Bird's-eye view of Cobourg, Ontario, 1874.

SOURCE: Archives of Ontario, Toronto.
Review Essays/Notes critiques

Cities and Regional Development

Gerald T. Bloomfield


As Mark Jefferson remarked in 1931: “Cities do not grow up of themselves. Countrysides set them up to do tasks which must be performed in central places.” This bold assertion has been challenged by later interpretations of urban development, and the complex economic growth mechanisms of cities and regions have been explored in a very substantial body of literature in economics, geography, planning, sociology and, more recently, in urban history. The economic growth mechanisms and linkages provide a dynamic element in the rise and decline of urban systems. The importance of these increasingly invisible linkages is most obvious when a city and its regional economy are failing. In Jefferson's time, the devastating effect of the severance of cities from their hinterlands was very evident in Danzig, Trieste and Vienna where the redrawing of national boundaries after the Versailles settlement truncated the service areas of these cities. In our time, major political shifts have affected cities as varied as West Berlin, Dacca, Hong Kong and Saigon. At a more gradual pace, the effects of deindustrialization may be observed in the retreat of the world hinterlands and diminution of markets in such old 'workshops of the world' as Glasgow, Manchester, Liège, Pittsburgh and Detroit.

The relationships of cities and regions rarely remain unchanged for very long. Some urban élites have always been quick to recognize the vital importance of pilgrimages (and now conventions), civil administration, commerce and industry in the process of city building and the maintenance of economic health. The economy of cities has to be continually made and refashioned by hinterland expansion, promotion and the offer of various types of incentives. Within the competitive framework of economic possibilities, there is always scope for individuals and institutions to shape the form and spatial pattern. In the present age, widely adopted innovations such as limited-access highways, containers for multi-modal shipments and the new telecommunications are directly or indirectly transforming cities and their hinterlands. Electronic transfers of funds and the “800” toll-free telephone service may eventually have as profound effects on the lower orders of the urban system as mail order catalogue retailing and chain stores had earlier in the century.

Gilbert Stelter's recent paper serves both to remind us of the importance of the regional context for urban history, and also to emphasize the past significance more generally of the city-and-region theme in urban studies. The scientific and scholarly study of the functions of cities, their external relations and the linkages between regional economic growth and urban development has a long tradition in several disciplines. Many of the earlier varied threads of research were drawn together by R.E. Dickinson in his important synthesis City, Region and Regionalism (1947) and in the next two decades major collections of papers were published on urban geography, economic development and urbanization which emphasized all the essential elements and their connections. A brief overview of the very extensive literature on cities and regions suggests at least five major themes of interest:

1) The concept of cities as points of integration and interaction in trade and other activities was fully recognized by early travellers such as Daniel Defoe and was one of the earliest themes approached by geographers (such as Kohl, 1841; Ratzel, 1882), economists (Stewart, 1805; Cooley, 1894), economic historians (Gras, 1922) and sociologists (Kolb, 1913) in their search of explanations for the location of economic activities and cities. An interest in the rise of large primate cities was the foundation of the study of metropolitanism, a theme very familiar to Canadian academics.

2) The economic functions of urban centres were appreciated by sociologists and urban planners at least by the 1920s. In the next decade the application of economics
methodology to small areas resulted in the development of urban economic base theory and the notion of economic multipliers and measurement. Such techniques of analysis and the later development of input-output studies, as well as the functional classification of places, provided both additional context and new methods in planning research. 

3) Community of interest, especially the identification of centre and hinterland from rural hamlets to metropolitan cities, was an important focus of work in sociology, business studies and, later, geography in the interwar period. A substantial body of case studies of newspaper circulation zones, tributary areas of retail establishments and journey-to-work was developed and this material now has a renewed interest as a benchmark against which to measure change in the past 50 years.

4) The formulation of location theories for industries (Weber, 1909), central places (Christaller, 1933) and the general economics of location (Losch, 1940) had a gradual influence on the perception of how all the functions interacted as well as the effects of transport costs in both production and marketing. The ideas of cities within hierarchical systems of cities partly evolved from location theory, and for geographers, provided the means to assess cities and their regions in a more elaborate form.

