

Renaissance and Reformation
Renaissance et Réforme



Bloch, Amy R., Carolyn James, and Camilla Russell, eds. The Art and Language of Power in Renaissance Florence: Essays for Alison Brown

Paula C. Clarke

Volume 43, numéro 2, printemps 2020

Transformative Translations in Early Modern Britain and France
Traductions transformatives dans la première modernité française et britannique

URI : <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1072205ar>

DOI : <https://doi.org/10.33137/rr.v43i2.34836>

[Aller au sommaire du numéro](#)

Éditeur(s)

Iter Press

ISSN

0034-429X (imprimé)

2293-7374 (numérique)

[Découvrir la revue](#)

Citer ce compte rendu

Clarke, P. (2020). Compte rendu de [Bloch, Amy R., Carolyn James, and Camilla Russell, eds. *The Art and Language of Power in Renaissance Florence: Essays for Alison Brown*]. *Renaissance and Reformation / Renaissance et Réforme*, 43(2), 351–354. <https://doi.org/10.33137/rr.v43i2.34836>

© All Rights Reserved Canadian Society for Renaissance Studies / Société canadienne d'études de la Renaissance; Pacific Northwest Renaissance Society; Toronto Renaissance and Reformation Colloquium; Victoria University Centre for Renaissance and Reformation Studies, 2020

Ce document est protégé par la loi sur le droit d'auteur. L'utilisation des services d'Érudit (y compris la reproduction) est assujettie à sa politique d'utilisation que vous pouvez consulter en ligne.

<https://apropos.erudit.org/fr/usagers/politique-dutilisation/>

érudit

Cet article est diffusé et préservé par Érudit.

Érudit est un consortium interuniversitaire sans but lucratif composé de l'Université de Montréal, l'Université Laval et l'Université du Québec à Montréal. Il a pour mission la promotion et la valorisation de la recherche.

<https://www.erudit.org/fr/>

des notices offertes, il ne peut qu'être happé par cet univers estudiantin, par l'incroyable richesse d'informations proposées. Ainsi, il a la possibilité de suivre les études de droit à Padoue des frères Du Tillet, Élie, Jacques et Jean, qui obtiennent, pour les deux derniers, leur doctorat en droit civil à Bologne, tandis qu'Élie finalise ses études en France, à son retour. Des étudiants célèbres, tels Michel de L'Hospital ou Pomponne de Bellièvre, croisent les fils du franc-comtois Nicolas de Granvelle, bras droit de Charles Quint, mais aussi d'une foule d'inconnus et de personnages hauts en couleur. En fait, et c'est ce qui fait tout l'intérêt de cet imposant ouvrage, c'est non seulement un nouveau regard qui est offert sur le monde universitaire au siècle de l'humanisme, mais c'est aussi un fourmillement d'informations qui est nous est livré à travers cette étude, à la fois sur l'histoire sociale, culturelle, religieuse et politique du temps. Érudit, précis, foisonnant, ce livre est une somme dotée de quatre index et d'une liste des ouvrages cités en abrégé. Véritable plongée dans les entrailles du monde universitaire du XVI^e siècle, ces trois volumes forment désormais une référence obligatoire pour tous ceux qui souhaitent travailler sur l'histoire de ces institutions et, plus largement, sur tous ces jeunes hommes qui ont étudié en Italie et qui ont par la suite animé l'histoire de l'Europe, de l'humanisme, et qui constituent la matière vivante de l'histoire des idées.

MARIE BARRAL-BARON

Université de Franche-Comté

Bloch, Amy R., Carolyn James, and Camilla Russell, eds.

The Art and Language of Power in Renaissance Florence: Essays for Alison Brown.

Essays and Studies 42. Toronto: Centre for Reformation and Renaissance Studies, 2019, Pp. 452 + 21 colour ill. ISBN 978-0-772756-59-6 (paperback) \$49.95.

This book is a product of a symposium held in 2015 at the Monash University Centre in Prato to celebrate the immense contribution that Alison Brown has made to the history of Renaissance Florence, particularly for the late fifteenth century. The book begins and ends with two appreciations of Brown's work by people who know her well and whose own work overlaps with hers: Roslyn

Pesman and John Najemy. Both offer insightful analyses of the themes and implications of Brown's work; Najemy also provides a critique of Brown's vision of the role of the Medici in Florence's evolution from a "dependent commune" in the fourteenth century to an "independent dominion" in the fifteenth. Nevertheless, as he points out, such critiques in no way detract from the importance of Brown's provocative and innovatory work.

Between the essays of Pesman and Najemy are ranged sixteen essays by individuals with a personal and/or professional connection with Brown. Twelve of these essays discuss issues related to fifteenth-century Florence, and often engage directly with Brown's work; three deal with sixteenth-century subjects; and the last describes the evolution of Renaissance Italian studies in twentieth-century London, where Brown developed as a historian. The articles are divided into three broad sections: "The Political and Social Milieu of Renaissance Florence," "Art in Political and Ritual Contexts," and "Humanism, the History of Ideas, and Intellectual Life: From Renaissance Florence to Twentieth-Century London." In a short review of this sort, it is not possible to give adequate attention to all of these contributions; instead, only a brief description will be attempted.

