

Canadian University Music Review

Revue de musique des universités canadiennes

Alexander Ringer, ed. *The Early Romantic Era: Between Revolutions, 1789 and 1848. Music and Society*. Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice Hall, 1991. x, 325 pp. ISBN 0-13-222399-6 (hardcover), ISBN 0-13-222332-5 (softcover)

James Deaville

Volume 16, numéro 2, 1996

URI : <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1014432ar>

DOI : <https://doi.org/10.7202/1014432ar>

[Aller au sommaire du numéro](#)

Éditeur(s)

Canadian University Music Society / Société de musique des universités canadiennes

ISSN

0710-0353 (imprimé)

2291-2436 (numérique)

[Découvrir la revue](#)

Citer ce compte rendu

Deaville, J. (1996). Compte rendu de [Alexander Ringer, ed. *The Early Romantic Era: Between Revolutions, 1789 and 1848. Music and Society*. Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice Hall, 1991. x, 325 pp. ISBN 0-13-222399-6 (hardcover), ISBN 0-13-222332-5 (softcover)]. *Canadian University Music Review / Revue de musique des universités canadiennes*, 16(2), 124–128.
<https://doi.org/10.7202/1014432ar>

tional subheadings while others divide up the sources into categories, such as in Chapter 4: Historical-political background; Literature and the arts; Theatre, opera and ballet; and, Instrumental music. These subheadings do not correspond with the subheadings used in the chapter. Unfortunately, the bibliographies have two negative characteristics, which are beyond the control of the editor and authors: the "English-language only" reader will be frustrated that many of the sources are in foreign languages; and, since this volume was published in 1989 the bibliography is quickly becoming outdated.

As in the other books in this series, the volume concludes with comparative chronological tables, listing five columns over a two-page layout: Music and musicians; Politics, war, rulers; Literature, philosophy, religion; Science, technology, discovery; and, Fine and decorative arts, architecture. The chronology begins with 1740 and ends in 1799, allotting one two-page chart for each of the six decades. This is followed by a detailed index, which is essential to a book of this nature since references to composers and their works can be scattered throughout the volume.

Without doubt, *The Classical Era* is a major accomplishment both in its scope and general conception. For the English-speaking reader it holds many excellent summaries of cultural, political, and economic situations in various locales. Nevertheless, in this age of polemical debates over the "new musicology," music analysis, and post-modernist theories, the contributors to this book also need to be aware of how their perceptions of music and music history influence their choice and interpretation of its social forces.

Patricia Debly

Alexander Ringer, ed. *The Early Romantic Era: Between Revolutions, 1789 and 1848*. Music and Society. Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice Hall, 1991. x, 325 pp. ISBN 0-13-222399-6 (hardcover), ISBN 0-13-222332-5 (softcover). Referred to below as I.

1. Alexander L. Ringer, "The Rise of Urban Musical Life between the Revolutions, 1789–1848";
2. Ralph P. Locke, "Paris: Centre of Intellectual Ferment";
3. Sigrid Wiesmann, "Vienna: Bastion of Conservatism";
4. Christoph-Hellmut Mahling, "Berlin: 'Music in the Air'";
5. Sieghart Döhring, "Dresden and Leipzig: Two Bourgeois Centres";
6. John Rosselli, "Italy: The Centrality of Opera";
7. Joel Sachs, "London: The Professionalization of Music";
8. Gerald R. Seaman, "Moscow and St. Petersburg";
9. Kathryn Bumpass, "The USA: A Quest for Improvement";
10. Gerard Béhague, "Latin America: Independence and Nationalism."

Jim Samson, ed. *The Late Romantic Era: From the Mid-19th Century to World War I*. Music and Society. Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice Hall, 1991. x, 463 pp. ISBN 0-13-524174-X (hardcover), ISBN 0-13-524182-0 (softcover). Referred to below as II.

1. Jim Samson, "Music and Society";
2. John Deathridge, "Germany: The 'Special Path'";
3. Paul Banks, "Vienna: Absolutism and Nostalgia";
4. James Harding,

"Paris: Opera Reigns Supreme"; 5. John Rosselli, "Italy: The Decline of a Tradition"; 6. Lionel Salter, "Spain: A Nation in Turbulence"; 7. David Fanning, "Russia: East Meets West"; 8. Jim Samson, "East Central Europe: The Struggle for National Identity"; 9. John Bergsagel, "Scandinavia: Unity in Diversity"; 10. Donald Burrows, "Victorian England: An Age of Expansion"; 11. Charles Hamm, "The USA: Classical, Industrial and Invisible Music"; 12. Gerard Béhague, "Latin America: Reflections and Reactions"; 13. Arnold Whittall, "Germany: Cross-Currents and Contradictions"; 14. Paul Banks, "Fin-de-siècle Vienna: Politics and Modernism"; 15. Jann Pasler, "Paris: Conflicting Notions of Progress."

At the outset I should note that these books represent major contributions to the burgeoning literature about musical history, institutions, and practices in relation to their social contexts. Thus it is particularly regrettable that, due to the space limitations of a summary review, the books cannot be reviewed in the detail that their rich and varied contents demand. Nevertheless, I shall make an attempt to produce a meaningful discussion of their overall character and contents, while pointing out details worthy of note.

