Renaissance and Reformation
Renaissance et Réforme

Gagné, John. Milan Undone: Contested Sovereignties in the Italian Wars

Amanda Madden

Aller au sommaire du numéro

Découvrir la revue

by contrast, Burton responds directly to (indeed, on) the final page inscribed by her grandmother. The interpolation of extraneous documents here seems at odds with the ethos and pathos of the source, which Camden articulates so well: "in writing in her grandmother's journal she [Burton] is aspiring to a proximity and protection, touching as it were the hand that penned an account of God's protection" (70). That touch, achieved with material ease in the original, is somewhat dulled by a thick weave of textual addenda in this collection.

Assembling, modernizing, annotating, and contextualizing such a diverse anthology—by many hands, in several genres, and including previously unpublished work—is nonetheless a major accomplishment. The presentation of these materials as a familial archive counterbalances our tendency to decontextualize historical texts by viewing them in isolation as the products and possessions of individual authors, rather than as part of a larger community or intergenerational inheritance. Similarly, the non-elite status of the creators of the Franklin family papers counterbalances the mass of such survivals, which disproportionately derive from higher-status people. On the whole, this volume offers a rich and complex resource for historians of early modern religion, urban life, the family, and life-writing to discover and further draw out.

LEAH KNIGHT
Brock University

Gagné, John.
Milan Undone: Contested Sovereignties in the Italian Wars.
I Tatti Studies in Italian Renaissance History. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2021. Pp. xvi, 452. ISBN 978-0-6742-4872-4 (hardcover) US$94.95.

As John Gagné says in the introduction to his new work, "as much as scholars have chased the history of the modern state by asking after its genesis or origins, there has been little talk of its failures, collapses, and stillbirths" (7). One might think that the study of state formation would offer nothing new, but Gagné brings something fresh to the perspective by homing in on these collapses and what he terms as the "surfeit of sovereignty" in the first three

decades of the sixteenth century. While this concept could be applied to the Italian peninsula as a whole, he focuses on Milanese sovereignty between the critical years leading up to Spanish domination, specifically between 1499 and 1535. As Gagné points out, Milan endured nine changes in government in three and a half decades and thus is a laboratory for what happened when the state-formation project failed. Using an impressive collection of sources, *Milan Undone* presents a tangled thread of a half-finished, unrealized state. The book reads much like an archaeological dig with various strata revealing the effluvia of various attempts to assert sovereignty.

In particular, Gagné separates sovereignty from legitimation by recognition—something that was particularly important to the parvenu Sforza dynasty, who were conscious of their own recentness, particularly in comparison with their Visconti predecessors and the French royal family who claimed Milan by virtue of marriage into the Visconti family. While the French were not parvenus, their claims to superiority did not result in a superior government. The French regime was as chaotic and disruptive as Sforza rule and included the continuity of corruption and exploitation. Ultimately, Gagné argues, "the fractured polity—just as much as the healthy one in the process of consolidation—reveals how power relations functioned and what profound social fracas could produce or destroy" (262).

The book is divided into three parts. The first, "Politics," focuses on what Gagné refers to as the temporality of the state, the urban environment, and the delegitimizing of the Sforza, respectively. Chapter 1 takes up the intriguing premise that time was a political weapon to be used as an instrument of sovereignty, particularly when considering the legitimacy of a regime. The French alluded that their overlordship of Lombardy dated back to the Gaulish invasion and as a result they were more native to Milan than many of the Milanese. In addition to these ancient origins, they dated their more concrete contemporary claims to Milan from the lineage's descendants from their marriage into the Visconti. Because the Sforza could not claim such illustrious beginnings, Lodovico Sforza articulated his competing claims by focusing on the future of the Sforza dynasty, particularly in his lengthy last will and testament which specified a highly detailed vision for his son, Massimiliano. Despite this temporal articulation of sovereignty, however, almost no differentiation can be made between the apparatuses of the state in these competing regimes.

As he argues in chapter 2, these slippages between regimes imprinted themselves on the urban environment not in the embellishments of coats of arms (although these existed) but in the unbuilding, as with each regime change the other sought to undo the previous regime's alterations to the urban landscape. These attempts to undo were another form of delegitimization of the Sforza. Chapter 3 makes the case that part of the reason for the success of the French regime was its ability to construct the Sforza as no longer politically and culturally relevant. Not only were they able to paint them as irrelevant but they successfully represented the Sforza as a "dead-end dynasty in several ways: unproductive, unhealthy, unclean, and not even particularly Italian" (79). According to this view, the once vigorous Sforza dynasty became a watered-down version of itself with each generation, culminating in the death of Francesco II without legitimate heirs.

The second part of *Milan Undone*, "Property," switches to the complex property transactions that undergirded sovereignty. As he notes in chapter 4, the overlord "giveth and taketh away" property from subjects confiscating land and confirming land rights as considered expedient. He examines several cases of contested lordships brought about by the conflicting regimes, including the case of Simone Arrigoni (1462–1507), one of the Lombard elites who battled with both the French and the Sforza over privileges and succeeded with neither. As examined in chapter 6, parties who faced similar dilemmas of disenfranchisement petitioned and sued their sovereigns. Families like the Attelani petitioned the Sforza for restoration of property and rights confiscated by the French, while families like the Sanseverino allied themselves with the French in order to avoid the fate of the Sforza. In neither case were the petitions to any avail. Elite families who faced similar fates often employed desperate strategies, and as chapter 6 shows sometimes the documents which proved rights and conferred legitimacy were forged or simply destroyed, which only resulted in further confusion or chaos.

Part 3, "People," examines subjects and citizens, including the elite, the church, and the citizens. As pointed out in chapter 7, there was a Sforza diaspora who fled to other states, including Mantua and Venice, while the French were in power, and this fact was to have wider political consequences as networks of exiles formed. As chapter 8 shows, these consequences were to have an impact on the Holy Church. French political networks also had their own viral influence as evidenced in the prophecies of the mystic Arcangela Panigarola

(1468–1525) who linked French victory to a cosmic reform. At the end, however, neither the exiles nor the mystics were most impacted by the confusion and chaos of these regime changes. Instead, it was the citizens who suffered poverty, famine, and displacement.

From genealogical scrolls, to beards, to weapons restrictions and trenches, Gagné draws from an incredibly impressive range of evidence: so much so that this reader sometimes found themselves losing the thread. *Milan Undone*, however, puts forward an intriguing premise, and Gagné more or less successfully makes the case that in order to understand state formation, we should also look at the states that collapsed.

AMANDA MADDEN
George Mason University

Gay, David.
Gifts and Graces: Prayer, Poetry, and Polemic from Lancelot Andrewes to John Bunyan.
Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2021. Pp. xiv, 209 + 8 b/w ill. ISBN 978-1-4875-0528-8 (hardcover) $70.

At first glance, the "prayer, poetry, and polemic" of David Gay's subtitle may seem a grab bag of key topics, but from the first pages of the book Gay lays out a clear and compelling line of inquiry, showing both how the three topics interrelate and how they together inform a key question of seventeenth-century English literature: How is it that Christian poets who (from our vantage point) agreed on so much doctrine were so radically and creatively divided on the most basic religious activity, prayer?

Gay responds to the tendency in recent work to emphasize the commonalities across confessional divides by keeping central the conflict between those who used set prayers and those who insisted that only extemporaneous prayers could be valid. But crucially to his argument, he attends to the generative effect of this conflict, showing how the poetry (broadly defined as imaginative writing) of Lancelot Andrewes, George Herbert, Jeremy Taylor, and Henry Vaughan on the one side, and John Milton and John Bunyan on the other, was spurred by the question.