Onward! Canadian Expansionist Outlooks and the Photographs that Serve Them

Elizabeth Anne Cavaliere

Résumé de l'article
Produites en tant qu'archives visuelles venant appuyer le processus de documentation du paysage canadien, les photographies topographiques du XIXe siècle ont également été utilisées afin de soutenir des prises de position culturelles et politiques. Nous explorons ici les différentes utilisations faites des photos prises par Charles Horetzky des levés du Chemin de fer Canadien Pacifique, en traçant les changement depuis leur contexte de production jusqu’à leur inclusion dans une publication de George Monro Grant datant de 1873 et intitulée Ocean to Ocean : Sandford Fleming’s Expedition through Canada in 1872. Grant, un révérend presbytérien pour qui l’idée d’expansion était rattachée à des motivations religieuses, instrumentalisa ces œuvres afin de justifier ses propres perspectives expansionnistes. En suivant ces transformations, cet essai examine le rôle de la photographie dans le peuplement du Canada ainsi que dans la formation des perceptions de l'Ouest canadien.
Onward! Canadian Expansionist Outlooks and the Photographs that Serve Them

Elizabeth Anne Cavaliere

2015 UAAC Conference Graduate Student Essay Award
Prix pour le meilleur essai pour un doctorant ou une doctorante au congrès de l’AAUC de 2015

The Canadian Pacific Railroad was understood to be a symbol of Canadian expansion and settlement long before its construction began in 1881. Starting in 1871, the Canadian Pacific Railway Survey (cprs), under the stewardship of its engineer-in-chief Sandford Fleming, had been conducting studies to establish the best route for the railway—from the Rocky Mountains to a suitable terminus on the Pacific coast. Seventy-eight expeditions would be mounted over the course of the next eight summers and a wealth of documentation was produced—journals, correspondence, field notes, maps, sketches, and photographs.¹ This essay addresses a key moment in the history of the cprs, when not only the physical terrain but also the ideological potential of the railway were being mapped, constructed, and circulated through visual media.

In 1872, Fleming assembled a survey party to travel to the Peace River area of northern British Columbia. The party consisted of his sixteen-year-old son, Frank; Arthur Moren, a doctor; John Macoun, a botanist; Terry, a cook; Charles Horetzky, a “photographer etc.” and “ex-H.B. [Hudson’s Bay Company] Officer;” and, Reverend George Monro Grant, a Presbyterian minister, who served as “secretary.”² In addition to Fleming’s official Reports of Progress, which included the correspondence and field notes of expedition members, Grant published Ocean to Ocean: Sandford Fleming’s Expedition through Canada in 1872, Being a Diary Kept During a Journey from the Atlantic to the Pacific with the Expedition of the Engineer-in-Chief of the Canadian Pacific and Intercolonial Railways in 1873 (hereafter Ocean to Ocean). It is a polished version of the diary and notes he kept while on the expedition, accompanied by an introduction and conclusion, as well as a table that describes the expedition’s itinerary. The first edition of Ocean to Ocean contains sixty-one illustrations, of which twenty-seven are based on photographs.³ It was printed by George E. Desbarats, the publisher of the Canadian Illustrated News, who, like Grant, understood the informative potential of images in publications.⁴ In the inaugural issue of the Canadian Illustrated News in 1869, Desbarats had outlined his view of the importance of including visual material in print publications:

The imagination is so closely linked to the perceptive faculties, that the speediest and surest way of reaching the mind and impressing thereon facts and objects, is to lay them vividly before the eye (that main feeder of the imagination) either in their reality, or in the drama, or even through their image painted or engraved…. By picturing to our own people the broad dominion they possess, its resources and progress, its monuments and industry, its great men and great events, such a paper would teach them to know and love it better, and by it they would learn to feel still prouder of the proud Canadian name.⁵

2. George Monro Grant, Ocean to Ocean: Sandford Fleming’s Expedition through Canada in 1872, Being a Diary Kept During a Journey from the Atlantic to the Pacific with the Expedition of the Engineer-in-Chief of the Canadian Pacific and Intercolonial Railways (Toronto, 1873), xv.