5) A parallel development of theory and practice in the economic development of regions evolved from several concerns. Ideas of how regions grow and how declining regions can be revived sprang from the study of depressed areas, regional income disparities and the post-colonial interest in developing nations. Among the many key ideas were export-base theory, sectoral growth theory (the notion of locally induced economic development in related stages) and Myrdal’s notable work on circular and cumulative causation. Rostow (1960) developed a scheme of stages of economic growth which aroused major interest and debate. Other historical studies examined the economic background of settlement on the new frontiers which linked in with the traditional Canadian emphasis on the staples.

Regional economic change can have a darker side in the centralization of control, and the draining away of capital and skills at critical times of readjustment. The problems of the exploitation of the periphery by the centre are now addressed in the study of dependency theory.

The more precise formulation of generalizations, linking the themes of city and region in a dynamic sense which could relate directly to urban history, came in the mid 1960s with the publication of a major synthesis by Wilbur Thompson. The lines of linkage between a city economy and the outside world were clearly developed and elaborated. Allan Pred added features to the growth model, especially the significance of the role of innovations in inducing change, and set the work in an historical framework and perspective. James Vance, in a masterly series of diagrams and brief explanatory text, linked central place theory with a mercantile model of settlement. This integration of ideas and methods on cities and regions has directly or indirectly inspired new studies in the last decade.

The three books under review reflect different aspects of the city and region theme. None of the books can be regarded as urban history in its viewpoint, but each may provide some linkages and insight into the important issues which interest students of the city and the frameworks in which cities function.

The Regional Structure of the Canadian Economy was designed for students of contemporary events in Canada with a focus on the reasons why the Windsor-Quebec City corridor has always been more prosperous than the other regions of the country. Subsidiary questions include the regional variations in the efficiency of investment in job creation, the shift in employment structure from resource extraction and manufacturing to ‘human value services’ such as education, health care and personal services and the possibilities of challenging the hegemony of the core region.

Two basic models of economic development, namely the staples approach and Rostow’s stages of economic growth, are developed in the first chapter and applied in subsequent chapters to Canadian economic growth from c.1500 to the late nineteenth century and to the period of the ‘branch plant economy’ to the 1950s. The central part of the book is devoted to a regional analysis of trends in the three decades since 1950. A basic model relating population increase to investment is outlined and then, combining data on investment, jobs and population, is used to show the sectoral and regional direction of investment as well as the extent to which investment was translated into actual population increase across the regions. Predicted results in population growth are then shown against actual intercensal increase. The results show a greater variation from the expected patterns in the 1960s and 1970s as the economy became more complex and as world changes gathered momentum.

The two final chapters conclude with points on the very important shifts in employment to a service sector dominance, the role of government intervention in attempting to moderate regional disparities in income and the fundamental problems of the regional structure of the Canadian economy. The authors, geographers at the University of Alberta, are intrigued by the possibilities of challenging the heartland of southern Ontario and Quebec. Had the investment boom of the 1970s been sustained unbroken for another two decades, Alberta might have achieved the appropriate
threshold of population and investment to become a Canadian equivalent of California.

Many readers will be disappointed in the absence of any explicit statement about the roles of cities as integral nodes within the spatial economic system and as control points of investment. Entries such as metropolitan (dominance) and urban (growth) are absent from the index; references to cities are incidental. To some degree this omission reflects the relative coarseness of Statistics Canada data on investment, but the role of cities in regional economic development and change surely requires some emphasis in a work of this type. Urban historians are likely to find Regional Structure of the Canadian Economy too abstract. What is meant by ‘investment,’ beyond the actual billions of dollars shown in some diagrams? How was the capital generated? How much foreign investment was there? What were the roles of financial institutions and metropolitan cities? These and other practical questions are left for the reader to ponder without guidance. Some telling case studies would have given the book much more interest from the perspectives of geographers, historians and other readers. Canada’s position in world trade and investment flows is largely absent and references to the larger body of work on regional development are sparse. The scale of this book is too broad to see the general and the particular relationships of cities to their regions.

Although regional geography has been traditionally regarded as the centre of the discipline the practice and writing of regional studies, especially at the national scale, is notoriously difficult to achieve in an interesting and challenging form. Most of the previous textbooks on the regional geography of Canada have taken a systematic view of the component elements such as population, environment and political framework, and then followed these with a survey of major regional characteristics across the country. Larry McCann has broken with the traditional form and offers in this volume a provocative interpretation, attempting to capture “... the essence of the evolving pattern of heartland and hinterland and the factors which have shaped regional character” (p. 31). Heartland and Hinterland stresses the importance of economic processes in shaping the varied regional structure of Canada.