Let us first examine the publications from the perspective of the stated intention of the series. In his "Preface" to each volume of the series, editor Stanley Sadie explains

the intention [of the Music and Society series] is to view musical history not as a series of developments in some hermetic world of its own but rather as a series of responses to social, economic and political circumstances and to religious and intellectual stimuli. We want to explain not simply *what* happened, but *why* it happened, and why it happened when and where it did (I and II, p. ix).

However, the reader should not expect here a study of "society in music," in other words, a sociology of music in the sense of John Shepherd's *Music as Social Text*, for which "the question no longer remains that of how to understand music and individuals in terms of society ..., [but rather] how to understand societies and individuals in terms of music."⁹ Music sociologists Shepherd and Simon Frith, among others, eschew the traditional assumptions and working methods of musicology in interrogating social practices and meanings in music.

In contrast, the social history of music Music and Society belongs to the venerable, worthy tradition most effectively represented by William Weber's *Music and the Middle Class*,¹⁰ which itself can trace its lineage back to Arthur Loesser's *Men, Women, and Pianos*¹¹ and Henry Raynor's *A Social History of Music*,¹² among others. This tradition, which we may designate as "music in

⁹John Shepherd, *Music as Social Text* (Cambridge: Polity Press, 1991), 220.

¹⁰William Weber, *Music and the Middle Class: The Social Structures of Concert Life in London, Paris and Vienna* (London: Croom Helm, 1975). This book remains a valuable source of details about and insights into the concert audience of the 19th century.

¹¹Arthur Loesser, *Men, Women, and Pianos* (New York: Knopf, 1954).

¹²Henry Raynor, *A Social History of Music: From the Middle Ages to Beethoven* (London: Barrie and Jenkins, 1972). One year after the appearance of Weber's book, Raynor published a second volume, entitled *Music and Society since 1815* (London: Barrie and Jenkins, 1976).

society," heavily relies upon contemporary sources to sketch out a detailed documentary history of music in light of its socio-political, economic, and intellectual contexts. For the nineteenth century, emphasis in such studies has been upon musical institutions, whether the piano in the case of Loesser or subscription concerts in the case of Weber. Also in the tradition of the social history of music, the books contain no substantive discussion of the music itself—as series editor Sadie notes, "the reader will not find technical, stylistic discussion in them" (I and II, p. ix).¹³

Series editor Stanley Sadie and volume editors Alexander Ringer and Jim Samson deserve congratulations for amassing such an impressive array of articles about the social contexts for nineteenth-century music in Europe and the Western Hemisphere. The selection of articles in the earlier volume privileges urban musical life, which was in the process of taking shape during the first half of the nineteenth century. Considering the emergence of national groups—if not schools—of composers in the later nineteenth century, it is logical that the topics of contributions should shift from cities alone to a mixture of major cities and nations for *The Late Romantic Era*. And the fin-de-siècle articles recognize the significant changes in political, social, and intellectual conditions that brought about "early modernism" (Samson's term) in major urban centres.

The editors have allowed for individual approaches to the subject matter, in content, structure, and nature of source material. Virtually all writers present the social conditions and historical events of a given city/country/region in their relations to the major institutions of "high" musical art, and thereby document the social history of music in those locations. Without exception, each article contains valuable new historical information, written in an engaging and eminently readable style. This is not to suggest that treatment is fully equal among contributions. Exemplary in detail and insight are—among others—Locke, Rosselli, and Sachs in the earlier volume and Samson, Banks, Hamm and all of the fin-de-siècle articles in the later volume. In contrast, the articles by Döhring and Salter are somewhat disappointing in their brevity, as are those that present regions, especially Béhague on Latin America and Bergsagel on Scandinavia. Bibliographic approaches of contributors also vary widely, in the best cases relying upon original archival research like Sachs, heavily drawing upon contemporary published sources like Mahling or Pasler, or significantly citing secondary sources like Deathridge, Fanning, and Banks. The introductory essays to the books (by Ringer and Samson) themselves present two different approaches to their task: while Ringer provides a wide-ranging essay that touches on a variety of topics, Samson methodically introduces some of the major social issues of the period that will inform the rest of the book.

¹³Certain readers, who believe that music cannot be separated from its social contexts, may find this exclusion of the "notes" problematic, yet the incorporation of musical analyses into these volumes would take the series outside the realm of social history of music.