Elizabeth Anne Cavaliere is a PhD Candidate in the Department of Art History at Concordia University—e_cavali@live.concordia.ca
The inclusion of illustrations in *Ocean to Ocean* adds a key layer to the conception and representation of the railroad within the socio-historic context of Canadian expansion and settlement. The changing uses of the illustrations, from the original contexts of Horetzky’s photographs to their adaptation, inclusion, and circulation in Grant’s volume as photolithographs and woodcuts, indicates that the usage and meaning of photographs was fluid. This essay examines the way in which the adaptation of Horetzky’s photographs in *Ocean to Ocean* is imbedded within Grant’s ideas of expansion and settlement and used in the shaping of perceptions and attitudes toward the Canadian West.

Horetzky was first assigned to a CPRS party in 1871 under Frank Moberly to explore the area between Fort Garry and the Howse and Leather passes. He was charged with observational tasks, leading small exploratory parties, and operating as a connection with Hudson’s Bay Company (HBC) outposts, of which he was a former employee. He also produced a series of photographs. Photography was a hobby that Horetzky had developed during his time as an HBC clerk at the Moose Factory outpost, and it is likely as a hobbyist that he produced photographs on the 1871 expedition. There is no mention of photography in either Moberly’s or Horetzky’s 1871 reports, nor a discussion of photography in any letters of employment and instruction to indicate that the photographs were being commissioned in advance of the survey. The same is true for his employment on the 1872 survey under Fleming. In a letter of instruction sent to Horetzky in August 1872, Fleming writes,

> Having every confidence in your energy and ability, I have to request that you will at once proceed to make an exploration through the country, and obtain by personal observation and enquiry as much information as it is possible to acquire within the present year… In addition to information obtained from personal observation, you will make full enquiries of parties who may have travelled in the country, respecting its mineral resources (especially coal and iron), the climate, depth of snow at different points, the extent of land suitable for settlement, quality of soil, etc., etc. You will report to me as full information as possible respecting the topographical features of the district you will traverse, having in view the opening up of the country by a trunk line or other lines of communication.⁵

This suggests that Horetzky’s primary goal was to observe and document the topography of the land, and there is no indication as to whether or how photographs would assist with the survey. Similarly, Horetzky’s report of March 15, 1873, in which he provides a detailed account of his route and the men he employed, as well as descriptions of the terrain and climate and measurements of distance, height, and pressure, includes no mention of the photographs he had taken.⁷ Nor is there any evidence in letters and reports to suggest that he was to take photographs that would subsequently be used to illustrate Grant’s *Ocean to Ocean*. Unlike the publication itself, which was planned from the outset with Grant’s participation in the survey, the inclusion of prints based on the photographs seems to have been an afterthought. It was, perhaps, because photography was relatively new and not very successful in the field of topography that it was not initially considered as a source for illustrations in *Ocean to Ocean*: survey photographer Humphrey Lloyd Hime had lost a selection of glass plates on his 1858 expedition, and on the 1871 Geological Survey of Canada, Benjamin Baltzly’s plates had had to be salvaged.
from a capsized canoe into icy waters. For Grant, it was fortuitous that Horetzky was attached to the survey.

When Horetzky himself was questioned about his role on the 1872 survey during the Canadian Pacific Railway Commission nearly ten years later, he responded,

Regarding the statement that I went out as a photographer, I can only say that it is utterly untrue, and so absurd as to scarcely require a denial. It is perfectly true that I took many photographic views during my numerous journeys, but I did so at first merely to please Mr. Fleming’s taste for fine scenery and to help embellish his [sic] book “Ocean to Ocean.” When United States officers of the Army Engineer Corps surveyed the route for the Union Pacific Railroad, some of them sketched the interesting scenery, but did not thereby lose their professional reputation as surveyors or engineers—in like manner did I photograph when the opportunity presented itself; but I did so merely to add to the general store of knowledge and may here say that I never received one cent for my trouble.

