The Cross-axial Houses of Samuel Maclure

Leonard K. Eaton

Volume 7, numéro 1-2, 1980

URI: https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1076875ar
DOI: https://doi.org/10.7202/1076875ar

Citer cet article
The Cross-axial Houses of Samuel Maclure

LEONARD K. EATON

University of Michigan

Victoria, founded in 1843 as a trading post and fort by the Hudson’s Bay Company, was in the late nineteenth century a curious combination of crude but flourishing seaport and sophisticated outpost of English culture. Despite its magnificent geographical situation, during its first few decades it seems to have presented many of the characteristic aspects of a frontier town: nondescript wooden buildings, muddy streets, and a general air of disorder. By the 1890s, however, economic prosperity, together with a peculiar set of social and political conditions, had overcome much of the urban disorder, and the city became a place of unusual architectural interest.

Initially Victoria’s economic base was its role as an entrepôt for the thousands of gold-seekers from all over the globe who streamed through in the 1850s and ’60s on their way to the fabulous fields of the Cariboo. More important in the long run was the vein of coal exploited by James Dunsmuir; until the early twentieth century it remained the backbone of Vancouver Island’s economy. Marketed in San Francisco, it was the basis of a huge fortune and what was, essentially, a private fiefdom. Most significant of all were the facts that until after the first World War Esquimalt harbour, adjacent to Victoria, was the headquarters of the British Pacific Fleet and that the city was the capital of the entire province of British Columbia. All of these elements contributed to the stable economy which is vital for a lively cultural life.

Socially the tone of the city was remarkably English. Martin Segger has put the matter neatly:

But the backbone of the social life by and large remained that select group of cosmopolitan immigrants whose lives, though often not their fortunes, had originated in Britain. Sea captains who had visited Victoria with the Royal Navy, … British civil servants who had retired from their administrative posts in the East, traders and businessmen who represented British interest in the Empire — all these were people who, though seeking their fortunes abroad, nourished their tenuous links with the motherland mainly through word of mouth and popular literature. The poetry and novels of the Victorian writers whose idealistic sentimentalism evoked a countrified nationalistic euphoria; the four-month-late Times, Punch or London Illustrated, and the long-awaited letters from home intensified this image in sentiment if not in fact.¹

It is not surprising, then, that the architecture of Victoria around 1900 presents a mélange of British and American forms, with the former predominating. Many of the expatriates showed a strong desire to be up to date with what was happening architecturally in the mother country when they built and furnished houses, and this inclination led to Victoria becoming a centre of the Arts and Crafts Movement. At the same time there was a great awareness of work in the United States, and one finds a certain number of buildings with a pronounced American flavour.

Among the architects prominent in the city during the boom years after 1900, the two most prominent were unquestionably Francis Mawson Rattenbury and Samuel Maclure. Of the pair, Rattenbury, an English immigrant, was the more flamboyant personality with the greater public impact. Today he is mainly known for his design of the provincial Parliament Buildings and the Empress Hotel. At his best with large civic buildings, he did only a handful of private houses. These were a specialty of Maclure, and the best of them have a quality which places them

¹ Martin Segger, Arts of the Forgotten Pioneers (Maltwood Museum, Victoria, summer 1971), unpaginated. Mr. Segger kindly provided a number of the illustrations.
high in the domestic architecture of that remarkable period on the Pacific Coast.

Born in the pioneer community of New Westminster, Samuel Maclure was the eldest son of a Scottish surveyor who had come to British Columbia to take part in the development of the country. A former officer in the Royal Engineers, John Maclure was for a time surveyor in charge of locating the line for the Collins Overland Telegraph, a project which was intended to carry telegraph lines north from British Columbia across the Bering Strait to Siberia and thence to Europe. It was abandoned when the first successful cable was laid across the Atlantic, but the elder Maclure's connection with telegraphy had a definite influence on the family. Samuel Maclure, his two brothers, and his two sisters all became expert operators, and for a time he apparently supported himself with this skill. His early ambition, however, was for a career in painting, and he thought of going to Germany to study. Apparently Maclure was, from a very early age, fascinated by the magnificent scenery and flora of British Columbia. He liked to draw, and in later years became a watercolourist of considerable skill. He is, in fact, one of the most pictorial of nineteenth-century architects. A view of Vancouver Island (Fig. 1) suggests his feeling for the watercolour medium.