In light of my earlier comments about *Music and Society* as a social history of music rather than a sociology of music, it would be unfair to the enterprise to criticize the volumes, for example, for not really dealing with issues of difference or otherness in music (e.g., non-urban and popular musical traditions or the status of women musicians). Rather, recognition should be given to such remarkable achievements as Rosselli's detailed investigation of the conditions behind the production and consumption of opera in Italy, or Deathridge's informed and open-minded attempt to "reclaim" a formative role for music societies and voluntary associations within German musical life of the 19th century, or Samson's heroic effort to sort out the patchwork of politics in late-19th-century East Central Europe, or Pasler's single minded, thorough interrogation of the concept of progress in fin-de-siècle Paris. Furthermore, certain contributions do distinguish themselves by their attention to difference, such as Locke's and Sachs' sensitive consideration of the role of women as composers, performers, and audience members and Hamm's substantial treatment of issues of race and class. And Samson's invocations of—among others—Nietzsche, Max Weber, Jürgen Habermas, and Peter Bürger in his article "Music and Society" reflect a deeper level of theoretical engagement that should inform all such overarching studies, whether as social histories or sociologies of music. In this context, certain historiographical problems such as Ringer's uncritical dismissal of virtuosity and the virtuoso ("the appealingly re-creative rather than uniquely creative individual" I, p. 10) and Béhague's facile comparisons of "national" musical styles ("Puerto Rico ... did not measure up to Cuba in musical importance" I, p. 286) stand out as unfortunate.

Although—as already mentioned—the "high" culture of "art music" is the centre of attention in the two volumes, some authors do examine musical activity on a popular level. Thus Mahling devotes several pages to balls, spa concerts, military bands, and private or salon orchestras, and—in an interesting reversal—Hamm's article is based upon the "vernacular" tradition in the United States (with "art music" occupying the position of the Other). It stands to reason that the writers responsible for nations/regions (rather than cities) would tend to reserve some of their space also for discussions of folk music, if in part to document developments within "art music."

Both volumes provide a wealth of iconographic material that is interesting for scholar as well as general reader, ranging from photographs of a commemorative fan for Rossini (Rosselli) and of tickets for the premiere of Wagner's *Ring des Nibelungen* in 1876 (Deathridge) to a pencil sketch by Waldmüller for a Schubertiade (Wiesmann) and Schoenberg's 1910 portrait of Mahler (Banks). The volumes contain a wide range of composer portraits and caricatures, covers and title pages for compositions, scenes from concert halls and concert programmes, costume and stage designs for operas and important or characteristic paintings from the various national schools. To document the musical life of the "masses," or more precisely, of the bourgeois, the books include occasional illustrations of domestic music making, popular entertainments, and folk ensembles. It might have been useful for the editors to augment the few regional maps with more detailed maps of the countries and even cities

under discussion. Each book presents an extremely helpful chronology that lines up important events and dates for music, politics, literature, science, and visual art. The indices appear to be quite complete, and thus are very useful. Users should be aware, however, that institutions and performance facilities normally do not receive separate index entries, but rather are indexed under their respective city.¹⁴

One note in passing, about Canadian content, which—while by no means a prerequisite for a successful social history of music—nevertheless should be reconsidered in the context of this journal. The United States receives complete treatments in articles in both volumes, larger Latin-American countries such as Mexico, Cuba, Brazil, and Argentina are also covered in some detail for the entire 19th century, and there are even short paragraphs about music in smaller countries like Peru, Bolivia, and Uruguay. In this light, the complete absence of any treatment of Canada, whether as a country or as represented by its leading urban centres Toronto and Montreal, is puzzling. While it is true that Canadian musical culture had yet to develop a unique voice during the nineteenth century, the significance of musical production under distinctive conditions from Europe or the United States and the emergence of isolated attempts at giving expression to the Canadian experience in music should warrant inclusion of Canada in future editions of the series' nineteenth-century volumes.

The two Romantic-Era volumes of *Music and Society* are essential reading for anyone who deals with nineteenth-century music, whether as performer, audience member, researcher, or teacher. The various articles inform us well about the conditions under which the specific music we play, hear, study, and teach arose. Moreover, the very existence of this series can be regarded as testifying to the social foundations of music in general. Perhaps upon the basis of recognizing music in society we can also begin to understand the more problematic, yet potentially equally rewarding, concept of society in music.

James Deaville

Robert P. Morgan, ed. *Modern Times: From World War I to the Present*. Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice Hall, 1994. x, 464 pp. ISBN 0-13-590134-0 (hardcover), ISBN 0-13-590159-6 (paperback).

1. Robert P. Morgan, "The Modern Age"; 2. Mark DeVoto, "Paris, 1918-45"; 3. Douglas Jarman, "Vienna after the Empire"; 4. Stephen Hinton, "Germany, 1918-45"; 5. John C.G. Waterhouse, "Italy from the first World War to the Second"; 6. Michael Beckerman and Jim Samson, "Eastern Europe, 1918-45"; 7. Laurel E. Fay, "The USSR"; 8. Knud Ketting, "The Nordic Countries, 1918-45"; 9. Stephen Banfield, "England, 1918-45"; 10. Carol J. Oja, "The USA, 1918-45"; 11. Gerard Béhague, "The Hispanic World, 1918-45"; 12. Andrew Clements, "Western Europe, 1945-70"; 13. Detlef Gojowy, "Russia and Eastern Europe, 1945-70"; 14. William Brooks, "The Americas, 1945-70"; 15. Keith Potter, "The Current Musical Scene"; 16. Michael Tenzer, "Western Music in the Context of World Music."

¹⁴For example, the "Société Nationale de Musique" is indexed under "Paris" in Volume 2.