Horetzky considered himself a keen topographical observer, able to make precise measurements and thorough descriptions and assessments of the land. He did acknowledge, however, that his own photographs could have multiple uses: corroborate his observations, record “fine scenery” for Fleming’s benefit, or “add to the general store of knowledge.” He did not want it to minimize his role as an objective observer. Nevertheless, his photographs came to be imbued with nationalist, expansionist sentiments when framed by Grant in *Ocean to Ocean*.

Horetzky published his own writings based on his 1871 and 1872 expeditions with the CPRS: *The North-West of Canada; Canada on the Pacific*, which also appeared in the *Ottawa Citizen* on October 24, 1873; and an unpublished report dated 1873 submitted to the Department of the Interior and titled “Some Remarks upon the Indians of the North West.” These were not only descriptive records of the land that he was exploring and photographing but also explorations of the possibilities that lay within that land for resources and settlement. In the introduction to *The North-West of Canada*, he writes,

Now that the subject of emigration is beginning to attract the attention it deserves, a brief but comprehensive description of the immense territories inhabited at present by a comparatively few nomadic Indian tribes, will not be out of place, and may assist the efforts of our Emigration Agents in Great Britain and on the Continent of Europe.

Horetzky’s descriptions are organized and dense. He catalogues topography, resources, and inhabitants in order to form an opinion regarding the suitability, advantages, and challenges of particular routes. None of his publications contain images.

This discrepancy between the photographer’s stated intention and subsequent uses of the photographs, both historic and contemporary, is compounded by the tensions between art and document that are inherent in the photographic medium. In the Canadian context, Joan Schwartz has examined the works of survey photographer Humphrey Lloyd Hime in order to point to the ways in which the study of images can reveal historical context. According to Schwartz, a photograph as visually empty as *The Prairie on the Banks of the Red River, Looking South*, which depicts only sky, flat land, and a horizon line, can be seen as a reflection of political and cultural ideas about Canadian expansionism, and of changing attitudes toward the prairie—from a place that is hostile, arid, and empty to one that is understood as being safe, fertile,
and suitable for settlement. Schwartz’s reading proposes that photographs should be read beyond their subject: in an examination of context the photograph can be understood as both a “form of visual representation” and an “act of visual communication” in which meaning is both invested in it and generated by it. The illustrations inspired by photographs in Ocean to Ocean have been invested with meaning by the context in which they are presented and they provide an additional, valuable visual layer to Grant’s narrative. Grant produced several publications in his lifetime, mainly based on sermons and lectures. He is perhaps best known for Ocean to Ocean and his subsequent Pictoresque Canada: The Country as it Was and Is, first published in 1875 by Art Publishing Company and distributed in serial form by subscription, then republished by Belden Bros. in 1882 as two volumes. Both publications have received scholarly attention for the readings they provide of nationalism and the formation of an early Canadian identity. However, while the heavily illustrated Pictoresque Canada has been examined for its visual information, the illustrations in Ocean to Ocean have been almost completely overlooked.

The physical book is hardbound and small in size, 371 pages in length, and easily held in one hand. The large amount of visual and textual information contained in such a small format is indicative of the intended audience of Ocean to Ocean. In his preface Grant addresses his reader directly as “the public.” This was not a publication intended as simply a record of the journey but rather something that would be widely read and perhaps even used as a guide for travellers and settlers. The inclusion of many illustrations would have further heightened popular interest. In his preface Grant writes, “The illustrations are mainly from photographs and on this account may be considered of special interest.” Even though photography may have been deemed risky as a topographical tool, Grant’s emphasis on photographs as a source taps into a growing popular interest in photography and is a reminder to us today of the fact that these images were produced at a transitional moment in the history of the illustrated book in Canada.

