
J. Donald Wilson

Approaches to the History of Urban Reform
Numéro 2-76, octobre 1976

URI: https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1019539ar
DOI: https://doi.org/10.7202/1019539ar

Citer ce compte rendu

https://doi.org/10.7202/1019539ar
Chapter I is supposed to treat the historical background to current urban questions. However, at least one-third of the chapter is not historical at all, and the historical section is so disjointed and lacking in continuity as to be almost useless. The few historical illustrations are well chosen, but there are too few of them.

In brief, this book cannot be considered recommended reading. [J. Donald Wilson, University of British Columbia].

* * *


The author has chosen seven major Canadian cities - Montreal, Vancouver, Edmonton, Winnipeg, Toronto, Ottawa, and Halifax - and for each sets forth a case study of a representative, large-scale, "superblock" development. For example, Place Ville Marie has been chosen for Montreal, and Place de Ville for Ottawa. The facts surrounding each development are laid out including the jockeying for position between developers on the one hand and interest groups and city government on the other. It is part of the author's technique to raise probing questions as part of his narrative, and thus the book might well serve as a senior high school text in urban geography.

One might easily criticize Collier's choice of developments for his case studies, but clearly in a book of this length he had to be selective. In general his cases are well chosen with a view to representing various types of confrontations between developers and city governments. The style is clear and straightforward, the approach consistent allowing for easy comparison, and various themes are followed through in each of the seven studies. The book is well illustrated, but more street maps should have been included. Street names and intersections
are mentioned throughout the text, but no maps are present to aid in pin-pointing location.

A final point: the title is very appropriate indeed. These modern "monuments", as Collier calls them, are indeed the cathedrals of our day, just as the Moscow subway is to Moscovites. [J. Donald Wilson, University of British Columbia].