition from cities as centres of industrial production to service economies; and the mobility of capital owing to cheaper sources of labour in developing countries. As a result of these developments, cities compete for development projects and are often forced to mould city and social welfare planning to suit the demands of investors. The authors address the question of whether cities can affect their own economic restructuring or whether they are victims of larger, transnational economic forces. Collectively the authors envision a model of economic development which abandons ruthless competition for mobile capital in favour of emphasizing

human needs and building upon the strengths of local economies.

Most of the authors are keenly attuned to the political dimensions of economic planning. Michael Parkinson's article on the transformation of British urban policy under Margaret Thatcher concludes that "change was primarily ideologically, not economically driven." Likewise, Susan Fainstein emphasizes that political will in New York and London in the 1980s shaped policies that produced "highly uneven development, severe shortages of affordable housing, congestion and environmental deterioration." Fainstein concludes that cities can have "growth with equity" only within a market-based system that promotes both the welfare of the middle class and greater public control over private investment patterns than is now the case in the United States and Britain. For historians who are accustomed to probing the social and intellectual context in which planning is carried out, these conclusions will come as no surprise.

The contributors to *Beyond the City Limits* stress that local responses to economic restructuring assume a variety of forms, but collectively they indicate that the decisions of the managers of international capital have a greater impact on restructuring than local politics. In addition, the authors point to the greater importance of national, rather than local, economic policies and planning. On occasion, however, such as in leftist-dominated municipal governments in France, local efforts to plan restructuring can have considerable impact—using the case of economic restructuring in French cities, Edmond Preteceille emphasizes the potential role of local social movements in rehabilitating the state as an instrument of restructuring.

The editors of *The Living City* pursue a similar line of argument, seeking to

challenge the idea that urban development must inevitably be determined by the imperatives of the marketplace. The authors stress the primacy of human needs, local self-reliance, and sustainability over the goals of international capital accumulation and economic growth.

The chief strength of this book is its attention to models of economic transformation in developing countries. In particular, Arif Hansan's description of the Orangi project in Karachi, Pakistan, a sewer building effort of the 1980s, suggests the potential for mobilizing local resources, through sensitive community involvement, to alter traditional habits of waste disposal. It required the modification of standard engineering techniques to take account of local abilities and resources. This project brought effective, low-cost sanitation to over 75 per cent of the target community and also altered the relationship of the people to local government in the direction of greater citizen participation. In a more generalized analysis of the politics of "Third World" development, Tade Akin Aina similarly stresses the resilience and ingenuity of poor urban dwellers to use scarce resources effectively. Both authors stress the importance of a respectful negotiation between planners and local populations, and both contribute to an emerging, reciprocal dialogue between planners from the industrialized and developing countries.

Green Cities: Ecologically Sound Approaches to Urban Space addresses primarily the concerns of environmental planners and activists on several issues. The authors seek to further the agenda of the "green planning movement," arguing that cities no longer make sense and cannot survive as presently constituted. Tremendous amounts of energy are wasted in the importation of food and the exportation of waste. Modern cities divorce peo-

ple from nature and indeed encourage a false distinction between humanity and nature. Like *Beyond the City Limits* and *The Living City*, *Green Cities* emphasizes the need for local initiatives, community participation and an end to the concept of economic growth as inherently desirable. "Economic Development," writes futurist consultant David Morris, "must be seen as a means to an end and not as an end in itself."

Readers will value this book for its descriptions of alternative environmental technologies and planning strategies. Christine Feredy offers an excellent example of the unintended environmental dividends in Calcutta from the practice of agricultural production on a bog filled with organic urban wastes. Planners interested in urban reforestation will learn much from Tjeerd Deelstra's historical account on the reconstitution of urban forests in the Netherlands. A section on political strategies to effect change will inspire activists involved in campaigns to promote "environmental literacy" and sound ecological planning. Readers will find the appendices, which list suppliers of green products and services, an extensive bibliography, and addresses of organizations and demonstration projects, especially useful.

Since Megalopolis contains a selection of articles by French geographer Jean Gottmann published since his monumental study *Megalopolis: The Urbanized Northeastern Seaboard of the United States* (1961), a book in which he identified the Boston-Washington corridor as a single urban unit. With its population of 38 million people living on about 2% of American territory, Megalopolis, in Gottmann's view, was the hinge of international exchange (cultural, technological, financial, and political) for the United States. In *Megalopolis*, Gottmann stressed the erosion of traditional distinctions between urban and rural societies.

