
Deborah Levine
lapses with the fourth essay, 'Exca-
ventions in Jerusalem - Review and
Evaluation', which would have pro-
vided a very useful introduction to
the rest of the volume by giving a
summary of the problems currently
under investigation. The articles
are of a fairly uniform length,
generally three or four pages. Some
topics can be summarized ade-
quately in this space but others
suffer from this restriction, such as,
for example, the essay on 'The
Lintels of the Holy Sepulchre.'

The black-and-white illustrations
which accompany the text (Fig. 1)
are of excellent quality, but they are
not numbered or referred to in the
body of the text; consequently, the
reader never knows when to look
for illustrations of particular points.
The four colour plates, on the
other hand, appear rather flat, al-
most like reproductions of water-
colours. The bibliography for the
entire volume consists of one page,
approximately thirty entries, with
no attempt to link these entries to
the individual articles. In addition,
most of the references are to the
periodical IEJ (Israel Exploration
Journal), but the meaning of this
abbreviation is not given anywhere.

On the positive side, the book
contains many maps, tables and
indexes which are clear and useful,
and the volume is printed on good
quality paper. A volume which goes
from pre-Davidic times to future
plans for a national park, referring
to such topics as the aqueducts of
Jerusalem, Islamic architecture,
Crusader Jerusalem and the Holy
Sepulchre, could suffer problems
of unity and cohesion, but this is
not the case, and the text flows
smoothly. On the whole the book
provides a very useful summary of
the archaeological problems under
investigation in the city of
Jerusalem to 1974. The reader is
given a picture which extends over
a wide period of time, wider than
one usually finds in an archaeologi-
cal publication, and the result is
comprehensive and coherent, and
more than a 'tourist manual.' Other
major cities of antiquity which are
still flourishing in the twentieth
century could benefit from a similar
treatment.

SHEILA D. CAMPBELL
Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval
Studies
Toronto

ELISABETH B. MACDOUGALL and
RICHARD ETTINGHAUSEN, eds. The
Islamic Garden. Washington, D.C.,
Dumbarton Oaks, 1976. 135 +
xxxvi pp., illus. $15.00.

The art of garden construction and
design is the most ephemeral of a
culture's efforts to force some as-
pect of its physical environment
into conformity to that culture's
idea of 'nature.' Scarcely any other
creation of man's architectural im-
agination is so vulnerable to ac-
cident or digression. Any gardener
knows that a single season's inatten-
tion can return his or her ordered
world to wilderness. And since
the basic components of garden design
— wood, water, grass, plant and
flower materials — are light and
flexible, no comparable physical
structure has lent itself with such
fluency to destructive transforma-
tions of taste. The international
garden Anglomania of the eighteenth
century, for example, virtually
eradicated the tradition of
the private formal garden in
France.

As a result, the garden historian,
far more than the art historian,
must work with secondary source
materials: ground plans, old
photographs, engravings, cartoons
describing a fête or plein-air theatri-
cal performance. The oppor-
tunities provided for archaeological
deduction are often considerable,
as F.H. Hazelhurst has dem-
onstrated in his brilliant recon-
struction of Le Nôtre's design for
the garden of the Archbishop of
Paris at Conflans. Nevertheless,
the emotion most frequently ex-
perienced by the garden enthusiast as
he or she surveys the history of the
subject is regret for so much that
has been destroyed.

Any serious attempt to interpret the
surviving fragments of civiliza-
tion's most exquisite contradiction of
perceived chaos must be wel-
come. For the past decade, the
Center for Studies in Landscape at
Dumbarton Oaks in the District of
Columbia has published the results
of a series of symposia discussing the
major, national garden tradi-
tions of the Western world. The
Italian, French and English garden
have been considered. The present
volume deals with the Islamic gar-
den.

The Islamic Garden offers the stu-
dent of garden history, and of
Islamic culture, significant rewards.
Not the least of these is Richard
Ettinghausen's cogent justification of
a selective cross-cultural, rather
than strictly regional, presentation of
the subject. Like Islam itself, the
Islamic garden exists as a nexus of
attitudes and responses which have
been translated into the visual lan-
guages of societies as diverse politi-
cally, and as distant physically, as
Umayyad Spain and Safavid Iran.
But while cultural idioms may have
varied, basic expressive relations-
ships — the relationship of artificial
to 'natural,' of garden setting to
architectural focus, of walled to
non-walled areas — demonstrate a
binding continuity over space and
time. The streams that nourished
the Islamic garden flowed out from
a single, central source, as Etting-
hausen suggests. The fact that the
five essays which follow the intro-
duction elaborate specific aspects of
this perceptive text imposes upon
the collection a thematic structure

not absent, certainly, from preceding volumes in the series, but less consciously developed in those earlier volumes.

Anne-Marie Schimmel's paper, 'The Celestial Garden in Islam,' analyses the unitive ideology of the Islamic garden. Working from a precise ground plan of Quranic reference and Arabic and Persian source materials, the author considers the significance to desert cultures of the paradise concept, the fusing of economic necessity and poetic impression in the careful management of water (always the dominant metaphor in Islamic gardens), and the symbolic use of fountain, tree and flower. Such anthologizing of primary assumptions, combining as it does impeccable scholarship with lucid literary style, offers both general reader and specializing student a valuable guide to the gardens of Islam.

Ralph Pinder-Wilson's essay, 'The Persian Garden: Bagh and Chahar-Bagh,' and William Hanway's study, 'Paradise on Earth: the Terrestrial Garden in Persian Literature,' focus developments of Islamic garden design through the imagery of a specific culture. Hanway's essay, indeed, although in places so densely argued as to be stylistically impenetrable, is especially noteworthy. His analysis of the relationships between the imagery of the poetic and the actual garden culminates in an ingenious demonstration of similarities between the literary rhythms of Sa'adi's Būstan (orchard) and Gulistan (rose-garden) and the structure of the chahar-bagh, the four-part, symmetrical Persian garden layout (Fig. 1).

The pleasure gardens of Muslim Spain and the garden palaces built by the Mughal emperors of North India have suffered most severely from the depredations of unsympathetic conquering cultures. What has been described above as the archaeological condition of the subject may account for the slightly labored quality of James Dickie's discussion of 'The Islamic Garden in Spain.' Dickie seems too often forced to analyse ruins rather than to describe gardens (glazed green and white tiles were found bordering the paths, which provides another link between the twelfth and thirteenth centuries. In addition, evidence was found of confining basins...') The author's scholarship is irreprouachable, but his style seems in general less evocative than that of Constance Villiers-Stuart, who explored the Moorish paradise gardens during the early decades of the twentieth century. The concluding essay in the collection, Susan Jellicoe's 'The Development of the Mughal Garden,' is an admirable précis of a subject which is treated fully in her co-authored publication The Gardens of Mughal India (1972).

A small but significant garden bibliography may be culled with a certain amount of application from footnotes in these volumes. Photographs are monochromatic and so severely reduced as to be frequently non-descriptive. This problem becomes serious when the reader is invited to refer to reproductions of complex palace and/or garden ground plans. The present volume has collected its illustrations at the end of the book instead of inter-leaving them with the appropriate texts, a practice found less effective by the present reviewer.

The student of the history of garden design may receive The Islamic Garden as an illustration of an attitude toward the manipulation of 'nature,' or may perceive it in the context of a universal human desire to distil order and 'beauty' (paradise) from the impinging facts of environment. The five essays collected here constitute a significant addition to, and an enrichment of, an already distinguished series of investigations into the ecology of the earthly paradise.

DEBORAH LEVINE
University of Michigan
Dearborn