A reversal in family finances made a trip to Germany impossible, and instead Maclure went east to New York and Philadelphia, enrolling at the Spring Garden Art School in the latter city. The reasons for his selection of this institution remain obscure. At the time it offered a combination of technical and artistic training. It taught mechanical and architectural drawing, and also offered such subjects as plumbing, heating, and metalwork. The combination of artistic and technical training may have appealed to Maclure. More important was the fact that Philadelphia was a centre of the diffusion of the new arts and crafts gospel according to William Morris. Maria Longworth, who was later to found the Rookwood Potteries, was active in the area.

Even more significant for the future development of Maclure was the presence of architect Wilson Eyre. Born in Florence in 1858, Eyre


3 Some of the biography is drawn from Ross Loft, 'Samuel Maclure, M.R.A.I.C., 1860-1926,' Journal of the Royal Architectural Institute of Canada, xxxv (1958), 114. This article, written by Maclure’s former partner, was for many years the most important source of information on him. In 1971 the Art Gallery of Greater Victoria published an exhibition catalogue by Leonard K. Eaton, The Architecture of Samuel Maclure (19 October –7 November 1971). This work attempted to bring him back to public notice. There is further discussion of his architecture in Martin Segger and Douglas Franklin, Victoria: A Primer for Regional History in Architecture (Victoria, 1979).
spent his first eleven years in Italy, and attended school in a variety of places, including Newport, Lennoxville, Québec, and Woburn, Massachusetts. He was briefly at M.I.T. and then in 1878 entered the office of James P. Sims, an elderly architect who specialized in the Queen Anne. In 1881 Sims died, and Eyre inherited his practice. He was immediately successful, and during the remainder of his career erected important buildings not only in Philadelphia but also in Detroit and New Orleans. Vincent Scully remarks that Eyre owed much to Norman Shaw and that he often used an English half-timber exterior, which was unusual in the mature buildings of the 1880s. A good example is his Charles A. Newhall house of ca. 1881, which uses a great deal of decorative half-timbering (Figs. 2, 3). Vincent Scully notes that Eyre's abstract rectangles, created with stripping and windows, turn the wall into a thin and articulated panel.4 Finally, he observes that the interior of the Newhall house shows a remarkable spatial richness and that there is a gallery around the entrance hall, which rises two storeys. In a sense it is this last motif which is most important.

We hasten to add that there is no positive proof that Maclure was affected by Eyre. He was one of the least verbal of architects, and the chief literary evidence for my contention comes from his partner, Ross Lort, who wrote: 'The impact of the eastern cities on him was so great that it was to this [architecture] that he turned and found in it what he wanted to do with his life.'5 It is worth noting, nonetheless, that Maclure fits neatly into that generation of architects who, maturing in the 'eighties and 'nineties, turned from painting to the building art. In Europe this group includes van de Velde, Saarinen, and Behrens. The comparison with van de Velde, who was so strongly affected by the Arts and Crafts Movement that he actually made a trip to London to call on William Morris, is especially close. In the case of Maclure he may have been powerfully influenced not only by Eyre but also by Bruce Price, who exploited the scheme in various projects of the 1880s.

Maclure's movements after his return to British Columbia in 1885 are a bit hard to trace. For a while he was on Vancouver Island giving lessons in drawing and painting, studying architecture, and earning his living as a telegraph operator on the Esquimalt and Nanaimo Railway. About 1887 he moved to New Westminster on the mainland and set up practice in partnership with an architect named Richard Sharp. The firm was successful, but most of its houses appear to have been in a rather Italianate version of the High Victorian Gothic. A good example is the Arthur Hill house of 1891 (Fig. 4). This is a two-storey structure, wood-framed, with decorative panels of scalloped shingles. A verandah, which includes a bay window under its roof line, runs across the western front. At the second-storey level there are two sleeping balconies, one at the west and

5 Lort, op.cit., 114.
one at the south. If there is anything unusual about the house, it is the lack of obvious historic ornament.

Maclure’s architectural personality began to emerge when he moved to Victoria in 1892. The first houses of which we have any convincing record in the city are two small dwellings which he built in 1897 on Superior Street for himself and for a local real estate man of modest means named Porter. The only surviving photograph of the Maclure house shows a modest building clad in shingles (Fig. 5). The Porter house may also have originally been shingled, but has been much remodelled. Of interest here is the fact that it was on a central plan with the rooms symmetrically arranged about a hall lit by a skylight. It might be considered a cross-axial scheme in embryo. H.S. Goodhart-Rendel has remarked that ‘this was a common nineteenth-century practice.’