Within the first section, Luca Boschetto provides convincing proof of the illegitimacy of Niccolò Machiavelli's father, Bernardo, and reflects on the ramifications this had for Niccolò's political career and psychology. Francesco Guidi-Bruscoli analyzes the manner in which Lorenzo the Magnificent's political goals in Rome, and particularly the marriage of his daughter to Innocent VIII's son, affected the fortunes of the Rome branch of the Medici bank. He concludes that, while the marriage improved the bank's prospects, it also required the bank to extend large loans to the pope and his son, thereby undermining its financial viability. Nevertheless, we are left with the question of whether Lorenzo's political success, particularly in having his son Giovanni raised to the cardinalate, was not in the end more important for the Medici family than the bank's financial failure. In the next article, Lorenzo Fabbri delves into the question of Lorenzo the Magnificent's responsibility in depriving the Pazzi family of the vast fortune of Giovanni Borromei, generally regarded as a factor behind the Pazzi conspiracy of 1478. While Fabbri accepts Lorenzo's responsibility for the passage of the law that decisively ruled against the Pazzi, he also places this law in the wider context of women's extensive legal disabilities in Florence. Andrea Guidi draws a parallel between Brown's study of the

Florentine chancellor Bartolomeo Scala and Guidi's own analysis of how a later chancery official, Angelo Marzi da San Gimignano, extended the Medici's control over the Florentine bureaucracy, even using official documents to single out enemies of the Medici for punishment. Fabrizio Ricciardelli supports Brown's view of increased political repression under Lorenzo de' Medici by tracing growing Medici control over the judicial system and the imposition of harsher punishments, such as execution. Finally, within this section, Jérémie Barths revisits the question of Machiavelli's meaning when, near the beginning of *The Prince*, he states that he will not discuss republics because he has already done so at length elsewhere. Bathas's conclusion that Machiavelli was referring to the theoretical introduction he had helped compose for the law establishing the Florentine militia is a novel proposal, if not completely convincing.

Opening the second section, Riccardo Fubino provides an interesting Hermetic-Kabbalistic interpretation of the portico frieze in the Medici villa of Poggio a Caiano, arguing that it reflected the (condemned) ideas of Giovanni Pico della Mirandola. Amy Bloch suggests that the decision to place Michelangelo's giant David in front of the Florentine Palazzo Vecchio may have been determined by the *gonfaloniere a vita*, Piero Soderini, acting through a Corbinelli relative of his. Jonathan Nelson discusses the conventions regarding donor portraits in altarpieces, concentrating on the unusual case of the Malatesta Altarpiece designed by Domenico Ghirlandaio, in which one of the donors, Elisabetta Aldobrandini, overturned these conventions to make an unusual statement about a woman's personal authority. The final contribution to this section, by Eckart Marchand, argues for the importance of ephemeral sculptures during the Renaissance, and the possibility of their gaining an after-life in more permanent structures or in literary records.

The third and last section opens with an emphasis by Gabriele Pedullà on an aspect of Machiavelli's political thought which has received increasing attention in recent years: his acceptance of the permanence of conflict in political life. Simone Testa relates the pragmatic views of Giovanfrancesco Lottini on papal elections to Brown's identification of a shift towards amoral values among Lorenzo the Magnificent's "new men." Maia Wellington Gahtan offers a window into sixteenth-century concepts of history through an analysis of Cesare Ripa's constructions of allegorical forms of *Historia*. Stefano Baldassarri asks why Giannozzo Manetti's *Against the Jews and the Gentiles* deals so little with Jewish thought, and finds the answer in Manetti's desire to write instead

a eulogy of the Christian religion. Maria Fubini Leuzzi analyzes Vincenzo Borghini's intellectual development through a discussion of the books listed in his *Ricordi*—i.e., those he possessed or acquired while outside Florence in 1541–45. The final entry is Camilla Russell's description of the development of Italian Renaissance studies in London during the twentieth century, as mentioned above.

This collection of essays thus engages with many diverse areas of history, from politics and art to ideas and mentalities. It reflects Brown's own wide-ranging interests and suggests how broad her influence has been on other scholars of Renaissance Florence.

PAULA C. CLARKE
McGill University

Bolzoni, Lina et Alina Payne, éd.s.

The Italian Renaissance in the 19th Century. Revision, Revival, and Return.

I Tatti Research Series 1. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2018. 552 p. + 134 ill. ISBN 978-0-6749-8102-7 (broché) 45 US\$.

Ce beau et fort volume, de plus de cinq cents pages richement illustrées, inaugure la collection « I Tatti Research Series » aux presses universitaires de Harvard. Il fait suite à un colloque qui a eu lieu à la Scuola Normale Superiore di Pisa et à la Villa I Tatti en 2013 et ayant réuni, outre des spécialistes de la Renaissance, un nombre appréciable de dix-neuviémistes. Toutes substantielles, les contributions, dont près du tiers est en italien, abordent un éventail impressionnant de sujets, relevant aussi bien de la musicologie, de la sculpture et des arts décoratifs que de l'architecture, de l'histoire de l'art et de la littérature. Les éditrices voient dans cette variété thématique un reflet de leur objet d'étude : même strictement limitée à son acception *italienne*, la Renaissance dont elles se proposent d'analyser la « présence » dans le XIX^e siècle européen correspondrait à une référence complexe, fragmentée et, à certains égards, contradictoire — laquelle ne recouvrerait même plus, sur le plan axiologique, la valeur universellement positive que lui assurait, par tradition, le discours humaniste. Aussi cette référence — ou cet ensemble de représentations — se recommanderait-elle