

Newell, Dianne and Greenhill, Ralph., *Survivals: Aspects of Industrial Archaeology in Ontario*. Erin, Ont: Boston Mills Press, 1989. Pp. 225. Illustrations, select bibliography, and index. \$39.50

Larry McNally

Volume 18, numéro 3, february 1990

URI : <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1017730ar>

DOI : <https://doi.org/10.7202/1017730ar>

[Aller au sommaire du numéro](#)

Éditeur(s)

Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine

ISSN

0703-0428 (imprimé)

1918-5138 (numérique)

[Découvrir la revue](#)

Citer ce compte rendu

McNally, L. (1990). Compte rendu de [Newell, Dianne and Greenhill, Ralph., *Survivals: Aspects of Industrial Archaeology in Ontario*. Erin, Ont: Boston Mills Press, 1989. Pp. 225. Illustrations, select bibliography, and index. \$39.50]. *Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine*, 18(3), 264–265.  
<https://doi.org/10.7202/1017730ar>

## ***Book Reviews/Comptes rendus***

modernization folk antecedents, and provides a valuable understanding of baseball's relationship to the English game of rounders. For these reasons alone it is a valuable read for baseball enthusiasts, but in many other ways the book fails to deliver on its promises.

Kirsch may be too ambitious when he suggests that "this volume also presents a complete narrative and analysis of early American cricket." Cricket is given much less space than baseball and even less analysis. The reader becomes aware that in the post Civil War period cricket's popularity lags far behind that of baseball, but Kirsch never seems to say exactly why. In the chapter dedicated to both games in the war years, he has the perfect opportunity to suggest some possibilities as to why baseball was the preferred game among the troops. Was the short duration of a baseball game more convenient than the three day cricket matches? Was this fact also a reason why working men in the post war years preferred baseball?

Kirsch could have provided a greater understanding of cricket by including some mention of the scholarly works on the game by British historians such as Keith Sandiford and Brian Stoddart. The reader would have been made aware that British cricket was not an industrial sport, but a game which was codified in the Georgian period under the direction of a leisured aristocracy and, therefore, never intended to be convenient for working men. Without understanding that English cricket was a game where the division of labour on the pitch was class based, and that wealthy batters hired professional fielders, the debate over pay for play in American baseball and cricket seems confusing. Kirsch may be

forgiven for the lack of current secondary sources he employs in his discussion on baseball - few exist - but the high quality of analysis employed by historians of English leisure, and especially cricket, would have supplied him with needed background, and a wide array of skilful analytical approaches to sports history in general.

Throughout the book, the reader is asked to accept that baseball became the preferred game in America, but while this is true, Kirsch never really explains why. He is dissatisfied with Adelman's modernization theory, but offers no real alternative. Was it that Americans preferred their own game, or was it that the influx of non-British immigrants into the industrial centres of the north meant that there were fewer and fewer devotees of cricket as compared to baseball players?

There are some valuable aspects to this book, not the least of which is the discussion concerning the diaspora of baseball throughout the entire country. The spread of the game is diligently researched and presented with charm. Kirsch provides lighthearted stories of early games, such as contests between fat and skinny players, in a manner which conveys the good natured approach to baseball in its infancy. Other volumes in the "Sport and Society" series have offered powerful social analysis - Kirsch, however, fails to provide the type of analysis which would explain baseball's incredible popularity and the inability of cricket to generate the same interest in the post Civil War period. In fact, it is never clear why, if not for direct comparative purposes, Kirsch chose to incorporate the early histories of both games in the same work.

James W. Martens  
Dept. of Humanities and Social Sciences  
Red Deer College

Newell, Dianne and Greenhill, Ralph.,  
*Survivals: Aspects of Industrial Archaeology in Ontario*. Erin, Ont: Boston Mills Press, 1989. Pp. 225. Illustrations, select bibliography, and index. \$39.50.

