

Mayne, Alan, and Tim Murray, eds. *The Archaeology of Urban Landscapes: Explorations in Slumland. New Directions in Archaeology*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002. Pp. xi, 192. Illustrations, bibliography, index. US\$25.00 (paperback)

Paul A. Erickson

Perspectives internationales sur l'histoire urbaine : un aperçu des tendances récentes

International Perspectives on Urban History: A Review of Recent Trends

Volume 32, numéro 1, fall 2003

URI : <https://id.erudit.org/iderudit/1015749ar>

DOI : <https://doi.org/10.7202/1015749ar>

[Aller au sommaire du numéro](#)

Éditeur(s)

Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine

ISSN

0703-0428 (imprimé)

1918-5138 (numérique)

[Découvrir la revue](#)

Citer ce compte rendu

Erickson, P. A. (2003). Compte rendu de [Mayne, Alan, and Tim Murray, eds. *The Archaeology of Urban Landscapes: Explorations in Slumland. New Directions in Archaeology*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002. Pp. xi, 192. Illustrations, bibliography, index. US\$25.00 (paperback)]. *Urban History Review / Revue d'histoire urbaine*, 32(1), 70–71. <https://doi.org/10.7202/1015749ar>

Book Reviews

public health urges a more nuanced reading of a wider range of medieval (and ancient and early modern) texts than is usually considered. The hagiographic writings of Gregory, sixth century Bishop of Tours, yield, in Horden's hands, "techniques for the reconfiguration of urban space" in epidemic and non-epidemic situations. (24) Yet Horden does not neglect the symbolic and ritualistic dimensions of his texts in order to isolate sensible (according to our current perspective) prescriptive measures. If Horden warns us against stripping these texts of their contemporary content in order to render them familiar, Colin Jones cautions us against using them as straightforward registers of contemporary events. In this too brief essay (9 pages) on the languages of plague in early modern French plague tractates, Jones identifies three primary scripts or genres, each with different producers, intended consumers, and analyses. The paper is tantalizing, but most readers will derive more benefit from the longer version in *Representations*. Peter Christensen's analysis of the 1711 plague in Copenhagen is, similarly, too brief to develop its thesis about Danish absolutism.

The remainder of the essays begin their analysis in the nineteenth century. Two papers share Horden's and Jones's emphasis on textual analysis. Flurin Condrau and Jakob Tanner analyze the language of disease in cholera tracts in nineteenth-century Switzerland, and Marjaana Niemi dissects the discourse of public health in Birmingham and Gothenburg from 1890-1920. Niemi persuasively links public health analyses in the two cities to local economic, political and moral agendas; public health authorities in the two cities, facing similar public health problems and relying on the same internationalized scientific discourse, nonetheless defined their problems and thus those problems' solutions in revealingly different ways.

Shifting attention away from texts, three papers explore the nineteenth century decline in mortality and its causes. The economic historian Robert Millward and his collaborator Frances Bell add another instalment to a series of papers devoted to a quantitative analysis of local authority expenditure in the second half of the nineteenth century. Using taxation records, the authors note that local authorities devoted a large proportion of their capital spending to public health broadly construed, but the timing of this expenditure, showing a marked late century peak, discouraged them "from assigning significance to investment on infrastructure as a cause of mortality decline before the end of the nineteenth century." It appears that the type of social interventions described by Simon Szreter in his important 1988 *Social History of Medicine* article had "only a weak influence on mortality before 1900." (163) In a similar vein, the economist John Brown argues in his study of the decline of infant mortality in German towns from 1889-1912 that policies explicitly designed to reduce infant mortality, such as the encouragement of breast-feeding or the provision of milk stations, "appear to have had only a limited effectiveness." (192) Brown's statistical analysis suggests that declining fertility was the most important variable determining infant mortality decline. The

gains from sanitary reform were so limited that in any given year unusually high summer temperatures could wipe them out.

The picture of public health drawn by Millward and Bell and Brown is difficult to reconcile with that drawn by Paul Laxton and Gerry Kearns in their respective papers on Dr. William Duncan, the first Liverpool medical officer. At the very least, Duncan's commitment would have been sapped had he known that many of the most important mortality determinants were beyond his power (the temperature) or purview (fertility). Yet the role of health reformers may not have been as unimportant as quantitative analyses imply. Millward and Bell admit that their local authority expenditure data does not fully capture all public health activity and that much of the improvement in housing to which they give significant credit for mortality reduction may be in part due to public health initiatives. Brown likewise suggests that sanitary improvements — the provision of waterclosets and water — had the potential to reduce mortality, especially from diarrhoea, the major infant killer. Brown's paper is nicely complemented by one from Jörg Vögele, Wolfgang Woelk and Silke Fehlemann, also oriented around the early twentieth-century decline in German infant mortality. They argue that the effectiveness of interventions targeted at individuals such as milk depots and infant welfare centres remains unproven, but suggest that those directed at the environment probably reduced deaths from diarrhoeal disease. This trio of papers reminds us that research into the decline in mortality continues to deliver interesting and important results nearly thirty years after Thomas McKeown published his provocative thesis.

