

Dougall, Lily. *What Necessity Knows*. 1893. Reprint with an introduction by Victoria Walker. Ottawa: Tecumseh Press, 1992. Pp. 445. \$13.95 paper

Sime, J.G. *Sister Woman*. 1919. Reprint with an introduction by Sandra Campbell. Ottawa: Tecumseh Press, 1992. Pp. 293. \$14.50 paper

Joanna Dean

Volume 21, numéro 2, march 1993

URI : <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1016806ar>

DOI : <https://doi.org/10.7202/1016806ar>

[Aller au sommaire du numéro](#)

Éditeur(s)

Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine

ISSN

0703-0428 (imprimé)

1918-5138 (numérique)

[Découvrir la revue](#)

Citer ce compte rendu

Dean, J. (1993). Compte rendu de [Dougall, Lily. *What Necessity Knows*. 1893. Reprint with an introduction by Victoria Walker. Ottawa: Tecumseh Press, 1992. Pp. 445. \$13.95 paper / Sime, J.G. *Sister Woman*. 1919. Reprint with an introduction by Sandra Campbell. Ottawa: Tecumseh Press, 1992. Pp. 293. \$14.50 paper]. *Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine*, 21(2), 128–130. <https://doi.org/10.7202/1016806ar>

tables generated enhance the text without unduly imposing on the reader. Equally at home with more traditional documentary sources such as church and school records, he also uses less traditional ones such as the ballads of a local bard. Micro-history at its best, his findings on every topic are presented in the context of the existing secondary literature and comparisons are drawn with well-known studies of other settlement areas such as Peel County and the Saguenay. Detailed maps accompany his findings on settlement; however, a map of the region showing county boundaries and adjacent urban centres would be a useful addition to the discussion of the last two chapters.

Little begins his study, appropriately, with social and economic conditions in the place of origin of its settlers. Two groups are actually studied: the crofters, Scots from the Isle of Lewis in the Hebrides and the habitants, French Canadian settlers originating primarily from the nearby seigneurie of Lauzon. Displaced by improving landlords and the potato blight the crofters who chose to settle in Winslow constituted a fairly homogeneous population as did their French Canadian neighbours. Little documents the process of settlement including the problems related to obtaining full title to land, but in the period before 1881, the greatest problem faced by the settlers was the isolation of the region and the lack of good roads.

Organized according to the approaches to family history suggested by Anderson<sup>1</sup> his next three chapters examine the demographic characteristics of the population, family life (the sentiment approach), and the household economy. In the absence of personal documents, the author's discussion of family life focuses primarily on household structure, based on census reports, and on inheritance, based on deeds in gift. He documents

some differences between the crofters and habitants such as the higher fertility rate of the French Canadians, their high infant mortality, their earlier transfer of property from one generation to the next, and their greater participation in the seasonal labour of the timber industry. By 1881 a much higher proportion of adult children still lived at home in Scottish households and fewer of them married. Partible inheritance was rare for both groups and the land was seldom split. The domestic economy was common to both, the geography of this township not lending itself to a high degree of market orientation.

The author then looks at the economic development of the community, the growth of institutions (churches, schools and municipal government) and public morality. Despite their many similarities these two communities remained mutually exclusive. This extended not only to schools and churches but also to municipal government, Winslow having been divided in 1858. Stratification was minimal in both communities. Because agriculture remained at a subsistence level and the timber industry was monopolized by an outside firm the local petty bourgeoisie of millers and merchants remained weak and played only a minor role in local exchange and credit.

This would also account for the weakness of the two villages (St Romain and Stornoway or Bruceville) which emerged in Winslow. Their development, or rather lack of it, and location in the urban hierarchy is not explored systematically but emerges from the discussion on local capital. The district service centre, St Vital de Lambton, and Lake Megantic, which emerged as a boom town when C.S. Clark's monopoly over timber in the region was finally broken by the railroad, were located outside the study area. Outside merchants also provided loans in the form of hypothecs to the French

Canadian population. Discussion of the county council is minimal but the fact that an unpopular railway tax could be imposed on the population by the larger body is suggestive. The author's focus on the township makes it difficult to approach these questions adequately. To do so a broader regional perspective would be necessary.

Marginal areas are seldom chosen for detailed study. This well-documented and lucid study therefore makes an important contribution to our knowledge of the settlement process in nineteenth century British North America/Canada. I have one reservation. The author writes that a desire for "the perpetuation of traditional social ties and cultural values" (p. 27) explains the Scots' choice of Winslow as a place to settle. The marginal lands, limited opportunities and isolation they would face there undoubtedly facilitated the retention of their culture, but it is unlikely that these were fully anticipated. But this in no way detracts from an excellent study.