The volume is organized in four parts and thirteen chapters. McCann in the first chapter sets out the framework for regional analysis. All the key concepts of heartland and hinterland, processes of economic development, linkages between the macro-economic forces and the urban system are succinctly outlined within a strong context of historical evolution. McCann achieves a powerful synthesis in this splendid introduction. For the most part McCann’s agenda is followed by his fourteen contributors — a major achievement for any group of academic writers.

Robert Galois and Alan Mabin contribute to the second part of the introduction with a chapter entitled “Canada, the United States and the World-System: The Metropolitan-Hinterland Paradox.” This is a remarkable essay, integrating several big ideas with good fresh examples in only 25 pages. Neophyte student and jaded teacher can read this chapter with pleasure and insight.

The Canadian economic heartland of southern Ontario and southern Quebec is covered in three chapters. Don Kerr describes the development over two centuries to 1950, while the changing problems of Canada’s ‘Main Street’ over the next thirty years are discussed by Maurice Yeates. The final chapter on the heartland, by Eric Waddell, breaks the primarily economic orientation of earlier sections to focus on cultural issues and the place of Quebec in North America.

Seven chapters and about sixty per cent of the whole book are devoted to the hinterland regions. Graeme Wynn leads with a major chapter on the geography of fragmentation and underdevelopment in the Maritimes. The distinctiveness of economy and society on the Atlantic margins is the focus of Michael Staveley’s essay on Newfoundland. Brenton Barr and John Lehr examine the development process in the western interior while Peter Smith illustrates the growth of post-war Alberta. British Columbia is examined by John Bradbury as a metropolis and hinterland in microcosm. Northern regions are discussed in two separate chapters. Iain Wallace covers the Canadian Shield and Peter Usher examines the territorial north.

Cole Harris has the last word in a concluding chapter on regionalism and ends on a note of the cultural differences which have shaped the evolving regional chapter of the country.

Heartland and Hinterland has been very well received since it was published three years ago. It is unashamedly an interpretation, refreshingly different with its strong emphasis on economic causation in an historical-geographical context. The book has certainly broken new ground in the organization of regional geography. Obviously no single volume can do justice to all possible themes and some reviewers have been less than fair in their criticisms. Given the explicit focus on the book, it is unreasonable to expect very much more on the environmental constraints of the Canadian ecumene or to demand an emphasis on the varied landscapes of the country and regions.

There are some criticisms to be made. Experienced readers will have no difficulty in making the transition from the introduction to the heartland and hinterland sections. The inexperienced reader, and this book was designed as a text for undergraduates, may well find that there is an unbridged gap. Ideally the gap should be closed by another two or three chapters in the same succinct form as the introduction. Some key points which need to be included are: the dynam-
ics and patterns of internal and international migration movements in Canada, one of the key measures of economic change and opportunity; and the basic fabric of the national economic geography, to define the heartland/hinterland divisions more sharply. The excellent maps in McCann’s first chapter need the support of a longer exposition. Similarly, elements of the basic flows of people, freight and electronic messages need to be illustrated. Finally, the sense of scale and linkages of the urban system, which provides so much of the integration of the space economy, ought to be presented as a base for the subsequent regional discussion.

The regional scale of metropolis and hinterland within the chapters is unevenly developed. Alberta and British Columbia are very well conceived and executed; others such as Quebec and the Maritimes are weaker. Some traditional urban and port hinterland maps could have enhanced the ideas of functional regions. The heartland chapters are a little disappointing. Somehow the linkages within the Windsor-Quebec City axis are poorly developed, and the role of Toronto and Montreal as national centres is less well developed here than in Kerr’s earlier work. Details of the size and dynamism of these two metropolitan cities and their extensive suburbs are also missing. The small scale maps are too limited to do justice to the physical spread, dynamism and growing significance of places such as Mississauga and Laval.

Most of the authors of the hinterland chapters convey a strong sense of exploitation by the heartland. Wallace’s chapter on the Shield, for example, makes several important points on the organization of the resource-based economy by metropolitan interests and the problems which result from such dependency and limited local initiatives. This is clearly an important theme which requires a more comprehensive and explicit introduction at the beginning of the book. Aspects which should be considered include: relative investment flows, the costs of serving the distant areas of the periphery, dependence on cyclical resource prices and foreign competition in resources production. The federal government’s role in the amelioration of conditions through transfer payments, subsidies and incentives offered by the former Department of Regional Economic Expansion needs a more prominent place in the book than merely being part of the chapter on the Maritimes.