He also argued that the area was not one undifferentiated city but contained forces and counter forces which ultimately would contribute to an ethos of cultural and social diversity. In an article in 1976, he identified five additional such centres internationally and predicted the emergence of three more.

One of the aims of *Since Megalopolis*, it seems, is to clarify previously stated ideas and to preserve the term "megalopolis" from misuse. Megalopolis, Gottmann writes, applies to "very large polynuclear urbanized systems endowed with enough continuity and internal interconnections for each of them to be considered in itself." The area must be separated from non-megalopolitan areas by substantial and less urbanized spaces, and its population density and intensity of activities must be substantially greater than that of conventional cities. Gottmann's efforts to refine the definition of Megalopolis are aimed at critics who appear to have understood the term only as an "overgrown metropolitan area."

Since Megalopolis is a delight to read, for Gottmann brings an erudition to his writing that is uncommon in the literature of North American urban studies. A superb essay on archaeological excavations on the Aegean islands of Santori and Delos, for example, provides an occasion for illuminating a discourse on the Platonic notion of cities as isolated, largely self-contained units, and Alexander of Macedon's pluralistic, expansive, commercial model which defined cities as parts of larger networks. Another essay examines urban planning in modern Japan and assesses the attempts of Japanese planners by the late 1970s to subordinate economic growth to the "non-material" needs of urbanites. In an engaging article entitled "The Ethics of Living at High Densities," (originally published in 1966), Gottmann stresses his argument from *Megalopolis* that

increases in population density have historically caused only temporary difficulties for urban dwellers. "The lesson from history seems fairly simple and clear," he writes in one of his characteristically sweeping positivist statements, "high density creates a challenge to improve, through better organization and fairer distribution, the lot of the people." Gottmann remains optimistic about the future of cities and about the capacity of thoughtful planning to cope with modern urban problems.

Readers will find these books useful, even occasionally intriguing. North American readers will particularly appreciate the many forays into non-Western arenas of urban politics and development. Many of the articles are written in a spirited and heartening tone, emphasising the possibilities of an urban economics based on human need and environmental sustainability. Historians, however, may have a difficult task in puzzling out a relationship to the efforts of planners to make sense of the contemporary scene. Readers will notice that there is almost no attention in these books to the peculiarities of race, gender, and ethnicity that has so enriched recent work in the discipline, such as Lisabeth Cohen's *Making a New Deal: Industrial Workers in Chicago, 1919-1934*, and Susan A. Glenn's *Daughters of the Shtetl: Life and Labor in the Immigrant Generation*. We are traditionally hesitant to embrace generalizations that are not rooted in time and place, and we resent the efforts of social scientists to ransack the past, as many of the contributors do, for evidence to support universal propositions. We are trained to account for change over time and to maintain a healthy distance from our informants, rather than to praise or criticise them. Perhaps, however, our dialogues with the practitioners of other disciplines are too infrequent, our abilities to wander in the literature of other fields too stunted to appreciate fully how our own

work might be different. These books invite us to try.

Bruce Tucker
Department of History
University of Windsor

Merriman, John M., *The Margins of City Life: Explorations on the French Urban Frontier 1815-1851*. New York and Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1991. Pp. 318. Illustrations, maps, black and white photographs. \$63.00.

John Merriman continues his exploration of French cities during the nineteenth century in his latest monograph, *The Margins of City Life*. While his previous work concentrated on one city, Limoges, this work deals with several towns, including Perpignan, Paris, Reims, Nimes and Poitiers. The social, economic and political consequences of urban development between 1815 and 1851 are examined.

The over-arching theme of the book is that of marginality in all its aspects: cultural, geographical, social and economic. Merriman tells the story of spatially isolated suburbanites who also were marginal in a social and economic sense. Perpignan most graphically illustrates this inclusive marginality. As Merriman brilliantly demonstrates, the working class inhabitants, the Catalan population, lived on the outskirts of town and were distinct from the French population of the city centre, linguistically, culturally, and religiously. The popular religious beliefs and practices of the Catalans conflicted with the orthodoxy of French Catholicism. These cultural differences bolstered the Catalan opposition to the French state.

Merriman reminds us of the importance of studying the marginal. Like other scholars in the field, such as Bernard Vincent and Roger Chartier, he believes that marginality served as a "mirror," meaning