Since Maclure’s work has already been the subject of a fair-sized exhibition with an accompanying catalogue, it seems appropriate here to discuss what was undoubtedly his outstanding architectural achievement: the development of an exceedingly strong and really unique cross-axial plan. The kind of space which resulted from this scheme was, as it is now clear from James D. Kornwolf’s excellent book on Baillie Scott, a primary objective of the Arts and Crafts Movement. Baillie Scott called it ‘the houseplace,’ and it was perhaps the single most important feature of his work, particularly in the period 1900–07. There are, in fact, so many parallels between the English architect and Maclure that one is tempted to propose a relationship between the two men. The latter’s houses, however, have a distinctly regional character that sets them off from those of Baillie Scott.

Maclure’s first venture into his highly personal type of cross-axial design was the Munn-Finlayson house of 1898–99 (Figs. 6–8). Harry Alexander Munn was born in Charlottetown, Prince Edward Island, and came to Victoria in 1883. At various times he was in the newspaper business, was a member of a real estate firm, and was a partner in a pharmacy. In 1897 he married Kate Morrow, and it is likely that the house was a bridal gift. A heart motif which appears on balconies, both interior and exterior, is a sentimental reference. In 1912 the house was sold to Sarah Finlayson, who lived there until 1939. For her Maclure carried through certain minor alterations, consisting chiefly of accommodations for servants who were housed beneath an extended balcony constructed across the rear elevation.


7 James D. Kornwolf, M.H. Baillie Scott and the Arts and Crafts Movement (Baltimore and London, 1972). See especially pp. 159–238. Baillie Scott’s work would have been known to Maclure through publications, particularly The Studio.
The basic plan and spatial arrangement were well preserved. An interesting feature of Maclure’s practice is that he very often did alterations to his own buildings, sometimes for the original owners, more frequently for their successors. This would seem to argue a remarkably strong local reputation.

The house presents a strongly cross-axial design, and is entered in the centre of the façade. Beyond the doorway is a balconied hall with a steeply rising staircase; the space is somewhat cramped in comparison with what Maclure was later to develop. The ground floor contains four rooms: kitchen and dining room on the north side, living room and drawing room on the south. In line, north to south across the second storey, are a bathroom, three bedrooms, and another bathroom. Here it is important to note that the most commonly used chambers usually received an eastward orientation so that the major view would be over the Straits of Georgia, and of land receding into water. This is a typical nineteenth-century pictorial concept. In fact, on at least one occasion, a client found Maclure literally up a tree studying the seacoast so that he might orient the master bedroom properly. At the same time it should be pointed out that the orientation of the Munn house was not only outward towards the view but also inward towards three handsome fireplaces: one in the living room, one in the drawing room, which originally had an inglenook surround, and one on the north side of the central hall. Probably influenced by the mild climate of Victoria and the English tradition of underheating, Maclure tended to rely on fireplaces to a considerable extent. In any event, in the houses we are discussing here, the spatial planning had a double focus: outward towards the landscape and inward towards the hearth.

The type of entry hall which Maclure began to develop in the Munn house became the distinguishing mark of his style in the next few years. A good example of the drama which he was able to create in these exciting spaces is in the Biggerstaff Wilson house of 1905-06 (Figs. 9, 10). On the exterior the shingles are replaced by Tudor detailing over a random ashlar foundation, but beyond the entrance lies a two-storey hall with a staircase and balcony of really magnificent quality. The woodworking is a masterpiece of joinery, and the great space is illuminated by windows filled with fine leaded glass. A space such as this can be seen as a backdrop for the extraordinarily elegant social life of pre-World War I Victoria. Down these staircases swept handsome women in elbow-length white gloves and Edwardian ball gowns. The city was actually the setting for a series of courts, and each of these had its own prescribed social rituals. It was, as we have said, the Pacific base of the Royal Navy, the headquarters of the Lieutenant-Governor of the province, and also the seat of an Anglican archbishop. Some idea of the elaborate entertainment which was a feature of life in the city can be gained from a newspaper story in the Victoria Colonist for 5 May 1907. It describes a party held in one of
Maclure's houses:

Mrs. J.H. Todd's beautiful residence, 'The Leasowes,' on St. Charles Street, was the scene of a merry dance last Friday evening, the 3rd of May. The color scheme throughout the apartments was yellow and green. The artistic hall was one gorgeous blaze of bloom artistically arranged in handsome brass shells. The supper table, which looked extremely dainty, was adorned with sparkling crystal lights, pale green tulle, and yellow primroses. Mrs. Todd welcomed her guests in a handsome gown of black lace. Miss Todd very striking in a cream lace empire dress, Mrs. Hobden Gillespie very handsome in a pastel blue spangled robe with a corsage of pale pink bantam roses, Mrs. C. Todd cream lace, Mrs. Robin Dunsmuir beautiful in green chiffon gown, Mrs. R.H. Pooley black lace empire over white taffeta, Mrs. Herchimer pale blue chiffon, Miss McQuade pale blue silk, Miss Gillespie pale pink, Miss Perry white crepe de chine, Miss Wigley lace over pale blue, Miss Cobbeit black, Miss Potts white chiffon over pale blue, Miss Arbuckle white silk, Miss Browne white liberty-satin, Miss Drake white, Miss R. Caudin pink silk organdy, Miss Mason white, Miss D. Mason white crepe de chine, Miss Monteith flowered chiffon, Miss L. Mason white, Miss P. Mason white, Miss T. Monteith white silk scarlet poppies, Miss Dupont chic costume of pale blue satin, Mrs. F. Pemberton white satin, Mrs. Muspratt Williams white satin, Miss Bryden white chiffon over pale green, Mrs. Genge dresden chiffon, Miss Arbuthnot white, Miss Savage chic pale green, Miss Hannington white liberty satin. Among the gentlemen were Messrs. Scott (Winnipeg), H. Gillespie, Rithet, Bell, Mason, Monteith, Gore, Heisterman, Pollen, Lauzon, F. Browne, J. Browne, Mackay (Winnipeg), Rochefort, Robertson, Foucher, Green, Colley, B. Green, Wright, Haggerty, LeVien, Crease, Dr. Hannington, K. Gillespie (Cowichan Lake), Fraser, Middleton, Potts, Ross, Stimpson, Col. Gregory, Col. Herchimer.

For such a party the balcony may very well have worked as a minstrel gallery in the old English tradition. It will also be noted that the absence of women's clubs in the city actually necessitated a great deal of entertaining at home.

Maclure's cross-axial planning reached complete maturity in a house built for Mr. and Mrs. John James Shallcross in 1907 (Figs. 11, 12). This remarkable dwelling stands well preserved on a high rock area which was once part of a five-acre estate. It commands an unobstructed view of the surrounding coastline, the sea, and the distant Olympic range; in every way this structure is a pictorial composition which relates to the major features of the surrounding landscape. The lower walls are of split granite boulders, while the boarding is of rough sawn pine stained with dark creosote. The roof is of cedar shingles painted a slate colour. The building is dominated by the imposing, expansive gable. Well-substantiated tradition has it that Maclure designed the sweeping roof, with its broad Wrightian overhangs, to suggest an image of a large, spread-eagled bird landing on the rock. This poetic conception originated with the Shallcrosses themselves, who were intensely interested in the Arts and Crafts Movement and in later years took a prominent part in the organization of the Art Gallery of Greater Victoria. Both Mr. and Mrs. Shallcross took an active interest in the building project, and the latter worked closely with Maclure on the furnishing of the interior.
While the Shallcrosses often entertained friends, business associates, and local dignitaries, they had no children, and hence the house was not designed for young people. Instead it was conceived as a setting for the entertainment of small groups, and two of the three bedrooms were for guests. What this meant in terms of programme and design was that the entrance was forced off-centre, and Maclure could dispense with the grand staircase, perhaps the most characteristic feature in his large houses. Instead he could concentrate on the development of the spatial core, which was naturally formed at the intersection of his two axes. The plan is therefore almost a square, with the two-storey living room at the centre, and the subordinate chambers on the periphery. As with the Munn house, the focus is both outward towards the superb view of the coast, which is today unhappily obscured by the growth of trees, and inward towards the hearth. As with the staircases in the larger houses, a certain formality in social ritual is indicated. One can easily imagine Mr. Shallcross and the gentlemen at a dinner party retiring to the smoking room to enjoy their port and their cigars.

At the centre of the composition, then, is a well of space, articulated by the marvellous wooden detailing of the balcony which runs around three sides of the interior (Figs. 13, 14). Maclure was probably as much fascinated by the possibilities of this material as the brothers Greene, but handled it in a very different way, much more English and less Oriental. And as the total design concept shows, he was as much interested in the cross-
axial plan as was Frank Lloyd Wright in his Willits house of 1902 (Figs. 15, 16). Where Wright, however, has a solid (a massive chimney) at the intersection of his axes, Maclure develops a pure core of space, rather like the two-storey volume of Wright's house for Isabel Roberts of 1909. Maclure's total composition is also much tighter and more compact than that of Wright. Instead of cantilevers emphasizing the extension of the horizontal line, Maclure's mass is actually very self-contained. He is, in fact, much closer to the cross-axial designs of Bruce Price, which have been discussed by Vincent Scully. It should be noted however, that Maclure was always an avid admirer of Wright. He corresponded with him, and purchased a copy of the great Berlin folio of 1910. In a sense his admiration is quite understandable. Both men derived from the same basic source — the Arts and Crafts Movement — but Maclure's development was entirely different from Wright's. With a clientele composed very largely of first- and second-generation English immigrants, he was naturally driven to exploit English sources.