Ocean to Ocean contains prints based on eleven photographs by Horetzky, five of which were taken on his previous expedition in 1871 under Moberly. Of the remaining fourteen source photographs, I have identified through comparison to archival photographs that nine are by Benjamin Baltzly, taken during his 1871 trip with the Geological Survey of Canada; three by Frederick Dally; a still life that can be attributed to Robert Bell; two unidentified still lifes that are indicated to be from photographs but, unlike the other twenty-five illustrations from photographs, are described as woodcuts in the publication’s list of illustrations; and one landscape that remains unattributed. That fewer than half of these are based on Horetzky’s photographs—even though he is the only photographer credited within the publication—and nearly half of those from a different surveying expedition, further reinforces the notion that the meaning of photographs is fluid: Grant carefully selected photographs from a variety of sources that could be used to reflect the particular message he was shaping in Ocean to Ocean.

While none of the illustrations inspired from photographs are specifically addressed by the text in Ocean to Ocean, they are nonetheless placed within it and therefore derive meaning from and add meaning to it. Like Fleming, who

---

12. Ibid., 105.
13. George Monroe Grant, Pictoresque Canada (Toronto, 1875); George Monroe Grant, Picturesque Canada: The Country as It Was and Is (Toronto, 1882).
16. Grant, preface, Ocean to Ocean, 1.
was not shy about advocating for Canadian expansion in his writings in the journal of The Canadian Institute, of which he was a founding member, Grant too was set on the benefits of expansion and settlement of the West. During the late 1860s, he had been a strong advocate for Confederation in Nova Scotia, believing that a national Presbyterian Church would be established as a direct outcome of unification. In his conclusion to Ocean to Ocean, he prayed God would give Canadians the characteristics they needed to settle the interior and the West: “A great future beckons us as a people onward. To reach it, God grant to us purity and faith, deliverance from the lust of personal aggrandizement, unity, and invincible steadfastness of purpose.” For Grant, the push for expansion and settlement was tied to religious motivations.

Suzanne Zeller, a historian of nineteenth-century Canadian science and culture, has suggested that in order “to deal with the perceived preeminent tasks of the Victorian age,” expansionism and the unification of Canada relied strongly on both human and natural resources. Zeller argues that the task of inventorying was definitive in the formation of Victorian Canada and of the “natural theology” that she sees as characteristic of Victorian science. This finds resonance in Grant’s thinking and in his decision to include prints inspired by photographs in Ocean to Ocean. Photography was central to the process of inventorying. It allowed surveyors to keep visual records of elements ranging from the smallest botanical specimen to the largest mountain range with unparalleled fidelity. Further, to empirically and visually organize the landscape is to assert a perceived control and dominance over it. Grant’s emphasis that certain plates were from photographs, as indicated in his list of illustrations, relies on this understanding of photography as a tool for inventorying and for claiming place. The making and circulation of photographs participated in the activation of human resources that Zeller explains was necessary in the process of Canadian expansion and unification. Grant’s emphasis that “the illustrations are mainly from photographs and on this account may be considered of special interest,” brings together his awareness of a growing popular interest in photography and of the medium’s potential to carry a particular message about the importance of people in the process of settlement. This is reaffirmed in his conclusion, in which he writes, “It is not our poverty of land, or sea, of wood or mine that shall ever urge us to be traitors. But the destiny of a country depends not on its material resources. It depends on the character of its people.”

This reading of Grant’s Ocean to Ocean points to an alternative to the US notion of manifest destiny, which is sometimes inaccurately applied to the Canadian context. In the United States, manifest destiny meant a belief that the land was given by God to people for the taking. In Canada, however, as Grant saw it, the land was already there, and the gift from God to the Canadian people was the fortitude and strength of character to settle the land. This makes sense in the timeline and context of Confederation, which was essentially the coming together and connection of already established centres, if we accept the Metropolitan thesis put forth by Canadian historians such as Harold Innis, Donald Creighton, and J.M.S. Careless. If there was a driving message for the Canadian people during this moment, it was not that of a westward push as in the United States, but of settlement in the spaces between centres.
Figure 1. *Salmon Cover, Nasse River, British Columbia,* after a photograph by Charles Horetzky, in George Monro Grant, *Ocean to Ocean* (Toronto, 1873), pl. 61. 20.5 x 15 cm. Photo: University of California Libraries, www.archive.org/details/oceantooceansandogranich.