Two chapters, the one by Waddell on the place of Quebec in North America and Cole Harris’s conclusion on regionalism, fit awkwardly in the otherwise well-planned structure of the book. Both studies have a strong cultural geography focus and therefore tend to sit uncomfortably with the economic interpretation of the whole book. The concluding chapter is a fine essay in its own right but is out of place here. The theme which has been followed fairly carefully from the outset is not drawn together as an integrated conclusion.

Heartland and Hinterland is a valuable interpretation, certainly of great interest to urban historians. It is also an important statement on the methods and approaches of contemporary geographical work. As with any effective book it should serve as a pointer towards further work with a focus on regional studies. Larry McCann and his contributors deserve congratulations for this challenging and very well produced study.

Gerald Friesen’s book on a classic ‘hinterland’ region surveys the history of the Prairies from the pre-history of the Indians to the early 1980s. This is a masterly study in regional history, clearly placing the events, issues and movements not only on the varied surface of the great inland plains, but also in their national and international context. Specialists and general readers will find much pleasure and insight in this volume.

The huge area of 750,000 square miles, large enough to encompass most of western Europe, is the setting for the evolution of the native and European fur trade and the tentative beginnings of permanent settlement. A chapter on Canada’s empire 1870-1900 describes central Canada’s perception of the West as a new investment frontier, which would have the ultimate goal of mile after mile of homesteads shipping out grain and livestock and providing new markets for the factories of central and Maritime Canada. Subsequent chapters cover some of the disappointments with the grand design which took so much longer to implement and involved higher costs than first anticipated. Friesen has a deft touch with issues as varied as the Riel uprising, the Dominion Lands Act, freight rates and the beginnings of cities. He paints a tidy portrait of Calgary in, “rather than a ‘cowtown’ with whiskey and revolvers, as American images would suggest . . . was built upon the tea, the gymkhana and entrenched wealth” (p. 238).

Urban historians should enjoy the chapters on the cities, resources towns, frontier camps and the rural areas. The commercial role of Winnipeg is outlined as is the successful work of the lobbyists in promoting new centres. Friesen has a very good sense of the urban hierarchy on the Prairies and how it worked. His section on the grain system and the futures trading on the Winnipeg Grain Exchange is a model of clarity.

Most of The Canadian Prairies is devoted to the development of the region up to 1940. The penultimate chapter covers the last forty years of political and economic change in the new west. Contrasts between Saskatchewan and Alberta are specially highlighted. The successes of Manning’s policies in the control of national gas and Lougheed’s later strategies to secure larger royalties for the province and local entrepreneurs illustrate the ability of local groups to redirect income from the distant corporations in order to secure more regional control. Friesen manages to encapsulate these big issues in a brief space and yet to retain detail.
of people, institutions and policy without recourse to the abstract and colourless generalizations noted earlier in the Regional Structure of the Canadian Economy.

Friesen has achieved a magnificent synthesis in a single volume, balancing the rich detail with a well-defined but unobtrusive structure of major issues and broad context. All the qualities of this fine book were deservedly recognized in the award of the Canadian Historical Association's Sir John A. Macdonald Prize.

Urban history as a field of knowledge in which many disciplines converged, was one of the hopes of Jim Dyos in the 1960s. The study of cities and regional development is one theme in urban history which can be enlightened and advanced by cross-disciplinary understanding and co-operation. While the general mechanisms of linkage and interaction of cities and regions are understood, their value and significance needs to be more widely diffused and adopted. At the same time the abstract models need life and colour. How did things work? Who were the people and institutions who made them work? The possibilities of research and the integration and synthesis at the regional scale have been clearly enhanced by the works of Gerald Friesen and Larry McCann and his contributors.

NOTES


13. Valuable summaries of work in the regional development field may be found in: W. Isard et al, Methods of Regional Analysis (New York, 1960); H.S. Perloff, E.S. Dunn, E.E. Lampard and R.F. Muth, Regions, Resources and Economic Growth (Baltimore, 1960); H.W. Richardson, Regional Growth Theory (London, 1973). This was one of the first major works to integrate urban and regional economics which were both rapidly expanding fields in the early 1970s.


16. The extensive literature is reviewed in W.L. Marr and D.G. Paterson, Canada: An Economic History (Toronto, 1980).