FRANÇOISE NOEL  
Associate Professor of History  
Nipissing University College

### **References**

1. Michael Anderson, *Approaches to the History of the Western Family, 1500-1914*, (London: Macmillan, 1980).

Dougall, Lily. *What Necessity Knows*. 1893. Reprint with an introduction by Victoria Walker. Ottawa: Tecumseh Press, 1992. Pp. 445. \$13.95 paper.

Sime, J.G. *Sister Woman*. 1919. Reprint with an introduction by Sandra Campbell. Ottawa: Tecumseh Press, 1992. Pp. 293. \$14.50 paper.

Reprinted after almost a century of obscurity, these two works of fiction pro-

vide insight into the transition of Canadian women into the urban labour force. In the twenty-six years between the publication of *What Necessity Knows* in 1893 and *Sister Woman* in 1919, women had moved into the public spaces of the city in increasing numbers as shop clerks, secretaries and factory workers. Their new positions challenged prevailing assumptions about gender, and raised fears about women's independence and sexual vulnerability.

*What Necessity Knows* sets the stage for the transition and speaks with the idealism of the late nineteenth century. On the surface a melodramatic romance about British immigrants, the novel explores the breakdown of gender, class and religious hierarchies in the new world.

*Sister Woman* speaks with experience and is bleakly realistic. In the introduction the narrator is challenged to explain the concerns of women; her answer is a series of stories about urban women. Sime's characters work long hard hours and are involved in a variety of 'irregular' sexual relationships, for which they pay a high emotional price.

While Lily Dougall and J.G. Sime both lived in Montreal, their works reflect different experiences in that city. Dougall was born in 1858 and grew up in Montreal as the youngest daughter in a prominent evangelical family. She left Montreal permanently in 1900 for a home in Britain. Her lifelong preoccupation and the underlying theme of most of her popular novels, as well as her later theological works, was the need to rethink spirituality in modern terms.

Sime was born ten years after Dougall, and grew up in a more cosmopolitan milieu in London, England. She moved to Montreal on the eve of her fortieth birthday in 1907 where she was apparently involved in long-term liaison with an

eminent married doctor. Her work is unusual for her candour about the pleasures of sexuality, and sympathy for those who transgress conventional morality.

For Dougall Canada was essentially rural. Her first novel, *Beggars All*, was set in urban Britain, but in *What Necessity Knows* Dougall focuses on what she sees as distinctly Canadian landscape and society: a remote lumber clearing and a small rural community in Eastern Townships. Montreal figures only as a temptation to a young girl, represented by fine dinner parties and carriages. Canada is a land of opportunity, and the spiritual regeneration her characters achieve is paralleled by their progress in the new world.

In contrast *Sister Woman* is grittily urban. Canada is less a land of opportunity than a place of faded dreams and lost hopes, inhabited by exploited showgirls, compromised servants, and lonely older women. The titles of the stories are revealing: "Alone," "Adrift," "Love-o'-Man," "Waiting," "The Last Hope."

Despite their hard-won financial independence, Sime's women are dominated, and often destroyed, by obsessive love for a man or a baby. No matter how painful, this love is described as superior to lonely independence. In "Damned Old Maid" a woman says, "Isn't it better to be sore and live with a man than to live safe and sound with yer past behind ye and no future to come?" (188)

It is not individual men, who are mainly of-stage figures, but social conventions that victimise women. Writing sympathetically of a pregnant servant, Sime reflects, not on the iniquity of the man involved, or the weakness of the girl, but on the unfairness of it. "And it seemed a lot to pay for a minute of two of warmth and contentment. For it hadn't been much more than that—she hadn't felt, she wasn't capable of feeling perhaps, any of that pas-

sionate love, that desire, that joy, that losing of herself ... " (139)

Dougall's women are victors, rather than victims. In *What Necessity Knows* Sissy is presented as a daring woman who physically dwarfs the man who loves her. And it is a woman, Sophie, rather than the minister, who is the moral mainstay of the novel. Both women defy social convention to retain their autonomy, yet, reflecting the idealism of the nineteenth century, they both find egalitarian marriages.

The contrast with Sime is apparent in passages about the sexual dangers young women face. Dougall says confidently: "(The hotel) is a safe place for her; for she is able to take care of herself anywhere, if she chooses; and if she doesn't choose, no place is safe." (201) Sime says bluntly, "Young women who look dainty and charming and tempting and delicious don't have a very easy time of it on life's journey if they have nothing to protect them but their own sense of decency and fairness." (117)

Sime's realism is the product of experience. Her own work as a secretary was typical of the changes that had occurred since the publication of Dougall's novel. Work is described by Sime as an exhausting necessity, and she is aware of the crushing poverty of the seamstress, and its consequences.

Although they are rich in emotional texture, these books, especially Sime's, will disappoint historians looking for the minutiae of historical detail. For example, Sime's story, "Munitions" makes no mention of factory conditions. It does however, describe the jubilant sense of liberation and strength felt by the munitions worker who has escaped the claustrophobia of domestic service.