Maclure's last major cross-axial design was done for a couple who were in many ways typical of his clients. Of English birth, Mr. Matthew P. Beattie was a successful Hong Kong businessman, who, on a visit to Victoria for his health, became enamoured not only with the scenery and climate of the West Coast but also with his nurse, Miss Evelyn Gibbs. The result was their marriage and the purchase of the Gibbs family property at Parksville on the east coast of Vancouver Island. On it they built in 1920-21 the structure known as Newbie Lodge (Figs. 17, 18). It is of interest that Maclure at first proposed a Queen Anne house, but at Mrs. Beattie's insistence he did a version of the Shallcross dwelling, with which she was familiar.

Located about 500 feet from the beach, the house is well sited on a gentle rise which overlooks the Straits of Georgia. Around each side and behind the house, tall fir and pine close in on what is now a hay meadow. As well as being a sportsman and hunter, Mr. Beattie was also an
enthusiastic gardener, and at one time the
grounds were extensively landscaped with trees
and shrubs brought from China. The structure
itself rests on a brick foundation, rather than
fieldstone, as in the Shallcross house, and the
wood detailing is, if anything, even more elabo-
rate. Mrs. Beattie relates that Maclure actually
advised them to use old cedar logs which had
been well seasoned in the swampy land to the
north of the house. These may possibly be the
great 10- by 10-inch piers which show up so
dramatically at the corners of the living rooms. At
the lower level on the exterior the Tudor half-
timbering has been transformed into a board-
and-batten finish over the wall studs, while the
triangles formed by the gables are clad in cedar
shingles. It is tempting to see Wrightian influence
in the overhang, but it may be noted that with
Wright this feature was originally devised to
protect the interior against the heat of a midwest-
ern sun. Here it sheds the rains which are so
common along the Pacific Coast. The original
colours were those common to Maclure’s other
rough cedar work – orange yellow board set off
with dark brown battens.

Like the Shallcross house, this one is built
around a central and impressive two-storey hall
with a huge fireplace in the north wall and a
balcony above (Figs. 19, 20). Since the Beattie
house has more depth in its east-west axis, the
balcony can extend completely around the cen-
tral living area. Also in contrast to the Shallcross
house is the fact that the Beattie house has
actually no front or rear in the conventional sense
of those words. Entrance from an automobile is
from the west. One goes through the vestibule
into the central hall and is then drawn to the east
balcony by the huge plate glass window which
affords the visitor a magnificent and un-
obstructed view of the distant sea and mountains.
In this way Maclure successfully unites the closed,
dark panelled interior space with the expansive
seascape of the site. The central hall and vestibule
have received typical arts and crafts treatment –
dark stained fr, heavy iron and brass hardware,
and a huge stone fireplace decorated with carved
foliage, in all probability done by George Gibson.
a talented artisan whom Maclure employed extensively in the last two decades of his practice. The other rooms are decorated in a Georgian manner. It is a pleasure to note that the house has been lovingly cared for by its present owners. The kitchen has been remodelled, and the east side of the upper balcony has been modified to make room for another guest room. Otherwise no alterations have been undertaken.

In Samuel Maclure, then, we have an interesting example of an architect who, because of the specialized conditions of his practice, was able to pursue the arts and crafts approach to design well into the twentieth century. It should be emphasized that we have here discussed only one aspect of his work: his extraordinary exploitation of the cross-axial plan, with which he probably first came in contact in Philadelphia and New York in the 1880s. Though far less a public personality than Rattenbury, his impact on the architecture of Victoria was no less deep and lasting. He had a host of followers, and today the extraordinary quality of several of the older residential quarters of the city is directly attributable to him.

8 Edward Gibson and Virginia Guest, 'British Columbia Architectural Carver George Gibson,' Canadian Collector, Jan.-Feb. 1980, 44-46. Gibson was a Scottish immigrant who did much important work around Victoria.

9 It is suggestive that, although Maclure had numerous followers, his cross-axial planning was never, so far as I know, imitated. Evidently it takes a remarkable architect and an unusual set of circumstances to make this concept work.