This attractive book is the joint effort of two long time workers in Canadian engineering and technological history. One is Dianne Newell who has also had a long interest in industrial archaeology. She wrote *Technology on the Frontier: Mining in Old Ontario*, which was published in 1986. Ralph Greenhill is a noted collector and writer on photography. His major interest is the history of engineering which led to *Engineer's Witness*, published in 1985. For this book each author has produced five essays, each one with 7 to 10 pages of text and 10 to 14 pages of photographs, both historical and modern. As Newell acknowledges in her introduction, the book is actually about their favourite sites in southern Ontario. Their selection starts with the Rideau Canal and covers Grand Trunk Railway bridges and stations, the Hamilton Pumphouse, Gooderham & Worts Distillery (Toronto), soap factories in London and Guelph, the Whirlpool Rapids Bridge (Niagara River), the St. Clair Tunnel (Sarnia), and the Peterborough Lift Lock.

The book deals almost exclusively with structures. The exceptions are two interesting essays by Newell on belt and line shafting and on the jerker rod system for pumping Lambton County oil wells. Power transmission, though vital to

industry, has been badly ignored by historians of technology. The type of transmission system used certainly influenced the size, construction and layout of equipment and factories. Newell is to be congratulated for starting to look at this neglected topic in Canada.

The overall concentration on large, spectacular structures and systems has created a bias in favour of masonry, steel and concrete structures, such as Gooderham & Worts, the Whirlpool Rapids Bridge and the Peterborough Lift Lock. As many of these structures are "monumental," they do not reflect the common practice or usual forms used in Ontario. Few ordinary structures or industries are discussed in the book. For instance woodworking only appears as part of the chapter on belt and line shafting.

The selection of large masonry structures at the beginning of the book also emphasizes the British tradition of permanence. The American influence is not detectable in the early period perhaps because American structures were wooden and very susceptible to fire and change. The American influence is more apparent later on as engineering became more of a science.

The Canadian contribution in the early days, according to the authors, is in bringing together various technological elements and adapting them to Canadian conditions. Even when structures were almost entirely imported, Canadian superintending engineers, contractors and workers were crucial to the success of the project. This fact has not been appreciated often enough especially for structures such as the Victoria Bridge. It was the turn of the century before

Canadian engineers began to design and build their own significant structures such as the St. Clair Tunnel and the Peterborough Lift Locks.

One of the strengths of the book is the use of visual images. Photographs show what a structure looked like at a given time, its evolution, its relationship to the surrounding environment and important details of its construction. The historical photos have been selected with great care and Greenhill's own photos bring the story of each structure up to date.

By using only text and photos, the industrial archaeology in *Survivals* becomes quite "soft". There is only one recent map and diagram in the book. Missing are diagrams of structures and machinery, tables giving dimensions or capacities, and lists of equipment or processes employed. Information of this type would have given this book a harder edge and made it more valuable as a source of engineering and technical history. It would have also made it useful for comparisons with similar structures in Canada or elsewhere in the world. Within the chosen format, however, the authors have produced a beautiful and useful introduction to industrial archaeology in southern Ontario.

Larry McNally  
Manuscript Division  
National Archives of Canada

Welsted, John Everitt, John, and Stadel, Christoph, eds. *Brandon: Geographical Perspectives on the Wheat City*. Regina: Canadian Plains Research Centre, University of Regina, 1988. Pp. xv, 224. 33 figures, 16 plates, 10 tables.

*Brandon: Geographical Perspectives on the Wheat City* was created by members of Brandon University's Geography Department to commemorate the twenty-fifth anniversary of their department and is dedicated to its founder, Dr. John Tyman. This collection of eleven essays by present and former members of the department and a provincial urban planner attempts to describe and explain the development of this prairie urban centre from geographical points of view. The underlying theme of the book is that the fortunes of Brandon cannot be considered in isolation from the region in which it is located. This emphasis on the relationship between this particular urban centre and its immediate hinterland reflects the geographers' traditional interest in the region, a perspective recently advocated by urban historians such as Chad Gaffield and Gilbert A. Stelter, who argue for a regional approach to the study of urbanization.

The first three chapters provide a standard geographic description of the setting. John Welsted describes the site and situation of Brandon and lists the themes discussed in the subsequent essays. In the next chapter, Welsted outlines how the shape and form of the Assiniboine Valley and the flow characteristics of the Assiniboine River have influenced the development of the city. This introduction is followed by a description of the climatology of Brandon and its surroundings by Rod McGinn.

In chapter four, John Everitt and Christoph Stadel outline the spatial growth of Brandon within a context of historical evolution. The authors explore the impacts of the C.P.R. and land speculation on the initial settlement of the city and then document the main stages