Readers of the reprinted editions of *What Necessity Knows* and *Sister Woman* will

find the introductions by Victoria Walker and Sandra Campbell very useful. They provide autobiographical information and an analysis that sets the work into literary and historical context. The books are photo-reproduced copies of the original texts, and the original typefaces give them an authenticity that is only occasionally marred by faded print and missing characters.

We owe the reappearance of these two books to the work of literary critics, especially feminist literary critics, who are retrieving from obscurity books that had been dismissed by the arbiters of the literary canon. Historians will look forward to future discoveries.

JOANNA DEAN,  
Department of History  
Carleton University

**William M. Baker, *Lethbridge: Founding the Community to 1914: A Visual History*. Lethbridge: Occasional Paper 27 published by the Lethbridge Historical Society, 1927, pp. 48**

For a quarter of a century, beginning in the 1882, Montreal businessman and politician Sir Alexander T. Galt and his son Elliott managed a variety of coal mining, railway, and land development companies in southern Alberta. Their enterprises included the townsite of Lethbridge, an orderly set of grids laid out by C.A. Magrath, a Dominion Land Surveyor and the Galt company's land agent. William Baker has assembled a fine collection of photographs dealing thematically with Lethbridge in its first decades. His extended captions and selection of photographs make this local production a useful aid for understanding the prairie city and its semi-arid hinterland.

Many of the pictures emphasize the suddenness of growth. The Indian ponies and travois in one picture and the 1906

photo of "old timers of both races" recall the contact of cultures. The solidity of what was quickly built as well as the "enormous gaps" and frontier openness provide startling contrasts that would enhance any lectures on prairie history. Whether it is a picture of an interior of a house or the exterior of a bank, the items in this collection serve to remind us how eastern culture and capital fashioned new communities on an interior "empire" within several decades. Yet the spacing of structures, the prominence of the horizon and "big sky", and the evidence of trains, coal, and grain locate Lethbridge as a place apart. The famous high-level railway bridge completed in 1909 is an apt symbol for the city before WWI, for it not only depicts aspects of the local economy but – as Baker notes – captures the ascendancy of the CPR enterprises over the Galt enterprises.

Most of the over seventy photographs and illustrations include people. This booklet is not just a collection of pictures of buildings, but a record of people and their material environment. Although not a full-blown academic study of the early decades of Lethbridge's history, this publication is an admirable local production from which teachers of Canadian history can find useful illustrative material. This booklet is available from the Lethbridge Historical Society, P.O. Box 974, Lethbridge Alberta, T1J 4A2

JOHN WEAVER  
McMaster University

**Ferretti, Lucia. *Entre voisins. La société paroissiale en milieu urbain: Saint-Pierre-Apôtre de Montréal 1848-1930*. Montréal: Boréal, 1992. Cartes. Pp. 264.**

En suivant un siècle de l'histoire socio-économique et religieuse de cette paroisse de l'est de Montréal, où s'entassèrent entre 1850 et 1914 de

8 000 à 15 000 habitants sur une superficie d'un tiers de mille carré, situé entre la rue Sainte-Catherine et le fleuve, entre les rues Panet et Saint-André, c'est un véritable âge d'or dans l'évolution des rapports entre l'Église catholique et les citadins que Lucia Ferretti fait apparaître. Naviguant sur des vagues continues de migrants ruraux, un groupe de pères Oblats réussit pendant huit décennies à "construire un réseau d'intenses relations locales", une institution d'un étonnant enracinement qui devint la principale agence de médiation entre la ville et les nouveaux venus.

Le secret de cette stabilité? L'énergie de ces pères Oblats, parmi les premiers à venir de France depuis la Conquête, dont c'est l'établissement urbain d'importance et le centre d'activités. (La monographie intéressera aussi les historiens du Nord, Saint-Pierre servant de maison mère aux Oblats missionnaires auprès des autochtones.) La flexibilité et l'ouverture de leur ultramontanisme qui transforme la tradition catholique urbaine au milieu du 19<sup>e</sup> siècle, et dont l'auteur peint un portrait concret et rafraîchissant. Ces frères missionnaires, d'origine modeste eux-mêmes, arrivent à s'attacher la population à coups d'essais et d'erreurs, dans un contexte où aucun pouvoir public n'a encore pris en charge leur bien-être ou leur adaptation. Cependant, la compétition entre ordres religieux pour la loyauté des fidèles donne aux citoyens un pouvoir remarquable dans l'histoire de la paroisse, de la détermination des horaires aux des règles des confréries en passant par les formes de piété. Ainsi, la marche de l'ultramontanisme n'est pas inéluctable et la reconquête spirituelle d'un tel quartier ne peut s'effectuer au moyen de simples mesures de "contrôle social". Elle commande un jeu d'échanges dans lequel la dizaine de pères en devoir à Saint-Pierre doivent comprendre les aspirations des "Bourragans" et tenter de les servir: non seule-