The volume's editors are clear that this collection of essays is highly selective in terms of chronological and geographic coverage: there is no discussion of developments after 1920 and no non-European developments. Seven of the ten essays cover the period from 1840 to 1920, and six of them deal with England and Germany. Notwithstanding these limitations, I recommend it to urban historians and historians of public health.

James Hanley
Department of History
University of Winnipeg

Mayne, Alan, and Tim Murray, eds. *The Archaeology of Urban Landscapes: Explorations in Slumland. New Directions in Archaeology*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002. Pp. xi, 192. Illustrations, bibliography, index. US\$25.00 (paperback)

Archaeologists can help historians understand the history of cities by recovering and interpreting past material culture. A new — probably the new — theoretical direction in urban archaeology is "landscape" archaeology, in which a landscape is any outcome of human physical or mental activity interact-

Book Reviews

ing with the natural environment. A landscape is symbolic, or cultural, and the job of the landscape archaeologist is to interpret it. A collection of such interpretations constitutes *The Archaeology of Urban Landscapes: Explorations in Slumland*.

The editors of *The Archaeology of Urban Landscapes*, Alan Mayne and Tim Murray, are an Australian historian and archaeologist. They want their book to show how historians and archaeologists can cooperate to expose derogatory stereotypes of the urban slum and replace them with realistic images of inner-city, working class vitality. The procedure they recommend is complex and somewhat open-ended, in which, following theoretical anthropologist Clifford Geertz, the historian and archaeologist aim, not so much to recreate slum life as it was once lived, but to "imagine" it in ways that are consistent with evidence. That evidence is limited, because, at least above ground, many slums have disappeared in nineteenth- and twentieth-century urban "renewal."

Following their introduction, Mayne and Murray divide *The Archaeology of Urban Landscapes* into two parts. They intend part one, comprising five case studies, to focus on research settings, scopes, and approaches and part two, comprising six case studies, to focus on research applications and conclusions. Although there is more reference to material culture in part two, in fact, the two parts are similar. Of the 11 cases, five are American (New York, Washington DC, Lowell, Massachusetts, Minneapolis, Minnesota, Oakland, California); two, English (London, Sheffield); two, Australian (Melbourne, Sydney); one, South African (Cape Town); and one, Canadian (Quebec City).

Of the cases in part one, four emphasize how slum stereotypes have developed in literature, social activism, planning policy, and the public mind. Ellen Ross shows how middle-class women approached their volunteer work in the slums of London in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. More politically, Elaine-Maryse Solari describes how counter-productive policies of urban redevelopment led to destruction of marginalized communities in West Oakland, California. Referring to limited archaeological excavations, Antonia Malan and Elizabeth van Heyningen outline a parallel, century-long trajectory of events in Cape Town's once-bustling District Six. Grace Karskens performs a similar task for Sydney's infamous Rocks neighbourhood, formerly inhabited by convicts. In the fifth case, Barbara J. Little and Nancy J. Kassner

use archaeology to explore the alleys of Washington, DC, revealing how alley culture was different from culture on the street. In all these cases, from the perspective of today, it is startling to learn, or remember, how little control inner-city communities have traditionally had over the planning policies and decisions that affected their lives.

Of the cases in part two, two explore relationships among space, work, and power in industrial slums. These are Paul Belford's study of the late eighteenth- and early nineteenth-century "Crofts" of Sheffield and Mary C. Beaudry and Stephen A. Mrozowski's study of the nineteenth-century "company city" of Lowell. Three other cases use detailed archaeological data to create an image of working-class identity and respectability. These are Murray and Mayne's study of the Melbourne city block of "Little Lon," John P. McCarthy's study of late nineteenth-century Minneapolis, and Rebecca Yamin's study of the Irish community of Five Points, New York; exemplifying archaeological "imagination, Yamin creates a first-person narrative for former Five Points resident Mary Callahan. In the sixth case, Réginald Auger and William Moss trace the progress of archaeological investigation of Quebec City's historic Lower Town, showing how progress there has been limited by a focus on the early French period. In all these cases, most recovered artifacts are mundane, not spectacular, something to be expected, even celebrated, in efforts to paint a realistic picture of working class life.

The cases studies in *The Archaeology of Urban Landscapes* are uniform in format, length, and style. Every one provides end notes, often numerous, and all but two are illustrated. Major sources appear in a comprehensive bibliography. These features, to the credit of the editors, make the book attractive and useful. Admittedly, coverage is restricted to cities in the English-speaking world. In recent years, most major Canadian cities have seen archaeological excavations, so, even though the book features only one Canadian city, its appeal in Canada is potentially geographically widespread. Because the book is cast theoretically, its most likely readers are scholars and some city planners. At the same time, because it is reasonably priced, it could serve as a textbook in colleges and universities.

Paul A. Erickson
Department of Anthropology
Saint Mary's University