Figure 2. Charles Horetzky, *Salmon Cove, Nasse River,* b.c. looking north, January 1873. Positive paper silver albumen, 14.9 x 20.2 cm. Ottawa, Library and Archives Canada, Sir Sandford Fleming collection, c-815604. Photo: Library and Archives Canada.
The use of photographs, then, can be seen as embedded within Grant’s understanding of God and settlement. In nearly all instances, the images in the publication show some aspect of human intervention on the landscape. For example, the engraved frontispiece of the book, *Salmon Cover, Nasse River, British Columbia*, [fig. 1] is based on a Horetzky photograph. [fig. 2] However, in *Ocean to Ocean*, four figures that do not appear in the original photograph have been added, revealing how the translation to engraving allowed for the inclusion or editing out of resonant details. With these figures, the focus shifts from the land to people, from landscape to scene of industry and settlement. Cart trails, fishing, campsites, forts, and settlements are prominent in *Ocean to Ocean* as signposts of human presence in the landscape. There are prints in which there are no human figures, such as *Mount Cheadle* from a Baltzly photograph or *Forks of Skeena River* [fig. 3] from a Horetzky photograph, which both depict large and impressive mountain peaks. However, these too bear the trace of human presence, endeavour, and fortitude. Mount Cheadle had already been explored and mapped, and the Rocher Déboulé range near Hazelton, pictured in *Forks of Skeena River* was set to become the site of large mining operations. Baltzly’s and Horetzky’s original photographs may have appealed to Fleming’s “taste for fine scenery,” but in their mediated forms, as selected and shaped, they also spoke to Fleming’s and Grant’s expansionist ideas of settlement.

The only instance in which Grant discusses at some length a specific location that is illustrated in *Ocean to Ocean* is regarding *Jasper House (looking towards Roche à Mielette)* [fig. 4]. To be clear, he is describing the location, not the original photograph nor the plate. Grant writes,

> A good photographer would certainly make a name and perhaps a fortune, if he came up here and took views. At every step we longed for a camera. … The most wonderful object was Roche à Myette [sic], right above us on our left. … Mighty must have been the forces that upreared and shaped such a monument. Vertical strata were piled on horizontal, and horizontal again on the vertical, as if nature had determined to build a tower that would reach to the skies.⁴

There are two key points to be made here. The first is that Horetzky took the photograph not during the 1872 expedition with Fleming and Grant, but rather on his 1871 trip with Moberly. This explains why Grant would be longing for a camera, since a photographer did accompany the 1872 expedition. Second, Grant’s discussion of the formation of the range is significant. Unlike the ideas of catastrophism that shaped perspectives on the formation of geological features in the Clarence King surveys in the United States for instance, and, to a lesser extent in the thinking of Canadian figures such as J.W. Dawson, Grant believes that the mountain has been formed by natural, not divine, forces. This reinforces the suggestion that, for Grant, the land was already there, to be settled by humans whose strength and ambition had been given by God. This reading also indicates that Grant believed in the human capacity to explore, conquer, and settle even the most vast and mighty mountain ranges. Indeed, Grant’s contemplative and awe-inspired tone is quite different from Moberly’s, who had been at Roche à Miette the previous year. In his account, Moberly detailed the hardship experienced by his team when exploring the range. Historian I.S. MacLaren further notes, “To read his [Moberly’s]

---

unpublished account of the toil involved in the survey disabuses one of any romantic illusions of the beauty of mountainous terrain to a surveyor.\textsuperscript{25}

The impact of \textit{Ocean to Ocean} on the broader Canadian consciousness echoes Grant’s ideas of settlement and can be assessed through contemporaneous reviews of the book, which can be found in the \textit{Canadian Illustrated News}, \textit{The Canadian Monthly and National Review}, and \textit{The Monthly Record of the Church of Scotland in Nova Scotia, New Brunswick and Adjoining Provinces}. For example, \textit{The Canadian Monthly and National Review} reads,

> The writer is enthusiastic with regard to the capacities of Manitoba for farming, and treats hostile Indians, mosquitoes and locusts as myths, and the winter, if not as a myth, yet as pleasanter, according to universal testimony, than that of Ontario, Quebec or the Maritime Provinces.\textsuperscript{26}

A reviewer in \textit{The Monthly Record}, a publication to which Grant was a regular contributor, writes,

> It may be the result of our idiosyncrasy, but we cannot help owning that deeply as “Ocean to Ocean” has interested us in its character as containing a revelation of a country hither-to unknown to us,—it has interested us still more deeply as containing a revelation of the character of its author. It is much to know that the new Dominion has in Manitoba and “The great Lone Land” room boundless in extent for the reception of emigrants; a fertile soil in some parts, amazing mineral wealth in others, \textit{inexhaustible} forest or fishing resources in others, and desirable homes for one or other description of people in nearly all; and that its varying capabilities in these respects are so described in this volume that the traveller can fix upon his destination beforehand, and shape his course accordingly with unhesitating confidence in the veracity of his informant.\textsuperscript{27}

As both these excerpts indicate, peopling the Canadian interior was a central concern. And the illustrations based on photographs came to serve as visual corroborations of the expansionist narrative in which Grant had placed them.

However, this is not the only framework in which Horetzky’s photographs have been used. His photograph of Roche à Miette, for instance, is currently found in a number of important photographic collections, all from various historic origins: in the Glenbow Museum collection of Horetzky photographs;

\begin{figure}
\centering
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{Forks_of_Skeena_River}
\caption{\textit{Forks of Skeena River}, after a photograph by Charles Horetzky, in \textit{George Monro Grant, Ocean to Ocean} (Toronto, 1873), pl. 59. 20.5 \times 15 cm. Photo: University of California Libraries, www.archive.org/details/oceantooceansandogranrich.}
\end{figure}
in the *Fort Garry to Jasper House Album*, part of the Sandford Fleming fonds at Library and Archives Canada; in the *Photographic Albums of Canadian Settlement*, part of the Department of the Interior fonds, also at Library and Archives Canada; and in the *Peace River Album* held at Vancouver Public Library. These are collections and albums that served purposes private, public, and governmental quite different than Grant’s publication, with Horetzky’s photographs finding a unique reading in each.²⁸

As this study indicates, Grant had a specific vision for the photographs, carefully selecting them and altering them to show human presence and industriousness on the landscape as markers of God’s desire for settlement of the Canadian interior. The photographs, however, are secondary to his account of the expedition: the second edition published in 1877 includes only six illustrations, none of which are based on Horetzky photographs, and no explanation provided by Grant regarding his choice to so drastically reduce the number of illustrations. That the photographs were not made specifically for *Ocean to Ocean* is perhaps the greatest reflection of the malleability of photographs to mediate between text and image, vision and meaning. This quality has made them a powerful tool, allowing Grant, in this instance, to adapt the image to communicate a specific conception of Canadian settlement. Perhaps, though, this can be traced back to Horetzky himself, in the disimpassioned stance he took toward his own photographic practice: after all, he did suggest that he took photographs “merely to add to the general store of knowledge”—however that knowledge came to be shaped. ¶

---

28. For more on the readings of photographs in albums and archival collections see Martha Langford, *Suspended Conversations: The Afterlife of Memory in Photographic Albums* (Montreal, 2008).